The New Family and the New Property

Mary Ann Glendon

The New Family and The New Property

Mary Ann Glendon

The New Family and the New Property © 1981 Butterworth & Co. (Canada) Ltd.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, photocopying, electronic, mechanical, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the copyright holder.

Printed and bound in Canada

The Butterworth Group of Companies

Canada:

Butterworth & Co. (Canada) Ltd., Toronto and Vancouver

United Kingdom:

Butterworth & Co. (Publishers) Ltd., London

Australia:

Butterworths Pty. Ltd., Sydney

New Zealand:

Butterworths of New Zealand Ltd., Wellington

South Africa:

Butterworth & Co. (South Africa) Ltd., Durban

United States:

Butterworth (Publishers) Inc., Boston Butterworth (Legal Publishers) Inc., Seattle Mason Publishing Company, St. Paul

Canadian Cataloguing in Publication Data

Glendon, Mary Ann, 1938-The new family and the new property

Includes bibliographical references. ISBN 0-409-83410-6

 Domestic relations. 2. Property. 3. Labor laws and legislation. I. Title.

K670.G63 346.01 C81-094077-9

Acknowledgments

The beginning of the work on this book in the fall of 1977 coincided with the establishment at Boston College of an interdisciplinary faculty seminar whose members were to work toward designing an undergraduate course in which some of the "human sciences" might be brought together in a meaningful way. During the next three years, the author met weekly with colleagues from the departments of economics, philosophy, political science, sociology and theology to read, study, and try to learn to talk with each other. Whatever fruits this collaboration eventually may bear for the institution that sponsored it, the benefits reaped by this participant in connection with her own ongoing work have been inestimable. Thus, I owe a particular debt of gratitude to my fellow members of the "Perspectives" program: Professors Joseph F. Flanagan, S.J. (philosophy); Frederick G. Lawrence (theology); Ritchie P. Lowry (sociology); Donald J. Maletz (political science); and Francis H. McLaughlin (economics).

Of the persons who read and commented helpfully on earlier versions of the manuscript, Dr. Carolyn Shaw Bell, Chairman of the Wellesley College Economics Department; Dr. Vivian C. Fox of the Boston State College History Department; Dr. Janet Z. Giele of the Heller School at Brandeis University; and Dr. Hilda Kahne of the Wheaton College Economics Department, were particularly generous with their time and their extensive knowledge of areas where I tread with great hesitation.

During the period of writing this book, I benefited greatly from the friendly interest and assistance of my law school colleagues Professors Sanford J. Fox, Sanford N. Katz and Richard S. Sullivan, as well as from the support and encouragement of my dean, Richard G. Huber. In addition, I count myself especially fortunate to have had the able, resourceful and indefatigable research assistance of David F. Capeless, Robert V. Carr, Rudy J. Cerone and Stephen M. Sheehy while they were students at Boston College Law School; and the highly professional assistance of Debra Simmons in supervising the preparation of the manuscript.

For providing a public forum in which some of the ideas advanced in this book could be expressed and tested, I thank the International Society on Family Law and the Uppsala University Law Faculty, who invited me to speak at the Society's third international meeting held in Uppsala, Sweden, in June 1979; the Tulane University Law School in New Orleans

which gave me the opportunity to be a Shell Foundation speaker there in February 1979; and the Canadian Association of Law Teachers which invited me to speak at their annual meeting in Montreal in June 1980.

Finally, I must acknowledge the unique contribution to this book of the distinguished Boston lawyer Edward R. Lev, my co-author on an article (Glendon and Lev, 1978-79) that eventually became part of Chapter 4. I found him in this, as in other joint enterprises — from writing briefs to raising our three children — a most congenial collaborator.

Mary Ann Glendon

Chestnut Hill, Massachusetts April 1981

List of Abbreviations

The basic system of citation followed throughout is that of the University of Chicago Press. In cases not covered by those rules, American and English legal citations are in the form of the Uniform System of Citation (published by the Harvard Law Review Association), and legal citations from other countries are in the forms commonly used in those countries.

