

# THE VALUATION OF PROPERTY

A Treatise on the Appraisal of Property for Different Legal Purposes

VOLUME I

BY

JAMES C. BONBRIGHT

Professor of Finance, Columbia University

First Edition Second Impression Third Impression

Published under the Auspices of the
COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY COUNCIL FOR RESEARCH
IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES

THE MICHIE COMPANY

Law Publishers

CHARLOTTESVILLE, VIRGINIA

1965 Reprint

# COPYRIGHT, 1937, BY JAMES C. BONBRIGHT

# PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

All rights reserved. This book, or parts thereof, may not be reproduced in any form without permission of the author.

# THE VALUATION OF PROPERTY VOLUME I

Another Book on Valuation published under the auspices of the Columbia University Council for Research in the Social Sciences

# VALUATION UNDER THE LAW OF EMINENT DOMAIN

A Complete Coverage of the Law of Valuation under Eminent
Domain Based on an Analysis of the Reported Court
Decisions and Commission Cases and on a General
Study of All Types of Valuation of Property by
the Courts.

Two Volumes - Second Edition

By LEWIS ORGEL

Registrar of the City of New York

PUBLISHED BY

THE MICHIE COMPANY

CHARLOTTESVILLE, VIRGINIA

# To

IRVING W. BONBRIGHT with Appreciation and Affection

# PREFACE

This treatise presents the results of a research in legal and economic theories of property valuation, prepared under the direction of the author and under the auspices of the Columbia University Council for Research in the Social Sciences. As with all other studies supported by the Council, the analysis and conclusions are those of the author and his associates, who alone assume responsibility therefor.

Although the present work covers almost the entire study, it omits a detailed treatment of several of the topics to which we have devoted separate monographs or articles. A list of these publications is given below. To the titles of three of the articles are attached asterisks in order to indicate that they are so largely reprinted in this work as hardly to repay the attention of the present reader. Acknowledgments are due to the Columbia Law Review for kind permission to reprint.

# MONOGRAPHS

Public Utility Valuation. By John Bauer and Nathaniel Gold. New York, The Macmillan Company, 1934.

Stock Watering: The Judicial Valuation of Property for Stock-Issue Purposes. By David L. Dodd. New York, Columbia University Press, 1930.

Valuation under the Law of Eminent Domain. By Lewis Orgel. Charlottes-ville, Va., The Michie Co., 1936.

### ARTICLES

"The Amount Available for Dividends Where No-par Shares Have Been Issued," by Joseph L. Weiner, 29 Columbia Law Review 906-919 (1929).

"Balance-sheet Valuations in German Law," by Joseph L. Weiner, 48 Journal of Accountancy 195-206 (1929).

"The Breakdown of 'Present Value' as a Basis of Rate Control," by James C. Bonbright, 15th Proceedings, Academy of Political Science 75–80 (1930).

"The Concept of Depreciation as an Accounting Category," by James C. Bonbright, 5 The Accounting Review 117-124 (1930).

"Conflicting Functions of the Upset Price in a Corporate Reorganization," by Joseph L. Weiner, 27 Columbia Law Review 132–156 (1927).

"Depreciation and Valuation for Rate Control," by James C. Bonbright, published simultaneously in 41 Quarterly Journal of Economics 185–211 (1927) and 27 Columbia Law Review 113–131 (1927).

"Money as a Device for Measuring Value," by Simon H. Rifkind, 26 Columbia Law Review 559-587 (1926).

