

ROUTLEDGE CRITICAL STUDIES IN PUBLIC  
MANAGEMENT

# Public Policy, Governance and Polarization

*Making Governance Work*

Edited by  
David K. Jesuit and  
Russell Alan Williams



 **Routledge**  
Taylor & Francis Group  
[www.routledge.com](http://www.routledge.com)

an **informa** business

ISBN 978-1-138-67593-3



9 781138 675933

# Public Policy, Governance and Polarization

Edited by David K. Jesuit and Russell Alan Williams

Routledge

# **Public Policy, Governance and Polarization**

Making Governance Work

**Edited by**  
**David K. Jesuit and**  
**Russell Alan Williams**

First published 2018  
by Routledge  
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN  
and by Routledge  
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

*Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business*

© 2018 selection and editorial matter, David K. Jesuit and Russell Alan Williams; individual chapters, the contributors

The right of David K. Jesuit and Russell Alan Williams to be identified as the authors of the editorial matter, and of the authors for their individual chapters, has been asserted in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilized in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

*Trademark notice:* Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

*British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data*

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Names: Jesuit, David K., editor. | Williams, Russell Alan, 1970– editor.

Title: Public policy, governance and polarization: making governance work / [edited by] David K. Jesuit and Russell Alan Williams.

Description: Abingdon, Oxon; New York, NY: Routledge, 2017. |

Includes bibliographical references and index. |

Identifiers: LCCN 2017005943 (print) | LCCN 2017022852 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781315560342 (eBook) | ISBN 9781138675933

(hardback: alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Policy sciences. | Polarization (Social sciences)

Classification: LCC H97 (ebook) | LCC H97.P793 2017 (print) |

DDC 320.6–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017005943>

ISBN: 978-1-138-67593-3 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-1-315-56034-2 (ebk)

Typeset in Times New Roman  
by Wearset Ltd, Boldon, Tyne and Wear



Printed and bound in Great Britain by  
TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall

Contemporary public administration scholars are paying more attention to evidence-based policy, while largely neglecting the greater polarization of political systems recently characterizing North America and the European Union. *Public Policy, Governance and Polarization: Making Governance Work*, edited by Jesuit and Williams, takes the readers into the causes, nature, and consequences of ideological polarization, determining the extent to which it might inhibit evidence-based policy formulation and be an obstacle to public engagement-based styles of policy making.

Denita Cepiku, *Professor of Global Public Management,  
University of Rome Tor Vergata, Italy*

*Public Policy, Governance and Polarization: Making Governance Work* provides a workable definition of “polarization” in politics and the production of public policy. The co-authors use comparative case studies from the United States, Canada, and Europe as a means of better understanding the causes and effects of political polarization. These analyses assert that political polarization is here to stay and will likely grow even more pronounced in the coming years. Consequently, public administrators must learn how to work with and manage polarization.

Nicholas Bauroth, *Associate Professor of Political Science at  
North Dakota State University, USA*



# Public Policy, Governance and Polarization

Polarization is widely diagnosed as a major cause of the decline of evidence-based policy making and public engagement-based styles of policy making. It creates an environment where hardened partisan viewpoints on major policy questions are less amenable to negotiation, compromise or change. Polarization is not a temporary situation – it is the “new normal.”

*Public Policy, Governance and Polarization* seeks to provide a theoretical foundation for scholars and policy makers who need to understand the powerful and often disruptive forces that have arisen in Europe and North America over the past decade. Academics and practitioners need to better understand this growing trend and to find ways in which it may be managed so that policy solutions to these threats may be developed and implemented.

Researchers and future policymakers in fields such as public administration, public management and public policy need to recognise how institutional design, corporatist interest group systems and different pedagogical approaches may help them understand, discuss and work beyond policy polarization. Edited by two leading political science scholars, this book aims to begin that process.

**David K. Jesuit** is a Professor and Chairperson of the Department of Political Science and Public Administration at Central Michigan University (CMU), USA.

