# Administrative Law

Fifth Edition

William F. Funk Richard H. Seamon

Government of the United States The Constitution lative Branch Executive Branch Judicial Branch The Department of Agriculture The Department of Commerce The Department of Defense The Department of Education The Department of Energy The Department of Health and Human Services The Department of Housing and Urban Developement



Wolters Kluwer

# Administrative Law

Fifth Edition

#### William F. Funk

Lewis & Clark Distinguished Professor of Law Lewis & Clark Law School

#### Richard H. Seamon

Associate Dean for Faculty Affairs and Professor of Law University of Idaho College of Law Copyright © 2016 CCH Incorporated.

Published by Wolters Kluwer in New York.

Wolters Kluwer serves customers worldwide with CCH, Aspen Publishers, and Kluwer Law International products. (www.wolterskluwerlb.com)

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or utilized by any information storage or retrieval system, without written permission from the publisher. For information about permissions or to request permissions online, visit us at www.wolterskluwerlb.com, or a written request may be faxed to our permissions department at 212-771-0803.

To contact Customer Service, e-mail customer.service@wolterskluwer.com, call 1-800-234-1660, fax 1-800-901-9075, or mail correspondence to:

Wolters Kluwer Attn: Order Department PO Box 990 Frederick, MD 21705

Printed in the United States of America.

1234567890

ISBN 978-1-4548-5010-6

#### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Funk, William F., 1945- author.

Administrative law / William F. Funk, Robert E. Jones Professor of Advocacy and Ethics, Lewis & Clark Law School, Richard H. Seamon, Professor of Law, University of Idaho College of Law. — Fifth edition.

pages cm — (Examples & explanations) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-4548-5010-6 (alk. paper)

1. Administrative law — United States. I. Seamon, Richard H., 1959- author. II. Title.

KF5402.F86 2015 342.73'06 — dc23

2015032141



#### **About Wolters Kluwer Law & Business**

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business is a leading global provider of intelligent information and digital solutions for legal and business professionals in key specialty areas, and respected educational resources for professors and law students. Wolters Kluwer Law & Business connects legal and business professionals as well as those in the education market with timely, specialized authoritative content and information-enabled solutions to support success through productivity, accuracy and mobility.

Serving customers worldwide, Wolters Kluwer Law & Business products include those under the Aspen Publishers, CCH, Kluwer Law International, Loislaw, ftwilliam.com and MediRegs family of products.

**CCH** products have been a trusted resource since 1913, and are highly regarded resources for legal, securities, antitrust and trade regulation, government contracting, banking, pension, payroll, employment and labor, and healthcare reimbursement and compliance professionals.

Aspen Publishers products provide essential information to attorneys, business professionals and law students. Written by preeminent authorities, the product line offers analytical and practical information in a range of specialty practice areas from securities law and intellectual property to mergers and acquisitions and pension/benefits. Aspen's trusted legal education resources provide professors and students with high-quality, up-to-date and effective resources for successful instruction and study in all areas of the law.

Kluwer Law International products provide the global business community with reliable international legal information in English. Legal practitioners, corporate counsel and business executives around the world rely on Kluwer Law journals, looseleafs, books, and electronic products for comprehensive information in many areas of international legal practice.

**Loislaw** is a comprehensive online legal research product providing legal content to law firm practitioners of various specializations. Loislaw provides attorneys with the ability to quickly and efficiently find the necessary legal information they need, when and where they need it, by facilitating access to primary law as well as state-specific law, records, forms and treatises.

**ftwilliam.com** offers employee benefits professionals the highest quality plan documents (retirement, welfare and non-qualified) and government forms (5500/PBGC, 1099 and IRS) software at highly competitive prices.

**MediRegs** products provide integrated health care compliance content and software solutions for professionals in healthcare, higher education and life sciences, including professionals in accounting, law and consulting.

Wolters Kluwer Law & Business, a division of Wolters Kluwer, is headquartered in New York. Wolters Kluwer is a market-leading global information services company focused on professionals.

For our wives and best friends, for putting up with us while we write,
Renate Funk
Holly V. Dawkins

— W.F.F. & R.H.S.

