

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

SOCIAL SECURITY LAW, COUNCIL OF EUROPE

S. GÜNTER NAGEL & FRANCIS R. KESSLER



Wolters Kluwer
Law & Business

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

Social Security Law, Council of Europe

S. Günter Nagel & Francis R. Kessler

This book was originally published as a monograph in the International
Encyclopaedia of Laws/Social Security Law.

General Editor: Roger Blanpain
Associate General Editor: Michele Colucci
Volume Editor: Willy van Eeckhoutte



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

Published by:

Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.
Stratton Business Park
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ
United Kingdom
Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

DISCLAIMER: The material in this volume is in the nature of general comment only. It is not offered as advice on any particular matter and should not be taken as such. The editor and the contributing authors expressly disclaim all liability to any person with regard to anything done or omitted to be done, and with respect to the consequences of anything done or omitted to be done wholly or partly in reliance upon the whole or any part of the contents of this volume. No reader should act or refrain from acting on the basis of any matter contained in this volume without first obtaining professional advice regarding the particular facts and circumstances at issue. Any and all opinions expressed herein are those of the particular author and are not necessarily those of the editor or publisher of this volume.

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-3390-8

© 2010 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed and bound in Great Britain by
CPI Antony Rowe, Chippenham and Eastbourne

Table of Contents

The Authors	3
List of Abbreviations	13
General Introduction	15
§1. COUNCIL OF EUROPE: THE OVERALL INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK	15
§2. ADMINISTRATIVE ORGANIZATION DEDICATED TO SOCIAL SECURITY MATTERS	16
§3. SOCIAL COHESION: THE POLITICAL PRINCIPLES FRAMING THE ACTIVITIES IN THE FIELD OF SOCIAL SECURITY	19
§4. THE GROWING INFLUENCE OF THE ECHR CASE LAW	22
§5. THE STANDARD-SETTING ACTIVITIES OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE	23
§6. STUDIES AND PUBLICATION ACTIVITIES OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE	23
Selected Bibliography	25
Part I. Social Security as a Fundamental Right: The European Social Charter and the Case Law of the ECHR	31
Chapter 1. Introduction	31
Chapter 2. Social Security Rights in the European Social Charter	33
§1. INTRODUCTION	33
§2. ARTICLE 12 THE RIGHT TO SOCIAL SECURITY	33
§3. THE CONTROL MECHANISM	34

Table of Contents

Chapter 3. ECHR Case Law: The Protection of Procedural Rights and Social Security Benefits 35