**Russell Alan Williams** is an Associate Professor of Political Science at Memorial University, Canada.



## **Routledge Critical Studies in Public Management**

Edited by Stephen Osborne

The study and practice of public management has undergone profound changes across the world. Over the last quarter century, we have seen:

- increasing criticism of public administration as the over-arching framework for the provision of public services;
- the rise (and critical appraisal) of the ‘New Public Management’ as an emergent paradigm for the provision of public services;
- the transformation of the ‘public sector’ into the cross-sectoral provision of public services; and
- the growth of the governance of inter-organizational relationships as an essential element in the provision of public services.

In reality these trends have not so much replaced each other as elided or co-existed together – the public policy process has not gone away as a legitimate topic of study, intra-organizational management continues to be essential to the efficient provision of public services, whilst the governance of inter-organizational and inter-sectoral relationships is now essential to the effective provision of these services.

Further, whilst the study of public management has been enriched by the contribution of a range of insights from the “mainstream” management literature it has also contributed to this literature in such areas as networks and inter-organizational collaboration, innovation and stakeholder theory.

This series is dedicated to presenting and critiquing this important body of theory and empirical study. It will publish books that both explore and evaluate the emergent and developing nature of public administration, management and governance (in theory and practice) and examine the relationship with and contribution to the over-arching disciplines of management and organizational sociology.

Books in the series will be of interest to academics and researchers in this field, students undertaking advanced studies of it as part of their undergraduate or postgraduate degree and reflective policy makers and practitioners.

**Public-Private Partnerships in the USA**

Lessons to be Learned for the United Kingdom

*Anthony Wal*

**Rethinking Public-Private Partnerships**

Strategies for Turbulent Times

*Edited by Carsten Greve and Graeme Hodge*

**Public Policy beyond the Financial Crisis**

An International Comparative Study

*Philip Haynes*

**Branding in Governance and Public Management**

*Jasper Eshuis and Erik-Hans Klijn*

**New Public Governance, the Third Sector, and Co-Production**

*Edited by Victor Pestoff,*

*Taco Brandsen, and*

*Bram Verschuere*

**Public Management and Complexity Theory**

Richer Decision-making in Public Services

*Mary Lee Rhodes, Joanne Murphy,*

*Jenny Muir, and John A. Murray*

**Social Accounting and Public Management**

Accountability for the Common Good

*Edited by Stephen P. Osborne and Amanda Ball*

**Making Public Services Management Critical**

*Edited by Graeme Currie,*

*Jackie Ford, Nancy Harding and*

*Mark Learmonth*

**Managing Complex Governance Systems**

Dynamics, Self-organization and Coevolution in Public Investments

*Edited by Geert Teisman,*

*Arwin van Buuren and Lasse Gerrits*

**The Study of Public Management in Europe and the US**

A Competitive Analysis of National Distinctiveness

*Edited by Walter Kickert*

**Unbundled Government**

A Critical Analysis of the Global Trend to Agencies, Quangos and Contractualisation

*Edited by Christopher Pollitt and*

*Colin Talbot*

**Innovation in City Governments**

Structures, Networks and Leadership

*Jenny M. Lewis, Lykke Margot Ricard,*

*Erik Hans Klijn, and Tamyko Ysa*

**Public Governance and Strategic Management Capabilities**

Public Governance in the Gulf States

*Paul Joyce and Turki Al Rasheed*

**Ethics Management in the Public Service**

A Sensory-based Strategy

*Liza Ireni-Saban and Galit Berdugo*

**Public Management in Times of Austerity**

*Edited by Eva Moll Ghin,*

*Hanne Foss Hansen, and*

*Mads Bøge Kristiansen*

**Public Policy, Governance and Polarization**

Making Governance Work

*Edited by David K. Jesuit and*

*Russell Alan Williams*



# Contributors

**Walter F. Baber**, Professor in the Graduate Center for Public Policy and Administration at California State University, USA.