### Preface to Fifth Edition

If you are like us when we were law students, you enrolled in a course on administrative law without knowing exactly what the course would be about or understanding what an administrative agency is. The mysteriousness is understandable. Administrative law is like the air we breathe: invisible yet pervasive. Administrative agencies affect so many areas of our lives that we take them for granted. They are part of the atmosphere of modern life, and, like the physical atmosphere, they are necessary (at least in some form) to sustain modern life, but they get little attention from most people. Nonetheless, law students need to learn about them because most lawyers must deal with them.

The near-invisibility and pervasiveness of administrative agencies make administrative law an exciting and challenging subject to learn. Just as students of science learn that the air is made up of many different elements that serve various life-sustaining functions, students of administrative law learn that "the bureaucracy" is made up of many different administrative agencies that serve various governmental functions. Nonetheless, just as all types of physical matter are subject to laws of science (such as the law of gravity), administrative agencies are governed by principles of administrative law. Unfortunately, just as seemingly simple laws of science have hidden complexities, seemingly straightforward principles of administrative law can be difficult to apply in particular situations.

Indeed, administrative law is an especially challenging subject because you must learn both the similarities, as well as differences, in the way government agencies operate. All agencies, for example, must obey the U.S. Constitution, as well as the statutes that create them. The Constitution stays the same, of course, regardless of the agency, but the statute that creates one agency will differ from the statute that creates another agency. In a course on administrative law, you will learn legal principles that are broadly applicable to many or most government agencies. To do so, however, you will study material, including judicial opinions, statutes, and regulations that deal with particular agencies. It can be difficult — but it is critically important — to distinguish the broadly applicable principles from the principles that just apply to a particular agency. For that reason, in a course on administrative law, even more so than in other law school courses, you must be able to see the forest as well as the trees.

This book will help you do that. In the 14 years since the first edition, thousands of law students have used this book. The need for a fifth edition is

#### Preface to Fifth Edition

a result of student demand. The first two chapters give you a lay of the land by providing an overview of (1) what the subject of administrative law is all about, (2) what administrative agencies are, and (3) how they fit into the government structure. Later chapters go into detail about the two major activities in which administrative agencies engage: rulemaking and adjudication. Following the chapters on rulemaking and adjudication are two chapters that will give you a detailed and carefully organized picture of a subject that is near and dear to the hearts of administrative law professors: judicial review of agency action. Finally, we discuss two additional agency activities that are covered in some courses on administrative law: information gathering and information disclosure. We have organized the book as a whole, as well as each chapter, to supply you with a detailed map of the administrative law terrain that should be useful in virtually every administrative law course that uses one of the national casebooks.

In addition to helping you see the big picture, this book is designed to help you understand the details. In every chapter, we discuss each topic in enough depth to facilitate a sophisticated understanding of the topic. These discussions include descriptions of all of the major, relevant decisions of the U.S. Supreme Court (through June 2015), as well as descriptions of the major doctrinal approaches taken by lower federal courts. Our discussion of each topic is followed by examples that enable you to test your understanding of the topic, and by explanations of the examples that, we hope, will deepen your understanding of the topic. Many of these examples are based on actual cases that have been decided by federal courts. This format will bring the sometimes abstract principles of administrative law down to earth.

You can use this book either to prepare for class or to prepare for exams, or for both purposes. The chapters are self-contained, and each chapter is carefully organized to enable you to quickly and easily to locate the topics that you cover in your course. Thus, you do not need to read the book from cover to cover, nor do you need to read the chapters in the order in which they are presented. In particular, you can read our general discussion of a topic to clear up things that remain unclear from class or your casebook, or to review topics at the end of the semester. You can also, during or at the end of the semester, consult the examples and explanations for the topics covered in your course to make sure that you have a handle on that topic or to get additional, concrete illustrations of topics. We hope you find this book helpful. We welcome your comments and suggestions for improvement.

