

Rethinking Career Studies

Facilitating Conversation
across Boundaries with the
Social Chronology Framework

Hugh Gunz and Wolfgang Mayrhofer



"In this authoritative book, Gunz and Mayrhofer demonstrate an inspiring width of vision and depth of analysis that will benefit career studies enormously. Their ability to identify and explain abstract concepts and then apply them rigorously to specific examples of career research is truly impressive. This book deserves to be a landmark in career studies and beyond – at last we have something that achieves what many of us careers academics have been calling for but have not delivered. The Social Chronology Framework deserves to become a key reference point for careers researchers in designing and interpreting their work, and in incorporating new ideas into their thinking."

Professor John Arnold, *Loughborough University*

"This book ought to be read by every scholar who studies careers. It is a demanding book, but the deeper you go the more you will be rewarded. The authors, carefully sequenced propositions, models and illustrative examples promote a rich appreciation of how career scholars can integrate and gain greater respect for one another's work. Moreover, the book provides a point of departure for conversations with scholars who study other topics – such as identity, role and leadership – which can also benefit from an interdisciplinary approach. We need more books like this if social science is ever going to fulfil its potential."

Professor Emeritus Michael B. Arthur, *Suffolk University, Boston, USA*

Cover illustration: Edmunds Dana/Getty

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS
www.cambridge.org

ISBN 978-1-107-05747-0



Gunz and Mayrhofer Rethinking Career Studies

CAMBRIDGE

Rethinking Career Studies

*Facilitating Conversation across Boundaries
with the Social Chronology Framework*

Hugh Gunz

University of Toronto

Wolfgang Mayrhofer

Vienna University of Economics and Business (WU Vienna)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE

UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107057470

DOI: 10.1017/9781107414952

© Hugh Gunz and Wolfgang Mayrhofer, 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-05747-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Rethinking Career Studies

Careers are studied across many disciplines – particularly from the social sciences – but there is little conversation between them. Many scholars are studying the same thing in different ways, too often missing opportunities to learn from one another and draw on each other's ideas and findings to enrich their own. Gunz and Mayrhofer bridge these scholarly discourses as they explore the meaning of 'career' and answer the question: What is it that career scholars do when they study careers? The framework that emerges from this answer – the Social Chronology Framework (SCF) – vitally facilitates valuable conversations between scholars in different intellectual traditions. Building on the SCF framework, this comprehensive introduction to career studies encourages students, researchers and practitioners to identify commonalities between the topics that they are studying and those examined in other fields, such as organization studies, drawing together interdisciplinary insights into career outcomes and their influencing factors.

HUGH GUNZ has a PhD in Chemistry and in Organizational Behavior, and is Professor of Organizational Behavior at the University of Toronto. He is the author of the book *Careers and Corporate Cultures* (1989), and the co-editor of the *Handbook of Career Studies* (2007). He serves or has served on the editorial boards of a number of journals, including *Journal of Professions and Organization*, *Academy of Management Journal*, and the *Journal of Managerial Psychology*, and *Emergence*, and is a former chair of the Careers Division of the Academy of Management.

WOLFGANG MAYRHOFFER is Full Professor and Head of the Interdisciplinary Institute of Management and Organizational Behavior, Vienna University of Economics and Business, Austria. He has (co-)authored/(co-)edited 31 books and (co-)authored more than 210 peer-reviewed articles and book chapters. He serves as editorial or advisory board member of several international journals and research centers and regularly consults with organizations in the for-profit and non-profit world. He has received national and international awards for outstanding research and service to the academic community.

Preface and Acknowledgments

This book addresses some deceptively simple questions: what is career, what do those of us who study career actually do, and why do we find it so hard to talk to each other about our work? Books about careers take many forms, from academic monographs through edited collections of academic writing to a vast array of books intended to be helpful to people who actually have careers. This one falls into the first camp: it targets anyone who is interested in research on careers. That is a much wider audience than it at first appears. One of our themes, and it is not an original one, is that career puts in an appearance almost anywhere you look. There are certainly scholars whose primary interest is career (or an obvious synonym for it), but they are in some ways a minority. Social scientists and scholars of the humanities, of almost any imaginable kind, may at one time or another find themselves reflecting on what happens as people pass through life. Our aim here is not quite as broad as this: we are addressing anyone who does research on career, whether or not it is their primary interest, with a specific focus on colleagues working in the broad field of organization studies. At the moment few of us in these disparate areas of enquiry talk to each other about our mutual if varying interest in career; what we hope to do in this book is suggest an approach to stimulating this kind of conversation.

