Competition Law and Policy in Latin America

Recent Developments

EDITED BY
PAULO BURNIER DA SILVEIRA



Competition Law and Policy in Latin America

Recent Developments

Edited by
Paulo Burnier da Silveira



Published by:

Kluwer Law International B.V.

PO Box 316

2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn

The Netherlands

Website: www.wolterskluwerlr.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S.

7201 McKinney Circle

Frederick, MD 21704

United States of America

Email: customer.service@wolterskluwer.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Quadrant

Rockwood House

Haywards Heath

West Sussex

RH16 3DH

United Kingdom

Email: international-customerservice@wolterskluwer.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-6047-8

e-Book: ISBN 978-90-411-8688-1 web-PDF: ISBN 978-90-411-8689-8

© 2017 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S., 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Website: www.wolterskluwerlr.com

Printed and bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Editor and Contributors

Paulo Burnier da Silveira is Commissioner at the Brazilian Competition Authority (CADE) and Associate Law Professor at the University of Brasilia (UnB). He holds a PhD in International Law from the University of Paris II and the University of São Paulo (USP), a LLM from the Catholic University of Lisbon and a BA from the Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro. The views hereby expressed are personal and do not necessarily reflect those of the organizations involved.

Aldo Henrique Cáder Camilot holds a Law degree, is notary, Salvadoran and Italian national, with over ten years of experience in Competition Law; since 2009, and is the head of investigations for the Superintendence of Competition from El Salvador. In addition, he is Professor of Civil and Commercial Law at the Higher School of Economics and Business (ESEN). He has been juridical assistant, coordinator and secretary in the Salvadoran Constitutional Chamber of the Supreme Court of Justice.

Alejandro Lucero is a Lawyer graduated from Mar del Plata University, Argentina and Licenciado en Derecho in Spain. He holds a Specialist in Regulation of Public Services degree from Austral University, Argentina and a LLM in European Law from Radboud University, The Netherlands. He worked in Utilities Companies and in the National Competition Authority of Argentina. Currently is an International Independent Consultant in Competition Law and works in International Projects for UNCTAD.

Amanda Athayde is Head of the Leniency Unit at CADE. She holds a PhD in Commercial Law from the University of São Paulo (USP), a BA in Law from the Federal University of Minas Gerais (UFMG) and a BA in Business Administration in the UNA Centre. She is a Professor of Economic and Competition Law at the Public Law Institute (IDP) and a volunteer Professor of Commercial Law at the University of Brasilia (UnB). E-mail: amandathayde@gmail.com.

Ana Frazão is a Law Professor at the UnB. She holds a PhD in Law from the Pontifical Catholic of São Paulo, a LLM from the UnB and a BA from the UnB. She is a private attorney and was a Commissioner at the CADE from 2012 to 2015. E-mail: frazao@unb.br.

Angelo Gamba Prata de Carvalho is a Law student at the UnB and former trainee at the CADE.

Ania Thiemann is the Head of Global Relations at the OECD's Competition Division. She is also in charge of the OECD Competition Committee's Working Party N°2 on Competition and Regulation. Before joining the OECD in 2009, she was Senior Economist at the Economist Intelligence Unit in London from 2000–2009. Ania holds an MSc in Economics from Birkbeck College, University of London; an MPhil in International Relations and Strategy from the Panthéon Sorbonne, Paris I; and an MSc in European Studies and International Relations from the London School of Economics. Ania. Thiemann@oecd.org.

Antonio Gomes is Head of the Competition Division at the OECD since November 2016. He has been President of the Portuguese Competition Authority (2013-2016), having previously served as a Senior Competition Expert in the OECD's Competition Division in 2013. Prior to joining the OECD in 2013, he was Director of the Merger Department of the Portuguese Competition Authority. Since 2005, he has been an Assistant Professor at the Universidade de Aveiro, Portugal. Antonio Gomes holds a Doctorate Degree in Economics from the University of York, United Kingdom, and Master's Degrees in Economics from the University of York and the Universidade Nova de Lisboa.

