### COPYRIGHT 1913 BY THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO

## All Rights Reserved

Published September 1913
Second Impression October 1913
Third Impression November 1913
Fourth Impression September 1914
Fifth Impression October 1914
Second Edition October 1915
Second Impression September 1916
Third Impression May 1917
Fourth Impression September 1919
Fifth Impression November 1919
Sixth Impression July 1920
Seventh Impression October 1920
Seighth Impression September 1921
Ninth Impression March 1922

Composed and Printed By The University of Chicago Press Chicago, Illinois, U.S.A.

# MATERIALS FOR THE STUDY OF ELEMENTARY ECONOMICS

### PREFACE

The materials collected in this volume are intended to acquaint the student with economic principles as they are manifested in the tangible facts of economic life. A few extracts of primarily theoretical character have been included to represent important aspects of contemporary or historic thought: but for the most part the selections are not so much authoritative formulations of economic laws as concrete case-material embodying such laws, or affording a background of information which the systematic treatises on economics can hardly give and which the teacher certainly cannot often assume that his students will possess. Various sources have been drawn upon, including not only the writings of recognized economists but also official literature of governmental and private organizations, commercial and financial periodicals, and the daily press. Some of the material has been prepared especially for this book. As regards form, the selections comprise expository and descriptive readings, statutes, judicial decisions, the findings of commissions, news reports, statistical tables. schematic analyses, and a number of maps, charts, and diagrams.

In the choice of the materials the editors have been guided by actual classroom experiment. The nucleus of the book was originally printed as a series of bulletins which have for three years formed a part of the reading required of beginning students in economics at the University of Chicago. During this time unsatisfactory selections have been eliminated and much new matter has been added. Copies of the bulletins have been submitted for criticism to teachers in several other institutions. The volume which now appears may thus be said already in a measure to have demonstrated its usefulness as an aid in college instruction.

The book is not designed to take the place of a systematic textbook. Rather, it should be used in conjunction with such a text. No attempt has been made to weld the readings into a hard-and-fast system. They have purposely been left to be utilized as the preference of the individual teacher may dictate. There has been no desire to dogmatize, or to force upon the student any particular interpretation of the evidence. In some cases conflicting views are set forth in different selections in order to stimulate critical thinking; and several extracts have been included precisely because they seem to involve unsound thinking, or a point of view so remote from the academic as to deserve consideration for that very reason.

The editors wish to acknowledge their obligation to the many authors and publishers who have kindly permitted the use of extracts from copyrighted publications. Every effort has been made to give due mention of author and publisher in each instance. Where a selection is stated to be "adapted from" the writings of a certain author the reader will understand, not that the changes from the original have necessarily been considerable, but simply that some change has been made for which the author is not accountable. Where no source is indicated for a selection, either by footnote or by the obvious nature of the topic, it may be understood that the editors assume responsibility.

L. C. M. C. W. W. J. A. F.

September, 1913

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

		PAGE
I.	Introductory	
	r. The Maladjustment of Man and Nature. T. N. Carver	I
	2. Man's Adaptation of His Environment. Max Nordau	8
	3. Ways of Getting a Living. T. N. Carver	10
	4. Competition and the Industrial Revolution. Arnold	
	Toynbee	11
	5. Exchange Co-operation. Adam Smith	17
II.	Wants and the Means of Their Satisfaction	
	6. A Study of Human Wants	20
	7. The Apportionment of Expenditures. F. H. Streightoff	27
	8. The Standard of Living. F. H. Streightoff	33
	9. A Normal Standard of Living. Massachusetts Com-	
	mission on the Cost of Living	37
	10. A Classification of the Means of Satisfying Wants.	
	T. N. Carver	41
	behind Property Rights. Irving Fisher	
	12. Forms of Wealth. Irving Fisher	42
	13. Forms of Property Rights. Irving Fisher	<b>4</b> 4
	14. Estimate of the Wealth of the United States. Special	44
	Census Report	45
	15. The Production of Economic Goods. J. A. Hobson .	45
	16. A Classification of Industries. J. A. Hobson	55
III.	NATURAL RESOURCES AS ECONOMIC FACTORS	
	17. The Function of Natural Agents. O. T. Mason	58
	18. The Influence of Geographic Factors. E. C. Semple.	61
	19. The Frontier in American History. F. J. Turner.	66
	20. An Illustration of the Law of Diminishing Returns .	73
	21. Factors Counteracting Diminishing Returns. J. S.	
	Mill	74
	Conservation. National Conservation Commission.	
	23. The Economic Possibilities of Conservation. L. C.	77
	Gray	102
	-197	