Because we are addressing what, for us at least, are fairly basic questions about career scholarship, there are places in this book, especially in Part II, where we get caught up in the weeds about basic issues. What we are trying to do is be as precise as we can about the ideas we are working with. We are pretty sure that this will interest some readers and irritate others. Some of the latter won't understand why we have to analyze every syllable and punctuation mark, so to speak, and some will regard our efforts as perhaps not bad for beginners but really needing an awful lot more work to be credible. We are signaling ahead on this point because our expectation is that different parts of this book will appeal to different readers and that by no means all of it will interest everyone. This means that anyone who has the endurance to read it all might find certain ideas coming back at them more times than they might wish. We apologize in advance for this. But there are some points that we do not want the

reader to miss, in particular that we think of the Social Chronology Framework (SCF) as a facilitator of conversation, *not* as a straightjacket for all thinking about career; that the studies we discuss are excellent pieces of scholarship on which it has been our pleasure to try to build; and that the SCF is by no means the only possible way of generating the ideas we claim for it.

It is very hard to be sure where an idea comes from. We – the authors – have been collaborating for a good many years on a number of projects, typically to do with conferences of one kind and another. Over that time we discovered a shared interest in a deceptively simple question: what on earth is career research all about? One of us (Hugh Gunz) had just finished coediting, with Maury Peiperl, a handbook that purported to define the field and where it might be heading. But at the end of that lengthy process he found himself as uncertain as ever about just what comprises the field of career studies (assuming that there is one). The other (Wolfgang Mayrhofer) was getting increasingly startled about what he had got himself into after setting up a longitudinal study on business school graduates' careers and the discussions about what a career "is" that were raging when doing this in an interdisciplinary team.

One of the ideas that emerged from the handbook, to which proper reference will be made when we get down to business in Chapter 1, was of career studies not being so much a field as a perspective on social enquiry. Whether that really was the origin of the idea for this book is hard to be sure because conversations ramble in many directions and ideas pop up out of them unexpectedly and randomly. We certainly had plenty of conversations like that. But the key point to be made here is that neither of us individually is the originator of the notion of the Social Chronology Framework: it has been a genuinely collaborative effort. Of course, this means that we carry equal blame, too.

The plan originally was for a journal article, which kept us going for longer than we prefer to remember. Gradually the structure of the argument took shape, and the clearer the shape became, the longer the article grew. We did submit it to a couple of journals (as well as present the ideas to a variety of meetings), and the reaction was constructive but pointed. There is too much here, they said, for a single article. One editor said quite bluntly that it looked to them as if we had the outline of a book manuscript, which was good to hear because by then Cambridge University Press had accepted our proposal for a monograph.

If it is hard in retrospect to identify where the idea for this book comes from, it is easy to identify friends and colleagues who have supported us along the way with their thoughtful and constructive criticisms and suggestions. Among them are John Arnold, Michael Arthur, Silvia Bagdadli, Joel Baum, Matthew Bidwell, Laurie Cohen, Audrey Collin, Gina Dokko, Nicky Dries, Jo Duberley, Daniel Feldman, Jeffrey Greenhaus, David Guest, Peter Heslin, Kerr Inkson, Candace Jones, Maria Krammer, Kathy Kram, Mila Lazarova, Barbara

Lawrence, Mary Dean Lee, Michael Meyer, Renate Meyer, Celia Moore, Nigel Nicholson, Thomas Schneidhofer, Johannes Steyrer, Stefan Titscher, Pam Tolbert, and Yoav Vardi as well as numerous other colleagues who have suffered our numerous presentations. Whether any of this wonderfully distinguished group of colleagues will recognize their advice in this book only time will tell, but we are deeply grateful for their contributions. We learned a lot from you: thank you. If we have failed to learn adequately, please accept our apologies. But the process has, for us, been enormous fun and incredibly stimulating.

We also thank Renate Gellner-Bächer and Gisela Ullrich-Rosner who dealt with a number of editing issues. As well we are most grateful to Valerie Appleby, James Gregory, and David Moore of Cambridge University Press and Paula Parish, formerly of Cambridge (who commissioned this book), whose enthusiastic support of the project from the initial submission of the book proposal to getting the first copies to our desks has been greatly appreciated.