William F. Funk Richard H. Seamon

September 2015

# Summary of Contents

Contents			xi
Preface		>	κvii
Chapter I	Introduction to Administrative Law		1
Chapter 2	How Agencies Fit into Our System of Separated	Powers	23
Chapter 3	Adjudication		71
Chapter 4	Due Process	1	07
Chapter 5	Rulemaking	1	39
Chapter 6	The Availability of Judicial Review	2	.09
Chapter 7	The Scope of Judicial Review	2	75
Chapter 8	Government Acquisition of Private Information	3	31
Chapter 9	Public Access to Government Information	3	61
Table of Case	25	i	419
Index			427

Preface			xvii
Chapter I	Introducti	on to Administrative Law	Ī
	I. Admini	strative Law — The Course	1
	II. Overvie	w of the History of Administrative Law	2
	III. Overvie	w of the Administrative Structure	5
	A. Age	ncies Generally	5
	B. Inde	ependent Regulatory Agencies	7
	C. Gov	rernment Corporations	11
	IV. What A	gencies Do and How They Do It	11
	A. Wh	at They Do	11
	B. Hov	w They Do It	13
	V. The Ro	le of the Courts	15
	VI. States in	n the Federal Administrative Law System	18
	VII. State A	dministrative Law	20
	VIII. The Or	ganization of This Book	22
Chapter 2	How Age	ncies Fit into Our System of	
	Separated		23
	I. Introdu	action	23
	II. Delega	tion Doctrine	28
	A. Leg	islative Powers	28
	B. Adj	udicative Powers	35
	III. Differe	nt Branches' Roles	41
	A. Co	ngress	41
	1.	Congressional Appointment	42
	2.	Legislative Membership on Administrative Bodies	44
	3.	Congressional Removal of Officers	46
	4.	Legislative Veto	47
	5.	Legislative Review and Oversight	49
	B. The	e President	52
	1.	Appointment	54
		Removal	60
	3.	Supervision	65

a. OMB/EO Review  1. Review Under E.O. 12866  2. Review Under the Information (Data) Quality Act  b. Independent Regulatory Agencies 1. E.O. 12866 2. Information (Data) Quality Act  4. Line Item Veto	66 66 68 68 69
Adjudication	71
<ul> <li>I. The Subject Matter of Adjudication</li> <li>II. Formal and Informal Adjudication <ul> <li>A. Formal and Informal Adjudication in the States</li> </ul> </li> <li>III. The APA Procedures for Adjudication <ul> <li>A. Notice Requirements</li> <li>B. The Burden of Proof</li> <li>C. Rules of Evidence</li> <li>D. The Role of the ALJ</li> <li>E. The Course of the Proceeding</li> <li>F. The Role of the Agency</li> <li>G. Ex Parte Communications — 5 U.S.C. §557(d)</li> <li>H. Separation of Functions — 5 U.S.C. §554(d) <ul> <li>1. Formal Adjudication in the States</li> </ul> </li> <li>IV. Procedures for Informal Adjudication</li> <li>V. Procedures Applicable to All Proceedings</li> <li>VI. Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) and Administrative Law</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	72 76 84 84 85 86 88 89 90 92 94 100 101
	107
<ul> <li>I. Is Due Process Required at All?</li> <li>A. History</li> <li>B. Modern Due Process</li> <li>1. Modern Concept of "Property"</li> <li>2. Modern Concept of "Liberty" <ul> <li>a. Liberty and Reputation</li> <li>b. Liberty and Correctional Facilities</li> </ul> </li> <li>II. What Process Is Due? <ul> <li>A. Historically</li> <li>B. The Modern Rule</li> <li>C. Particular Requirements</li> <li>1. The Need for an Impartial Judge</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	108 109 110 111 115 115 119 121 123 131 132
	1. Review Under E.O. 12866 2. Review Under the Information (Data) Quality Act b. Independent Regulatory Agencies 1. E.O. 12866 2. Information (Data) Quality Act 4. Line Item Veto  Adjudication  I. The Subject Matter of Adjudication II. Formal and Informal Adjudication A. Formal and Informal Adjudication in the States III. The APA Procedures for Adjudication A. Notice Requirements B. The Burden of Proof C. Rules of Evidence D. The Role of the ALJ E. The Course of the Proceeding F. The Role of the Agency G. Ex Parte Communications—5 U.S.C. §557(d) H. Separation of Functions—5 U.S.C. §554(d) 1. Formal Adjudication in the States IV. Procedures for Informal Adjudication V. Procedures Applicable to All Proceedings VI. Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) and Administrative Law VII. Licensing  Due Process  I. Is Due Process 1. Modern Due Process 1. Modern Concept of "Property" 2. Modern Concept of "Liberty" a. Liberty and Reputation b. Liberty and Correctional Facilities II. What Process Is Due? A. Historically B. The Modern Rule C. Particular Requirements

