

COMMUNICATION, SOCIETY AND POLITICS

"Clark and Marchi take an unsparing look at how young people today are getting, creating, and sharing their news by-passing traditional news organizations. It's a sobering, insightful probe into four urban communities and a cautionary tale for news organizations whose very existence depends on reaching the next generation of news consumers."

Lulu Garcia-Navarro, Host, Weekend Edition Sunday, NPR

"Much here will be eye-opening to those who are too quick to dismiss the political consciousness of the coming generation and the future of journalism. Rather than focusing on youth news consumption as a problem, this book shows what's working about how young people share news and information with each other and what its implications are for fostering even greater degrees of civic and political participation."

Henry Jenkins, Co-author, By Any Media Necessary: The New Youth Activism

"In this beautifully written book, Clark and Marchi insightfully look beneath popular claims of youth apathy to reveal the multidimensionality of young Americans' engagement with the news and the potential for reconnecting them to powerful media and political processes."

Sonia Livingstone, LSE, author of The Class: Living and Learning in the Digital Age

"The future of democracy depends on how today's young people learn to use, share, and produce the news. Clark and Marchi offer an impressive theoretical framework and rich and insightful narratives of actual youth to diagnose the current crisis and propose solutions."

Peter Levine, Associate Dean and Lincoln Filene Professor, Jonathan M. Tisch College of Civic Life, Tufts University

Cover illustration: Erik McGregor/Pacific Press/ LightRocket via Getty Images.





ark

Young People and the Future of News

Social Media and the Rise of Connective Journalism

LYNN SCHOFIELD CLARK

University of Denver

REGINA MARCHI

Rutgers University



CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107190603
DOI: 10.1017/9781108116015

© Lynn Schofield Clark and Regina Marchi 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-19060-3 Hardback ISBN 978-1-316-64072-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Young People and the Future of News

Young People and the Future of News traces the practices that are evolving as young people come to see news increasingly as something shared via social networks and social media rather than produced and circulated solely by professional news organizations. The book introduces the concept of connective journalism, clarifying the role of creating and sharing stories online as a key precursor to collective and connective political action. At the center of the story are high school students from low-income minority and immigrant communities who often feel underserved or misrepresented by mainstream media but express a strong interest in politics and their communities. Drawing on in-depth field work in four major urban areas over the course of ten years, Young People and the Future of News sheds light on how young people share news that they think others should know about, express solidarity, and bring into being new publics and counterpublics.

Lynn Schofield Clark is Professor and Chair of the Department of Media, Film, and Journalism Studies and Director of the Estlow International Center for Journalism and New Media at the University of Denver. She is author of *The Parent App: Understanding Families in a Digital Age* (2013) and *From Angels to Aliens: Teenagers, the Media and the Supernatural* (2005), and is coauthor of *Media, Home and Family* (2004).

Regina Marchi is Associate Professor of Journalism and Media Studies at Rutgers University. Before entering academia, she worked as a journalist, community organizer, and teacher. Her first book, *Day of the Dead in the USA: The Migration and Transformation of a Cultural Phenomenon* (2009), won the 2010 national James W. Carey Award for Media Research and an International Latino Book Award in the category of "Best History/Political Book."



COMMUNICATION, SOCIETY AND POLITICS

Editors

W. Lance Bennett, *University of Washington*Robert M. Entman, *The George Washington University*

Politics and relations among individuals in societies across the world are being transformed by new technologies for targeting individuals and sophisticated methods for shaping personalized messages. The new technologies challenge boundaries of many kinds – between news, information, entertainment, and advertising; between media, with the arrival of the World Wide Web; and even between nations. Communication, Society and Politics probes the political and social impacts of these new communication systems in national, comparative, and global perspective.