- "Payment of Dissenting Stockholders," by Joseph L. Weiner, 27 Columbia Law Review 547-565 (1927).
- "The Problem of Judicial Valuation," by James C. Bonbright, 27 Columbia Law Review 493-522 (1927).
- "Progress and Poverty in Current Literature on Valuation," by James C. Bonbright, 40 Quarterly Journal of Economics 295-328 (1926). (Confined to valuation for rate-making purposes.)
- "Railroad Valuation with Special Reference to the O'Fallon Decision," 28 American Economic Review Supplement 181-216 (1928). Simultaneously published in somewhat revised form under the title "The Economic Merits of Original Cost and Reproduction Cost," 41 Harvard Law Review 593-622 (1928).
- "A Survey of the Problem of Valuation," by James C. Bonbright, 20th Proceedings, National Tax Association 15-25 (1927).
- "Theory of Anglo-American Dividend Law," by Joseph L. Weiner, 28 Columbia Law Review 1046-1060 (1928), 29 ibid. 461-483 (1929), 30 ibid 330-358 (1930).
- "Two Rival Theories of the Priority Rights of Security Holders in a Corporate Reorganization," by James C. Bonbright and Milton M. Bergerman, 28 Columbia Law Review 127-165 (1928).
- \*"Valuation of Property to Measure Fire-insurance Losses," by James C. Bonbright and David Katz, 29 Columbia Law Review 857-900 (1929).
- \*"The Valuation of Real Estate for Tax Purposes," by James C. Bonbright, 34 Columbia Law Review 1397-1438 (1934).
- \*"Valuation to Determine Solvency under the Bankruptcy Act," by James C. Bonbright and Charles Pickett, 29 Columbia Law Review 582–622 (1929), reprinted in 34 Commercial Law League Journal 684, 751 (1929).
- "Value and Vested Rights," by Robert L. Hale, 27 Columbia Law Review 523-529 (1927).
- "Value to the Taker in Condemnation Cases," by Robert L. Hale, 31 Columbia Law Review 1-31 (1931).
- "What Is Fair Value in Taxation?" by Simon H. Rifkind, 19th Proceedings, National Tax Association 305-313 (1926).

Other publications by members of our staff, while not formal contributions to this research, may be noted for their discussions of value theory: Professor Robert L. Hale's book on Valuation and Rate Making (New York, 1918); his portion of Smith, Dowling and Hale's Cases on the Law of Public Utilities (rev. ed., St. Paul, 1936); the author's article on "Valuation" in the Encyclopedia of the Social Sciences; his monograph on Railroad Capitalization (New York, 1920); and his portion of the Minority Report of the New York State Commission on the Revision of the Public Service Commissions Law (Albany, 1930). Professor David L. Dodd is co-author with Mr. Benjamin Graham of a book on Security Analysis (New York, 1934), which discusses the valuation of corporate securities. The official

PREFACE ix

Report on Law and Procedure in Condemnation Applicable to Proceedings Brought by the City of New York (New York, 1932), by Hon. Leonard M. Wallstein, reflects many of the views of Mr. Lewis Orgel, whose studies and services were loaned by the research to Mr. Wallstein for this investigation.

It may be in point to mention the relationship between this study and other studies published under the auspices of the Columbia University Council. That by Professor Adolf A. Berle, Jr., and Dr. Gardiner C. Means, on The Modern Corporation and Private Property (New York and Chicago, 1932), raises issues as to asset valuation and security valuation, some of which are discussed here. Jointly with Miss Victoria J. Pederson, Professor Berle also published a book on Liquid Claims and National Wealth (New York, 1934), which goes further than we have gone in raising certain implications as to the significance of market values. Professors Robert M. Haig and Roswell Magill are directing a research on the concepts of taxable income, one portion of which has already been published: Magill, Taxable Income (New York, 1936). The close connection between the theory of income and the theory of value is well recognized by economists, and the newer study will doubtless clarify many issues inadequately treated in the present work.

So many of the author's colleagues and former students have participated in this study that it is impossible to assign proper credit to each individual.

Without the constant cooperation of Mr. Joseph L. Weiner of the New York Bar, this book could not have been written in its present form. The chapters on the law of damages, on the law of dividends, on suits by dissenting stockholders, on the law of reorganization, and on the valuation of corporate stock under the Federal income tax, are largely based on his studies; and many portions of them have been written by him. His criticisms and suggestions have influenced the entire treatise. At present he is Counsel to the Board of Transportation of the City of New York.

The separate treatise on Valuation under the Law of Eminent Domain, by Mr. Lewis Orgel of the New York Bar, forms the basis of the summary of this subject presented in Chap. XVI of the present work. Mr. Orgel is now Assistant \*Corporation Counsel of the City of New York, in charge of important condemnation cases.

The untimely death of Mr. Charles S. S. Epstein of the New York Bar was a serious loss to the research staff and to the legal profession. A large part of the chapters on tax valuations was prepared by him, as was a portion of our study in the law of damages.