Chapter 5 Ru	ılemaking	139
	I. The Nature of Rules	139
	A. "Rule" Under the APA	140
	B. Legislative and Nonlegislative Rules	143
	C. Rules v. Orders	144
I	I. Beginning Rulemaking	146
II	I. Rulemaking Procedures	148
	A. Rules Exempt from Section 553	150
	<ol> <li>The Military and Foreign Affairs Exemption</li> <li>The Exemption for Matters Involving Agency Management or Personnel, Public Property,</li> </ol>	150
	Loans, Grants, Benefits, and Contracts	152
	B. Rules Excepted from Section 553's Notice-and-	
	Comment Requirements	154
*	1. Interpretative Rules, Statements of Policy, and	
	Procedural Rules	155
	a. Interpretative Rules	155
	1. The Substantial Impact Test	156
	2. The "Legally Binding" or "Force of Law"	
	Test	157
	a. Whether in the absence of the rule	
	there would not be an adequate basis	
	for enforcement action or other agency	У
	action to confer benefits or ensure	158
	the performance of duties	130
	b. Whether the rule interprets a legal standard or whether it makes policy	159
	c. If the agency is interpreting a	137
	legislative rule, whether the claimed	
	interpretative rule is consistent	
	with the legislative rule it is	
	supposedly interpreting	162
	d. Whether the agency	
	contemporaneously indicated that	
	it was issuing an interpretative rule	163
	e. Whether the person signing the	
	agency document had the authority	
	to bind the agency or make law	163
	f. Doubtful factors	164
	g. Conclusion	164
	b. General Statements of Policy	165
	c. Rules of Agency Organization, Procedure,	
	or Practice	171

xiii

	1. Substantial Impact Test	1/2
	2. "Encoding a Substantive Value Judgment"	
	Test	173
	2. When the Agency Finds for Good Cause That	
	Notice and Public Procedures Are Impracticable,	
	Unnecessary, or Contrary to the Public Interest	174
	C. The Procedures for Formal Rulemaking	176
	D. The Procedures of Notice-and-Comment Rulemaking	180
	1. The Notice	180
	2. The Comment	182
	3. The Final Rule	183
	4. The "Logical Outgrowth" Test	184
	E. Procedures for Rules Not Subject to Formal	
	Rulemaking or Notice-and-Comment Rulemaking	187
	F. Negotiated Rulemaking	188
	G. Constitutional and Other Judicially Created	
	Procedural Requirements	190
	1. Ex Parte Communications	191
	2. Decision Makers' Bias or Prejudice	193
	3. Undue Influence	195
	H. Other Administratively or Statutorily Required	
	Procedures — Hybrid Rulemaking	197
	1. Executive Orders	199
	2. National Environmental Policy Act	202
	3. Regulatory Flexibility Act	203
	4. Unfunded Mandates Reform Act	204
	5. The Paperwork Reduction Act	205
	6. Congressional Review	205
	7. Information Quality Act	206
	8. Conclusion	207
Chapter 6	The Availability of Judicial Review	209
	I. Reviewability Generally	210
	A. Jurisdiction — Statutory Jurisdiction	210
	B. Jurisdiction — Standing	213
	1. Constitutionally Required Standing	213
	a. Injury for Standing	215
	1. Recreational, Aesthetic, or	
	Environmental Injury	215
	2. Risk as Injury	217
	3. Fear as Injury	221
	4. Procedural Injury	222
	5. Informational Injury	223
	6. Other Widely Shared Injuries	226