**Robert V. Bartlett**, Professor, Department Chair and Gund Chair of the Liberal Arts, Department of Political Science, University of Vermont, USA.

**Jeremiah J. Castle**, Post-doctoral Fellow, Central Michigan University, Mount Pleasant, Michigan, USA.

**Charles Conteh**, Graduate Program Director, Associate Professor, Public Policy and Management, Department of Political Science, Brock University, St. Catharines, Canada.

**Lindsay Flynn**, Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science, Wheaton College, USA.

**Pamela S. Gates**, Professor of English and Dean of the College of Humanities and Social and Behavioral Sciences, Central Michigan University, USA.

**Nathan Grasse**, Associate Professor, School of Public Policy and Administration, Carleton University, Canada.

**Thomas Greitens**, Associate Professor and Director of the Master of Public Administration Program, Central Michigan University, USA.

**Raffael Hanschmann**, Doctoral Researcher, Department of Economics and Social Sciences, University of Potsdam, Germany.

**David K. Jesuit**, Professor, Political Science and Public Administration, Central Michigan University, USA.

**Piotr R. Paradowski**, Data Expert and Research Associate, LIS Cross-National Data Center, Luxembourg.

**Ian Roberge**, Department Chair and Associate Professor, Political Science Department, Collège Glendon, Université York, Canada.

**Thomas Rohrer**, Director, Great Lakes Institute for Sustainable Systems, Central Michigan University, USA.

**Daniel M. Shea**, Director of the Goldfarb Center for Public Affairs and Civic Engagement and Professor of Government, Colby College, USA.

**J. Cherie Strachan**, Associate Professor, Political Science and Public Administration, Central Michigan University, USA.

**Lawrence Sych**, Professor, Political Science and Public Administration, Central Michigan University, USA.

**Marcy Taylor**, Professor of English, Assistant Dean of the College of Humanities and Social and Behavioral Sciences, Central Michigan University, USA.

**Russell Alan Williams**, Associate Professor, Memorial University Department of Political Science, Memorial University, Canada.

**Michael R. Wolf**, Associate Professor of Political Science, Indiana University and Purdue University-Indianapolis, USA.

**Susan Morrissey Wyse**, Faculty of Environmental Studies, York University, Canada.

# Preface

This volume represents the continued intellectual collaboration of scholars and practitioners under the auspices of the Transnational Initiative on Governance Research and Education Network, or “TIGRE Net.” This international group of scholars, students and field specialists is dedicated to identifying the opportunities and challenges public managers confront in the global economy, and to providing them with the strategies and skills necessary to overcome obstacles to domestic, cross-border and international coordination. Outputs from the TIGRE Net include several academic conferences and workshops, which have been supported by a grant from the Canadian Social Science and Humanities Research Council (SSHRC) and academic partners in the US, Italy and Canada. Research from these events has been published in a number of academic outlets, including journals such as the *International Journal of Public Administration* (IJPA) and the *International Journal of Public Sector Management* (IJPSM). Previous edited collections have included *Making Multilevel Governance Work: Lessons from Europe and North America* (2012), published by CRC Press, and *Governance and Public Management: Strategic Foundations for Volatile Times* (2014), published by Routledge. Core partners of TIGRE Net include universities in the US (Central Michigan University and California State-Long Beach), Italy (the University of Rome “Tor Vergata” and the University of Macerata) and Canada (York University, Toronto and Brock University, St. Catharines).

