

Edited by
Dennis Weber and
Stef van Weeghel

The 2010 OECD Updates

**Model Tax Convention & Transfer
Pricing Guidelines
A Critical Review**

Series
on International
Taxation



38



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

The 2010 OECD Updates

Model Tax Convention & Transfer Pricing Guidelines A Critical Review

Edited by

Dennis Weber

Stef van Weeghel



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

Published by:

Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.
Stratton Business Park
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ
United Kingdom
Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-3812-5

© 2011 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA.
Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed and Bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY.

The 2010 OECD Updates

Series on International Taxation

VOLUME 38

Founding Editors

Richard Doernberg, Kees van Raad and Klaus Vogel †

Senior Editor

Professor Dr Kees van Raad,
International Tax Center, University of Leiden

Managing Editors

Professor Ruth Mason,
University of Connecticut School of Law
Professor Dr Ekkehard Reimer,
University of Heidelberg

The title published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Preface

On 19 November 2011, the ACTL Seminar, ‘The 2010 update to the OECD MC and the revised Transfer Pricing guidelines’ was held at Amsterdam. This book contains all the subjects that were discussed, and a compilation of papers which were written following the panels and discussions that took place during the Seminar.

On behalf of the Amsterdam Centre for Tax Law, we extend our thanks and appreciation to the speakers for their contributions to the discussions and papers.

Dennis Weber and Stef van Weeghel

Summary of Contents

Preface	xvii
Part I	
Introduction	1
Chapter 1	
The 2010 OECD MC Amendments and the Revised TP Guidelines: An Overview	3
<i>Stef van Weeghel & Jan Gooijer</i>	
Part II	
The new Article 7 of the OECD MC: Attribution of Profits to PE	19
Chapter 2	
Article 7 – New OECD Rules for Attributing Profit to Permanent Establishments	21
<i>Mary Bennett</i>	
Chapter 3	
The 2010 Elimination of Article 7-3 (1963): Rise and Fall of an Article	37
<i>Hans Pijl</i>	
Chapter 4	
Attribution of Profits to PE: A Business Perspective	51
<i>Johan Muller</i>	

Part III	
Tax Treaty Entitlement of CIVs	63
Chapter 5	
Characterization and Tax Treaty Issues of Collective Investment Vehicles: A Review of the OECD Report and the 2010 Amendments to the Model Tax Convention	65
<i>Bruno da Silva</i>	
Chapter 6	
Suggested Treaty Benefits Approaches for Collective Investment Vehicles (CIVs) and Its Investors under the OECD MTC 2010 Update	83
<i>Hein Vermeulen</i>	
Chapter 7	
The 2010 CIV-Report: A Comparison with the 1999 Partnership Report	101
<i>Ton Stevens</i>	
Part IV	
Income from Employment	113
Chapter 8	
Updates to the Commentary on Article 15 of the OECD Model – Thoughts on the Interpretation of the Term ‘employer’ for Treaty Purposes	115
<i>Walter Andreoni</i>	
Chapter 9	
Some Selected Interpretation and Qualification Issues with Respect to Article 15(2)(b) and (c) of the OECD Model	125
<i>Frank P.G. Pötgens</i>	
Part V	
The Revised Transfer Pricing Guidelines	145
Chapter 10	
The 2010 update to the OECD Transfer Pricing Guidelines	147
<i>Caroline Silberztein</i>	
Chapter 11	
Chapters I and III of the 2010 OECD Guidelines: Capita Selecta	161
<i>Antonio Russo</i>	

Chapter 12	
OECD Revision of Chapters I–III and IX of the Transfer Pricing Guidelines: Some Comments on Hierarchy of Methods and Re-characterization of Actual Transactions Undertaken	173
<i>Guglielmo Maisto</i>	
 Part VI	
Sovereign Wealth Funds	183
 Chapter 13	
How to Treat(y) Sovereign Wealth Funds? The application of tax treaties to state-owned entities, including sovereign wealth funds	185
<i>Stijn Janssen</i>	

Table of Contents

Preface	xvii
Part I	
Introduction	1
Chapter 1	
The 2010 OECD MC Amendments and the Revised TP Guidelines: An Overview	3
<i>Stef van Weeghel & Jan Gooijer</i>	
1. Introduction	3
2. Changes to Article 7 MC (Business Profits)	4
2.1 Historical Background	4
2.2 The Distributive Rule of Article 7, Paragraph 1	4
2.3 Attributable Profits: Article 7, Paragraph 2, MC	5
2.4 Adjustment of Profit Attribution in Case of Double Taxation (Article 7, Paragraph 3, MC)	7
2.5 Rule of Interpretation (Article 7, Paragraph 4, MC)	8
3. Collective Investment Vehicles	9
4. State-Owned Entities Including Sovereign Wealth Funds	11
5. Application of Tax Treaties to International Telecommunication Operations	11
6. (Short-Term) Employment	13
6.1 Introduction	13
6.2 Formal Approach	13
6.3 Substance over Form	14
7. 2010 Transfer Pricing Guidelines	15
7.1 Introduction	15
7.2 Chapter I: The Arm's Length Principle	15

