GENERAL EDITORS: SHARON MACDONALD AND HELEN REES LEAHY

# MUSEUM Theory

**VOLUME EDITORS** 

Andrea Witcomb Kylie Message



WILEY Blackwell

General Editors: Sharon Macdonald and Helen Rees Leahy

## **Museum Theory**

Volume Editors

Andrea Witcomb and Kylie Message

WILEY Blackwell

This edition first published 2015 © 2015 John Wiley & Sons Ltd.

Registered Office

John Wiley & Sons Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, UK

Editorial Offices

350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA 9600 Garsington Road, Oxford, OX4 2DQ, UK

The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, UK

For details of our global editorial offices, for customer services, and for information about how to apply for permission to reuse the copyright material in this book please see our website at www.wiley.com/wiley-blackwell.

The right of Sharon Macdonald, Helen Rees Leahy, Andrea Witcomb, and Kylie Message to be identified as the authors of the editorial material in this work has been asserted in accordance with the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be available in electronic books.

Designations used by companies to distinguish their products are often claimed as trademarks. All brand names and product names used in this book are trade names, service marks, trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective owners. The publisher is not associated with any product or vendor mentioned in this book.

Limit of Liability/Disclaimer of Warranty: While the publisher and authors have used their best efforts in preparing this book, they make no representations or warranties with respect to the accuracy or completeness of the contents of this book and specifically disclaim any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose. It is sold on the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services and neither the publisher nor the author shall be liable for damages arising herefrom. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

The international handbooks of museum studies / general editors: Sharon Macdonald, Helen Rees Leahy. – First edition.

pages cm Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-4051-9850-9 (cloth)

 Museums. 2. Museum exhibits. I. Macdonald, Sharon. II. Leahy, Helen Rees. AM5.I565 2015 069–dc23

2015003407

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Cover image: Meen Warrann (smallpox) by Maree Clarke. Photo Dianna Snape, courtesy of Museum of Victoria.

Set in 11/13 pt Dante by SPi Global, Pondicherry, India Printed and bound in Singapore by Markono Print Media Pte Ltd

Museum Theory

**Museum Theory** 

Edited by Andrea Witcomb and Kylie Message

**Museum Practice** 

Edited by Conal McCarthy

Museum Media

Edited by Michelle Henning

**Museum Transformations** 

Edited by Annie E. Coombes and Ruth B. Phillips

## LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

#### Color plate section

- 8.1 Design Museum exhibit
- 10.1 Interior shot of the Musée du Quai Branly, 2013
- 10.2 Exterior shot of the National Museum of the American Indian, 2012
- 10.3 Our Peoples: Giving Voice to Our Histories at the Smithsonian's National Museum of the American Indian
- 10.4 Lisa Reihana, *He Tautoko*, 2006, Museum of Archaeology and Anthropology, Cambridge
- 10.5 Installation view of Otobong Nkanga, Facing the Opponent, Weltkulturen Museum
- 12.1 Saatchi Gallery mark 3
- 12.2 Scott King, Pink Cher, Saatchi Gallery mark 3
- 12.3 Installation view: Scott King and Steven Claydon, Newspeak Part One, 2010
- 12.5 Damien Hirst, The Physical Impossibility of Death in the Mind of Someone Living, 1991
- 12.6 Damien Hirst, For the Love of God, 2007
- 12.7 Pyramid of the Capitalist System, IWW poster, 1911
- 16.1 Bunjil's wing kinetic sculpture, First Peoples exhibition, Melbourne Museum
- 16.3 Maree Clarke, Meen Warrann (smallpox), First Peoples exhibition, Melbourne Museum
- 19.1 A zombie of anatomy, Biomedical Center, Uppsala University
- 23.1 Lyndell Brown and Charles Green, The Vale of Kashmir, 1995
- 23.2 Lyndell Brown and Charles Green, Afghan Traders, Tarin Kowt, Uruzgan Province, Afghanistan, 2007–2009
- 23.3 Lyndell Brown and Charles Green, History Painting: Market, Tarin Kowt, Uruzgan Province, Afghanistan, 2008
- 23.4 Lyndell Brown and Charles Green, Helicopter Landing, View from Roof of Morgue, Southern Iraq, 2007–2009
- 23.5 Lyndell Brown and Charles Green, Styx, 2005
- 23.6 Lyndell Brown and Charles Green, Hare Rama Hare Krishna, 2008-2009
- 24.3 Michelle Guyton, interpretive scrapbook on September 11, 2001
- 25.2 Poetry Tree, Strathewen, 2010, Museum Victoria