A. PERIODICALS

A.B.A.J. American Bar Association Journal

Am. Hist. Rev. American Historical Review

Am. J. Comp. L. American Journal of Comparative Law

Am. J. Soc. American Journal of Sociology
Ann. Rev. Soc. Annual Review of Sociology

Antioch Rev. Antioch Review

B.C. Ind. & Comm. Boston College Industrial and Commercial

L. Rev. Law Review

B.C.L. Rev. Boston College Law Review
B.U.L. Rev. Boston University Law Review

B.Y.U.L. Rev. Brigham Young University Law Review

Buffalo L. Rev. Buffalo Law Review
Calif. L. Rev. California Law Review
Cambridge L.J. Cambridge Law Journal
Canadian Bar Rev. Canadian Bar Review
Colum. L. Rev. Columbia Law Review

Comm. Prop. J. Community Property Journal

Cornell L. Rev. Cornell Law Review

D. Recueil Dalloz

D.H. Dalloz. Recueil hèbdomadaire.

D.S. Recueil Dalloz Sirey

Fam. L. Family Law

Fam. L.Q. Family Law Quarterly
Fam. L. Rptr. Family Law Reporter

FamRZ Zeitschrift für das gesamte Familienrecht

Fordham L. Rev. Fordham Law Review
Ga. L. Rev. Georgia Law Review
Gonz. L. Rev. Gonzaga Law Review
Harv. Civ. Rts. — Harvard Civil Rights —
Civ. Lib. L. Rev. Civil Liberties Law Review
Harv. J. Legis. Harvard Journal on Legislation

Harv. L. Rev. Harvard Law Review

Hastings Int. & Hastings International and Comp. L. Rev. Comparative Law Review Hastings L.J. Hastings Law Journal

Ind. L.J. Indiana Law Journal

Indus. & Lab. Industrial and Labor Relations Review

Rel. Rev.

Indus. Rel. L.J. Industrial Relations Law Journal
Intl. & Comp. L.Q. International and Comparative Law

Quarterly
Intl. Lab. Rev. International Labour Review

J. Fam. L. Journal of Family Law

J. Interdisciplinary Journal of Interdisciplinary History

Hist.

J. Marr. & Fam. Journal of Marriage and the Family
J.C.P. Juris-Classeur Périodique (La Semaine

Juridique)

Juridical Rev. Juridical Review

Ky. L.J. Kentucky Law Journal
L.Q. Rev. Law Quarterly Review
La. L. Rev. Louisiana Law Review
Lab. L.J. Labor Law Journal
Law & Soc. Rev. Law & Society Review
Mich. L. Rev. Michigan Law Review

Mod. L. Rev. Modern Law Review

Monthly Lab. Rev. Monthly Labor Review

mpr Policy Newsletter Mathematica Policy Research Policy

Newsletter

New L.J. New Law Journal

NJW Neue Juristische Wochenschrift

Nw. U.L. Rev. Northwestern University Law Review

Ohio St. L.J. Ohio State Law Journal
Osgoode Hall L.J. Osgoode Hall Law Journal

Pac. L.J. Pacific Law Journal
Pepperdine L. Rev. Pepperdine Law Review

Proc. Am. Phil. Soc. Proceedings of the American Philosophical

Society

Rabels Zeitschrift für ausländisches und

internationales Privatrecht

Real Prop., Prob. & Real Property, Probate and

Trust L.J. Trust Law Journal

Rev. Trim. Dr. Civ. Revue trimestrielle de droit civil

Rutgers L. Rev. Rutgers Law Review Sci. Am. Scientific American

So. Calif. L. Rev. Southern California Law Review
Southwestern U.L. Southwestern University Law Review

Rev.