IV. Human Beings as Economic Factors	PAGE
24. Some Definitions of Labor	105
tion. J. S. Mill	106
Henry Gannett	108
27. The Malthusian Theory of Population	109
28. Economic Influences on the Marriage-Rate. G. U. Yule	<b>1</b> 11
29. The Quality of Population	
a) Non-Survival of the Fittest. W. R. Greg	112
b) Eugenics	118
30. The Cost to Society of a Family of Degenerates.  R. L. Dugdale	121
31. The Conservation of Human Energy. Irving Fisher	123
32. Causes of the Growth of Cities. A. F. Weber	134
33. Immigration to the United States, 1820-1912 (Chart).  Commissioner-General of Immigration.	137
34. Sources of Immigration and Character of Immigrants  Immigration Commission	138
35. Causes of Emigration. Immigration Commission	140
36. The Problems of Immigration. J. W. Jenks and W. J.	
Lauck	144
37. Immigration and the Birth-Rate. F. A. Walker 38. Fecundity of Native and Immigrant Women in Rhode	146
Island, 1900. Immigration Commission	<b>14</b> 9
mons	150
Immigration Commission	152
V. Capital Goods as Economic Factors	
41. The Roundabout Process. E. von Böhm-Bawerk	157
42. Machinery Used in the Making of Pins. Commissioner of Labor	158
43. Hand vs. Machine Methods. Commissioner of Labor	160
44. Machinery vs. Hand Labor in the Raising of Small	-00
Grains. Commissioner of Labor	161
45. Machine Methods in Agriculture. H. V. Quaintance	164
46. Relative Increase of Capital and Employees in Manufacturing	
47. Some Sources of the Supply of Capital. Wall Street	170
Journal	170

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
48. Capital-Demand and Supply. Journal of Commerce	172
49. What Is Meant by Depreciation. F. A. Delano	175
50. Inroads of War on the Savable Fund. Special Com-	-13
missioner of the Revenue	179
	-19
VI. THE ORGANIZATION OF INDUSTRY	
A. Specialization:	
51. Limitations of the Division of Labor. J. S. Mill	181
52. The Tin-Peddler and the Development of Connecti-	
cut Industries. R. M. Keir	182
53. Classification of Occupations. Census	183
54. Stages in the Production of Iron and Steel Products.	
Commissioner of Corporations	189
55. The Localization of Manufacturing Industries. Census	189
56. The Division of Labor in Pin-Making. Adam Smith	198
57. Division of Labor in Meat Packing. J. R. Commons	199
58. Division of Labor in the Shoe-Making Industry.	
Census	200
B. Management:	
59. The Problem of the Business Man	204
60. Problems of Farm Management. T. N. Carver	206
61. The Principles of Business Organization. The System	
Company	207
62. Scientific Management. F. W. Taylor	219
63. Criticisms of Scientific Management. H. S. Person .	228
64. Partnership Articles	233
65. Form of Corporation Charter	234
66. A Charter "Object Clause" (United States Steel Cor-	
poration)	236
67. Corporation Charters Granted Before 1800. S. E.	
Baldwin	238
68. The Holding Company. Interstate Commerce Com-	
mission	239
69. A Classification of Bonds. F. A. Cleveland	241
70. Examples of Typical Investment Securities	244
71. The Basis of Capitalization. Industrial Commission	252
72. Methods of Stock Watering. Industrial Commission	257
VII. Examples of Modern Capitalistic Organization	
A. Railroads:	
73. Transportation Costs in the Pioneer Middle West.	
Isaac Lippincott	259

