

INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNAL FOR THE LAW OF THE SEA
TRIBUNAL INTERNATIONAL DU DROIT DE LA MER

**Pleadings, Minutes of Public
Sittings and Documents**

**Mémoires, Procès-verbaux des
Audiences Publiques et Documents**

2012



TOME II

International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea
Tribunal international du droit de la mer
Am Internationalen Seegerichtshof 1, 22609 Hamburg, Germany

Published by
Brill Nijhoff Publishers

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-04-24584-6 (hardback, set)

ISBN 978-90-04-24582-2 (hardback, vol. 1)

ISBN 978-90-04-24583-9 (hardback, vol. 2)

ISBN 978-90-04-27246-0 (e-book)

© 2014 International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Koninklijke Brill NV provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.



Abbreviated reference:

*ITLOS Pleadings, Minutes and Documents 2012, Vol. 17/II,
Delimitation of the maritime boundary in the Bay of Bengal
(Bangladesh/Myanmar)*

Référence abrégé :

*TIDM mémoires, procès-verbaux et documents 2012, vol. 17/II,
Délimitation de la frontière maritime dans le golfe du Bengale
(Bangladesh/Myanmar)*

INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNAL FOR THE LAW OF THE SEA
PLEADINGS, MINUTES OF PUBLIC SITTINGS AND DOCUMENTS

**DISPUTE CONCERNING DELIMITATION OF
THE MARITIME BOUNDARY BETWEEN BANGLADESH
AND MYANMAR IN THE BAY OF BENGAL
(Bangladesh/Myanmar)
Tome II**

TRIBUNAL INTERNATIONAL DU DROIT DE LA MER
MÉMOIRES, PROCÈS-VERBAUX DES AUDIENCES
PUBLIQUES ET DOCUMENTS

**DIFFÉREND RELATIF À LA DÉLIMITATION DE
LA FRONTIÈRE MARITIME ENTRE LE BANGLADESH
ET LE MYANMAR DANS LE GOLFE DU BENGALE
(Bangladesh/Myanmar)
Tome II**



BRILL NIJHOFF
LEIDEN/BOSTON
2014

DISPUTE CONCERNING DELIMITATION OF
THE MARITIME BOUNDARY BETWEEN BANGLADESH
AND MYANMAR IN THE BAY OF BENGAL
(BANGLADESH/MYANMAR)

DIFFÉREND RELATIF À LA DÉLIMITATION DE
LA FRONTIÈRE MARITIME ENTRE LE BANGLADESH
ET LE MYANMAR DANS LE GOLFE DU BENGAL
(BANGLADESH/MYANMAR)

The proceedings relating to the *Dispute concerning delimitation of the maritime boundary between Bangladesh and Myanmar in the Bay of Bengal* were instituted on 14 December 2009.

The pleadings, oral arguments and documents in the case are published in two tomes:

- | | |
|---------|--|
| Tome I | Pleadings (including a CD-ROM) |
| Tome II | Minutes of public sittings and documents |
-

L'instance relative au *Différend relatif à la délimitation de la frontière maritime entre le Bangladesh et le Myanmar dans le golfe du Bengale* fut introduite le 14 décembre 2009.

Les pièces de la procédure écrite, les plaidoiries et les documents relatifs à l'affaire sont publiés dans deux tomes :

- | | |
|---------|--|
| Tome I | Pièces de la procédure écrite (comprenant un CD-ROM) |
| Tome II | Procès-verbal des audiences publiques et documents |

TABLE OF CONTENTS – TABLE DES MATIÈRES

DISPUTE CONCERNING DELIMITATION OF THE MARITIME BOUNDARY BETWEEN BANGLADESH AND MYANMAR IN THE BAY OF BENGAL (Bangladesh/Myanmar)

DIFFÉREND RELATIF À LA DÉLIMITATION DE LA FRONTIÈRE MARITIME ENTRE LE BANGLADESH ET LE MYANMAR DANS LE GOLFE DU BENGAL (Bangladesh/Myanmar)

