

THE COALITION EFFECT 2010-2015



EDITED BY
ANTHONY SELDON
AND MIKE FINN

The Coalition Effect, 2010–2015

Edited by
Anthony Seldon and Mike Finn

Assistant editor
Illias Thoms



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107440180

© Cambridge University Press 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-08061-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-44018-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

The Coalition Effect, 2010-2015

The British general election of May 2010 delivered the first coalition government since the Second World War. David Cameron and Nick Clegg pledged a 'new politics' with the government taking office in the midst of the worst economic crisis since the 1930s. Five years on, a team of leading experts drawn from academia, the media, Parliament, Whitehall and think tanks assesses this 'coalition effect' across a broad range of policy areas. Adopting the contemporary history approach, this pioneering book addresses academic and policy debates across this whole range of issues. Did the coalition represent the natural 'next step' in party dealignment and the evolution of multi-party politics? Was coalition in practice a historic innovation in itself, or did the essential principles of Britain's uncoded constitution remain untroubled? Fundamentally, was the coalition able to deliver on its promises made in the Coalition Agreement, and what were the consequences – for the country and the parties – of this union?

Anthony Seldon is a leading contemporary historian and political commentator, and the 13th Master of Wellington College. A Fellow of King's College London, he has authored or edited over thirty-five books on contemporary history and politics. With Peter Hennessy, he co-founded the Institute of Contemporary British History, now part of King's College London.

The is the eighth 'Effect' book he has edited.

Mike Finn is Director of the Centre for Education Policy Analysis and Lecturer in the History of Education at Liverpool Hope University. He has taught history and politics at a number of institutions, including as a Research Fellow of Lady Margaret Hall, Oxford, and as a Bye-Fellow of Magdalene College, Cambridge. In 2006 he was Head of Research and political speechwriter to the Leader of the Liberal Democrats during the transition from Charles Kennedy to Ming Campbell.

In 2001 he won the Palgrave/Times Higher Education Humanities and Social Sciences writing prize. A former Kennedy Scholar at Harvard University, he is the editor of *The Gove Legacy: Education in Britain after the Coalition* (2015).

CONTRIBUTORS

Rosie Campbell is Reader in Politics at Birkbeck, University of London. She has research interests in voting behaviour, political participation, representation, political careers, and gender and politics. Rosie is Vice Chair of the Political Studies Association's (PSA) Executive Committee. She teaches modern British politics and research methods. Her book *Gender and the Vote in Britain* was published in 2006 and she has recently published in the *British Journal of Political Science*, *British Politics*, *Political Quarterly*, *Political Studies* and the *British Journal of Politics and International Relations*.

Daniel Chandler is an economist at the Institute for Fiscal Studies. Previously, he worked in the Prime Minister's Strategy Unit and in the Deputy Prime Minister's office, where he led projects on welfare policy and social mobility, and at the Resolution Foundation think tank, where he co-wrote the *Commission on Living Standards*. He has a BA in History from Cambridge and an MSc in Economics and Philosophy from LSE, and pursued graduate study in economics and politics at Harvard, where he was the Henry Fellow. His current research interests include housing, labour markets, living standards and inequality.

Sarah Childs is Professor of Politics and Gender at the University of Bristol. Her research centres on the relationships between sex, gender and politics. It is concerned, both theoretically and empirically, with questions of women's descriptive, symbolic and substantive representation. She has published extensively on women's political representation in the UK since 1997, especially regarding the feminization of British

political parties and the recruitment of women to the UK Parliament, with monographs on *New Labour's Women MPs* (2004), *Women and British Party Politics* (2008), and *Sex, Gender and the Conservative Party* (2012, with Paul Webb). Her current research looks at gender and intra-party democracy; gender and party regulation; and conservatism, feminism and representation.

Michael Clarke is Director General of the Royal United Services Institute. Until July 2007 he was Deputy Vice-Principal and Director of Research Development at King's College London, where he is now also Visiting Professor of Defence Studies. He has been a Specialist Adviser to the House of Commons Defence Committee since 1997, having served previously with the House of Commons Foreign Affairs Committee 1995–6, and the Joint Parliamentary Committee on Bribery in 2009. In 2004 he was appointed the UK member of the United Nations Secretary General's Advisory Board on Disarmament Matters. In 2009 he was appointed to the Prime Minister's National Security Forum and in 2010 to the Chief of Defence Staff's new Strategic Advisory Group. He also serves on the Strategic Advisory Panel on Defence for UK Trade and Industry. His recent publications include: *The Afghan Papers: Committing Britain to War in Helmand 2005–06* (2011) and 'Does War Have a Future?', in Lindley-French and Boyar (eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of War* (2012).