	PAGE
74. Widening of the Market through Improved Transportation	260
75. The Relation of the Transportation Charge to Prices.	200
L. G. McPherson	261
76. Costs in Railroad Operation. J. F. Strombeck	266
77. Added Traffic Pays. A. M. Wellington	269
78. A Result of Railroad Competition. A. J. Cassatt .	269
79. Some Forms of Railroad Discrimination. Commissioner of Corporations	
sioner of Corporations	270
statutes	074
81. Railway Rate Theories of the Interstate Commerce	274
Commission. M. B. Hammond	286
82. Valuation of Public Utilities. Judicial decisions.	280
83. Suggestions for Effective Public Utility Regulation.	209
T 77 T	201
	291
B. Industrial Combinations:	
84. Forms of Combination. Industrial Commission	299
85. The Steel Rail Pool of 1887. Commissioner of Cor-	
porations	304
86. The Continental Wall Paper Company. Judicial	
decision	307
87. The American Tobacco Company. Commissioner of	
Corporations	308
88. The United States Steel Corporation. Commissioner	
of Corporations	313
89. The Steel Corporation Underwriting Agreement.	
Commissioner of Corporations	318
90. Companies Acquired by the United States Steel Cor-	
poration. Commissioner of Corporations	323
91. An Example of Trust Efficiency. Commissioner of	
Corporations	327
92. Proposed Remedies for the Evils of Trusts. Indus-	
trial Commission	329
93. Federal Anti-Trust Legislation	334
VIII. MARKETS AND TRADING	
94. Methods of Marketing. A. W. Shaw	240
95. Marketing Farm Products. Department of Agriculture	340
96. Retail Distribution of Farm Machinery. Commissioner	352
of Corporations	356
97. The Distributing System of the International Har-	330
vester Company. Commissioner of Corporations.	250
Company. Commissioner of Corporations .	359

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	98. Co-operative Fruit Marketing. Department of Agri-	PAGE
	culture	361
	99. Organized Exchanges: Grading of Commodities.	
	Commissioner of Corporations and others	364
	100. Organized Exchanges: Futures, Puts and Calls. Com-	
	missioner of Corporations	368
IX.	VALUE	
	101. Demand and General Overproduction. J. S. Mill.	371
	102. Advertising and Demand. A. W. Shaw	373
	103. The Ability of the Consumer to Defend Himself. P. T.	
	Cherington	374
	104. Some Cases of Demand and Supply. Daily Newspapers	376
	105. Demand and Supply in the Market for Agricultural	
	Products. H. C. Taylor	380
	106. Organized Speculation and Its Regulation. H. H.	
	Brace	391
	107. A Cost Diagram	396
	108. Items Entering into Cost. W. C. Redfield	397
	109. Analysis of the Retail Price of Eggs. C. W. Thompson	407
	110. Middlemen's Charges in Marketing Agricultural Prod-	_
	ucts. T. N. Carver	408
	111. Costs in the Retailing of Shoes. Harvard Bureau of	
	Business Research	410
	112. Prices to the Small Purchaser. F. H. Streightoff.	414
	113. Package Goods. Massachusetts Commission on the	
v	Cost of Living	415
	Roard	
	Board	417
	horations	0
	porations	418
	117. Diminishing Cost of Production. Wall Street Journal	419
	118. Joint and Composite Demand and Supply (Diagram).	421
	119. The Complexity of Competitive Price Making. J. M.	422
	Clark	422
	120. Selling Below Cost: Tobacco. Commissioner of Cor-	422
	borations	426
	porations	426
	122. Monopoly Price: Coffee Valorization. Robert Sloss.	429
	123. Discriminating Prices: Oil. Commissioner of Cor-	4-9
	porations	436
	124. The Burden of Advertising Costs. P. T. Cherington	430