Mr. David Katz of the New York Bar is co-author of the article on "Valuation of Property to Measure Fire Insurance Losses," which is almost completely reprinted as Chap. XV. He also contributed much to the damage study.

Mr. Simon H. Rifkind of the New York Bar, in addition to writing the articles noted above, was a major contributor to the chapters on tax valuations.

Mr. Charles J. Pickett of the New York Bar prepared the material for the article on valuation as a test of solvency, which is now substantially reprinted as Chap. XXII.

The separate volume on *Stock Watering*, by Professor David L. Dodd of the Columbia University School of Business, is the only comprehensive study that has yet been made of valuation for stockissue purposes. His conclusions are summarized in Chap. XXIII.

Mr. Milton M. Bergerman of the New York Bar is co-author of the separate article on corporate reorganization, which discusses a controversial legal theory mentioned in Chap. XXV. He also contributed to the study of the damage cases.

Mrs. Dorothy Maggs prepared much of the material for the study of public-utility condemnations and for the references to the British condemnation law.

Mr. Warren H. Lowenhaupt of the New York Bar initiated the study of eminent domain, which he was prevented from concluding because of his appointment as secretary to the late Judge Bijur of the New York Supreme Court.

The separate article on "Value to the Taker," by Professor Robert L. Hale of Columbia University, furnishes our analysis of this aspect of the law of condemnation, discussed in Chap. XVI and in Mr. Orgel's book on eminent domain.

Mr. Carlos L. Israels of the New York Bar contributed reports used in the chapters on the law of damages.

Dr. Gardiner C. Means' call to Washington terminated his brief membership on the research staff. But his critical analysis of the chapters on value concepts have led to material revisions in this part of the treatise.

Dr. John Bauer and Mr. Nathaniel Gold prepared the monograph on valuation for purposes of rate control. While the chapters on the same subject in the present treatise (Chaps. XXX and XXXI) present the independent views of the author, they reveal few conflicts on major issues.

Mr. Morton Liftin of the New York Bar participated in the revision of the chapters on property taxation.

Miss Elizabeth Sanford initiated the study of tax assessments under the unit rule.

Mr. Benjamin Goldring of the New York Bar collaborated with the author in completing Chaps. XVII, XVIII, and XIX, on tax valuations.

Messrs. Myron N. Krotinger and Milton Sandberg prepared the material for the sections of Chap. XXV dealing with corporate reorganizations under Secs. 77 and 77B of the Bankruptcy Act. They also made valued contributions to Chaps. XIII and XIV, on the law of damages.

The brief acknowledgments that follow by no means adequately express the author's indebtedness to colleagues and other specialists for important advice and criticisms: In accountancy, to Mr. Howell A. Inghram and Professor Roy B. Kester of Columbia University, and to Mr. George O. May of Messrs. Price, Waterhouse & Co.; in appraisal, to Messrs. J. W. Cunningham and L. H. Olson of the American Appraisal Company; in bibliography, to Mr. Walter Hausdorfer and his staff in the library of the Columbia University School of Business; in fireinsurance appraisals, to Mr. H. R. Bassford of the Metropolitan Life Insurance Company, to Professor Ralph H. Blanchard of Columbia University, and to Mr. Prentiss B. Reed of the firm of Wagner & Glidden; in the law of damages, to Professor Charles T. McCormick of the Northwestern University School of Law; in the law of evidence, to Professor Jerome Michael of Columbia University; in the law of real property, to Professor Richard R. B. Powell of Columbia University; in the mathematics of finance, to Professors Harold Hotelling and John A. Northcott of Columbia University; in taxation, to Professors Robert M. Haig, Roswell Magill, and Carl S. Shoup of Columbia University, to Hon. Barnet Hodes, Corporation Counsel of the City of Chicago and former member of the Illinois State Tax Commission, to Dr. Arthur H. Kent and associates in the Federal Department of Internal Revenue, and to Mr. David C. Krakauer and Commissioner Jacob Manicoff of the New York State Department of Taxation and Finance; and in many legal problems, to Professor Hastings Lyon of Columbia University. At the inception of the study, Professor Karl Llewellyn of Columbia University took part in the staff conferences and presented points of view that have been fundamental to the preparation of the entire treatise. To Miss Anna D. Hynd of Columbia University the author is indebted for her able superintendence of the secretarial work.