Other Books in the Series

Erik Albæk, Arjen van Dalen, Nael Jebril, and Claes de Vreese, Political Journalism in Comparative Perspective

Eva Anduiza, Michael James Jensen, and Laia Jorba, eds., *Digital Media and Political Engagement Worldwide: A Comparative Study*

C. Edwin Baker, Media Concentration and Democracy: Why Ownership Matters

C. Edwin Baker *Media*, *Markets*, *and Democracy*W. Lance Bennett and Robert M. Entman, eds., *Mediated*

Politics: Communication in the Future of Democracy

Rodney Benson, Shaping Immigration News: A French-American Comparison Bruce Bimber, Information and American Democracy:

Bruce Bimber, Information and American Democracy: Technology in the Evolution of Political Power

Bruce Bimber, Andrew Flanagin, and Cynthia Stohl, Collective Action in Organizations: Interaction and Engagement in an Era of Technological Change

Murray Edelman, The Politics of Misinformation

Frank Esser and Barbara Pfetsch, eds., Comparing Political Communication: Theories, Cases, and Challenges

Myra Marx Ferree, William Anthony Gamson, Jürgen Gerhards, and Dieter Rucht, Shaping Abortion Discourse: Democracy and the Public Sphere in Germany and the United States

Hernan Galperin, New Television, Old Politics: The Transition to Digital TV in the United States and Britain

Tim Groeling, When Politicians Attack: Party Cohesion in the Media

(continued after the Index)



Acknowledgments

This book has benefitted from the insights of many colleagues and friends. We were fortunate to have opportunities to interact with many people who listened, read, and commented on our research at differing stages, and we are grateful to our families and to colleagues at our home universities of the University of Denver and Rutgers University for their support.

Special thanks are due especially to Adrienne Russell for reading and commenting throughout and for being such a great inspiration and friend; to Margie Thompson for her inspiration and collaborations as a scholar activist; and to University of Denver alumna Rachel Monserrate for her early and important work interviewing high school journalists. We also want to thank Lance Bennett, Director of the Center for Communication and Civic Engagement, for his helpful feedback on the manuscript, as well as the anonymous reviewers and staff at Cambridge University Press.

Lynn wishes to thank University of Denver colleagues Erika Polson, Yoli Anyon, and Heather Kennedy, and Critical Participatory Action research collaborators Hava Gordon, Nicole Nicotera, and Kate Willink, as well as colleagues Nancy Wadsworth, Mary Stansbury, Derigan Silver, Nadia Kaneva, Renee Botta, Sheila Schroeder, Christof Demont-Heinrich, Rod Buxton, Diane Waldman, Elizabeth Henry, Tony Gault, Bob Handley, Steven Barnard, Rachel Liberman, and Taylor Nygaard. She also thanks University of Denver research assistants and associates Grace Chiou, Mike Mwirigi, Ben Peters, Badiah Haffejee, Maggie Lautzenheizer-Page, Courtney Dunson, Lilly Kautz, Andrea Ring, Diana Aqra, Maria Lewis, Elle Mohs, Mario Fierro, and Jen O'Connor for such wonderful support and valuable insights. She also thanks friends and colleagues at the University of Colorado who provided encouragement and wisdom,

including Stewart Hoover, Nabil Echchaibi, Benjamin Thevenin (now at Brigham Young University), and Deborah Whitehead, and friends who read and commented on earlier versions via Academia.edu, including Andrea Stanton, Maria Jose Brites, David Feltmate, and Timothy Beal.

A key opportunity to formulate research and writing for this book occurred during Lynn's time in 2014 as a visiting fellow at RMIT University in Melbourne. Special thanks are due to Heather Horst at RMIT for her wonderful friendship and her generous offerings of listening and providing feedback on the earliest formations of this book's main thesis. Thanks to other colleagues at RMIT who are members of the wonderfully collegial Digital Ethnography Research Center, including John Postill, Sarah Pink, Larissa Hjorth, and Jo Tacchi, Antonio Castillo, Peter Horsfield, and Elisende Ardevol (from the University of Barcelona) for hospitality and timely conversations; Zala Volcic, Mark Andrejevic, Graeme Turner, Pradip Thomas, and Nick Carah at the University of Queensland; Gerard Goggin and Fiona Martin at the University of Sydney; and Anita Harris and Amy Dobson at Monash University.

Colleagues at the University of Copenhagen, where Lynn serves as an Affiliate Professor, have provided invaluable feedback and suggestions, as well. Thanks to Stig Hjarvard, Christa Lykka Christensen, Nete Christensen, Mette Mortensen, and the mediatization project at the University of Copenhagen for providing generous funding that enabled Lynn to have time to write and think in a wonderfully rich intellectual setting. Lynn also thanks colleagues Klaus Bruhn Jensen, Kjetl Sandvik, and Rasmus Helles in Copenhagen and Gitte Stald at IT; Annette Markham, Stine Liv Johanssen, Kirsten Frandsen, Maja Sonne Damkjaer, and Helle Strandgaard Jensen at Aarhus University; Line Nybro Petersen, Kim Schroder and Kirsten Drotner at Southern Denmark University, and offers a special thanks in memoriam for Kevin Barnhurst, who offered early inspiration for this project when both Lynn and Kevin served as visiting professors in Denmark back in 2007. During a sabbatical at the University of Copenhagen in 2014, Lynn also had an opportunity to visit Stockholm and learn from Jenny Sunden, Alexandra Segerberg, and longtime friend Mia Lovheim.