## **Chapter illustrations**

8.1	Design Museum exhibit	140
8.2	Design Museum poster	141
9.1	M. NourbeSe Philip, excerpts from Looking for Livingstone:	
	An Odyssey of Silence, 1991 and Royal Ontario Museum invitation	174
10.1	Interior shot of the Musée du Quai Branly, 2013	187
10.2	Exterior shot of the National Museum of the American Indian, 2012	189
10.3	Our Peoples: Giving Voice to Our Histories at the Smithsonian's	
	National Museum of the American Indian	190
10.4	Lisa Reihana, He Tautoko, 2006, Museum of Archaeology and	
	Anthropology, Cambridge	196
10.5	Installation view of Otobong Nkanga, Facing the Opponent,	
	Weltkulturen Museum	199
12.1	Saatchi Gallery mark 3	239
12.2	Scott King, Pink Cher, Saatchi Gallery mark 3	241
12.3	Installation view: Scott King and Steven Claydon,	a de la companya de l
	Newspeak Part One, 2010	242
12.4	Alberto Korda, Guerrillero Heroico, 1960	242
12.5	Damien Hirst, The Physical Impossibility of Death in the Mind of	
	Someone Living, 1991	244
12.6	Damien Hirst, For the Love of God, 2007	246
12.7	Pyramid of the Capitalist System, IWW poster, 1911	249
16.1	Bunjil's wing kinetic sculpture, First Peoples exhibition,	
1	Melbourne Museum	329
16.2	Language map showing message sticks and the relationship to	
	Country, First Peoples exhibition, Melbourne Museum	330
16.3	Maree Clarke, Meen Warrann (smallpox), First Peoples	
	exhibition, Melbourne Museum	332
16.4	Treaty and Tanderrum section of "Our Story," First Peoples	
	exhibition, Melbourne Museum	333
19.1	A zombie of anatomy, Biomedical Center, Uppsala University	390
19.2	Object landscape of the Swedish National Heritage Board,	
	Stockholm, 1926	400
19.3	Evolutionary walk, Swedish History Museum, shortly after	
	opening in 1866	402
19.4	Remains of the old anatomical collection of Uppsala University	406
23.1	Lyndell Brown and Charles Green, The Vale of Kashmir, 1995	488
23.2	Lyndell Brown and Charles Green, Afghan Traders, Tarin Kowt,	
	Uruzgan Province, Afghanistan, 2007–2009	491
23.3	Lyndell Brown and Charles Green, History Painting: Market,	
	Tarin Kowt, Uruzgan Province, Afghanistan, 2008	493
23.4	Lyndell Brown and Charles Green, Helicopter Landing,	
	View from Roof of Morgue, Southern Iraq, 2007–2009	498
23.5	Lyndell Brown and Charles Green, Styx, 2005	502

#### List of Illustrations xi

23.6	Lyndell Brown and Charles Green, Hare Rama Hare Krishna, 2008–2009	506
24.1	Poster distributed by Jeffrey Wiener's family members	
	in their search after 9/11	518
24.2	Firefighter's pry bar carried by Lt. Kevin Pfeifer, FDNY	522
24.3	Michelle Guyton, interpretive scrapbook on September 11, 2001	524
24.4	Comment card from September 11: Bearing Witness to History exhibition	525
25.1	Sign, Devon North, Gippsland, February 8, 2009	538
25.2	Poetry Tree, Strathewen, 2010, Museum Victoria	542
25.3	Leadbeater's possum nest box, Lake Mountain, 2010, Museum Victoria	549