		PAGE
X.	Money and Prices	
	125. Exchange by Barter. W. S. Jevons	443
	126. The Early History of Money. W. S. Jevons	445
	127. A Monetary Chronology. U.S. Treasury circular .	451
	128. History of Coins and Currency of the United States.	
9	U.S. Treasury circular	452
	129. Redemption of United States Money. U.S. Treasury	
	circular	455
	130. Legal-Tender Qualities of United States Money. U.S.	
	Treasury circular	456
	131. Statement of United States Money in Circulation.	
	U.S. Treasury bulletin	457
	132. Principles of Token Money. Indianapolis Monetary	
	Commission	458
	133. Production of Gold and Silver since 1492. U.S.	
	Treasury circular	461
	134. Commercial Ratio of Silver to Gold Annually since	
	1687. U.S. Treasury circular	462
	135. Gresham's Law: French Coinage 1817-69 (Diagram)	463
	136. Increase in the World's Production of Gold, 1800–1906.	
	National Conservation Commission	464
	137. The Increased Cost of Living. Massachusetts Com-	
	mission on the Cost of Living	466
	138. The Correction of Price-Changes. David Kinley	474
	139. A Compensated Dollar. Irving Fisher	474
	140. The Compensated Dollar: A Criticism. F. W. Taussig 141. Methods of Regulating a Paper Currency. W. S.	479
		.0.
	Jevons	483
	Ramsay	485
	143. Table of the Depreciation of the Continental Currency.	405
	Thomas Jefferson	492
	144. Greenback Prices During the Civil War (Diagram).	492
	W. C. Mitchell	493
	145. Depreciated Paper Money in the Confederacy. G. C.	790
	Eggleston	493
	146. Depreciated Money and Wage-Earners: The Strike at	
	Iquique. J. L. Laughlin	496
XI.	CREDIT AND BANKING	
	147. Credit Instruments	499
	148. The Use of Credit Instruments. David Kinley	500
	149. The Clearing House. J. G. Cannon	<b>50</b> 3
		1

	TABLE OF CONTENTS	xiii
		PAGE
	150. The Journey of a Check. J. G. Cannon	512
	151. Weekly Statement by the Federal Reserve Board.	
	Commercial and Financial Chronicle	514
	152. Weekly Statement of New York Clearing-House Banks	516
	153. Statements of Typical American Banks	518
	154. Number of Private, State, and National Banks, 1877-	
	1909 (Diagram). G. E. Barnett	522
	155. Statements of the Bank of England, The Bank of	
	France, and the Reichsbank	523
	156. The Elasticity of Currency. Indianapolis Monetary	
	Commission	525
	157. A Summary View of the Work of the Independent	
	Treasury. David Kinley	531
	158. Bankers' Views of Our Banking and Currency Needs.	
	American Bankers' Association	535
	159. The Federal Reserve Act of December 23, 1913	539
	160. The Case against State Guaranty of Bank Deposits.	
	A. P. Andrew	545
XII.	INTERNATIONAL TRADE AND FOREIGN EXCHANGE	
	161. The Foreign Trade of the United States, 1912-13.	
	Journal of Commerce	547
	162. The Trade Balance of the United States. George Paish	549
	163. The Balance of Trade and Gold Shipments. Wall	
	Street Journal	<b>55</b> 9
	164. Commercial Credits in the Financing of Imports and	
	Exports. Franklin Escher	<b>55</b> 9
	165. A Documentary Commercial Long Bill	566
	166. The Par of Exchange and Approximate Gold Points .	566
	167. Foreign Exchange Transactions. Howard K. Brooks.	567
	168. Foreign Exchange Quotations. Howard K. Brooks .	568
	169. The Foreign Exchange Market. Franklin Escher	570
	170. Factors Affecting the Rates of Foreign Exchange.	
	Journal of Commerce	574
XIII.	TARIFF POLICY	
	171. A Summary of the Tariff History of the United States	578
	172. Principal Sources of Customs Revenue, 1912. Statistical	
	Abstract of the United States	585
	173. The Balance of Trade and Protection	
	a) A Mercantilist Point of View. Charles King	585
	b) An American Argument. Association of Wool Manu-	
	facturers	590
	A Linux Manhat Angumant III III and I amount	2220