This project was also developed through interactions at conferences such as the meetings of the Association of Internet Researchers, International Communication Association, the International Conference on Media, Religion, and Culture, and the Social Media and the Transformation of Public Spaces conference, as well as a thinking session with Microsoft scholars Nancy Baym, Dan Green, Tarleton Gillespie,

Andre Brock, and Sara Hamid. Thanks to Zizi Papacharissi, Diane Winston, Mara Einstein, Knut Lundby, Gordon Lynch, Jolyon Mitchell, Nick Couldry, Thomas Poell, Jose Van Dijck, Irene Costera Meijer, Dan Mercea, Maria Bakardjieva, Lina Dencik, Nick John, Goran Bolin, Stina Bengtsson, Mark Deuze, Peter Dahlgren, Sonia Livingstone, Peter Lunt, Terri Senft, Holly Kruse, Jenny Korn, Kishonna Gray, Sun Sun Lim, Ian Gordon, Michele Rosenthal, Mirca Madianou, Danny Miller, Jean Burgess, Karine Nahon, Eszter Hargittai, Karin Wahl-Jorgensen, Jen and Michael Olin-Hitt, Laurie Menzies, Julie Janson, Geoff Baym, Jeffrey Jones, Cornel Sandvoss, Jonathan Gray, Rodney Benson, Paul Mihailidis, Lou Rutigliano, Marie Gillespie, and Clemencia Rodriguez. Thanks also to media activists, educators, and advocates Adan Medrano, Tony Shawcross, Gia Irlando, Nina Horton, Carlo Kriekels, Kris Rollerson, Daniel Weinshenker, Peggy Holman, Steven Silha, Marla Crockett, Linda Miller, Larry Greene, Adrian Barboa, Andrea Quijada, Raphael Nevins, Lorna Samraj, Josh Stearns, Diane Alters, Mario Montano, and Alan Michel.

Thanks to the many collaborators in Denver, including David Brennan, Rich Cole, Ruthann Kallenberg, Haines Eason, Rob Duren, Kristin Waters, Karen Duell, and Jen Hanson, as well as Denise, Abel, Ezana, Yonas, Karim, Jennifer, Prinsela, Samira, Rosemund, Richard, Helena, Christmas, Nabaa, Kunita, Azeb, Gio, Rebekah, Marvon, Barwaga, Joon, Jeneba, Tram, Milad, Sabrina, Seraphina, Fuwei, Jo, Wilfred, Sordum, Barikwa, Amran, John, Tugi, Ace, and Cesar.

Regina wishes to thank the youth at Zumix and Z-Radio in Boston, as well as Zumix staff and parents who shared their insights in interviews with her, and especially Zumix Director, Madeleine Steczynski, who was extremely supportive of this research. She also wants to thank Debra Cave, Director of Boston's City Roots Alternative Education Program and the City Roots high school students who participated in the interviews. In addition, she is grateful to her former student research assistants at Rutgers, Christine Schneider, who coordinated the interviews with young documentary filmmakers at WHYY in Philadelphia, and Carina Sitkus and Cristabel Cruz, who helped interview high school journalism students in New Jersey. She thanks her Rutgers colleagues in the Department of Journalism and Media Studies and in the Social Media and Society Cluster of the School of Communication and Information for helpful conversations and feedback over the years. In addition, a special thanks is due to her family and friends for their encouragement and, particularly, to Roberto Verthelyi for his ongoing moral support during the long research and writing process. Regina also wishes to thank Lynn for inviting her to collaborate on this book. It has been wonderful working together! Early research for this project was funded by a generous grant from the Lilly Endowment, and additional funding came from the University of Denver's Center for Community Engagement and Service Learning and from research funds provided by the Rutgers School of Communication and Information, for which we are very grateful. While we are extremely thankful for the support of so many, we recognize that any errors in this manuscript are our own.