NEW YORK, N. Y., January, 1937. JAMES C. BONBRIGHT.

# COMPLETE LIST OF CHAPTERS

Preface	Page Vii
VOLUME I	
PART I. CONCEPTS OF VALUE	
I. THE PROBLEM OF JUDICIAL VALUATION	3
II. CONCEPTS OF PROPERTY VALUE	10
III. MARKET VALUE OR EXCHANGE VALUE	40
IV. VALUE TO THE OWNER	66
V. THE CONCEPT OF PROPERTY AS AFFECTING THE CONCEPT OF VALUE	98
PART II. METHODS OF VALUATION	
VI. METHOD OF VALUATION AS DEPENDENT ON MEANING OF VALUE	113
VII. METHODS OF VALUATION: I. GENERAL THEORY; II. ACTUAL SALE	
PRICES AS MEASURES OF VALUE	127
VIII. ACTUAL OR ORIGINAL COST AS A MEASURE OF VALUE	140
IX. REPLACEMENT COST AS A MEASURE OF VALUE	150
X. Depreciation as a Deduction from Replacement Cost New	177
XI. Capitalized Income as a Measure of Value XII. Capitalized Earnings as the Basis of Enterprise Valuation	216 233
AII. CAPITALIZED MARRINGS AS THE DASIS OF ENTERPRISE VALUATION	200
PART III. VALUATION FOR SPECIFIC LEGAL PURPOSES	
XIII. VALUE AS A MEASURE OF INDEMNITY: THE LAW OF DAMAGES	269
XIV. VALUATION UNDER THE LAW OF DAMAGES, CONTINUED	319
XV. THE MEASUREMENT OF FIRE-INSURANCE LOSSES	362
XVI. VALUATION UNDER THE LAW OF EMINENT DOMAIN	407
XVII. VALUATION FOR TAX PURPOSES: THE GENERAL PROPERTY TAX XVIII. VALUATION OF PUBLIC UTILITIES AND OTHER ENTERPRISES FOR	451
Tax Purposes	511
Ann a University	011
VOLUME II	
XIX. TAX VALUATIONS UNDER THE UNIT RULE: HISTORICAL DEVELOP-	
MENT	633
XX. TAX VALUATIONS UNDER THE UNIT RULE: LEGAL AND ECONOMIC	
Analysis	658

xiv	COMPLETE LIST OF CHAPTERS	
CHAPTER XXI.	VALUATION UNDER THE ESTATE AND INHERITANCE TAXES	PAGE 693
XXII.	DETERMINATION OF SOLVENCY UNDER THE BANKRUPTCY ACT	747
XXIII.	VALUATION UNDER THE LAWS AGAINST STOCK WATERING	790
XXIV.	VALUATION IN DISSENTING STOCKHOLDERS' SUITS	811
XXV.	MORTGAGE FORECLOSURES AND CORPORATE REORGANIZATIONS	837
XXVI.	VALUATION TO DETERMINE INCOME: INTRODUCTORY	894
XXVII.	VALUATION TO DETERMINE PROFITS OR SURPLUS AVAILABLE FOR	
	Dividends	912
XXVIII.	VALUATION UNDER THE FEDERAL INCOME TAX	976
XXIX.	THE VALUATION OF CORPORATE STOCK UNDER THE FEDERAL	
	INCOME TAX	1019
XXX.	VALUATION FOR RATE-MAKING PURPOSES: ECONOMIC THEORY	
	VERSUS LEGAL DOCTRINE	1078
XXXI.	Valuation for Rate-making Purposes: Methods of Appraisal;	
	NONUTILITY PRICE FIXING	1111
XXXII.	Conclusions	1166
Case Int	DEX	1199
SUBJECT	INDEX	1221