Table of Contents

7.3	Chapter II: Transfer Pricing Methods	15
7.4	Chapter III: Comparability Analysis	16
7.5	Chapter IX: Business Restructurings	16

Part II

The new Article 7 of the OECD MC: Attribution of Profits to PE	19
---	-----------

Chapter 2

Article 7 – New OECD Rules for Attributing Profit to Permanent Establishments	21
--	-----------

Mary Bennett

1.	Introduction	21
2.	Background on the Project on the Attribution of Profits to Permanent Establishments	22
3.	The ‘Authorized OECD Approach’	23
4.	Implementation of the AOA	24
5.	Issues Faced in Drafting the New Article 7	26
5.1	Paragraph 1 of the New Article 7	27
5.2	Paragraph 2 of the New Article 7	28
5.3	Paragraph 3 of the New Article 7	29
5.4	Elimination of Other Paragraphs	31
5.5	Domestic Law Restrictions on the Deductibility of Expenses	31
5.6	Notional Payments	32
6.	Implications of the New Article 7	34
7.	The 2010 Report on the Attribution of Profits to Permanent Establishments	36
8.	Conclusion	36

Chapter 3

The 2010 Elimination of Article 7-3 (1963): Rise and Fall of an Article	37
--	-----------

Hans Pijl

1.	Introduction	37
2.	Article 7-3’s Function	39
3.	The Three Cases	41
4.	The Scope of Article 7-3	44
5.	The Changes in 1977	45
6.	The 1994 Changes	46
7.	The Changes of 2008 and 2010	47
8.	Summary	49

Chapter 4	
Attribution of Profits to PE: A Business Perspective	51
<i>Johan Muller</i>	
1. Introduction	51
2. A General Appraisal of the Tax Work Done by the OECD, in Particular the Committee on Fiscal Affairs	51
3. Questions of the Day	53
3.1 Which Differences Still Exist in Post-2010 Treaties between PEs and Subsidiaries Regarding Profit Determination and Arm's Length Dealing?	53
3.2 Which Commentary Should a Court Read?	54
3.2.1 The Status of Existing Commentaries to Tax Treaties	54
3.2.2 The Status of New Commentaries to Pre-existing Tax Treaties	55
4. Should the Court Also Read the Profit Attribution Report? What Is Its Legal Significance (If Any)?	57
5. Which Capital Is Attributable to the PE?	57
6. Do We Now Have Full Internal Interest, Rent, Fees and Royalties?	57
7. Withholding Taxes on Such Notional Remunerations (Which Are Not 'Payments')?	58
8. Which State Should Follow Which State's Adjustments? Whichever Is Last in Auditing the Company?	59
9. Practical Examples	59
10. Management PEs	59
11. Drill Ships	60
12. Freight forwarder Service PEs?	61
Part III	
Tax Treaty Entitlement of CIVs	63
Chapter 5	
Characterization and Tax Treaty Issues of Collective Investment Vehicles: A Review of the OECD Report and the 2010 Amendments to the Model Tax Convention	65
<i>Bruno da Silva</i>	
1. Introduction	65
2. The Relevance of CIVs and the Tax Policy	66
3. Tax Treaty Issues	68
4. The Definition of CIVs	70
5. Claim of Tax Treaty Benefits by CIVs	71
5.1 Preliminary Remarks	71
5.2 CIV as a 'Person'	71

Table of Contents

5.3	CIV as a 'Resident'	73
5.4	CIV as 'Beneficial Owner' of the Income	75
6.	Tax Treaty Claim by Investors	79
7.	Double Tax Relief	80
8.	Conclusions	81

Chapter 6

Suggested Treaty Benefits Approaches for Collective Investment Vehicles (CIVs) and Its Investors under the OECD MTC 2010 Update **83**

Hein Vermeulen

1.	The Problem	84
2.	The Solutions	85
3.	Inclusion in the Tax Treaty of a Definition of the CIVs of the Contracting States	86
4.	The 'In Its Own Right-Approach'	87
4.1	Full Treaty Benefits	87
4.2	Proportionate Treaty Benefits	89
4.2.1	Extension to Other Contracting States	91
4.2.2	Limitation to the Contracting States	92
4.2.3	Threshold Consideration	92
5.	The 'Look Through-Approach'	93
5.1	The Basic 'Look Through-Approach'	94
5.2.	Extension to Other Contracting States	94
5.3	Risk of Abuse	96
6.	Compliance Considerations	96
6.1	Assumption of Ownership	96
6.2	Reasonable Proportionment Approach	97
6.3	Publicly Traded CIVs	97
7.	Conclusion	98

Chapter 7

The 2010 CIV-Report: A Comparison with the 1999 Partnership Report **101**

Ton Stevens

1.	Introduction	101
2.	Comparison	102
2.1	Procedure/Goal/Scope	102
2.2	Definitions	104
2.3	Treaty Entitlement	105
2.3.1	General	105
2.3.2	Person	105