Rory Coonan is Chairman, Design for Care. From 2005 to 2011 he was Director of Planning, Design and Architecture for Circle Health, pioneering the 'compact' hospital concept to designs by the architectural practices headed by Lord Foster and Lord Rogers. A former director of architecture at the Arts Council of Great Britain, he devised the design policies of the National Lottery and served as chair of the National Lottery Design panel. In 1994–7 he conceived and developed NESTA (National Endowment for Science, Technology and the Arts). He was educated at Oxford University and the Royal College of Art. He has served as architecture correspondent of the *Financial Times* and *Observer*, and as a member of the Franco-British Council. He is an honorary fellow of the Royal Institute of British Architects. The National Portrait Gallery Collection has acquired works by him as a photographer.

Philip Cowley is Professor of Parliamentary Government at the University of Nottingham. He is author of *The Rebels: How Blair Misled His*

Majority (2005), co-author with Dennis Kavanagh of *The British General Election of 2010* (2010), and editor with Robert Ford of *Sex, Lies and The Ballot Box: 50 Things You Need to Know about British Elections* (2014). He runs www.revolts.co.uk.

John Curtice is Professor of Politics at the University of Strathclyde and President of the British Polling Council. He has been a co-editor of NatCen's annual British Social Attitudes reports since 1994 and co-director of the Scottish Social Attitudes surveys since their inauguration in 1999. Between 1983 and 1997 he co-directed the British Election Study, the principal instrument for the survey-based study of electoral behaviour in Britain.

Mike Finn is Director of the Centre for Education Policy Analysis and Lecturer in the History of Education at Liverpool Hope University. Born in Liverpool, he was educated there and at Oxford, Cambridge and Harvard, where he was a Kennedy Scholar. He held Fellowships at Magdalene College, Cambridge and Lady Margaret Hall, Oxford before serving as Head of Research and political speechwriter to the Leader of the Liberal Democrats in 2006. He was the recipient of the 2001 Palgrave/*Times Higher Education* Humanities and Social Sciences Writing Prize. His research interests focus on contemporary politics, the British constitution, the history of the post-war British state, and the politics of education. He is the editor of *The Gove Legacy: Education in Britain after the Coalition* (2015).

Howard Glennerster is Professor Emeritus of Social Policy at the London School of Economics and Political Science and an associate of the Centre for Analysis of Social Exclusion (CASE). He is author of *British Social Policy since 1945* and numerous books and papers on the economics of social policy in general and health care in particular. He has lectured widely abroad and has spent several sessions as a visiting scholar at the Brookings Institution in Washington.

Julian Glover was a special adviser at the Department for Transport between 2012 and 2015. He was a speechwriter for the Prime Minister between 2011 and 2012 and worked as a journalist for *The Guardian* between 2001 and 2011.

Dieter Helm, CBE, is the Professor of Energy Policy at the University of Oxford, a Fellow of New College and a Professorial Research Fellow of the Smith School of Enterprise and the Environment. He is an economist specializing in utilities, infrastructure, regulation and the environment, and concentrating on the energy, water, communications and transport sectors, primarily in Britain and Europe. He is author of *The Carbon Crunch: How we are getting climate change wrong and how to fix it* (2013), co-editor, with Cameron Hepburn, of *Nature in the Balance* (2014) and Independent Chair of the Natural Capital Committee.

Paul Johnson is Director of the Institute for Fiscal Studies. He is also currently visiting professor in the department of economics at University College London. He has worked and published extensively on the economics of public policy, with a particular focus on income distribution, public finances, pensions, tax, social security, education and climate change. As well as a previous period of work at the IFS his career has included spells at HM Treasury, the Department for Education and the FSA. Between 2004 and 2007 he was deputy head of the Government Economic Service. He is currently also a member of the committee on climate change, of the Actuarial Council of the FRC and of the executive committee of the Royal Economic Society. He was an editor of the 'Mirrlees Review'.

Guy Lodge is Associate Director at the Institute for Public Policy Research (IPPR), where he leads the institute's work on political and democratic reform. He writes and commentates on British politics and is the author with Sir Anthony Seldon of *Brown at 10*, a history of Gordon Brown's premiership. His latest book (co-authored with Iain McLean and Jim Gallagher) is *Scotland's Choices: The Referendum and What Happens Afterwards*. He is also the co-editor of *Juncture*, IPPR's quarterly politics journal.