Stan. L. Rev. Stanford Law Review
Tex. L. Rev. Texas Law Review
The Pub. Interest
Tulane L. Rev. Tulane Law Review

U. Calif. — Davis University of California — Davis Law

L. Rev. Review

U. Chi. L. Rev. University of Chicago Law Review
U. Colo. L. Rev. University of Colorado Law Review
U. Pa. L. Rev. University of Pennsylvania Law Review
U. Toronto L.J. University of Toronto Law Journal

Urb. & Soc. Change Urban and Social Change Review

Va. L. Rev. Virginia Law Review
Wash. L. Rev. Washington Law Review
Willamette L.J. Willamette Law Journal

Wisc. L. Rev. Wisconsin Law Review

Yale L.J. Yale Law Journal

Z.f.R.V. Zeitschrift für Rechtsvergleichung

B. CODES, STATUTES AND COLLECTIONS OF JUDICIAL DECISIONS

American Law Reports, Second Series A.L.R. 2d

(Lawyers Cooperative Publishing Co.)

American Law Reports, Third Series A.L.R. 3d

(Lawyers Cooperative Publishing Co.)

Atlantic Reporter, Second Series (West A. 2d

Publishing Co.)

All E.R. All England Reports

Cal. Civ. Code California Civil Code (West Publishing Co.) California Reporter (West Publishing Co.) Cal. Rptr.

Conn. Connecticut Reports

Employee Retirement Income Security Act ERISA F. Supp. Federal Supplement (West Publishing Co.)

Federal Rules Decisions (West Publishing F.R.D.

Co.)

F. 2d Federal Reporter, Second Series (West

Publishing Co.)

Fam. Family Reports (England)

Family Law Reporter (Bureau of National Fam. L. Rptr.

Affairs)

Ill. Stat. Ann. Illinois Statutes Annotated

Journal officiel de la République Française. J.O.

Lois et Décrets (Statutes and Decrees of

the French Republic)

Lab. Arb. & Disp.

Settl.

Labor Arbitration and Dispute Settlements

(Bureau of National Affairs)

Labor Relations Reporter (Bureau of Lab. Rel. Rptr.

National Affairs)

Mass. Gen. Laws. Ann. Massachusetts General Laws Annotated

(West Publishing Co.)

N.E. 2d Northeastern Reporter, Second Series (West

Publishing Co.)

N.W. 2d Northwestern Reporter, Second Series (West

Publishing Co.)

N.Y.S. 2d New York Supplement, Second Series (West

Publishing Co.)

NLRA	National Labor Relations Act
P. 2d	Pacific Reporter, Second Series (West Publishing Co.)
S. Ct.	Supreme Court Reporter (West Publishing Co.)
S.E. 2d	Southeastern Reporter, Second Series (West Publishing Co.)
S.W.	Southwestern Reporter (West Publishing Co.)
S.W. 2d	Southwestern Reporter, Second Series (West Publishing Co.)
So. 2d	Southern Reporter, Second Series (West Publishing Co.)
Tenn.	Tennessee Reports
U.S.	United States Supreme Court Reports (U.S. Govt. Printing Office)
U.S.L.W.	United States Law Week (Bureau of National Affairs)
UMDA	National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws, Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act of 1970 (with 1971 and 1973 amendments)
USC	United States Code (Government Printing Office)
USCA	United States Code Annotated (West Publishing Co.)
Wash. Rev. Code Ann.	Washington Revised Code Annotated (Bancroft-Whitney & West Publishing Cos.)

Weekly Law Reports (England)

WLR

Table of Cases

A

Adair v. United States, 149, 168, 169, 204
Agis v. Howard Johnson Co., 166, 204
Alcorn v. Anbro Engineering, Inc., 200
Allied Structural Steel v. Spannaus, 187
Arnett v. Kennedy, 189

B

Batterton v. Francis, 202
Bellotti v. Baird, 37
Berman & Sons v. Jefferson, 185
Besaw v. Besaw, 57
B.H.A. v. Hemingway, 168, 185
Bishop v. Wood, 189
Blanchette v. Blanchette, 93
Board of Regents v. Roth, 170, 189, 190
Boddie v. Connecticut, 170
Branti v. Finkel, 157, 210, 226
Brown, In re Marriage of, 67
Butler v. Butler, 55