Carlos Mena Labarthe is Head of the Investigation Authority in the Federal Economic Competition Commission and university professor. The following opinions are expressed in a personal capacity and with the freedom that an academic discussion allows. As former Head of the Planning, Institutional Relations and International Affairs Unit, and former Director General for Cartels, comments may reflect such experience.

Cynthia Andino is of-counsel at AntiTrust Consultores & Abogados®, Quito-Ecuador. She holds a Master in Droit des Affaires from the University of Strasbourg 14', a European Master in Transnational Trade Law and Finance from the University of Deusto and the University of Tilburg 13'. She also has an International Commerce degree from the Universidad Americana of Asunción 09'. Mrs. Andino participated in the Commission that drafted Paraguay's Competition Law. The author thanks the contribution of Charles Reeves and David Sperber. The views hereby expressed are exclusively of the author and do not necessarily reflect those of the aforementioned organizations.

David A. Sperber is a Partner at AntiTrust Consultores & Abogados, Quito – Ecuador www.antitrust.ec. He holds a Juris Doctor from the Pontificia Universidad Católica del Ecuador '01, an LLM from Harvard Law School '02, and a PhD from Universidad de Barcelona '12. He teaches law at the Universidad Internacional del Ecuador.

Eduardo Caminati Anders is the Partner at Lino, Beraldi, Belluzzo and Caminati Advogados, Head of the Antitrust area. He is the Chairman of the Board of Directors of

Brazilian Institute of Studies of Competition, Consumer and International Trade – IBRAC and a member of the Applied Corporate Law Institute – IDSA. He was Chairman of the Commission on Competition Studies and Economic Regulation (CECORE) of the Brazilian Bars Association – Sao Paulo Section (OAB-SP) (2010/2012). He graduated from the Faculty of Law of the USP in 1999.

Eugênia Cristina Nilsen Ribeiro Barza is Associate Professor at Recife Law School of the Federal University of Pernambuco, where she teaches Private International Law, International Trade Law and Latin American Integration Law. She holds a PhD, a LLM and a Law degree from the Federal University of Pernambuco. She leads the research group Regional Integration, Globalization and International Law.

Fabián Pettigrew is economist from Mar del Plata University, Argentina. Member of the Board of the *Comisión Nacional de Defensa de la Competencia*. Argentina. During his mandate he was in charge of this investigation. Currently, he is an independent consultant in competition issues.

Francisco Javier Núñez Melgoza worked for more than twenty-two years in the antitrust agency of the Mexican government. He was Director General of Mergers of the former Federal Competition Commission (CFC) and Commissioner of the Federal Economic Competition Commission (COFECE). He is currently economic consultant and university professor.

Germán Enrique Bacca Medina is currently a Commisioner of the Communications Regulation Commission of Colombia. He is a lawyer from Universidad Externado de Colombia and holds a Specialist Diploma in Finance and Securities Law from the same University, an LLM degree in Communications and Computer Law from Queen Mary University of London and a Postgraduate Diploma in Economics for Competition Law from King's College University of London. Prior to his current position, he served as Deputy Superintendent for Antitrust at the Superintendence of Industry and Commerce and Deputy Superintendent for Data Protection at the same entity. He has also worked as Senior Competition Associate at the law firm Philippi Prietocarrizosa Ferrero DU & Uría in Bogotá.

Graciela Miralles is a Competition Specialist at the Trade and Competitiveness Global Practice of the World Bank Group. In this function, she has been involved in a wide variety of operational and analytical projects to promote competition policy reforms across countries in Latin America, East Asia Pacific, Europe and Central Asia, Middle East and North Africa. Graciela holds a PhD from the European University Institute (Florence, Italy), an LLM in European Community Law from the College of Europe (Bruges, Belgium); and an LLM in Comparative, European, and International Laws from the European University Institute. Dr. Miralles is a member of the Academic Society for Competition law (ASCOLA) and a qualified lawyer since 2003.

Guilherme de Aguiar Falco is a Competition lawyer and Economist with extensive experience in international antitrust cases, especially focusing on the Latin America

region. Guilherme holds graduate degrees from Columbia University (LLM) and the Universidade Federal de Sao Carlos (MA in Applied Economics) as well as bachelor degrees in Law (Pontificia Universidade Catolica de Sao Paulo) and Economics (Universidade de Sao Paulo). Guilherme is currently working as a consultant for the World Bank Group.