We would like to dedicate this book to our families. To Jon, Jonathan, and Allison and the Schofield and Clark families, and to Roberto and the Marchi and Cave-Madaro families along with Mary Ellen Welch and Kevin Farrell. Thank you for sustaining us and inspiring us throughout this very long project.

Contents

Acknowledgments		page ix
	Introduction: Young People and the Future of News	I
Ι	Young People, Journalism, and Politics	18
2	Connective Journalism	35
3	Hope and Disillusionment with Legacy News	55
4	Young People "Produsing" and Consuming News	79
5	Connective Journalism and the Formation of Youthful Publics and Counterpublics: Inserting Oneself into the Story through Witnessing and Sharing Outrage	112
6	Youth Citizen Journalism: The Connective Journalism Practices of Participation and Making the Story	136
7	Moving Forward: What We Can Do	163
Methods Appendix		201
Notes		213
References		263
Index		293



Introduction

Young People and the Future of News

It was the dawn of a chilly November morning, and a small group of adults had gathered on the sidewalk across the street from a diverse urban high school in Denver. They carried signs reading, "Fags doom nation" and "God hates fags" – visible reminders that these adults were members of the infamous anti-gay Westboro Baptist Church, recognized for its well-publicized and hateful attempts to garner attention. The word had been leaked that the group might stage something at the high school so that, in the colorful words of one of the protesters, they might "warn this wicked generation that their sins will take them straight to hell." The possibility of a protest hadn't been covered in the mainstream media, but teachers, students, and parents had heard the rumors, and on Facebook and other social network sites in the days before the event, many had been involved in conversations about how to respond.

On the morning of the protest, the first students on the scene began texting photos to friends, who in turn texted the news to others and then rushed to the school with handmade signs. Within ten minutes after the protest had begun, three hundred people had reportedly shown up for a silent counterprotest, holding signs that read, "We were born this way," "Spread love, not hate," and "Why is love wrong?"

The camaraderie was palpable. Students who did not usually discuss their own sexual orientation stood alongside those who openly identified as gay or lesbian, straight allies, bisexual, transgender, or questioning. In the crowd were students from a variety of friendship circles and from differing racial/ ethnic and economic backgrounds. They stood together in

proud opposition, their phones held high to document their participation in the event for themselves and for one another.

We first learned of this event almost two years after it had occurred, when we happened to be interviewing a group of students from that school about news and social media. We'd asked the students to talk about a moment when their interactions on a social network site had helped them to become informed about events that were of importance to them. We didn't know at the time that this event would come to be one of many, as US society was then in the early days of a marked upsurge in high school and college student protest movements. A perceived increase in the suppression of youth voice and experience was building, leading to numerous protests, rallies, and acts of civil disobedience. We might date the dramatic increase in protests to the 2014-15 academic year. That was when tens of thousands of high school students and their parents participated in various forms of civil disobedience. Among other things, students opted out of mandated standardized school testing, demonstrated against related cuts to educational and community programs, protested rising university tuitions and soaring student debt, and advocated for the Development, Relief, and Education for Alien Minors (DREAM) Act and other immigrant rights. And perhaps most prominently, students and their family members involved themselves in a variety of activities loosely related to the #BlackLivesMatter movement emerging in the aftermath of teenager Michael Brown's death at the hands of Ferguson Missouri police officers, protesting the overly harsh disciplining of youth by members of law enforcement and calling for more respect for young Black men and women.² Student protest movements continued in the 2015-16 and 2016-17 academic years in high schools from Oregon to Texas and on college campuses from the University of Missouri to the University of Washington, Clemson University and Rutgers, first in relation to disparate resources, relations between students of color and police, and poor on-campus racial climates, and later in response to hate crimes and antiimmigrant rhetoric that took place in response to the election of Donald Trump as US president, stimulating student activism across the country for "sanctuary campuses." Students from around the country marked their identification and solidarity with student activism through the circulation of messages with hashtags such as #StandUpFG, #ReclaimOSU, #jeffco4kids, #DismantleDukePlantation, and Rutgers' #LikeAMinority. The years 2014-2016 also saw the growth of a national movement to end sexual violence on university campuses, with hundreds of victims speaking out, pressing charges against their universities, and organizing protest events.4