C

Cady v. Cady, 63
Califano v. Westcott, 109
Campbell v. Campbell, 55
Campbell v. Ford Industries Inc., 162
Carey v. Population Services Int'1,
37, 85
Carlson v. Olson, 77
Cartledge v. Miller, 67
Cary, In re Marriage of, 77, 85
Collins v. Gilbreath, 38
Connolly v. Connolly, 53
Coppage v. Kansas, 169, 204

D

Dawley v. Dawley, 53 De Minico v. Craig, 204 Druker v. Roland Wm. Jutras Assocs., 166 Dyson Holdings Ltd. v. Fox, 240

E

Eisenstadt v. Baird, 43, 44, 111 Elrod v. Burns, 157, 210 English v. English, 55

F

Fiorentino v. United States, 189
Foley v. Community Oil Co., 164
Foley v. Foley, 55
Fortune v. National Cash Register,
164, 165, 166, 167, 204
Frampton v. Central Ind. Gas Co.,
160, 162
Frances v. United Technologies
Corp., 67
Friedlander v. Friedlander, 67
Fuentes v. Shevin, 92
Furnco Construction Corp. v. Waters,
159

G

Geary v. U.S. Steel Corp., 161, 162, 164 Gibson v. Berryhill, 190 Gigele v. Gigele, 67 Goldberg v. Kelly, 92, 188, 189 Gomez v. Perez, 73 Goss v. Lopez, 189 Grace v. Town of Brookline, 182 Grishman v. Grishman, 79 Griswold v. Connecticut, 43 Guy v. Guy, 67

H

Hagerty v. Hagerty, 200
Hampton v. Mow Sun Wong, 190
Harless v. First National Bank in
Fairmont, 160
Harrah Independent School District
v. Martin, 189
Harrison v. Loyal Protective Life Ins.
Co., 166
Hewitt v. Hewitt, 79
Hinrichs v. Tranquilaire Hospital,
150, 168
Hisquierdo v. Hisquierdo, 67, 188
Horstmann, In re Marriage of, 68
Hutton v. Watters, 150

I

ILGWU v. Quality Manufacturing Co., 156 Inman v. Inman, 68 International Brotherhood of Teamsters v. Daniel, 187, 188 International Brotherhood of Teamsters v. United States, 175

J

Jackson v. Minidoka Irrigation
District, 161
Javins v. First Nat'l Realty Corp.,
177
Johnson, Ex parte, 67
Johnson v. Moreton, 241
Johnsrud, In re Marriage of, 60
Joseph Albanese's Case, 200

K

Kahn v. Shevin, 109 Kelsay v. Motorola, Inc., 162 Kirk La Shelle Co. v. Paul Armstrong Co., 166 Kozlowski v. Kozlowski, 77

L

Larsen v. Motor Supply Co., 164

Leach v. Lauhoff Grain Co., 160, 162 Lindsey v. Normet, 177 Lutgert v. Lutgert, 67 Lynn v. Lynn, 55

M

Marvin v. Marvin, 77, 78, 79, 85
Mathews v. Eldridge, 189
McArdle v. McArdle, 60
McCullun v. McCullun, 77
McDonald v. Santa Fe Trail
Transportation Co., 158
McDonnell Douglas Corp. v. Green, 158, 159
McEachnie v. McEachnie, 55
Meachum v. Fano, 189
Miller v. Morris, 72
Monge v. Beebe Rubber Company, 162, 163, 164, 166, 167, 183
Moore v. City of East Cleveland, 240

N

Nace v. Nace, 55 Nees v. Hock, 161 Newman v. Newman, 55 NLRB v. Brown, 164 NLRB v. Jones and Laughlin Steel Corp., 150 NLRB v. Weingarten, 156

0

O'Connor v. Yezukevicz, 170 Orr v. Orr, 54, 109

P

Paige v. Harris, 189
Parham v. J.R., 37
Payne v. Western & Atl. R.R. Co., 150
Percival v. General Motors Corp., 162
Perry v. Sindermann, 170, 189
Petermann v. International
Brotherhood of Teamsters, 160, 162, 164
Phelps Dodge Corp. v. NLRB, 169
Pines v. Perssion, 177
Pirre v. Printing Developments, Inc., 164