# Contents

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <i>List of figures</i>  | xi        |
| <i>List of tables</i>   | xii       |
| <i>List of contributors</i>   | xiv       |
| <i>Preface</i>  | xvi       |
| <br>  |           |
| <b>Introduction and overview: polarization explained and applied</b>  | <b>1</b>  |
| JEREMIAH J. CASTLE, DAVID K. JESUIT AND<br>RUSSELL ALAN WILLIAMS  |           |
| <br>  |           |
| <b>PART I</b>   |           |
| <b>Polarized mass publics and electoral politics</b>  | <b>13</b> |
| <br>  |           |
| <b>1 Concerted action in complex environments: a comparison of industrial restructuring in mid-sized city-regions in Canada and the United States</b> | <b>15</b> |
| CHARLES CONTEH  |           |
| <br>  |           |
| <b>2 Lines in the sand: how Americans' polarization results in unwillingness to accept compromise policy outcomes</b>                                 | <b>36</b> |
| MICHAEL R. WOLF, J. CHERIE STRACHAN AND<br>DANIEL M. SHEA   |           |
| <br>  |           |
| <b>3 Can unequal distributions of wealth influence vote choice? A comparative study of Germany, Sweden and the United States</b>                      | <b>60</b> |
| LINDSAY FLYNN AND PIOTR R. PARADOWSKI   |           |

**PART II**

**An example of polarization: the climate change debate** 85

- 4 Consensual environmental policy in the Anthropocene: governing what humanity hath wrought** 87

WALTER F. BABER AND ROBERT V. BARTLETT

- 5 Polarized climate debate? Institutions and structure in subnational policymaking** 106

RUSSELL WILLIAMS AND SUSAN MORRISSEY WYSE

- 6 Polarized business interests: EU climate policy-making during the “Great Recession”** 126

RAFFAEL HANSCHMANN

**PART III**

**Potential remedies to polarized policymaking** 157

- 7 Comparative national energy policies and climate change actions in countries with divided and unified governments: reflections, projections and opportunities for improved pedagogy** 159

THOMAS ROHRER AND PAMELA S. GATES

- 8 Exploring the mediating effects of institutions on polarization and political conflict: evidence from Michigan cities** 174

NATHAN GRASSE, THOMAS GREITENS, DAVID JESUIT,  
AND LAWRENCE SYCH

- 9 Political polarization, fiscal stress and financing public universities: a comparative analysis of the Ontario and Michigan public policy experience** 186

LAWRENCE SYCH AND MARCY TAYLOR

- 10 The silence is deafening: a look into financial services sector policymaking in Canada** 208

IAN ROBERGE

- Conclusion: managing polarization to make governance work** 224

DAVID K. JESUIT AND RUSSELL ALAN WILLIAMS

- Index* 228



# Figures

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| 3.1  | Share of income and wealth held by households, cross-country average  | 65  |
| 3.2  | Wealth and income distributions by country  | 66  |
| 3.3  | Lorenz curves in the United States and Sweden   | 67  |
| 3.4  | Political affiliation by wealth level   | 71  |
| 3.5  | Simulated probabilities, likelihood to vote for a party on the right, by income quintile and employment status in Germany | 78  |
| 6.1  | Passenger car registrations per quarter in the EU-27, 2006–2013   | 131 |
| 6.2  | Market shares of selected manufacturers of light and heavy passenger cars (Western Europe)                                | 132 |
| 6.3  | Congruence network of the 130 grams per kilometer negotiations before the French–German compromise                        | 136 |
| 6.4  | Congruence network of the 130 grams per kilometer negotiations after the French–German compromise                         | 138 |
| 6.5  | Congruence network of the entire 130 grams per kilometer negotiations   | 140 |
| 6.6  | Congruence network of the 95 grams per kilometer negotiations before the German intervention                              | 142 |
| 6.7  | Schematic illustration of limit value curves  | 144 |
| 6.8  | Congruence network of the 95 grams per kilometer negotiations after the German intervention                               | 146 |
| 6.9  | Congruence network of the entire 95 grams per kilometer negotiations  | 148 |
| 6.10 | Congruence network of the European car industry during the 130 grams per kilometer negotiations                           | 149 |
| 6.11 | Congruence network of the European car industry during the 95 grams per kilometer negotiations                            | 149 |
| 8.1  | Path model of polarized municipalities – institutional form and outcomes  | 181 |
| 9.1  | Sample graph from EMU’s 2014 financial statement  | 198 |