Guilherme Teno Castilho Missali is a Senior Associate at Lino, Beraldi, Belluzzo and Caminati Advogados, focusing its activities on the Antitrust front. He is a member of the Brazilian Institute of Studies of Competition, Consumer and International Trade – IBRAC and a member of the CECORE of the Brazilian Bars Association – Sao Paulo Section (OAB-SP). He is currently attending Master Degree in Commercial Law at Faculty of Law of the USP. He is specialized in Compliance by Getúlio Vargas Foundation (FGV) and graduated from the Faculty of Law of the USP in 2011. He is the cofounder of the study group called "NECSO" at Faculty of Law of the USP that studies the interplay between sociology and competition.

James Mancini is an Analyst in the OECD's Competition Division. James has previously worked as an Economist specializing in competition litigation and policy analysis at PricewaterhouseCoopers Canada as well as NERA Economic Consulting. He has also served as an Economist at the Canadian federal Department of Finance and at a provincial utilities regulator. James holds an MSc in Economics from the London School of Economics.

Javier Tapia is currently Judge of the Chilean Competition Tribunal (Tribunal de Defensa de la Libre Competencia de Chile or TDLC) and academic of the Postgraduate School at the Universidad de Chile, School of Law. He also teaches in other universities in Chile and abroad. Javier holds a Law degree from Universidad de Chile, School of Law; a PhD from University College of London, U.K.; an MSc. in Regulation from The London School of Economics and Political Sciences, U.K.; and a Diploma in Torts from Universidad de Chile. Javier is the corresponding author: jtapia02@gmail.com

Julián Peña is a partner at Allende & Brea since 2004. He graduated as a lawyer from the Universidad Católica Argentina in 1995. He was legal adviser to the Ministry of Economy (1996/2004), having advised different Ministers and Secretaries of Trade. He has also worked at the Argentine Antitrust Commission (1999/2001). He is Professor of Competition Law at Universidad de Buenos Aires and was Visiting Professor at the University of Florida (2009). Mr. Peña is founder and moderator of ForoCompetencia, an antitrust community with more than 550 members from more than twenty countries. Peña is also officer of the IBA's Antitrust Committee; a member of the International Task Force of the ABA's Section of Antitrust Law; and an international advisor of the American Antitrust Institute. He co-edited the book "Competition Law in Latin America. A Practical Guide" (with Marcelo Calliari, 2016) and is the author of "Control de Concentraciones Económicas" (2002) and of numerous articles, chapters and columns on antitrust and trade law. He has lectured on antitrust and trade issues at various universities and conferences.

Lucia Villarán Elias is a competition lawyer at the Competition Policy Cluster at the Trade and Competitiveness Global Practice of the World Bank Group. Lucia has extensive and applied experience on antitrust and regulatory sectoral frameworks worldwide, with focus on the Latin America region. Education: University of Michigan and Pontifícia Universidad Católica del Perú.

Marcelo Cesar Guimarães is currently a LLM candidate at Recife Law School of the Federal University of Pernambuco, specializing in International Competition Law. He holds a law degree from the same institution. In 2016 he was visiting researcher at the Centre d'études sur l'intégration et la mondialisation of the Université du Québec à Montréal.

Martha Martinez Licetti is the Lead Economist and Global Lead of the Competition Policy Cluster for the Trade and Competitiveness Global Practice at the World Bank Group, where she oversees a portfolio of more than fifty countries. She has more than fifteen years of experience in industrial organization, economic regulation and competition policy. She has held leading positions in the private and public sectors, including at the competition authority and the telecommunications regulator in her native Peru. She has lectured in industrial organization, network regulation, antitrust and economic analysis of law. Education: Northeastern University in Boston (Massachusetts), University of Austin (Texas) and Pontificia Universidad Catolica del Peru.