## VOLUME EDITORS

Andrea Witcomb is a professor and Director of the Cultural Heritage Centre for Asia and the Pacific at Deakin University and a Deputy Director of the Alfred Deakin Institute for Citizenship and Globalisation. Her research interests range across the museum and heritage fields and are informed by theoretical, historical, and professional practice concerns. She brings an interdisciplinary approach to her research, locating her work at the intersection of history, museology, and cultural studies. Her work is driven by a desire to understand the ways in which a range of heritage practices can be used to foster cross-cultural understandings and dialogue. As part of this, she explores the uses of immersive interpretation strategies in museums and heritage sites, the role of memory and affect in people's encounters with objects and displays, and the nature of Australia's extraterritorial war heritage sites. Andrea is the author of Re-imagining the Museum: Beyond the Mausoleum (Routledge, 2003) and, with Chris Healy, the coeditor of South Pacific Museums: An Experiment in Culture (Monash University ePress, 2006). Her latest book, cowritten with Kate Gregory, is From the Barracks to the Burrup: The National Trust in Western Australia (UNSW Press, 2010).

Professor Andrea Witcomb Director Cultural Heritage Centre for Asia and the Pacific Deakin University Victoria, Australia

Kylie Message is Associate Professor and Head of the School of Archaeology and Anthropology at the Australian National University. Her research explores the role that museums play as sites of cultural and political exchange. Her current projects investigate the relationship between museums, citizenship, and political reform movements in different national contexts. She is the author of Museums and Social Activism: Engaged Protest (Routledge, 2013) and New Museums and the Making of Culture (Bloomsbury, 2006), and coeditor of volumes including "Compelling Cultures: Representing Cultural Diversity and Cohesion in Multicultural Australia," a special issue of Humanities Research Journal (2009). She is joint chief coeditor for the journal Museum Worlds: Advances in Research, and previous managing editor for Museum and Society, and exhibition reviews editor for Australian Historical Studies.

Associate Professor Kylie Message Associate Dean (Research Training) ANU College of Arts and Social Sciences The Australian National University Canberra ACT, Australia

#### GENERAL EDITORS

**Sharon Macdonald** is Alexander von Humboldt Professor in Social Anthropology at the Humboldt University Berlin where she is establishing and directing a center for research on heritage and museums. Her edited and coedited volumes include the *Companion to Museum Studies* (Blackwell, 2006), *Exhibition Experiments* (with Paul Basu; Blackwell, 2007), and *Theorizing Museums* (with Gordon Fyfe; Blackwell, 1996). Her authored books include *Behind the Scenes at the Science Museum* (Berg, 2002), *Difficult Heritage: Negotiating the Nazi Past in Nuremberg and Beyond* (Routledge, 2009), and *Memorylands: Heritage and Identity in Europe Today* (Routledge, 2013).

Professor Sharon Macdonald Alexander von Humboldt Professor in Social Anthropology Institute for European Ethnology Humboldt University of Berlin Berlin, Germany

Helen Rees Leahy is a Professor of Museology and Director of the Centre for Museology at the University of Manchester. Prior to coming to Manchester, Helen worked as a curator and museum director for over 12 years, and organized numerous exhibitions of fine art and design. She has held a variety of senior posts in UK museums, including the Design Museum, Eureka! The Museum for Children, and the National Art Collections Fund. She has also worked as an independent consultant and curator, and has organized numerous exhibitions of art and design. She is currently Curatorial Adviser to Elizabeth Gaskell's House, the Manchester home of Elizabeth and William Gaskell (which opened in October 2014), and has published on practices of individual and institutional collecting, in both historical and contemporary contexts, including issues of patronage, display and interpretation. *Museum Bodies: The Politics and Practices of Visiting and Viewing* was published by Ashgate in 2012. She is now writing a book on the exhibitionary archive which explores the material and critical legacies of past exhibitions.