The fun and stimulation accompanying writing the manuscript happened during a great many writing sessions, almost all of which took place at the home of one or the other of us. That required great tolerance on the part of our wives, Elizabeth Badley and Andrea Mayrhofer, both successful professionals in their own areas of expertise, who we are sure were convinced that all this endless talk was never going to go anywhere. We thank them for their unfailing hospitality and support and for not throwing us out of their respective homes as the SCF rolled over everything else in seemingly endless repetition. Finally, we are grateful to the distillers of numerous fine whiskeys and bourbons, whose support for morale at the end of a long day's writing was always appreciated.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page vii</i>
<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>Preface and Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xi</i>

Part I Point of Departure 1

1	Establishing the Need for the Social Chronology Framework	3
	What Is Career? Is There a Field of Career Studies?	6
	Conversation within and between Career Discourses and Its Obstacles	13
	Finding a Common Language: The Supportive Role of Perspectives	14
	Outline of the Book	17
	Summation	20
2	Exploring Career as a Concept	21
	Views of Career	21
	Core Ideas in Career Definitions	25
	Career Actors	29
	Summation	37

Part II The Social Chronology Framework (SCF) 39

3	The Three Perspectives and Their View of Career	41
	Perspectives: Creating Reality and Meaning	41
	Spatial Perspective	47
	Ontic Perspective	53
	Temporal Perspective	57
	Interplay between Perspectives	62
	A Theoretically Grounded Definition of Career	63
	Summation	73
4	A Heuristic Model of Career	74
	Career Transitions	75
	Modeling Career Transitions: The Basic Building Block	78
	Assembling the Blocks: The Elaborated SCF Model	85
	Summation	91

5	Exploring the Architectonics of the SCF	92
	Theory in the Social Sciences	92
	Frameworks and Models	96
	The SCF as a Framework	98
	Activities When Applying the SCF	100
	Summation	107
	Part III Putting the SCF to Work	109
6	Facilitating Conversations within Career Studies	111
	The Importance of Conversation	112
	Conversations between Career Fields	122
	Identity-Related Conversations: A Narrative of the OMC Field's History	130
	Summation	145
7	Stimulating Cumulative Research within Career Studies	147
	Mapping and Reviewing Constructs and Their Relationships	149
	Looking for Missing Connections	156
	Moving beyond the Current Bounds	160
	Summation	168
8	Bringing Ideas In from Organization Studies	169
	Coevolutionary Theory, Complementarity Theory, and Mentorship	170
	Neo-institutionalism and Career Success	183
	What Career Studies Can Learn	193
	Summation	201
9	Contributing to Organization Studies	202
	Reframing Individual Studies	203
	Reframing Fields	208
	Summation	235
	Part IV Conclusion	237
10	Taking the SCF Forward	239
	Main Messages of the Book	239
	Some Further Directions	244
	Coda: Defamiliarization, Imagination, and Conceptual Combination	255
	<i>References</i>	257
	<i>Index</i>	296

Figures

1.1	Fields, proto-fields, and nascent commonalities of interest	page 13
4.1	Career transition – basic building block	79
4.2	SCF heuristic model chained over time	86
4.3	Elaborated SCF heuristic model (partial view)	90
5.1	The stages of the SCF and its applications	99
5.2	Reconstructing contextual perspectives on career in terms of the SCF	104
6.1	Ideal types of career research	122
6.2	Development of the OMC field	144
7.1	Betz and Hackett’s model of career-related self-efficacy	151
7.2	Reconstructing Betz and Hackett’s model within the SCF	152
7.3	Reconstructing the Seibert <i>et al.</i> (2001) model within the SCF	153
7.4	Reconstructing Seibert <i>et al.</i> (2001) to show a lagged effect on objective career success	155
7.5	Career success and social capital (Seibert <i>et al.</i> , 2001): supplementary hypothesis	158
7.6	Reconstructing CEO succession and non-appointed managers (Boyer and Ortiz-Molina, 2008)	159
7.7	Refinement of the reconstruction of Betz and Hackett’s model	161
7.8	Further extension of Seibert <i>et al.</i> (2001) model	165
7.9	Extended model of reconstructing CEO succession and non-appointed managers (Boyer and Ortiz-Molina, 2008)	166
9.1	Recasting Shen and Cannella’s (2002) model in terms of the SCF – view 1	205
9.2	Recasting Shen and Cannella’s (2002) model in terms of the SCF – view 2	207
9.3	Major events and offices in the political life of Nelson Mandela	214
9.4	de Klerk, Mandela, and Mbeki – major events and offices in their political lives	218
9.5	Interconnections between the PSF’s principal actors (based on Hinings <i>et al.</i> , 2015a: 19)	224

9.6	Model of the career of the focal professional, chained over time	226
9.7	Elaborated model of focal professional's career, showing propositions	231
10.1	Conversations between fields, proto-fields, and nascent commonalities of interest	240

Tables

2.1	Potential “units” to which careers are attributed	<i>page</i> 33
3.1	Elements of the SCF	46
6.1	Life-course theory paradigmatic principles (from Elder, Johnson, and Crosnoe, 2003: 11–13) and the SCF	127
8.1	Institutional pillars and carriers (Scott, 1995: 52)	191
9.1	Interplay between discourses and career as a research focus	203

