

The United Nations Special Procedures System

Edited by

Aoife Nolan

Rosa Freedman

Thérèse Murphy

The United Nations Special Procedures System

Edited by

Aoife Nolan
Rosa Freedman
Thérèse Murphy



BRILL
NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Nolan, Aoife, editor. | Freedman, Rosa, editor. | Murphy, Thérèse, editor.

Title: The United Nations special procedures system / Edited by Aoife Nolan, Rosa Freedman, Therese Murphy.

Description: Leiden : Brill Nijhoff, 2017. | Series: Nottingham studies on human rights ; 6 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016049410 (print) | LCCN 2016049561 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004304697 (hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9789004304703 (E-book)

Subjects: LCSH: United Nations Human Rights Council. | Human rights.

Classification: LCC K3241 .U549 2017 (print) | LCC K3241 (ebook) | DDC 341.4/8--dc23

LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2016049410>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2211-7342

ISBN 978-90-04-30469-7 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-30470-3 (e-book)

Copyright 2017 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Hes & De Graaf, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Rodopi and Hotei Publishing.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Koninklijke Brill NV provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Printed by Printforce, the Netherlands

The United Nations Special Procedures System

Nottingham Studies on Human Rights

PUBLISHED UNDER THE AUSPICES OF THE HUMAN RIGHTS LAW
CENTRE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF NOTTINGHAM

Edited by

Dominic McGoldrick
David Harris

VOLUME 6

The titles published in this series are listed at *brill.com/nshr*

Acknowledgements

This volume has its genesis in an expert workshop on the United Nations Special Procedures System which was held at the University of Nottingham in November 2014. Thanks are due to colleagues at the Human Rights Law Centre, including David Harris, Dominic McGoldrick, Agnes Flues, Ruth Brittle and Laura Wills, who provided invaluable support with regard to that event. We are grateful to those who have assisted us at different stages in the production of this collection, particularly Petr Mádr who provided outstanding research assistance. Lydia Bright Davies also provided assistance during the early stages of the collection. As always, the support of colleagues at our respective universities is much appreciated. Finally, especial thanks are owed to our families and friends – both old and new – who have borne with us throughout the process.

List of Illustrations

Figures

- 6.1 The Islamic Republic of Iran: responses to communications issued by Special Procedures 169
- 8.1 A virtuous cycle of cooperation 253

Tables

- 3.1 Visits and requests according to regional groups 101
- 3.2 Recommendations about Special Procedures made at UPR sessions 105
- 6.1 The Islamic Republic of Iran: responses to requests for visits from 2003 168

List of Abbreviations

ACHPR	African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights
AU	African Union
CAT	United Nations Committee against Torture
CC	Coordination Committee of Special Procedures
CED	International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CESCR	United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CHR	United Nations Commission on Human Rights
CMW	Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families
CPR	civil and political rights
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
CSO	civil society organisations
CSR	corporate social responsibility
CUNY-BC	City University of New York, Brooklyn College
DPRK	Democratic People's Republic of Korea
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
ECOSOC	United Nations Economic and Social Council
EGI	Ethical Globalization Initiative
ESCR	economic, social and cultural rights
EU	European Union
FfT	Freedom from Torture
FOTCD	Field Operations and Technical Cooperation Division
FPIC	free, prior and informed consent
GP	Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights
GSK	GlaxoSmithKline
HRC	United Nations Human Rights Council
HRuF	Human Rights up Front Action Plan
IAC	international armed conflict
IBP	institution-building package
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross

ICT	information and communication technologies
IDP	internally displaced persons
IIT	international investment treaties
IMF	International Monetary Fund
JIU	United Nations Joint Inspection Unit
LOIPR	Lists of Issues Prior to Reporting
NGO	non-governmental organisation(s)
NIAC	non-international armed conflict
NPM	National Preventive Mechanisms
OEIWG	Open-Ended Intergovernmental Working Group on Transnational Corporations and Other Business Enterprises with Respect to Human Rights
OHCHR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
OIOS	United Nations Office of Internal Oversight
OPCAT	Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
OPPBA	United Nations Office of Programme Planning, Budget and Accounts
PBI	statement of programme budget implications
RRDD	Research and Right to Development Division
SG	Secretary-General
SP	Special Procedure(s)
SPB	Special Procedures Branch
SPT	Subcommittee on the Prevention of Torture
SR	Special Rapporteur(s)
SRSg	Special Representative of the Secretary-General
SRT	United Nations Special Rapporteur on Torture
SWIFT	Society for Worldwide Interbank Financial Telecommunication
TGR	third generation rights
TTIP	Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership
UN	United Nations
UNCAT	Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNGC	United Nations Global Compact
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNMIK	United Nations Interim Administration Mission to Kosovo
UPR	Universal Periodic Review
WEOG	West European and Others Group
WG	Working Group on the Issue of Human Rights and Transnational Corporations and Other Business Enterprises

WGAD	Working Group on Arbitrary Detention
WGEID	Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances
WTO	World Trade Organization

Notes on Contributors

Dr Danielle Beswick

is a Senior Lecturer and Director of Research at the International Development Department, University of Birmingham. She completed her PhD at Manchester University, researching the relationship between aid and statehood in post-genocide Rwanda and how the country came to be considered a 'donor darling'. Conceptually, Danielle's research is situated at the interface of security and development, exploring how fragile and conflict-affected States seek to improve their security through relationships with donors. This has led to research on topics including the relationship between international aid and national security policy in Rwanda, involvement of African States in peace-keeping, and sources and limits of African agency. She has co-edited special issues of *Third World Quarterly* and *Conflict Security and Development*, and published articles in leading journals including *African Affairs* and *Development and Change*. Danielle has received research funding from the British Academy and the Economic and Social Research Council. Her most recent publication is *Conflict Security and Development: An Introduction* (with Paul Jackson; 2nd edn, Routledge 2015).