§1. INTRODUCTION 35

§2. SOCIAL SECURITY BENEFITS FALL WITHIN THE SCOPE OF ARTICLE 6.1 AS RIGHTS OF A CIVIL NATURE 35

§3. EXAMPLES OF APPLYING ARTICLE 6.1 36

Chapter 4. ECHR Case Law Social Security Rights as a Possession 39

§1. INTRODUCTION 39

§2. INSURABILITY AND THE OBLIGATION TO PAY CONTRIBUTIONS 42

§3. LIMITATION ON BENEFITS TO SELF-EMPLOYED WORKERS 43

§4. RESIDENCE 43

§5. CALCULATION OF PENSIONS AND BENEFITS 43

§6. OVERLAPPING OF BENEFITS WITH INCOME FROM OTHER SOURCES 45

§7. LOSS OF PENSION AS A RESULT OF CRIMINAL CONVICTION 45

§8. CHANGE OF SYSTEM CASES 46

§9. LATE PAYMENT OF BENEFITS 46

§10. CONCLUSION 47

Chapter 5. Non-discrimination Case Law and Social Security Rights 48

§1. INTRODUCTION 48

§2. GROUNDS OF DISCRIMINATION 48

§3. NATIONALITY AND RESIDENCE REQUIREMENTS 49

§4. EXPORT OF BENEFITS 51

§5. GENDER 51

Table of Contents

§6. OTHER GROUNDS	53
§7. CONCLUSION	55
Part II. The Coordinating Instruments in the Social Security Field	57
§1. PRELIMINARY CONSIDERATIONS	57
Chapter 1. The European Interim Agreements	60
§1. HISTORY	60
§2. PRINCIPLES OF THE AGREEMENTS	60
§3. THE CONTENT OF THE AGREEMENTS	61
§4. THE PROTOCOL	64
§5. STATE OF SIGNATURE AND RATIFICATION	65
Chapter 2. The European Convention on Social Security and the Supplementary Agreement for the Application of the European Convention on Social Security – Protocol to the Convention	66
§1. HISTORICAL ELEMENTS	66
§2. OBJECTIVES OF THE EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON SOCIAL SECURITY	66
§3. OVERALL ORGANIZATION OF THE CONVENTION	67
§4. THE PRINCIPAL CHARACTERISTICS OF THE CONVENTION	69
I. The Scope of the Convention	69
II. Determination of the Applicable Legislation	69
§5. THE BASIC COORDINATION PRINCIPLES	71
I. Equality of Treatment	71
II. Maintenance of Acquired Rights or Those in Course of Acquisition	71
III. The Payment of Benefits Abroad	72
§6. COORDINATION METHODS	72
§7. OVERLAPPING OF BENEFITS	73

Table of Contents

§8. MISCELLANEOUS PROVISIONS	73
§9. TRANSITIONAL AND FINAL PROVISIONS	73
§10. RELATION BETWEEN THE CONVENTION AND OTHER COORDINATING INSTRUMENTS	74
§11. STATE OF SIGNATURE AND RATIFICATION	74
§12. PROTOCOL TO THE EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON SOCIAL SECURITY	74
Chapter 3. The European Convention on Social and Medical Assistance	75
§1. INTRODUCTION	75
§2. THE MATERIAL SCOPE OF THE CONVENTION	75
§3. COORDINATION PRINCIPLES OF THE CONVENTION	75
I. Equality of Treatment	76
II. Non-repatriation	76
Chapter 4. European Agreement Concerning the Provisions of Medical Care and Arrangement for Its Application	77
Part III. The Standard-Setting Instruments	79
Chapter 1. The European Code of Social Security and Protocol to the European Code of Social Security	79
§1. INTRODUCTION	79
§2. THE STRUCTURE OF THE CODE	80
§3. THE MAIN DIFFERENCES BETWEEN ILO CONVENTION NO. 102 (MINIMUM STANDARDS OF SOCIAL SECURITY) AND THE EUROPEAN CODE OF SOCIAL SECURITY	83
§4. THE MAIN DIFFERENCES BETWEEN THE EUROPEAN CODE OF SOCIAL SECURITY AND ITS PROTOCOL	85
I. Preliminary Remarks	85
II. General Differences	86
III. Differences per Branch	87

§5. THE IMPACT OF THE CODE AND THE PROTOCOL ON NATIONAL LEGISLATION	90
Chapter 2. The European Code of Social Security (Revised)	92
§1. INTRODUCTION	92
§2. STRUCTURE OF THE (REVISED) CODE	93
§3. THE MAIN CHARACTERISTICS OF THE (REVISED) CODE	95
I. Preamble to the (Revised) Code	95
II. Part I. General Provisions	96
A. Definition of Certain Terms	96
B. Conditions of Ratification	96
C. Extent of Commitment	96
D. Succession in time of the European Code of Social Security and Its Protocol and the (Revised) Code	97
E. Non-Compulsory Insurance Schemes	97
F. Derogations	97
III. Part II. Medical Care	98
A. Contingency	98
B. Personal Scope	98
C. Material Scope	99
D. Conditions of Entitlement	99
E. Duration of the Period of Provision of Benefit	99
IV. Part III. Sickness Cash Benefit	99
A. Contingency	99
B. Personal Scope	99
C. Nature and Amount of Benefit	100
D. Conditions of Entitlement	100
E. Waiting Period and Duration of the Period of Provision of Benefit	100
F. Grant for Funeral Expenses	100
V. Part IV. Unemployment Benefit	100
A. Contingencies	100
B. Personal Scope	101
C. Nature and Amount of Benefit	101
D. Conditions of Entitlement	101
E. Waiting Period	101
F. Duration of Payment of Benefit	102
G. Preventive Measures	102
VI. Part V. Old-Age Benefit	102
A. Contingency	102
B. Lowering of Pensionable Age	102
C. Personal Scope	103
D. Calculation of Benefit	103