TOME II

<i>MINUTES OF PUBLIC SITTINGS –</i>	1163
<i>PROCÈS-VERBAL DES AUDIENCES PUBLIQUES</i>	
MINUTES OF THE PUBLIC SITTINGS HELD FROM 8-24 SEPTEMBER 2011 AND ON 14 MARCH 2012	
PROCÈS-VERBAL DES AUDIENCES PUBLIQUES TENUES DU 8 AU 24 SEPTEMBRE 2011 ET LE 14 MARS 2012	
PUBLIC SITTING HELD ON 8 SEPTEMBER 2011	1169
AUDIENCE PUBLIQUE TENUE LE 8 SEPTEMBRE 2011	1174
a.m.	
Opening of the Oral Proceedings	1179
Ouverture de la procédure orale	
Argument of Bangladesh	
Statement of Ms Moni (Agent)	1182
Statement of Mr Reichler (Counsel)	1185
Statement of Mr Crawford (Counsel)	1196
PUBLIC SITTING HELD ON 9 SEPTEMBER 2011	1210
AUDIENCE PUBLIQUE TENUE LE 9 SEPTEMBRE 2011	1210

a.m./matin

Argument of Bangladesh (continued)

Statement of Mr Boyle (Counsel) 1211

Statement of Mr Sands (Counsel) 1222

PUBLIC SITTING HELD ON 12 SEPTEMBER 2011 1238

AUDIENCE PUBLIQUE TENUE LE 12 SEPTEMBRE 2011 1238

a.m./matin

Argument of Bangladesh (continued)

Statement of Mr Sands (Counsel) (continued) 1239

Statement of Mr Martin (Counsel) 1250

Statement of Mr Reichler (Counsel) 1260

p.m./après-midi

Argument of Bangladesh (continued)

Statement of Mr Crawford (Counsel) 1270

Statement of Mr Akhavan (Counsel) 1284

PUBLIC SITTING HELD ON 13 SEPTEMBER 2011 1293

AUDIENCE PUBLIQUE TENUE LE 13 SEPTEMBRE 2011 1293

a.m./matin

Argument of Bangladesh (continued)

Statement of Mr Parson (Counsel) 1294

Statement of Mr Alam (Deputy Agent) 1302

Statement of Mr Boyle (Counsel) 1306

PUBLIC SITTING HELD ON 15 SEPTEMBER 2011 1320

AUDIENCE PUBLIQUE TENUE LE 15 SEPTEMBRE 2011 1320

p.m./après-midi

Argument of Myanmar

Statement of Mr Shin (Agent) 1321

Exposé de M. Pellet (conseil) 1324

Exposé de M. Samson (conseil) 1332

Statement of Mr Wood (Counsel) 1337

PUBLIC SITTING HELD ON 16 SEPTEMBER 2011 1354

AUDIENCE PUBLIQUE TENUE LE 16 SEPTEMBRE 2011 1354

p.m./après-midi

Argument of Myanmar (continued)

Statement of Mr Wood (Counsel) (continued)	1355
Statement of Mr Sthoeger (Counsel)	1359
Statement of Mr Lathrop (Counsel)	1367
Exposé de M. Pellet (conseil)	1380

PUBLIC SITTING HELD ON 19 SEPTEMBER 2011	1387
--	------

AUDIENCE PUBLIQUE TENUE LE 19 SEPTEMBRE 2011	1387
--	------

a.m./matin

Argument of Myanmar (continued)

Exposé de M. Pellet (conseil) (suite)	1388
Exposé de M. Forteau (conseil)	1397
Exposé de M. Müller (conseil)	1404
Statement of Mr Lathrop (Counsel)	1413
Exposé de M. Forteau (conseil)	1421

p.m./après-midi

Argument of Myanmar (continued)

Exposé de M. Forteau (conseil) (suite)	1426
Statement of Mr Wood (Counsel)	1441
Exposé de M. Pellet (conseil)	1447

PUBLIC SITTING HELD ON 20 SEPTEMBER 2011	1457
--	------

AUDIENCE PUBLIQUE TENUE LE 20 SEPTEMBRE 2011	1457
--	------

a.m./matin

Argument of Myanmar (continued)