Professor Helen Rees Leahy Director, Centre for Museology School of Arts, Languages and Cultures University of Manchester Manchester, UK

## CONTRIBUTORS

Ien Ang, University of Western Sydney, Australia Janice Baker, Curtin University, Australia Amelia Barikin, University of Queensland, Australia Jennifer Barrett, University of Sydney, Australia Tony Bennett, University of Western Sydney, Australia Lyndell Brown, University of Melbourne, Australia Shelley Ruth Butler, McGill University, Canada Fiona Cameron, University of Western Sydney, Australia Rebecca Carland, Museum Victoria, Australia Peter Dahlgren, Lund University, Sweden Liza Dale-Hallett, Museum Victoria, Australia Sandra H. Dudley, University of Leicester, UK Peg Fraser, Museum Victoria, Australia James B. Gardner, US National Archives, USA Haidy Geismar, University College London, UK Charles Green, University of Melbourne, Australia Joke Hermes, Inholland University, The Netherlands Kevin Hetherington, Open University, UK Jim McGuigan, Loughborough University, UK Scott McQuire, University of Melbourne, Australia Kylie Message, Australian National University, Australia Toby Miller, Cardiff University, UK, and Murdoch University, Australia Howard Morphy, Australian National University, Australia Nikos Papastergiadis, University of Melbourne, Australia Elsa Peralta, University of Lisbon, Portugal

xvi Contributors

Natalia Radywyl, Fjord, New York

**Philipp Schorch,** Deakin University, Australia, and Ludwig-Maximilians-University Munich, Germany

Laurajane Smith, Australian National University, Australia

Russell Staiff, University of Western Sydney, Australia

Fredrik Svanberg, National Historical Museums, Sweden

Sheila Watson, University of Leicester, UK

Andrea Witcomb, Deakin University, Australia

## **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

Editing this volume has been an enormously rewarding experience. We wish to thank all those who made it possible, particularly our friend Chris Healy, who first brought us into this project. We would also like to thank Sharon Macdonald and Helen Rees Leahy, who conceptualized the series and have overseen its development. As our guiding editor, Sharon was exacting but enormously supportive, and we thank her for it. We also warmly acknowledge our contributors – colleagues inside and outside museums without whom this volume would not have taken shape. Thank you for staying the course of the project – all those emails backward and forward, the drafting and redrafting that went into the editing process, and your faith that the publication would eventually emerge. Finally but not least, we wish to thank Gill Whitley, the project manager working with Wiley, who went above and beyond her duty of care in supporting us as editors, running around chasing copyright, and keeping us to deadlines or managing requests for extensions when we needed them. We are also no less grateful for the patience, careful reading, and extraordinary care taken by our copy-editor, Jacqueline Harvey.

Collectively, these handbooks include over a hundred original, state-of-the-art chapters on museums and museum studies. As such, they are the most comprehensive review to date of the lively and expanding field of museum studies. Written by a wide range of scholars and practitioners – newer voices as well as those already widely esteemed – the *International Handbooks* seek not only to provide extensive coverage of key topics and debates in the museum field, but also to make a productive contribution to emerging debates and areas, as well as to suggest how museum studies – and museums – might develop in the future.