Table of Contents

E. Condition of Entitlement to Benefit	103
F. Duration of Payment of Benefit	103
VII. Part VI. Work Accident and Occupational Disease Benefit	103
A. Contingencies	103
B. Definition of Work Accident	104
C. Definition of Occupational Disease	104
D. Personal Scope	104
E. Material Scope	104
F. Nature and Amount of Benefit	105
G. Condition of Entitlement	105
H. Duration of Provision	105
I. Prevention and Occupational and Medical Rehabilitation	105
J. Specific Measures for the Prevention of Occupational Diseases	106
K. Substitution Clause	106
VIII. Part VII. Family Benefit	106
A. Contingency	106
B. Personal Scope	106
C. Material Scope	106
D. Conditions of Entitlement	107
E. Amount of Benefit	107
F. Period of Provision of Benefit	107
IX. Part VIII. Maternity Benefit	107
A. Contingencies	107
B. Personal Scope	107
C. Material Scope	108
D. Nature and Amount of Benefit	108
E. Conditions of Entitlement	108
F. Duration of Provisions of Benefit	108
G. Substitute Provisions in the Event of Parental Leave	109
X. Part IX. Invalidity Benefit	109
A. Contingencies	109
B. Personal Scope	109
C. Calculation of Benefit	109
D. Conditions of Entitlement to Benefit	110
E. Occupational and Medical Rehabilitation Measures	110
F. Duration of Payment of Benefit	110
XI. Part X. Survivors' Benefit	111
A. Contingency	111
B. Personal Scope	111
C. Calculation of Benefit	111
D. Conditions of Entitlement to Benefits	112
E. Duration of Payment of Benefit	112
F. Transitional Clause	112
XII. Part XI. Calculation of Periodical Payments	112
XIII. Part XII. Common Provisions	116
XIV. Part XIII. Miscellaneous Provisions	116

Table of Contents

XV. Part XIV. Amendments	117
XVI. Part XV. Final Provisions	117
XVII. State of Signature and Ratification	117
Part IV. Other Legal Instruments and Model Provisions	119
Chapter 1. Resolutions/Recommendations	120
Chapter 2. Model Provisions	126
§1. MODEL PROVISIONS IN THE FIELD OF SOCIAL SECURITY	126
§2. MODEL PROVISIONS FOR A BILATERAL SOCIAL SECURITY AGREEMENT	127
Part V. Conferences of European Ministers Responsible for Social Security	129
Chapter 1. Introduction	129
Chapter 2. The First Conference	130
Chapter 3. The Second Conference	131
Chapter 4. The Third Conference	132
Chapter 5. The Fourth Conference	133
Chapter 6. The Fifth Conference	135
Chapter 7. The Sixth Conference	137
Chapter 8. The Seventh Conference	139
Chapter 9. The Eighth Conference	141
Index	143

KLUWER LAW INTERNATIONAL

Social Security Law, Council of Europe

S. Günter Nagel & Francis R. Kessler

This book was originally published as a monograph in the International
Encyclopaedia of Laws/Social Security Law.

General Editor: Roger Blanpain

Associate General Editor: Michele Colucci

Volume Editor: Willy van Eeckhoutte



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

AUSTIN BOSTON CHICAGO NEW YORK THE NETHERLANDS

Published by:
Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:
Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspenspublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:
Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.
Stratton Business Park
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ
United Kingdom
Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

DISCLAIMER: The material in this volume is in the nature of general comment only. It is not offered as advice on any particular matter and should not be taken as such. The editor and the contributing authors expressly disclaim all liability to any person with regard to anything done or omitted to be done, and with respect to the consequences of anything done or omitted to be done wholly or partly in reliance upon the whole or any part of the contents of this volume. No reader should act or refrain from acting on the basis of any matter contained in this volume without first obtaining professional advice regarding the particular facts and circumstances at issue. Any and all opinions expressed herein are those of the particular author and are not necessarily those of the editor or publisher of this volume.