Statement of Mr Lathrop (Counsel)	1458
Exposé de M. Pellet (conseil)	1464
Exposé de M. Müller (conseil)	1472

PUBLIC SITTING HELD ON 21 SEPTEMBER 2011	1489
--	------

AUDIENCE PUBLIQUE TENUE LE 21 SEPTEMBRE 2011	1489
--	------

p.m./après-midi

Reply of Bangladesh

Statement of Mr Martin (Counsel)	1490
----------------------------------	------

Statement of Mr Boyle (Counsel)	1496
Statement of Mr Sands (Counsel)	1501
 PUBLIC SITTING HELD ON 22 SEPTEMBER 2011	 1511
AUDIENCE PUBLIQUE TENUE LE 22 SEPTEMBRE 2011	1511
 a.m./matin	
Reply of Bangladesh (continued)	
Statement of Mr Reichler (Counsel)	1512
Statement of Mr Crawford (Counsel)	1526
Statement of Mr Boyle (Counsel)	1533
 p.m./après-midi	
Reply of Bangladesh (continued)	
Statement of Mr Boyle (Counsel) (continued)	1542
Statement of Mr Akhavan (Counsel)	1545
Statement of Mr Crawford (Counsel)	1553
Statement of Mr Alam (Deputy Agent)	1562
Statement of Mr Quayes (Counsel)	1563
 PUBLIC SITTING HELD ON 24 SEPTEMBER 2011	 1565
AUDIENCE PUBLIQUE TENUE LE 24 SEPTEMBRE 2011	1565
 a.m./matin	
Reply of Myanmar	
Statement of Mr Müller (Counsel)	1566
Exposé de M. Pellet (conseil)	1573
Statement of Mr Wood (Counsel)	1583
Exposé de M. Forteau (conseil)	1588
 p.m./après-midi	
Reply of Myanmar (continued)	
Statement of Mr Lathrop (Counsel)	1602
Statement of Mr Wood (Counsel)	1609
Statement of Mr Shin (Agent)	1614
 Closure of the Oral Proceedings	 1615
Clôture de la procédure orale	
 PUBLIC SITTING HELD ON 14 MARCH 2012	 1616

AUDIENCE PUBLIQUE TENUE LE 14 MARS 2012	1619
---	------

a.m./matin

Reading of the Judgment	1622
Lecture de l'arrêt	

<i>DOCUMENTS – DOCUMENTS</i>	1625
------------------------------	------

Authorizations – Autorisations

(a) Letter from the Minister for Foreign Affairs of Bangladesh to the Registrar dated 22 December 2009 designating Mr Md. Khurshed Alam as Deputy Agent	1627
(b) Note verbale No. 44 11 2/1 (569) dated 23 December 2009 from the Minister of Foreign Affairs of Myanmar to the Registrar informing about the appointments of Mr Tun Shin as Agent and Ms Daw Hla Myo Nwe and Mr U Nyan Naing Win as Deputy Agents	1628
(c) Letter from the Agent for Myanmar to the Registrar dated 24 May 2011 replacing Mr Win with Mr San as Deputy Agent	1629
(d) Note verbale No. 206/3208 from the Embassy of Myanmar to the Tribunal dated 15 August 2011 informing about appointment of Mr San as Deputy Agent and replacement for Mr Win	1631

Designation of judges *ad hoc* – Désignation de juges *ad hoc*¹

(a) Letter from the Agent of Myanmar to the Registrar dated 13 January 2010 concerning the appointment of a judge <i>ad hoc</i>	1632
(b) Letter from the Agent of Myanmar to the Registrar dated 5 May 2010 concerning the choice of judge <i>ad hoc</i> by Myanmar	1634
(c) Letter from the Agent of Myanmar to the Registrar dated 12 August 2010 informing about choice of Mr Oxman as judge <i>ad hoc</i> , attached:	1635
- CV of Mr Oxman (not reproduced)	
(d) Letter from the Registrar to both parties dated 7 September 2010 informing about withdrawal of Judge <i>ad hoc</i> Vaughan Lowe (sample reproduced), attached:	1636

¹ *Note by the Registry:* Bangladesh nominated Mr Vaughan Lowe as judge *ad hoc* in paragraph 6 of its letter of 13 December 2009 (see Notification of Special Agreement above).