Marcela Mattiuzzo was Advisor and Chief of Staff at the Office of the Presidency at CADE (2015-2016). She is a Master's of Laws Candidate at the University of São Paulo, from were she holds a Law degree, and was a Visiting Researcher at Yale Law School (2016-2017). She is also a researcher at ITS Rio, with work focused on privacy and personal data regulation, and a partner at VMCA, a consultancy firm specialized in competition policy, compliance, and regulatory advocacy.

Pablo Márquez is a partner at Márquez, Barrera, Castañeda & Ramirez. Before joining the firm, Pablo served as Chairman of the Commission for the Regulation of Communications and Superintendent for Antitrust in Colombia. He holds a PhD in Competition Law for the University of Oxford, an LLM in Law from Harvard, an MSc in Economics, a BPhil and a BA in Law from Universidad Javeriana.

Pablo Reja Sánchez is a former UNPD Consultant at the CADE, University Professor and PhD student in International Law from the UnB, Master in International Relations at the State University of Paraiba/UnB and BA from the University of Granada. Erasmus exchange at University of Paris II Panthéon-Assas (2010/2011).

Pierre Horna is responsible for the design, formulation and implementation of technical assistance and capacity building programs on competition and consumer protection laws and policies for selected developing countries in the ASEAN, Balkan, CIS and Latin American regions. He is the legal affairs official at the Competition and Consumer Policies Branch at UNCTAD Mr. Horna has doctorate studies in International Competition Law at the University of Geneva, Switzerland. Master of

Editor and Contributors

Laws in International Business Law from Leiden University, The Netherlands with thesis on the developmental dimension of expanding WTO covered agreements into Competition Policy (2002) and studies on E-commerce and consumer protection at the Buckingham University, England (2001). Visiting research fellow at Oxford's Centre for Competition Law and Policy and Senior Associate at Pembroke College, University of Oxford.

Rosana Aragón Plaza is a Policy Analyst at the OECD's Competition Division. She is based at the OECD Mexico Center. Before joining the OECD in 2016, Rosana was a competition counsel at a major Brussels law firm. She holds an LLM from Harvard Law School and an LLM in EU law and economic analysis from the College of Europe; she obtained degrees in law and international relations from Universidad Pontificia Comillas de Madrid (ICADE).

Tanja Goodwin is an Economist in the Trade and Competitiveness Global Practice of the World Bank Group. She focuses on analytics and technical assistance in procompetition sectoral regulation and on the implementation of competition policy. Before joining the World Bank Group, Tanja worked at private and public research institutes in Germany and in Latin America. Education: New York University and University of Tuebingen.

Vanessa Facuse is former Head of the Litigation Division at the Chilean Competition Agency (Fiscalía Nacional Económica or FNE). She teaches competition law in the MBA program at Universidad Diego Portales. Vanessa holds a law degree from Universidad de Chile, School of Law, a Master in IT Law and Telecommunications from Universidad de Chile, and a Diploma in Administrative Law from the same university.

Vinicius Marques de Carvalho was President of the CADE from 2012 till 2016. He is also Professor of Law at the USP and holds a PhD in Law from both the USP and the University Paris I (Panthéon-Sorbonne). After leaving the authority, Vinicius was a Yale Greenberg World Fellow and is now the managing partner at VMCA, a consultancy firm specialized in competition policy, compliance, and regulatory advocacy.

Foreword

António Gomes

Competition Policy, Enforcement and Welfare in Latin America

Several countries in Latin America have undergone important economic and social transformation in the past two decades, engaging in reforms to favour open market economies which included the adoption of competition laws.

In the 90s and the 2000s, countries such as Argentina, Mexico, Brazil, Chile and Colombia, which have had competition laws for decades, have significantly modernized their competition laws whilst several countries introduced modern competition laws. More recently, further improvements based on national experience and international best practices were introduced, as is the case of the reforms of 2011 in Brazil or 2013 and 2014 in Mexico.

Effective competition is critical to guarantee a dynamic business environment and to deliver consumer welfare through lower prices, better quality and greater choice.

Competition among businesses can deliver efficiency improvements and brings newer and better products to consumers through innovation, leading to gains in productivity, competitiveness and economic growth. But a competitive environment with adequate competition rules and robust institutions also contributes to improve business confidence or to reduce the risk of corruption. Competition benefits not only consumers, but also firms, the State and taxpayers.