The number of high-quality contributors able and willing to write on museum topics is itself testimony to the state of the field, as was recognition by the publishers that the field warranted such a substantial work. Bringing together such a range and quantity of new writing about museums was accomplished through the deep knowledge, extensive networks, and sheer labour of the volume editors – Andrea Witcomb and Kylie Message, *Museum Theory*; Conal McCarthy, *Museum Practice*; Michelle Henning, *Museum Media*; and Annie E. Coombes and Ruth B. Phillips, *Museum Transformations*. All enthusiastically took up the mandate to go out and recruit those they thought would be best able to write useful and timely essays on what they defined as the most important topics within their area of remit. Their brief was to look widely for potential contributors, including unfamiliar, as well as familiar, names. We – and they – were especially interested in perspectives from people whose voices have not always been heard within the international museum studies conversation thus far. This breadth is also a feature of the expanded and expanding field itself, as we explain further below.

#### **Diversification and democratization**

The editors of the four volumes that constitute these *International Handbooks* are based in four different countries – Australia, New Zealand, the United Kingdom, and Canada; and contributors have their institutional homes in over a dozen more. Yet these numbers alone do not fully convey the trend to diversification that we see in these volumes, and in museum studies more widely. "Internationalization" is a term that might be used but does not, we think, adequately characterize what is involved. Certainly, there is more traffic between nations of ideas about museums and about how to study them. Debates travel from one part of the globe to another, with museums and exhibitions in one location being used as models for emulation or avoidance in another. The massive expansion of professional training in museum

studies that has taken place over the past three decades helps establish a shared discourse, not least as many students study away from their home countries or those in which they will later work. So too do texts in and about the field, certain key ones often being found on reading lists in numerous countries and also republished in successive readers. Such developments establish the basis for a conversation capable of transcending borders.

It is evident from the contents of The International Handbooks of Museum Studies, however, that the democratization runs deeper than the traffic of discourse and practice across national borders, and, in particular, that the traffic is more multidirectional than it was previously. Not only do contributors have their primary work bases in a range of different countries, and not only do many have experience of training or working in others, they also often give attention - sometimes through the direct engagement of collaborative work or study - to a wide range of groups and populations in a variety of countries, including their own. This seeks not merely to incorporate but also to learn from and be challenged by people and perspectives that have not been part of mainstream museological debate. The attention to the (not unproblematic) category of the indigenous is especially marked in these International Handbooks, most notably in the Transformations volume, although it also finds its way into the others. Like attention to other forms of absence from the existing mainstream museum conversation, this is symptomatic of a broader move toward finding alternative ways of seeing and doing, ways that both add to the range of existing possibilities and also, sometimes, unsettle these by showing how, say, particular theorizing or practice relies on unspoken or previously unrecognized assumptions.

Diversification takes other forms too. While these volumes are not organized by type of museum – a format that we think restrictive in its lack of recognition of so many shared features and concerns of museums - and do not use this as a classification of content, it is nevertheless clear that a great range of museum kinds, and even of forms that might not always be considered museums, or that challenge the idea of the museum as a physical space, are included here. Museums of art, history, and ethnography - and also those more general and eclectic museums that have sometimes been described as encyclopedic - have powered a good deal of museum theorizing and debate, and they are amply represented here. But they are accompanied also by examples from museums of natural history, science, technology, and medicine, as well as heritage sites and out-ofgallery installations. Alongside national museums, which were the backbone of much important theorizing of the role of museums in the making of national identity and citizenship, are numerous examples of smaller museums, some of which are devoted to a specific topic and others of which have a regional or local foundation and focus. These museums may be less well endowed with staff, buildings, or funds, but are nevertheless doing important, even pioneering, work that deserves attention from museum studies. That attention contributes not only to extending the range of types and cases but also helps to illuminate the range of specific features of museums that need to be taken into account in formulating more comprehensive approaches. As many chapters across the volumes show, one size does not fit all – or, to put it better perhaps, one theoretical perspective or set of guidelines for practice, one apt choice of media or transformative activity, does not fit all types and sizes of museums. Adding more to the mix does not just provide greater choice but also helps to identify better what is at stake and what might be possible in different kinds of situations, constellations, or conjunctures (to use a word favored in *Museum Theory*). It helps those of us engaged in and with museums to get a better grasp on what is and might be shared, as well as on what is distinctive and needs to be understood in more fine-grained ways.