Planned Parenthood of Missouri v. Danforth, 37 Posner v. Posner, 53 Pstragowski v. Metropolitan Life Ins. Co., 164

R

Radio Officers' Union v. NLRB, 164 Reuther v. Fowler & Williams Inc., 161 Richey v. A.A.A., 166 Rislove v. Rislove, 60 Roberts v. Atlantic Richfield Co., 162 Robinson v. Diamond Housing Corp., 163, 177, 180, 181, 182 Runyon v. McCrary, 43

S

San Antonio Independent School
District v. Rodriguez, 189
Sargent v. Ross, 162
Shakman v. Democratic Organization
of Cook County, 210
Smith v. Lewis, 67
Sniadach v. Family Finance Corp.,
92, 188
Snyder, In re, 39, 40
Spingola v. Spingola, 74
Stanton v. Stanton, 109
State v. Williams, 38
Stern v. Stern, 68
Sumey, In re, 40
Sventko v. Kroger Co., 161

T

Texas Department of Community Affairs v. Burdine, 159 Textile Workers v. Darlington Manufacturing Co., 181 Thorpe v. Housing Authority of Durham, 180 Travitzsky v. Travitzsky, 74

U

United Steelworkers of America v. American Mfg. Co., 154 United Steelworkers of America v. Enterprise Wheel & Car Corp., 154

United Steelworkers of America v. Warrior & Gulf Nav. Co., 154 Uproar Co. v. National Broadcasting Co., 166

V

Vegelahn v. Guntner, 205

W

Wash. Statewide Org. of Stepparents v. Smith, 75 Weinberger v. Wiesenfeld, 110

\mathbb{Z}

Zablocki v. Redhail, 72 Zimmer v. Wells Mgmt. Corp., 165

Contents

A. Pe B. Co	edgmentsbbreviationseriodicalsodes, Statutes and Collections of Judicial Decisions	ix ix
Introduct	tion]
Part I.	The New Family	9
CHAP	TER 1. THE ATTENUATION OF FAMILY	
	TIES: THE TIES THAT BIND	11
A.	Circumscribing the Family Unit: The Law of	
	Companionate Marriage	
В.	The Bonding of the New Family	17
	1. The Marriage Bond: Its Centrality and	
	Closeness	20
	2. Fluidity, Detachability, and Interchangeability	28
	a. Marriage	28
	b. Parents and Children	
C.	The Emergence of the Individual	41
CHAP	TER 2. THE ATTENUATION OF FAMILY	
	TIES: THE TIES THAT SUPPORT	47
A.	The Narrowing of the Circle	48
В.	The Casualties of Divorce	51
	1. Spousal Support	52
	2. Property Division	57
	3. Child Support	68
	4. Dissolution of De Facto Families	76
	5. Conclusion	
C.	The Sharing of Functions	
	1. The Support Capacity of the New Family	
	2. Old and New Property	
D.	Conclusion	

Part II. Families, Property and Law	. 99
CHAPTER 3. FAMILY LAW AND PROPERTY	101
A. The Transformation of Family Law	101
B. Law to Strengthen Families?	
1. Private Law	
2. Public Law	
C. The "Liberated" Individual	
Part III. The New Property	141
CHAPTER 4. ALTERED PATTERNS OF LEGAL	
BONDING	143
A. Occupational Bonding	143
1. The Ties that Bind the Job to the Employee	151
2. The Ties that Bind the Employee to the Job	170
B. Landlord-Tenant Excursus	176
C. Law to Make Existence Secure?	
D. The Job as Property: Access, Instability and	
Ambiguity	192
CHAPTER 5. TOWARDS A FEUDALISM OF NEW	
PROPERTY?	207
A. The Institutional Context	207
B. The Transformation of Private Law	215
C. A Relational Society?	227
D. The Iron Cage and the Golden Chain	
Selected Bibliography	247
Index	