The OECD has been engaged in the development of competition law and policy in the region for many years. This has taken several forms. First, in partnership with the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB), the OECD has established, in 2003, the Latin American and Caribbean Competition Forum (LACCF). This Forum has been contributing to stronger and more effective competition law enforcers and advocates for pro-competitive reform, through the sharing of experiences and establishment of best practices in the region. The success of the LACCF also shows the growing importance

of regional cooperation as the economies in the region become more and more interdependent.

Second, the OECD has supported several countries in identifying scope for improvement in their competition frameworks, through reviews which have often served as guidance for implemented reforms (Argentina, 2009; Brazil, 2005 and 2010; Chile, 2004, 2010, 2014; Colombia, 2009, 2016; Costa Rica, 2014; El Salvador, 2008; Honduras, 2011; Mexico, 2004; Panama, 2010; Peru, 2004; as well as follow up, in 2007 and 2012, of the recommendations in previous peer reviews in Latin America).

Lastly, in many countries in the region, the OECD has been providing capacity building in competition policy and enforcement, promoting the fight against bidrigging, and also developing competition assessment of legislation and regulation which may unduly restrict competition.

This book brings together authors with extensive experience in Latin America, who bring their first hand experience and insight on the developments in competition law and policy in the region. It will serve as a testament to the impressive changes that have strengthened competition laws and institutions in recent years to the benefit of consumers and the economies of the majority of countries in Latin America. By doing so, this book will certainly contribute to shaping our views on how competition law and policy will, or should, evolve in the years to come.

Presentation

Vinícius Marques de Carvalho

A New Era for Competition Policy in Latin America

The new competition legislation in place in Brazil since 2012 significantly changed the structure of the Administrative Council for Economic Defense (CADE) in its capacity of watchdog for competition law, including merger control, unilateral conduct and antitrust sanctions. The overall numbers are quite impressive: CADE has drastically reduced the average time analysis for merger review and has exponentially increased the number of anticompetitive practices condemnations. The new legal framework enabled CADE to become one of the most important competition authorities in the world.

Nevertheless, the Brazilian experience is not a sole man journey in the region. This trend of boosting competition enforcement may be noticed thorough Latin America. The Mexican recent reform is surely an interesting example, as the new institutional setup allows for greater competition enforcement policy in line with what was experienced in Brazil.

This book sheds light on the increasing role of competition law and policy in Latin America. In twenty chapters, including contributions from Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Ecuador, El Salvador, Mexico and Paraguay, the readers will have the chance to confirm the trend mentioned above, which became a reality in a very short time. In addition, contributions from experts with great experience from international organizations, such as the OECD, UNCTAD and the World Bank, complements the national experiences shared by local competition experts. In total, thirty-one competition experts participated in the endeavor.

The book is divided into three sections: (i) Institutional setups and advocacy efforts; (ii) Enforcement experiences, including anticompetitive practices and merger control; and (iii) International cooperation.

In a first section, new Latin American setups for competition policy are presented, including the recent legislation changes in Mexico and Paraguay. Some

different advocacy initiatives are also addressed in other contributions, for instance those related to compliance in Brazil as well as efforts lead by the World Bank and the OECD in the region. The section reflects the constant effort to improve the governing rules about competition protection in the Latin America.

A second section focus on the analysis of concrete enforcement experiences in Latin America. It includes chapters covering predatory pricing, the use of indirect evidences, liability of company directors, bid-rigging, among others. The authors did not hesitate to put forward some difficult issues in the daily life of a competition authority, which may assist other competition authorities in the region to seek for solutions to similar challenges.

Finally, a third section will serve to illustrate international cooperation efforts in the region. It demonstrates the importance of international cooperation for competition protection, as well as ways to improve international cooperation among Latin American countries. Cooperation in enforcement activities, future of competition policy within Mercour and Trans-Pacific Partnership are topics addressed in this section

In a nutshell, competition law and policy in Latin America have taken huge steps towards development in the last decade, which enables us to speak of a "New Era" for competition enforcement in the region. Companies should be aware of this trend in order to increase efforts to comply with competition legislation, which are subject to modern investigation techniques and heavy fines.