TOPICAL TABLE OF CONTENTS OF VOLUME I	
PREFACE	Vii
PART I	
CONCEPTS OF VALUE	
CHAPTER I	
The Problem of Judicial Valuation	3
CHAPTER II	
CONCEPTS OF PROPERTY VALUE	10
CHAPTER III	
As Construed by Economists, 40. Preference for "Exchange Value," 41. Inadequate Attention Given to Definition, 43. First Meaning: Price for Which the Property Can Be Sold, 44. Second Meaning: Current Market Price per Unit, Multiplied by Number of Units to Be Valued, 46. Neither Definition Precludes Different Valuations at Same Time, 48. Time for Negotiation of Sale Unstated, 49. Time of Delivery and Payment Not Stated, 50. Type of Owner Not Stated, 51. Not Clear What Pressures Buyer and Seller May Use in Bargaining, 51. May Mean Gross or Net Sale Price, 53. As Construed by the Courts, 54. First Sense: Price Which Property Would Bring If Offered for Sale, with Reasonable Time for Negotiation, 56. Second Sense: Valuation Based on Current Market Prices of Substantially Similar Commodities, 57. Third Sense: Hypothetical Sale Price as between Willing Buyer and Willing Seller, 59. Fourth Sense: Cost of Replacement through Purchase on Market Place, 61. Fifth Sense: "Justified" or "Normal" Selling Price, 62. Conclusions, 64.	40
CHAPTER IV	
A Form of Subjective Value, 67. "Owner" Used in Broad Sense, 69.  Measured in Terms of Money, 70. Identical in Amount with Adverse Value of Entire Loss That Owner Would Suffer if Deprived of the Prop-  xv	66

PAGE erty, 71. Can Be Stated Only by Reference to Conditions under Which Ownership Interest Is Assumed to Cease, 74. Value of the Parts of an Organic Whole, 76. Possible Distinctions between What a Thing Is Worth, and What People Think It Is Worth, 82. Hindsight Valuations, 83. Does "Value to Owner" Accept Owner's Judgment and Taste? 85. "Pecuniary" or "Economic" Value, 87. Sentimental Value, 90. Relation between Value to Owner and Market Value, 91. Summary, 92. Appendix on Economists' Concepts of Marginal Utility and Subjective Value, 94. CHAPTER V THE CONCEPT OF PROPERTY AS AFFECTING THE CONCEPT OF VALUE. . . 98 Disputes as to Value as Dependent on Disputes as to Nature of the Property, 98. Ambiguity of the Word "Property," 100. Do Appraisers Value Objects of Wealth or Merely the Legal Rights in These Objects? 101. Changing Concept of Property, 105. PART II METHODS OF VALUATION CHAPTER VI METHOD OF VALUATION AS DEPENDENT ON MEANING OF VALUE. . . . . . 113 Meaning of Value as Affecting Problem of Evidence, 113. Theory of Proof Confused by Ill-defined Concepts of Thing to Be Proved, 115. Confusion Because Evidence of Value, Like Value Itself, Is Often Stated in Dollars, 117. Situations Where "Evidence" Is Superior to Value Itself, 119. Compromise Rules of Evidence Resulting from Compromise Standards of Value, 122. Conclusions, 125. CHAPTER VII METHODS OF VALUATION: I. GENERAL THEORY; II. ACTUAL SALE PRICES AS General Theory of Appraisal Technique, 129. Does Valuation Involve Prophecy?, 132. Actual Sales as Measures of Value, 134. As Evidence of Market Value, 134. As Evidence of Value to the Owner, 138. CHAPTER VIII Actual Cost, Original Cost, Historical Cost, 140. A Question of "Fact" or an Opinion Estimate? 141. Bearing on Present Value, 144. Sometimes Influences Valuation beyond Merits as Probative of Present Value, 146. CHAPTER IX REPLACEMENT COST AS A MEASURE OF VALUE. . . . . Definitions of Replacement Cost and Reproduction Cost, 152. Theory

of Replacement-cost Valuations, 153. First Theory: Law of Competitive Price, 153. Second Theory: Law of Substitution, 156. The "Inci-

PAGE

dental-damage" Factor, 157. When Is Replacement Cost a Measure of Value, Not Merely an Upper Limit? 159. Depreciation as a Deduction, 160. The Interest Factor, 161. Cost of Identical Property May Measure Value Only on Assumption that Property Would Be Replaced by Virtual Replica, 163. The Estimate of Reproduction Cost, 165. The Role of Replacement Cost in the Appraisal of Different Types of Property, 167. Marketable Chattels, 168. Vacant Land, 168. Improved Real Estate, 169. Fixed Assets, 169 An Entire Physical Plant, 170. A Business Enterprise, 171. Securities, 172. Limited Role of Replacement Cost as a Measure of "Intrinsic Value," 172. Replacement Cost Sometimes a Better Basis of Valuation Than Value Itself, 174. Summary, 175.