		PAGE
	175. Improved Transportation and Protection	
	a) An American Campaign Argument. Republican	
	Campaign Text-Book	<b>5</b> 91
	b) A Spanish Analogy. Frédéric Bastiat	592
	176. Two proposals for Increasing the Demand for Labor.	
	Frédéric Bastiat	<b>5</b> 93
	177. The Law of Comparative Costs and the Working of the	
	Tariff. F. W. Taussig	597
*****		• ,
XIV.	Rent	
	178. The Origin of Agricultural Rent. F. M. Taylor.	<b>60</b> 9
	179. Rent Diagrams	617
	180. Some Factors Affecting Land Values. R. M. Hurd.	620
	181. Railroads and Land Values. I. D. Andrews	627
	182. Land Valuation. R. M. Hurd	628
	183. Car-Fares and Suburban Site-Values. Grosvenor Atter-	
	bury	634
	184. The Value of a Chicago Quarter-Acre, 1830-94. Illinois	
	Bureau of Labor Statistics	635
	185. Examples of Real Estate Transactions. Chicago	
	Daily Tribune	639
XV.	Wages	
	186. Labor as a Source of Income. F. H. Streightoff.	640
	187. Two Early Theories of Wages	040
	a) A Cost of Subsistence Theory of Wages. David	
	Ricardo	643
	b) The Wages Fund. James Mill	645
	J. S. Mill	646
	188. Wages and Hours of Labor. Statistical Abstract of the	040
	United States	647
	189. Women's Work and Wages. J. A. Hobson	647
	190. Time Wages and Piece Wages. Industrial Commission	
	191. Wage Systems and Labor Management. C. B. Going	66 <sub>1</sub>
	191. Wage Systems and Babot Management. C. D. Going	001
XVI.	LABOR PROBLEMS	
	192. Purposes of the American Federation of Labor.	
	Official statement	668
	193. Structure of the American Federation of Labor (Dia-	
	gram). Official report	670
	194. Membership of the American Federation of Labor.	-1-
	Official report	671
	195. Union Charters Issued by the American Federation of	- 4 =
	Labor. Official report	67 т

	the second secon	LAGE
	196. Extracts from the Constitution of the International Union United Mine Workers	672
	197. Joint Interstate Agreement of Coal Operators and	
	Miners. Text of the Official Agreement	683
	198. A Piece-Work Wage-Scale Agreement. Potters' Asso-	
		691
	ciation	091
		,
ž	Machinery. Industrial Commission	693
	200. The Dayton Employers' Association. A. C. Marshall	694
	201. The National Founders' Association. Official pamphlet	695
	202. The United Typothetae of America. Official pamphlet	698
	203. Industrial Unionism and the Industrial Workers of	
	the World. Vincent St. John	700
	204. Statistics of the Extent of Strikes. U.S. Commissioner	•
	of Labor	705
	205. Causes of Strikes. U.S. Commissioner of Labor	706
	206. Estimates of Losses Due to Strikes and Lockouts	700
	a) Twenty Years of Losses from Strikes and Lockouts.	
	U.S. Commissioner of Labor	708
	b) Losses from the Anthracite Coal Strike of 1902.	
	Anthracite Coal Strike Commission	708
	207. Unemployment and a Proposed Solution of the Prob-	
	lem. Royal Commission on the Poor Laws	709
	208. Seasonal Unemployment (Chart)	715
	209. Long Hours versus Efficiency. Josephine Goldmark.	716
	210. The Sweating System. Industrial Commission	721
	211. The Economic Theory of a Legal Minimum Wage.	122
	Sidney Webb	
	212. The Minnesota Minimum Wage Law of 1913. Minne-	723
	sota statutes	733
	213. Machinery and the Quality of Labor. J. A. Hobson.	737
	214. Employers' Liability. G. L. Campbell	747
	215. A Survey of Workingmen's Insurance in the United	
	States. C. R. Henderson	756
	216. Summary of Workingmen's Insurance Laws in Ger-	
	many. L. K. Frankel and M. M. Dawson	761
XVII.	Interest	
	217. Theories of Interest. Irving Fisher	762
	William Smart	
	W WWWIII STILLT	764
	218. Interest Rates. W. A. Scott	773
×1	219. Conditions in the Money Market. Journal of Com-	
	merce	783