Summary of Contents

Editor dia Contributoro	
Foreword António Gomes	XXV
Presentation Vinícius Marques de Carvalho	xxvii
Part I Institutional Setups and Advocacy Efforts	1
CHAPTER 1 New Competition Policy in Mexico Carlos Mena Labarthe	3
Снартек 2 New Competition Policy in Argentina Julián Peña	37
CHAPTER 3 New Competition Policy in Paraguay Cynthia Andino	45
CHAPTER 4 Antitrust Compliance Programs – The Brazilian Experience Marcela Mattiuzzo	59

Summary of Contents

CHAPTER 5 The Dissemination of the Competition Culture in Brazil: The Role Played	
by Civil Associations Eduardo Caminati Anders & Guilherme Teno Castilho Missali	73
CHAPTER 6 Trends and Developments in Competition Advocacy in Latin America Martha Martínez Licetti, Lucía Villarán & Tanja Goodwin	85
CHAPTER 7 Pro-competitive Regulatory Assessment in Latin America Ania Thiemann, James Mancini & Rosana Aragón Plaza	111
Part II Enforcement Experiences: Anticompetitive Practices and Merger Control	133
CHAPTER 8 Bid Rigging in Public Procurement in Colombia: Evolution and Challenges Germán Enrique Bacca Medina	135
CHAPTER 9 Predatory Pricing Policy for Latin American Emerging Economies Pablo Márquez	151
Chapter 10 Bid Rigging in Ecuador David A. Sperber	187
CHAPTER 11 The Case of Automotive Market in a Special Customs Area of Argentina Alejandro Lucero & Fabián Pettigrew	197
CHAPTER 12 Exchanges of Information in Competition Law: The Chilean (Incipient) Experience Javier Tapia & Vanessa Facuse	205
CHAPTER 13 Ten Years Fighting Cartels: The Case of El Salvador Aldo Henrique Cáder Camilot	227
CHAPTER 14 The Use of Indirect Evidences in the Fight Against Cartels in Brazil Paulo Burnier da Silveira & Pablo Reja Sánchez	233

CHAPTER 16 The Relation Between Antitrust and Intellectual Property Law on CADE's Case Law Ana Frazão & Angelo Gamba Prata de Carvalho CHAPTER 17 Merger Control in Mexico: Development and Outlook Francisco Javier Núñez Melgoza PART III
Merger Control in Mexico: Development and Outlook Francisco Javier Núñez Melgoza 269
DART III
International Cooperation 283
CHAPTER 18 Regional Coordination in Cartel Investigations: The Liquid Oxygen Case Pierre Horna 285
Chapter 19 The Defense of Competition in Mercosur Eugênia Cristina Nilsen Ribeiro Barza & Marcelo Cesar Guimarães 315
CHAPTER 20 Implications of the Trans-Pacific Partnership for Competition Policy Martha Martínez Licetti, Graciela Miralles Murciego & Guilherme de Aguiar Falco 329
Index 361

Table of Contents

Editor 6	114 00		
Foreword António Gomes			XXV
Present.		ques de Carvalho	xxvii
PART I Instituti	ional S	Setups and Advocacy Efforts	25
	mpet	ition Policy in Mexico Labarthe	3
§1.01	Intro	duction	3
§1.02	Over	view of the Evolution of Competition Law in Mexico	4
	[A]	First Competition Provisions	4
	[B]	First Competition Law. The Real Emergence of a	
		Competition Law	4
	[C]	The Strengthening of Competition Law	6
		[1] Public Opinion as a Factor for Change	6
		[2] Relevant Cases	7
	[D]	Transformation Factors That Became Amendments	11
		[1] The 2006 Legal Reform	11
		[2] The 2011 Legal Reform digm Shift in Competition Law	13
§1.03	14		
	[A]	Political Context of the 2013 Constitutional Reform	14

15

17

The 2013 Constitutional Reform

[1] Incremental Powers

[B]