# CHAPTER X

Depreciation as a Deduction from Replacement Cost New. . . . . 177 Controversial Nature of Subject, 178. Meanings of Depreciation, 179. Confusions in Meaning Due to Ill-defined Concepts of Value, 179. First Sense: Impaired Serviceableness, 183. Second Sense: Fall in Value, 183. Third Sense: Difference between Value of Old Property and Value of Hypothetical, New Property, 184. Fourth Sense: Amortized Cost, 185. Types of Depreciation, 187. The Measurement of Depreciation as a Deduction from Cost New, 188. Determined by Present Value of Prospective Differential Income, 189. Formulas Designed to Allow for Differential Income, 190. First Assumption: Equal and Constant Annual Incomes but Different Periods of Useful Life, 191. Second Assumption: Equal Future Service Lives with Constant Income Differential, 194. Third Assumption: Combination of the Two Previous Assumptions, 195. Difficulty of Securing More Realistic Formulas, 195. The Problem of Allowing Simultaneously for Various Kinds of Depreciation, 196. Retirement Dates, 199. Estimating Future Service Life, 200. Salvage or Scrap Value, 201. The Incidental-damage Factor, 202. Does the Straight-line Method Exaggerate Depreciation? 203. Observation 204. Composite Depreciation, 206. Plant-immortality Theory, 207. 50 Per Cent Theory, 209. Organic Theory, 209. Appreciation, 212. Conclusion, 213.

# CHAPTER XI

# CHAPTER XII

Capitalized Earnings as the Basis of Enterprise Valuation . . . . 233

Meaning of the "Value" of a Business Enterprise, 234. Principle That
Value Depends Solely on Prospective Earnings, 237. Exceptions to This
Principle, 238. Bearing of Asset Valuations, 240. Stock-and-bond
Method, 244. Application of Capitalized-earnings Method: Estimating

Earning Power, 249. Realized vs. Prophesied Earnings, 249. Current vs. Average Earnings, 251. Calculation of Realized Net Earnings: Allowance for Depreciation, 253. Allowance for Taxes, 257. Rate of Capitalization as Applied to Future Earnings, 259. As Applied to Realized Earnings, 262. Summary, 264.

# PART III

# VALUATION FOR SPECIFIC LEGAL PURPOSES

# CHAPTER XIII

VALUE AS A MEASURE OF INDEMNITY: THE LAW OF DAMAGES. . . . . . . 269 INTRODUCTION TO THE INDEMNITY CASES, 269. Distinction between Indemnity and Other Forms of Compensation, 269. Bearing of Indemnity Principle on Concept of "Value," 271. Legal Use of Value Concept to Distinguish between Recoverable and Nonrecoverable Losses, 273. THE LAW OF DAMAGES, 276. Introductory, 276. The Role of Valuation in the Measurement of Damages, 277. The Assumed Principle of Full Indemnity versus Conflicting Principles or Rules of Recovery, 278. Failure to Allow Full Costs of Litigation, 279. Inadequate Allowance of Interest, 280. Failure to Allow for Changes in Value of Money, 280. Failure to Allow for Changes in Value of Property, 281. Rule against Allowance for "Sentimental Value," 285. Doctrine against Allowance for "Speculative Damage," 285. Delimination of Recovery to Injuries (a) "Reasonably Contemplated" or (b) "Proximately Caused," 286. Arbitrary, Traditional Rules Opposed to Exact Indemnity, 288. Influence on Value Concept of Three Conflicting Legal Motives, 288. Value as Dependent on Who Is Suing, 291. The Dealer as Plaintiff, 292. The Manufacturer-seller as Plaintiff, 310. The Consumer as Plaintiff, 315.

### CHAPTER XIV

# CHAPTER XV

THE MEASUREMENT OF FIRE-INSURANCE LOSSES . . . .

Nature of Policy as Affecting Nature of Recovery, 365. Cash Value as Limiting Recovery, 368. Cash Value as Interpreted by the Cases, 372. Merchandise in Hands of Dealer, 373. Manufactured Goods in Hands of Manufacturer, 377. Personal Property Held for Use, 379. Buildings, 384. Effect of Limiting Clause, 394. Summary, 401.