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-3390-8

© 2010 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed and bound in Great Britain by
CPI Antony Rowe, Chippenham and Eastbourne

The Authors



S. Günter Nagel (born 22 August 1941 in Karlsruhe) studied economics, law and sociology at the Universities of Heidelberg, Dijon, Freiburg and Strasbourg. He obtained his 'Diplom-Volkswirt' at the University of Freiburg, his 'Diplôme d'études supérieures ès sciences économiques' at the University of Strasbourg and his 'Diplôme d'études supérieures européennes' at the Centre Européen Universitaire de Nancy.

He obtained a Doctorate at the University of Strasbourg in 1970.

Between 1968 and 1971, he was lecturer/assistant at the Universities of Nancy and Strasbourg and in 1972 he became an Administrator of the Council of Europe, becoming responsible in 1979 for the social security section from 1993

to 1996, then he was successively Head of the Social Security and Employment Division, Head of Division – Chargé de mission in the Directorate General I Legal Affairs and Head of the Department for the Execution of Judgments of the European Court of Human Rights – Directorate General of Human Rights.

S. Günter Nagel was visiting professor at the University of Aix-Marseille and – until its retirement in 2006 – has given lectures at the University of Strasbourg (in particular: Institut d'Etudes Politiques) and Nancy (Centre européen universitaire).

S. Günter Nagel is the author of numerous publications especially in the field of economics, social policy and social security and human rights in relation with social protection.

S. Günter Nagel was a member of the 'Gesellschaft für Wirtschafts- und Sozialwissenschaften- Verein für Sozialpolitik'; of the European Institute for Social Security; of the Administrative Board of Research Institute in the field of Social Security of the University of Athens, Law Department; of the Comité Scientifique du Séminaire international du droit compare du travail, des relations professionnelles et de la sécurité sociale de l'Université d'Attila Jozsef, Faculté de Droit, Szeged; du Conseil d'Administration de l'Institut d'Etudes Politiques de Strasbourg.

S. Günter Nagel is 'Chevalier dans l'Ordre des Palmes Académiques'.

The Authors



Francis R. Kessler (born 26 July 1958 in Altkirch, France) studied law at the University of Strasbourg. He graduated at the University of Strasbourg with a 'DEA de droit social' in 1982 and the second grade of the International faculty of Comparative law in 1984.

He obtained a PhD in law at the University of Strasbourg in 1986.

Between 1987 and 1991 he was post-doc at the Max-Planck Institute for foreign and international law in Munich. From 1988 to 1993, he was senior lecturer at the University of Nancy, then assistant professor and head of the Institute

for Labor at the University of Strasbourg from 1993 to 1998.

Since 1998 he is assistant professor at the University of Paris 1 Panthéon-Sorbonne and since 2002, member of the Paris bar and associate at Gide Loyrette Nouel A.A.R.P.I., Paris. Francis R. Kessler was visiting professor at the University of Montreal and Beijing and a guest lecturer at many European universities (Trier, Tilburg, Helsinki, Edinburgh, Roma (LUISS), Madrid (Carlos III), ...). He is member of the editorial board of several reviews (European journal of social security, *Revue de droit sanitaire et social*, *Lien social et politiques*, *Cadres CFDT*.)

Francis R. Kessler has a long experience as an Expert at the Council of Europe as well as EU-programmes. He was member of the Secretariat at the MISSOC programme – an exchange of information on social security for thirty-one States – National French expert on the first 1408/71 Observatory at Directorate General employment of the European Commission, becoming then Member of the Project directorate of treSS (Training and reporting on social security) an EU-Commission project on coordination of basic social security schemes. At present, Francis R. Kessler is member of the European labour law network (ELLN), a European Commission subsidized project on the evolution of labour law.

He worked as an expert of the Council of Europe in Romania, and on old age dependency and later on pension schemes as well as a lecturer in several Council of Europe training programmes.