Another feature of diversification that deserves comment here is the temporal. There has been a considerable amount of outstanding historical research undertaken in museum studies and the *International Handbooks* both review some of this and contribute further to it. Such work is important in its own terms, helping us to understand better the contexts in which museums emerged and have operated, and the concerns, constraints, personalities, and opportunities in evidence in particular times and places. It also contributes in vital ways to contemporary understandings, both by adding to the range of cases available for analysis and by showing the longer historical trajectories out of which various current approaches and practices emerged. Sometimes – and there are examples in all of the volumes here – their message is salutary, showing that what seemed like an innovation has been tried before, and perhaps with the distance of time allowing a more critical perspective than might feel comfortable today. The past shows change but also continuities and the re-emergence, or even repackaging, of what has gone before.

#### Disciplinarity and methodology

Such research shows the importance of historical method, and of history as a discipline, within museum studies, which brings us to the wider issue of disciplinarity and methodology. To talk of museum studies as interdisciplinary has become a truism. The volumes here are a clear illustration that those involved in museum studies have been trained in and may have primary institutional locations in a wide range of disciplines and areas of study, including anthropology, archaeology, architecture, area studies, cultural studies, economics, education, geography, literature, management, media studies, political science, and sociology, as well as history and art history. Beyond that, however, they are also carving out new niches, sometimes institutionally recognized, sometimes not, in areas such as digital curation, and creative technologies, as well as in art gallery, museum, and heritage studies, in various combinations or alone. Moreover, in addition to disciplines and a multitude of academic specialisms, practitioner contributors bring diverse professional

xxii

expertise in areas including exhibition design, community engagement, conservation, interpretation, and management.

Alongside the diversity of concepts and methodologies offered by different disciplines and different forms of practical expertise, is also the distinctive feature of museum studies - its engagement with the past, present, and future world of museums. Such work, to varying extents, confronts researchers and academics with the actual concerns, predicaments, objects, spaces, media, and people all, in various ways, involved in museum collections and exhibitions. Increasingly, this means actual collaboration, and the development of methodological approaches to enable this. Examples in these volumes include those who consider themselves to be primarily academics, artists, or activists being directly involved in the production of collections, media (e.g., new media apps or forms of display), and exhibitions. The nature of museum work is, inevitably, collaborative, but in some cases it also involves more explicit attempts to work with those who have had little previous engagement in museum worlds and draws on methodology and ethical insight from disciplines such as social and cultural anthropology to do so. Such actual engagement - coupled with what we see as more fluid traffic between academia and museums also powers new forms of theorizing and practice. This productive mobility affords museum studies its characteristic - and, in our view, especially exciting - dynamic.

#### Organization of the International Handbooks

As we originally planned these *International Handbooks*, dividing their coverage into the four volumes of Theory, Practice, Media, and Transformations (originally envisaged as Futures) made good sense as a way of grouping key areas of work within the field. Our idea was that *Theory* would bring together work that showed central areas of theorizing that have shaped museum studies so far, together with those that might do so in the future. We envisaged *Practice* as attending especially to areas of actual museum work, especially those that have tended to be ignored in past theorizing, not in order to try to reinstate a theory / practice division but, rather, to take the opportunity to transcend it through theorizing these too. We saw *Media* as the appropriate label to cover the crucially important area for museums of their architecture, spaces, and uses of diverse media primarily, though not exclusively, for display. *Transformations* was intended to direct its attention especially to some of the most important social, cultural, political, and economic developments that are shaping and look likely to reshape museums in the future.

In many ways, what has resulted fits this original remit. We always knew that there would inevitably be areas of convergence: in particular, that theory can derive from practice, and vice versa; that the development and expansion of social media is propelling some of the most significant transformations in museums, and so forth. Yet it is probably true to say that there are more synergies than we had