2.3.3 Resident	106
2.3.4 Beneficial Owner	107
2.4 Source State Perspective	108
2.5 Residence State Perspective	110
3. Conclusions	111

Part IV

Income from Employment	113
-------------------------------	------------

Chapter 8

Updates to the Commentary on Article 15 of the OECD Model – Thoughts on the Interpretation of the Term ‘employer’ for Treaty Purposes	115
<i>Walter Andreoni</i>	

1. Introduction	115
2. International Hiring Out of Labour	116
3. The Update to the Commentary on Article 15 OECD MC	117
4. A Formalistic Approach to the Definition of the Term ‘Employer’	119
5. A Substantial Approach to the Definition of the Term ‘Employer’	121
6. Conclusions	123

Chapter 9

Some Selected Interpretation and Qualification Issues with Respect to Article 15(2)(b) and (c) of the OECD Model	125
<i>Frank P.G. Pötgens</i>	

1. Introduction	125
2. Paragraph 8 of the 1992–2008 Commentary on Article 15	126
3. Some General Features of the 2010 Commentary on Article 15 of the OECD Model	127
4. Interpretation	128
4.1 Distinction between Formal and De Facto Employer	128
4.2 Formal Employer	129
4.3 De Facto Employer	129
4.4 Evaluation of Interpretation Method as Regards De Facto Employer	131
5. Interpretation Conflicts and Qualification Conflicts	133
5.1 General	133
5.2 The 2010 Commentary on Article 15 of the OECD Model as Regards Qualification and Interpretation Conflicts	135
6. ‘Paid by, or on Behalf of’ (Article 15(2)(b) of the OECD Model)	137
6.1 General	137
6.2 2010 Commentary on Article 15 of the OECD Model	137

Table of Contents

7.	‘Borne by’ (Article 15(2)(c) of the OECD Model)	140
7.1	General	140
7.2	The Meaning of <i>Borne by</i> according to the Commentary on Article 15(2)(c) of the OECD Model	140
8.	Conclusion	142

Part V

The Revised Transfer Pricing Guidelines	145
--	------------

Chapter 10

The 2010 update to the OECD Transfer Pricing Guidelines	147
--	------------

Caroline Silberstein

1.	The Arm’s Length Principle and the TPG	147
2.	Structure and Contents of the TPG	148
3.	An Extensive Consultation Process	149
4.	New Guidance on Comparability (Chapter III)	149
5.	Putting Comparability Analysis into Perspective	151
6.	New Guidance on the Selection of the ‘Most Appropriate Method to the Circumstances of the Case’ (Chapter II)	153
7.	New Guidance on the Application of Transactional Profit Methods (Chapter II)	154
8.	New Guidance on the Application of the Arm’s Length Principle to Business Restructurings (Chapter IX)	154
9.	Conclusion: Way Forward	159

Chapter 11

Chapters I and III of the 2010 OECD Guidelines:

Capita Selecta	161
-----------------------	------------

Antonio Russo

1.	General	161
2.	Chapter I: The Arm’s Length Principle, ‘Reloaded’	163
3.	Chapter III: More on Comparability Analysis	165
4.	Conclusive Remarks	169

Chapter 12

OECD Revision of Chapters I–III and IX of the Transfer Pricing Guidelines: Some Comments on Hierarchy of Methods and Re-characterization of Actual Transactions Undertaken	173
---	------------

Guglielmo Maisto

1.	Introduction	173
2.	Hierarchy of Methods	175
2.1	Description of the Changes	175

2.2	The Procedure for Selecting the Methods	177
2.3	Trends in the Use of Profit Methods	178
3.	The New Chapter IX and the Guidance on Recognition of Actual Transaction Undertaken	179
3.1	The Exceptional Cases in Which the Tax Authority Have the Ability to Disregard a Transaction	179
3.2	The Government Exceptional Re-characterization Powers and the Domestic Provisions' Legal Base	181

Part VI

Sovereign Wealth Funds	183
-------------------------------	------------

Chapter 13

How to Treat(y) Sovereign Wealth Funds? The Application of Tax Treaties to State-owned Entities, Including Sovereign Wealth Funds	185
--	------------

Stijn Janssen

1.	Introduction	185
2.	Sovereign Wealth Funds: Spreading Their Wealth	187
3.	MTC: 'State and Any Political Subdivision or Local Authority Thereof'	189
4.	Commentary on Article 1 MTC	190
5.	Commentary on Article 4 MTC	196
5.1	Definition of SWF: Integral Part of the State?	196
5.2	Liable to Tax	200
5.3	Object of the Treaty	201
5.4	Scope of the Treaty	202
5.5	Liable versus Subject to Tax	202
6.	Commentary on Article 10 MTC	205
7.	Commentary on Article 11 MTC	206
8.	Conclusion: International Tax and the Position of SWF	207

Part I

Introduction