	7. States as Plaintiffs	227
	b. Causation for Standing	227
	1. Procedural Violations and Causation	227
	2. Third-Party Actions and Causation	230
	3. Contribution as Causation	231
	c. Redressability for Standing	232
	1. Third-Party Actions and	
	Redressability	232
	2. Procedural Violations and	
	Redressability	233
	3. Partial Redress or Avoidance	233
	2. Representational Standing	234
	3. Prudential Standing	235
	II. Exceptions to Judicial Review Under the APA	236
	A. Statutory Preclusion	236
	B. Committed to Agency Discretion by Law	239
	III. Requirements for Judicial Review Under the APA	244
	A. Causes of Action and the Zone of Interests	244
	B. Agency Action	250
	IV. Problems of Timing	251
	A. Final Agency Action	252
	B. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies	259
	C. Ripeness	266
	V. Primary Jurisdiction	273
Chapter 7	The Scope of Judicial Review	275
	I. Review of Questions of Law	277
	A. Statutory Interpretation and the Chevron Doctrine	277
	B. Interpretation of Rules	295
	II. Substantial Evidence Review	298
	A. When Does a Court Review for Substantial Evidence	
	B. What Does Substantial Evidence Mean?	299
	C. Substantial Evidence Review in Hybrid Rulemaking	
	III. Arbitrary and Capricious Review	308
	IV. De Novo Review	318
	V. Review of Agency Action Unlawfully Withheld or	
	Unreasonably Delayed	319
	VI. Remedies	322
	VII. Equitable Estoppel	325
	VIII. The Effect of Judicial Decisions	327
	A. Res Judicata and Collateral Estoppel	327
	* *	327
	1. Against Parties Suing the Government	
	<ol> <li>Against Parties Suing the Government</li> <li>Against the Government</li> </ol>	
	<ol> <li>Against Parties Suing the Government</li> <li>Against the Government</li> <li>Non-Acquiescence</li> </ol>	328 328

Chapter 8	Government Acquisition of Private	
	Information	331
	I. Introduction	331
	II. Legal Limits on Government Acquisition of Private	
	Information — In General	332
	III. Administrative Inspections — Fourth	224
	Amendment Limits	334
	IV. Obtaining Documents and Testimony	340 340
	A. Reporting Requirements     1. Paperwork Reduction Act	341
	2. Subpoenas	346
	B. Fourth Amendment Limits on Reporting	0.10
	Requirements and Subpoenas	349
	C. Fifth Amendment Limits on Reporting	
	Requirements and Subpoenas	354
Chapter 9	Public Access to Government Information	361
	I. Introduction	361
	II. Freedom of Information Act	362
	A. In General	362
	B. Exemptions	370
	Exemption 1	375
	Exemption 2	376
	Exemption 3	379
	Exemption 4	382
	Exemption 5	388
	Exemption 6	391
	Exemption 7	395
	III. Government in the Sunshine Act	400
	IV. Federal Advisory Committee Act	405
	V. The Privacy Act	412
	A. General Rule Against Disclosure	412
	B. Exceptions	413
	C. Other Functions	414
	D. Judicial Relief	414
	E. Summary	415
Table of Cases	9	419
Index		427

# Introduction to Administrative Law

Administrative law, though often dreary, can be of huge importance to the day-to-day lives of Americans.

- Washington Post editorial, June 23, 2001

#### I. ADMINISTRATIVE LAW — THE COURSE

Administrative law is largely about procedure — the procedure that government agencies must follow in order to take action that affects private parties. Administrative law as taught in American law schools is a basic course that, despite the approximately 19 different casebooks in the field, does not differ greatly among schools or teachers. All the courses focus on federal administrative law, although some may touch on state administrative law in the particular state in which the course is given. All focus on the federal Administrative Procedure Act (APA), rather than on the myriad other federal statutes that govern the various agencies' activities. Moreover, despite the focus on the APA, administrative law courses are invariably taught through the case method, relying almost exclusively on judicial opinions to explicate the law. All cover the procedural requirements agencies must follow in taking various actions; all include the relationships among the branches of government, making administrative law sort of an advanced political science or constitutional law course; and all address how courts review agency action. Government regulation of private conduct and constitutional due process also figures heavily in all administrative law courses.

#### I. Introduction to Administrative Law

Professors, depending upon their background and point of view, may stress one of these areas more than others, and the order in which they are addressed may differ, but ultimately the courses have more in common than they differ.