		PAGE
	220. Differences in Rates of Interest on Public Loans	
	a) Special Census Report	785
	b) Statistical Abstract of the United States	785
	221. Table of Bond Values	786
	222. The Relation of Interest Rates to Rising or Falling	
	Prices. H. G. Brown	787
	223. The Theory of Bond Values During a Rising-Price Era.	
	W. E. Clark	788
VVIII	Profits	
AVIII.		
	224. Walker's Theory of Profits. F. A. Walker	790
	225. The Risk Theory of Profits. F. B. Hawley	795
	226. Classes of Risks to Capital. A. H. Willett	796
	227. The Classes of Risk-Takers. F. B. Hawley	799
	228: Hedging as an Insurance against Risk. Commissioner	0
	of Corporations	801
	229. Fire Insurance and Credit. S. S. Huebner	807
	230. Embarrassment of Industry through Lack of Insurance.	0
	Journal of Commerce	810
	231. Some Functions and Effects of Insurance. John	0
	Haynes	811
	232. Financial Statements of Two Corporations. Annual	814
	reports	014
	233. Monopoly Profits: The Tobacco Trust. Commissioner	818
	of Corporations	010
		818
	sioner of the Revenue	010
	235. The Profits of an Underwriting Syndicate. Commissioner of Corporations	819
	236. A Classification of Business Failures by Causes. Brad-	010
	street's	822
	237. Two Instances of Failure. Financial journals	823
	237. Two instances of Fandre. Financial journals	023
XIX.	PUBLIC FINANCE AND TAXATION	
	238. The Growth of State and Local Expenditures. W. F.	
	Gephart	824
	239. Federal Expenditures (Chart)	828
	240. The Cost of Government, National, State, and Local.	
	E. V. D. Robinson	829
	241. Total Debt of the United States, National, State, and	
	Local (Diagram). Special Census Report	841
	242. Public Debt of the United States, 1791-1911 (Chart):	84:
	243. Public Debt of the United States, and of Cash in the	, .
	Treasury, 1915. U.S. Treasury Bulletin	843

	TABLE OF CONTENTS	xvii
		PAGE
	244. Total and Per Capita Debt of Certain Countries.  Statistical Abstract of the United States	846
	245. Principal Sources of Ordinary Federal Revenues by Decades, 1800–1910 (Chart)	847
	246. The Adequacy of the Customs Revenue System. R. F. Hoxie	847
	247. Some General Difficulties in Our State Systems of Taxation. E. R. A. Seligman	853
	248. A System of State and Local Taxes and Their Apportionment. Minnesota Tax Commission	855
	249. The General Property Tax. Special Committee, Inter-	860
	national Tax Association	
	Tax Commission	862
	251. Taxation of Corporations. Commissioner of Corpora-	864
	tions	865
	253. Income Taxes	870
	a) The Federal Income Tax	874
	Commission	876
	254. Separation of State and Local Revenues. Minnesota Tax Commission	880
	255. The Taxes on Land in Western Canada. Minnesota Tax Commission	883
	256. The Single-Tax Argument. C. B. Fillebrown	889
	257. The Land-Value Tax as a Social Reform. Fels Fund	894
XX.	Some Programs of Social Reform	
	258. Profit-Sharing in the N. O. Nelson Manufacturing Company. N. O. Nelson	898
	259. Profit-Sharing and Labor-Copartnership. T.C. Taylor	899
	260. A Promising Venture in Industrial Partnership. R. F. Foerster	901
	261. The Róchdale Plan of Co-operation. James Ford .	904
	262. Co-operative Creameries. James Ford	905
	263. Co-operative Stores. James Ford	907
	264. Causes of the Failure of Co-operative Stores in America.  I. B. Cross	908
	265. Wastes in the Competitive Distribution of Milk	
	266. Socialism. O. D. Skelton	911
	267. The National Platform of the Socialist Party	