Martin Loughlin is Professor of Public Law at the London School of Economics and Political Science. He taught at Osgoode Hall Law School of York University, Toronto, the University of Warwick and at the LSE before moving to the John Millar Chair of Public Law at the University of Glasgow in 1988. From 1991, he was Professor of Law at the University of Manchester, and he returned to LSE in 2000. He is a Fellow of the British Academy and author of *The British Constitution: A Very Short Introduction* (2013) and *Foundations of Public Law*

(2010). He has been a member of the Editorial Committee of *The Modern Law Review* since 1987, and from 2002 to 2007 served as General Editor.

Neil McGarvey is the BA Politics Subject Leader at the School of Government and Public Policy, University of Strathclyde. He is the co-author (with Paul Cairney) of the leading textbook *Scottish Politics*, a second edition of which was published in 2013. His main research interests are in the fields of Scottish politics, local government and public administration. His current research includes the examination of links between immigration, deprivation, voting and representation. This includes work on behalf of the Scottish Local Government Boundary Commission.

Philip Norton (Lord Norton of Louth) is Professor of Government and Director of the Centre for Legislative Studies at the University of Hull. His publications include over thirty books and over a hundred book chapters and journal articles. From 2001 to 2004 he was Chairman of the House of Lords Select Committee on the Constitution. He is Vice President of the Political Studies Association of the UK, a Member of Council and Director of Studies of the Hansard Society and a member of the Advisory Board of the Centre for Policy Studies.

Peter Preston is a columnist for *The Guardian* and *The Observer*. He was previously editor of *The Guardian* for twenty years, from 1975 to 1995, and has written two books, *Bess* (1999) and *The 51st State* (1998).

Peter Riddell, CBE, is Director of the Institute for Government. He was previously a Senior Fellow at the Institute and divided his time there with his work for the Detainee Inquiry, a privy counsellor panel looking at whether the British government was implicated in the improper treatment of detainees held by other countries. At the Institute, he has co-authored reports on Transitions and Ministerial Effectiveness and has been closely involved in work on political and constitutional reform. Until mid-2010, Peter was a journalist for nearly forty years, split between the *Financial Times* and *The Times*, where he had been their domestic political analyst and commentator. He has received two honorary doctorates of literature, is a Fellow of the Royal Historical Society, an Honorary Fellow of the Political Studies Association and

was one of the first recipients of the President's medal of the British Academy.

Anthony Seldon is Master of Wellington College. He has edited or written over thirty-five books on British politics and contemporary history. This is the eighth book he has edited looking at the effects of specific governments on a wide array of issues.

Julie Smith is a Senior Lecturer at the University of Cambridge. She is the Chief Examiner for the MPhil in International Relations and Politics. She is a Fellow of Robinson College, where she is a graduate tutor and Director of Studies. An expert in European politics, she was Head of the European Programme at Chatham House (the Royal Institute of International Affairs) from 1999 until 2003. She is the co-editor and contributor of the *Palgrave Handbook of National Parliaments and the European Union* (2014).

Alan Smithers is Professor and Director of the Centre for Education and Employment Research at the University of Buckingham. He has been previously the Sydney Jones Professor of Education at the University of Liverpool, Professor of Policy Research at Brunel University and Professor of Education at the University of Manchester. He has advised the Education Select Committee since 1997 and has been Standing Adviser to it throughout the 2010–15 Parliament. He has written influentially on education in schools, further education colleges and universities, and training in the colleges and in employment. He has published numerous refereed papers in the fields of education, psychology and the biological sciences. He has served on a number of national bodies.

Illias Thoms studied History and Politics at Balliol College, Oxford, graduating in 2014. He was a researcher on *Brown at 10* by Anthony Seldon and Guy Lodge (2010). As well as being the assistant editor of this volume, he was a senior researcher on *Cameron at 10* by Anthony Seldon and Peter Snowdon, to be published later this year.

Nicholas Timmins is a senior fellow at the Institute for Government and at the King's Fund. He is a visiting professor in social policy at the London School of Economics and in public management at King's College London. Between 1996 and 2012 he was public policy editor at the Financial Times. He is also the author of *The Five Giants*:

A Biography of the Welfare State (1995) and a past president of the Social Policy Association.

Tony Travers is Director of LSE London and a Professor at the London School of Economics and Political Science. He is an adviser to the House of Commons Education Select Committee and an adviser to the House of Commons Communities and Local Government Select Committee. He was a member of the Audit Commission from 1992 to 1997 and an Associate of The King's Fund. He has published a number of books and articles about local government and cities, including *The Politics of London: Governing an Ungovernable City* (2003).