As the introductory quotation from the Washington Post suggests, the subject of administrative law has rarely been considered intrinsically interesting. Unlike torts, for instance, its subject matter does not often relate to everyday life. At the same time, Executive Branch agencies make rules on matters as diverse as environmental protection, workplace safety, wholesale electricity price caps, and agricultural price supports. Federal student aid requirements are another example of agency regulations. In addition, federal agencies make individualized decisions affecting some of the most important aspects of people's lives, from health care coverage decisions to decisions on deportation. State agencies make decisions governing who will be admitted to the bar and who will be disbarred, as just one example. In other words, administrative law actually affects you in real life. Moreover, if you care at all about how your government functions, you should care deeply about administrative law, because it governs most of what government does. It is all about power and how to control it.

Also, administrative law is really not all that difficult; it is not tax law. While there are statutory provisions, most administrative law is determined from judicial opinions. Like most areas of the law that are largely driven by judicial decisions—as opposed to statutory or regulatory text—some administrative law is clear-cut, black-letter material, whereas other parts of it involve clear principles, usually easily stated (often with multipart tests), but the application of which is fraught with fuzziness. Finally, some administrative law is still up for grabs; the courts have not yet worked it out, or legislatures pass new laws that confuse the issues.

This book can help sort out what is clear from what is fuzzy in the law, and through examples and explanations help to reduce the fuzziness in the areas that are not so clear-cut but which rely on a contextual application of a general principle. This book also can identify those areas that are not yet worked out and, in those areas at least, identify the issues that are unclear and the likely range in which an ultimate answer is likely to occur.

## II. OVERVIEW OF THE HISTORY OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

How the law has developed over time often helps to illuminate how judges are likely to rule today. This may be particularly true of administrative law.

The subject matter of administrative law itself is relatively recent in the law. Professor Felix Frankfurter of Harvard Law School, later Supreme Court

#### 1. Introduction to Administrative Law

Justice, is credited with authoring in 1932 one of the first casebooks on administrative law. Prior to the Great Depression, which began with the stock market crash in 1929, the prevailing wisdom reflected in both courts and legislatures was laissez-faire economic theory. This theory is characterized by the absence of government regulation of business with the exception of public utilities (e.g., gas, water, electricity, and telephone companies), so-called natural monopolies. What "administrative" law existed consisted of the constitutional law doctrine of "separation of powers," which you may already have studied in constitutional law, but which administrative law courses revisit with a particular focus. For example, two-thirds of Frankfurter's casebook covered separation of powers, with the remaining one-third dedicated to particular types of administrative functions — utility regulation, taxation, immigration, and "miscellaneous." Compare that to your casebook.

The Great Depression, however, spawned the New Deal, with its belief in the ability of government regulation of business to cure the excesses of laissez-faire capitalism. To implement this regulation, Congress created agencies that were supposed to be apolitical and have the necessary technical expertise to manage industries in a scientific manner. This led to an explosive growth in business regulation, which, because the agencies in reality were more political and less expert than their ideal conception, in turn led to an explosive growth in litigation in which businesses challenged their regulation. After an initial period in which, on the basis of various constitutional provisions, the Supreme Court resisted wide-scale government regulation of business, the Court acceded to the constitutionality of most of the New Deal agencies and regulations. Instead, the Court now developed a common law to control these agencies. This common law emphasized procedural regularity in agency decision making, often mirroring the procedures of courts, and applied a degree of judicial oversight of the substantive adequacy of the agency's decisions. Business interests, not satisfied with this judicially created regime, lobbied Congress for more protective legislation. In 1946, the Administrative Procedure Act (get used to calling it the APA) was passed as a compromise between business interests and the Executive Branch. At the same time, the American Bar Association and the National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws approved a Model State APA, which slowly but surely provided the basis for the adoption of administrative procedure acts in almost every state.

The APA in 1946 was hardly a revolutionary law. Rather, it largely codified the developing common law. It has remained largely unamended since that time, but it has been subject to substantial judicial interpretation over the years that has taken the APA well beyond its literal text. In particular, this occurred during the 1970s, the second great wave of government regulation after the New Deal. During the New Deal, most of the government regulation was regulation of particular industries in their economic activities. For example, the Federal Communications Commission (FCC)