Introduction

In all known societies, family structure has been closely linked to economic structure.1 The complex nature of the linkage and the actual dynamics of related changes in the family and the economy have been the subject of much speculation and study,2 but their legal aspects have been little noted.3 This book examines recent developments in family law, employment law and property law, and finds that they are closely related to each other, as well as to certain modern trends that are transforming private law generally. In a time of transition, both in family behavior and in the nature and forms of wealth, the law is reflecting and interacting with social trends which affect the majority of persons, primarily those who are at neither the highest nor the lowest economic levels. Of particular note are the following: (1) While legal ties among family members are becoming attenuated and the legal structure of the family is being loosened, the web of relationships that bind an individual to his job (and his job to him) is becoming tighter and more highly structured. Changes in the legal regulation of family relationships increasingly reflect the perishability and fluidity, if not the transience, of these relationships, while legal changes in the workplace recognize and reinforce the durability and centrality, if not the permanence, of the work relationship. (2) Developments in labor, property, social welfare, constitutional and family law reflect and promote expectations that an

¹ See generally, König (1974) paras. 36 and 55; Wrigley (1977) 83; Marx (1973) 3; and Kanter (1977).

² E.g., Engels (1972); Lasch (1977a); Goode (1977); Stone (1977). Lasch (1977b, 33) raises the important "possibility that the history of the family provides the missing link between culture and intellectual history on the one hand and politico-economic history on the other; between the study of culture and the study of social structure, production, and power." Stone's early modern English family history, a synthesis based on his own research and on studies made by many other family historians, is remarkable for its attention to economic and legal history of the period.

³ A notable exception is James Coleman (1974) who began his book, *Power and the Structure of Society*, as follows:

[[]T]here seems nowhere to exist, neither among social scientists nor among others who discuss these matters, the recognition that the society has changed over the past few centuries, in the very structural elements of which it is composed.

A sensitive indicator of this change may be found in law, because law (along with politics) is the practicing profession for which social organization is the central field of operations (13).

individual's economic security against illness and old age or family disruption by death or divorce will no longer, in principle, be provided by the family, and that it will, in principle, be provided through her own work and work-related benefits, with government as a back-up system.

These changes are part of a long historical process that has effected a fundamental alteration in the relative social and economic importance of family, work and government as determinants of wealth, standing, self-esteem and economic security. In the legal order, these changes form part of the intensification of that pervasive process of rationalization and bureaucratization early identified by Max Weber, through which all law becomes more public and administrative. In the economic order, stress points — elements of instability that seem to augur change whose direction is uncertain — pose problems for the legal system. Ideology frequently distracts from or disguises important tensions. Chapters 1 through 4 examine these legal changes through examples drawn from inheritance law, family law, employment law, property law and social welfare law. Chapter 5 then speculates on their broader implications and considers the signs that some of the legal trends described in earlier chapters may be reaching the limits of their expansive force.

Although continuity of analysis is provided here by following the law of the United States, the study draws on legal developments in England, France, Sweden and West Germany, where appropriate, to support, confirm, refine or qualify the hypotheses advanced here. The study proceeds on the assumption that family law, property and contract are all essentially parts of one field of law, and that developments in each area become more comprehensible when they are placed in the context of trends in private or civil law generally. In this respect, the approach taken here is basically that of a civil lawyer for whom the distinction between private law, that body of norms purporting to govern the relationships of citizens with each other, and public law, those norms governing the relationships of public bodies with citizens or other public bodies, has traditionally been important. But while disparate fields of common law can be thought of as collapsing together into a single field of private law through a process we might call "civilization," the field of private law itself has been deeply invaded in civil- and common-law countries through what may be called a process of "publicization." Thus, the private-public law distinction is increasingly difficult to make and maintain. However, it is convenient to use as a starting point the characterization by the great French legal sociologist, Jean Carbonnier, of property, contract and family as the "three pillars of the civil law,"5

⁴ Weber (1946) 198ff, 216ff.

⁵ Carbonnier (1971) 123.