Francis R. Kessler is the author of numerous publications especially in the field of French and comparative labour and social security law as well as European labour and social security law.

Table of Contents

The Authors	3
List of Abbreviations	13
General Introduction	15
§1. COUNCIL OF EUROPE: THE OVERALL INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK	15
§2. ADMINISTRATIVE ORGANIZATION DEDICATED TO SOCIAL SECURITY MATTERS	16
§3. SOCIAL COHESION: THE POLITICAL PRINCIPLES FRAMING THE ACTIVITIES IN THE FIELD OF SOCIAL SECURITY	19
§4. THE GROWING INFLUENCE OF THE ECHR CASE LAW	22
§5. THE STANDARD-SETTING ACTIVITIES OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE	23
§6. STUDIES AND PUBLICATION ACTIVITIES OF THE COUNCIL OF EUROPE	23
Selected Bibliography	25
Part I. Social Security as a Fundamental Right: The European Social Charter and the Case Law of the ECHR	31
Chapter 1. Introduction	31
Chapter 2. Social Security Rights in the European Social Charter	33
§1. INTRODUCTION	33
§2. ARTICLE 12 THE RIGHT TO SOCIAL SECURITY	33
§3. THE CONTROL MECHANISM	34

Table of Contents

Chapter 3. ECHR Case Law: The Protection of Procedural Rights and Social Security Benefits 35

§1. INTRODUCTION 35

§2. SOCIAL SECURITY BENEFITS FALL WITHIN THE SCOPE OF ARTICLE 6.1 AS RIGHTS OF A CIVIL NATURE 35

§3. EXAMPLES OF APPLYING ARTICLE 6.1 36

Chapter 4. ECHR Case Law Social Security Rights as a Possession 39

§1. INTRODUCTION 39

§2. INSURABILITY AND THE OBLIGATION TO PAY CONTRIBUTIONS 42

§3. LIMITATION ON BENEFITS TO SELF-EMPLOYED WORKERS 43

§4. RESIDENCE 43

§5. CALCULATION OF PENSIONS AND BENEFITS 43

§6. OVERLAPPING OF BENEFITS WITH INCOME FROM OTHER SOURCES 45

§7. LOSS OF PENSION AS A RESULT OF CRIMINAL CONVICTION 45

§8. CHANGE OF SYSTEM CASES 46

§9. LATE PAYMENT OF BENEFITS 46

§10. CONCLUSION 47

Chapter 5. Non-discrimination Case Law and Social Security Rights 48

§1. INTRODUCTION 48

§2. GROUNDS OF DISCRIMINATION 48

§3. NATIONALITY AND RESIDENCE REQUIREMENTS 49

§4. EXPORT OF BENEFITS 51

§5. GENDER 51

Table of Contents

§6. OTHER GROUNDS	53
§7. CONCLUSION	55
Part II. The Coordinating Instruments in the Social Security Field	57
§1. PRELIMINARY CONSIDERATIONS	57
Chapter 1. The European Interim Agreements	60
§1. HISTORY	60
§2. PRINCIPLES OF THE AGREEMENTS	60
§3. THE CONTENT OF THE AGREEMENTS	61
§4. THE PROTOCOL	64
§5. STATE OF SIGNATURE AND RATIFICATION	65
Chapter 2. The European Convention on Social Security and the Supplementary Agreement for the Application of the European Convention on Social Security – Protocol to the Convention	66
§1. HISTORICAL ELEMENTS	66
§2. OBJECTIVES OF THE EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON SOCIAL SECURITY	66
§3. OVERALL ORGANIZATION OF THE CONVENTION	67
§4. THE PRINCIPAL CHARACTERISTICS OF THE CONVENTION	69
I. The Scope of the Convention	69
II. Determination of the Applicable Legislation	69
§5. THE BASIC COORDINATION PRINCIPLES	71
I. Equality of Treatment	71
II. Maintenance of Acquired Rights or Those in Course of Acquisition	71
III. The Payment of Benefits Abroad	72
§6. COORDINATION METHODS	72
§7. OVERLAPPING OF BENEFITS	73