xvii

## I. INTRODUCTORY

# I. THE MALADJUSTMENT OF MAN AND NATURE

The question, Why do things have the power to satisfy wants? would lead us back through physiology and psychology quite to the borders of the unknowable. The question, Why are they scarce? would lead us also toward the unknowable, but by a somewhat different route. Into this philosophical hinterland of his science the economist has generally refrained from bursting lest he should be found poaching upon the preserves of the philosopher; but there are some things in this region which, when seen through the eyes of the economist, may come to have a new significance.

Of course the first and most obvious reason for the scarcity of goods is that nature has not provided them in sufficient abundance to satisfy all the people who want them. Of some things, it is true, she is bounteous in her supply; but of others she is niggardly. Things which are so bountifully supplied as to satisfy all who want them do not figure as wealth, or economic goods, because we do not need to economize in their use. But things which are scantily supplied must be meted out and made to go as far as possible. That is what it means to economize. Because we must practice economy with respect to them they are called economic goods or wealth. In fact the whole economic system of society, the whole system of production, of valuation, of exchange, of distribution, and of consumption, is concerned with this class of goods—toward increasing their supply and making the existing supply go as far as possible in the satisfaction of wants.

The fact that there are human wants for whose satisfaction nature does not provide in sufficient abundance—in other words, the fact of scarcity—signifies that man is, to that extent at least, out of harmony with nature. The desire for fuel, clothing, and shelter grows out of the fact that the climate is more severe than our bodies are fitted to endure, and this alone argues a very considerable lack of harmony. The lack is only emphasized by the fact that it is necessary for us to labor and endure fatigue in order to provide ourselves with these means of protecting our bodies against

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Adapted from T. N. Carver, "The Economic Basis of the Problem of Evil," in *The Harvard Theological Review*, I, 98 ff. (January, 1

the rigors of nature. That labor also which is expended in the production of food means nothing if not that there are more mouths to be fed, in certain regions at least, than nature has herself provided for. She must therefore be subjugated, and compelled to yield larger returns than she is willing to do of her own accord. And that expanding multitude of desires, appetites, and passions which drive us as with whips; which send us to the ends of the earth after gewgaws with which to bedeck our bodies, and after new means of tickling the five senses; which make us strive to outshine our neighbors, or at least not to be outshone by them—these even more than our normal wants show how widely we have fallen out of any natural harmony which may supposedly have existed in the past.

That there is a deeper harmony lying hidden somewhere beneath these glaring disharmonies is quite possible. Certainly no one can positively assert that it is not so. It may be true, as some profoundly believe, that these natural discomforts, with the necessity for work which accompanies them, furnish a discipline which is necessary for our highest good. Being thus driven by a vis a tergo toward our own highest good, we may be in harmony with our surroundings in ways which do not appear to our immediate sense of self-interest. But this whole question lies within the field of philosophical conjecture, and nothing positive can be affirmed on either side.

Whatever our belief upon that point may be, there is not the slightest doubt that men are sometimes cold and hungry and sick; and that these discomforts would be much more frequent than they now are, if men did not work to prevent them. But work causes fatigue. Obviously the individual cannot be expected to see in this situation any sign of a complete harmony between himself and his material environment. So far as the individual can see and understand, the lack of harmony between himself and nature is a very real one.

Viewed from this standpoint, the whole economic struggle becomes an effort to attain to a harmony which does not naturally exist. As is well known, the characteristic difference between the non-economizing animals, on the one hand, and man, the economizer, on the other, is that in the process of adaptation the animals are passively adapted to their environment, whereas man assumes the active rôle in attempting to adapt his environment to himself. If the climate is cold, animals must develop fur or blubber; but man builds fires, constructs shelters, and manufactures clothing. If there are enemies to fight against, the animals must develop claws or fangs, horns or