- letter from Mr Vaughan Lowe to the President of the Tribunal dated 1 September 2010 (not reproduced)	
(e) Letter from the Deputy Agent of Bangladesh to the Registrar dated 13 September 2010 informing about choice of Mr Mensah as judge <i>ad hoc</i> , attached:	1637
- CV of Mr Mensah (not reproduced)	
(f) Letter from the Registrar to the Agent of Myanmar dated 20 September 2010 informing that Mr Oxman will be admitted to participate as judge <i>ad hoc</i>	1638
(g) Letter from the Agent for Myanmar to the Registrar dated 8 October 2010 confirming that Myanmar has no objection to choice of judge <i>ad hoc</i> of Bangladesh	1639
(h) Letter from the Deputy Registrar to the Agent of Bangladesh dated 26 October 2010 informing that Mr Mensah will be admitted to participate as judge <i>ad hoc</i>	1640

Completion of documentation – Complément d'information

(a) Letter from the Deputy Registrar to the Agent of Bangladesh dated 13 July 2010 requesting legible copies of several documents from the Memorial (not reproduced)	
(b) Letter from Mr Reichler, Counsel for Bangladesh, dated 16 July 2010 transmitting legible copies of several documents as requested (letter not reproduced; annexes reproduced as part of Memorial)	
(c) Letter from the Registrar to the Agent of Myanmar dated 1 March 2011 requesting copies of missing page (not reproduced)	
(d) Letter from the Deputy Agent for Myanmar to the Registrar dated 31 March 2011 transmitting complete copy of Annex 2 to Counter-Memorial (letter not reproduced; annexes reproduced as part of Counter-Memorial, tome I, p. 465)	

Responses to questions from the Tribunal – Réponses aux questions du Tribunal

(a) Points which the Tribunal would like the parties to address, 7 September 2011	1642
(b) Letter from the Registrar to the Agent of Bangladesh dated 30 September 2011 requesting information on the coordinates of certain base points	1643
(c) Letter from the Deputy Agent of Bangladesh to the Registrar dated 4 October 2011 in reply to (b) above	1644

Further information - Informations additionnelles

(a) Letter from the Deputy Minister for Foreign Affairs of Myanmar to the Registrar dated 14 January 2010 informing about withdrawal of declaration accepting the jurisdiction of the Tribunal	1646
(b) Letter MOFA/UNCLOS/113/2/235 from the Deputy Agent of Bangladesh to the Registrar dated 18 January 2010 (reproduced as Annex 26 of the Memorial, tome I, p. 252)	
(c) Note verbale No. 205/3208 from the Embassy of the Republic of the Union of Myanmar to the Registry of the Tribunal informing about the change of the complete name of the country	1648

Minutes of Public Sittings – Procès-verbal des audiences publiques

**INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNAL FOR THE LAW OF THE SEA
TRIBUNAL INTERNATIONAL DU DROIT DE LA MER**



MINUTES OF PUBLIC SITTINGS

MINUTES OF THE PUBLIC SITTINGS
HELD FROM 8 TO 24 SEPTEMBER 2011
AND ON 14 MARCH 2012

*Dispute concerning delimitation of the maritime boundary
between Bangladesh and Myanmar in the Bay of Bengal
(Bangladesh/Myanmar)*

PROCÈS-VERBAL DES AUDIENCES PUBLIQUES

PROCÈS-VERBAL DES AUDIENCES PUBLIQUES
TENUES DU 8 AU 24 SEPTEMBRE 2011
ET LE 14 MARS 2012

*Différend relatif à la délimitation de la frontière maritime
entre le Bangladesh et le Myanmar dans le golfe du Bengale
(Bangladesh/Myanmar)*