Cal Viney is a doctoral candidate at the London School of Economics and Political Science. Previously, he served as an adviser on legal and constitutional policy issues at the Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet in Australia. He has also practised as a lawyer and worked as a political staffer. Cal completed an LLM in Public Law (LSE) as a Chevening Scholar and holds an LLB and BA (Deakin University).

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Anthony Seldon would like to thank his co-editor Mike Finn for exceptional support and insight, without whom the project would not have been possible. He would also like to thank his assistant editor Illias Thoms for providing administrative and editorial assistance throughout the entire process. Huge thanks are due to the editorial team at Cambridge University Press of John Haslam, Carrie Parkinson, Jessica Ann Murphy, Malcolm Todd and William Jack as well as to Angela Reed and Hani Edwards at Wellington College for their invaluable assistance. Also at Wellington, he would like to thank his senior management team including Robin Dyer and his head of politics Dibran Zeqiri. He is also immensely grateful for the work of all the contributors, who provided pieces of exceptional quality, insight and style.

Finally, he would like to thank his wife, Joanna, and his family who continue to be a source of inspiration, support and love, and Ian MacEwen, fellow politics teacher, for introducing him to Mike.

Mike Finn is immensely grateful for the support and guidance of his co-editor, Sir Anthony Seldon. He would like to thank assistant editor Illias Thoms for first-rate editorial work and support beyond the call of duty and the editorial team at Cambridge University Press, John Haslam and Carrie Parkinson. He would also like to thank Hope Kilmurry for research support and Dr Richard Huzzey for insightful discussions of Liberal Democrat politics and values. In addition, thanks are due to friends and colleagues at Liverpool Hope University, especially Dr Gary Anderson, Dr Phil Bamber, Dr Heather Ellis and Dr Steven Shakespeare. A special thank you is reserved for Dibran Zeqiri

and Ian MacEwen, exceptional teachers of politics and invaluable friends and sounding boards. He also wishes to record his great intellectual debt to Frank Ledwidge and Alexander Donnelly, and to Dr Jon Lawrence for inspiring his academic interest in politics in the first place.

He would also like to thank those (necessarily anonymous) Conservative and Liberal Democrat politicians, staff members and activists who supplied him with invaluable context for his research. Finally, he would like to dedicate his efforts in this work to his mother and father, Rita and Tom Finn, in gratitude for their enduring forbearance and love.

CONTENTS

Contributors page viii

Acknowledgements xv

David Cameron as Prime Minister, 2010–2015: The verdict of history 1

Anthony Seldon

Part I **The coalition and the government of Britain**

1 The coming of the coalition and the Coalition Agreement 31
Mike Finn

2 The coalition and the constitution 59
Martin Loughlin and Cal Viney

3 The coalition beyond Westminster 87
Neil McGarvey

4 The coalition and the executive 113
Peter Riddell

5 The coalition and Parliament 136
Philip Cowley

Part II The coalition and policy

- 6** The coalition and the economy 159
Paul Johnson and Daniel Chandler
- 7** The coalition and energy policy 194
Dieter Helm
- 8** The coalition and infrastructure 209
Julian Glover
- 9** The coalition and society (I): Home affairs and local government 228
Tony Travers
- 10** The coalition and society (II): Education 257
Alan Smithers
- 11** The coalition and society (III): Health and long-term care 290
Howard Glennerster
- 12** The coalition and society (IV): Welfare 317
Nicholas Timmins
- 13** The coalition and foreign affairs 345
Michael Clarke
- 14** Europe: The coalition's poisoned chalice 370
Julie Smith
- 15** 'What the coalition did for women': A new gender consensus, coalition division and gendered austerity 397
Rosie Campbell and Sarah Childs
- 16** The coalition and culture: 'Bread, circuses and Britishness' 430
Rory Coonan

Part III The coalition and political culture

- 17** The coalition and the Conservatives 467
Philip Norton
- 18** The coalition and the Liberal Democrats 492
Mike Finn
- 19** The coalition and the Labour Party 520
Guy Lodge and Illias Thoms
- 20** The coalition and the media 553
Peter Preston
- 21** The coalition, elections and referendums 577
John Curtice

Part IV Conclusion

- 22** Conclusion: The net coalition effect 601
Mike Finn
- Index* 608

DAVID CAMERON AS PRIME MINISTER, 2010-2015

The verdict of history

ANTHONY SELDON



Morten Morland for The Times / News Syndication

The historic significance

Win or lose the election in 2015, this government will be remembered as one of the most historically significant and unusual since the end of the