Ms Jane Connors

is the International Advocacy Director (Law and Policy) of Amnesty International, based in Geneva. She is also a Visiting Professor in Practice at the London School of Economics and Political Science's Centre for Women, Peace and Security and the chair of the board of trustees of the UK-based charity, Keeping Children Safe. She was formerly Director of the Research and Right to Development Division at the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, prior to which she worked in the Human Rights Treaties Division and as Chief of the Special Procedures Branch. From 1996 to 2002, she was the Chief of the Women's Rights Section in the Division for the Advancement of Women in the Department of Economic and Social Affairs in New York. Jane has also been a law teacher at the School of Oriental and African Studies in London and other universities in the United Kingdom and Australia.

Professor François Crépeau

is Full Professor and the Hans & Tamar Oppenheimer Chair in Public International Law at the Faculty of Law of McGill University, and Director of the McGill Centre for Human Rights and Legal Pluralism. He is the UN Special

Rapporteur on the Human Rights of Migrants (2011–17) and was the Chair of the Coordination Committee of the United Nations Human Rights Special Procedures (2014–15). François is guest professor at the Université catholique de Louvain (2010–18). He has written, edited or co-edited nine books. François is a member of the Advisory Committee of the International Migration Initiative of the Open Society Foundations, and is a member of several editorial boards. He heads the 'Mondialisation et droit international' collection at Éditions Bruylant-Larcier. François is a Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada, was a Fellow of the Pierre Elliott Trudeau Foundation, and is an *Advocatus Emeritus* of the Quebec Bar Association.

Dr Daria Davitti

is an assistant professor at the University of Nottingham, School of Law. She previously worked at the University of Keele. Her expertise is in the protection of human rights in situations of armed conflict. Her research focusses on the relationship between international investment law and international human rights law in conflict contexts, and on the impact of extractive sector investments on economic, social and cultural rights. Daria's work prior to returning to academia included deployment with the United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan as a Human Rights Field Officer, as a consultant for the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) and as a Monitor and Evaluation Officer for the Danish Committee for Afghan Refugees.

Ms Catarina de Albuquerque

is the Executive Chair of the Sanitation and Water for All Global Partnership. She was the first UN Special Rapporteur on the Human Rights to Water and Sanitation and before that she was the Chairperson-Rapporteur of the UN Working Group on the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. Since 1997 she has chaired the negotiations of several initiatives in the areas of economic, social and cultural rights and child rights. She was the Portuguese negotiator of the two Optional Protocols to the Convention on the Rights of the Child. She has lectured in human rights law and has been a consultant for UNICEF, UNDP and the European Commission. She was awarded the Human Rights Gold Medal by the Portuguese Parliament for outstanding work in the area of human rights. Her work in human rights was also honoured by the Portuguese President of the Republic with the Order of Merit. She is a Doctor of Laws (*honoris causa*) from the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill.

Professor Olivier de Frouville

is a Professor of Public Law at the University of Paris 2 (Panthéon-Assas) and Director of the Center of Research on Human Rights and Humanitarian Law. He is also a member of the Institut Universitaire de France, undertaking a programme of research called 'On a democratic theory of International Law'. From August 2011 to August 2012, Olivier was a visiting fellow at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law and at Clare Hall, University of Cambridge. Olivier de Frouville has worked for more than twenty years as a human rights expert in the United Nations. In June 2014, he was elected as a member of the UN Human Rights Committee. Between November 2008 and November 2014, he was a member of the United Nations Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances, of which he was the Chairperson-Rapporteur between April 2012 and October 2013. He was also a member of the Coordination Committee of UN Special Procedures in 2013–14. Between 2009 and 2014, he was a member of the National Consultative Commission on Human Rights in France.

Dr Elvira Domínguez-Redondo

is Associate Professor of International Law at Middlesex University, London, and Adjunct Lecturer of the Irish Centre for Human Rights (NUI Galway, Ireland). Elvira has previously held a range of different academic positions, including at the Transitional Justice Institute (University of Ulster), the Irish Centre for Human Rights, the University of Alcalá de Henares, and University of Carlos III de Madrid. She has worked as a consultant with the UN Special Rapporteur on torture at the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. Elvira specialises in international law and human rights legal theory. She is the author of two books, *Public Special Procedures of the UN Commission on Human Rights* and *Minority Rights in Asia* (co-authored with Joshua Castellino). Elvira has written a wide range of articles on human rights topics for academic journals. Her current research focusses on the best strategies for the promotion and protection of human rights within international organisations, the interlinkage between peace, development and human rights, the co-existence of multiple human rights mechanisms dealing with human rights communications at UN level, and territorial disputes in East-Asia.

Sir Professor Malcolm Evans KCMG OBE

is Professor of Public International Law at the University of Bristol where he has taught since 1988. His areas of legal specialism include both international human rights protection and the international law of the sea. In the field of human rights his particular interests concern torture and torture prevention and the protection of religious liberty under international law, on both of which he

was written extensively. He became a member of the UN Subcommittee for the Prevention of Torture in 2009 and since 2011 has served as its Chair. In 2014–15 he was Chair of the Meeting of Chairs of UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies. From 2002–13, he was a member of the OSCE ODIHR Advisory Council on the Freedom of Religion or Belief. He is a member of the Foreign Secretary's Human Rights Advisory Group and has been a member of FCO Advisory Groups on Freedom of Religion or Belief and on Torture Prevention. From 2003 to 2005, he was Head of the School of Law and, from 2005 to 2009, Dean of the Faculty of Social Sciences and Law at the University of Bristol. He is General Editor of the *International and Comparative Law Quarterly* and Co-Editor in Chief of the *Oxford Journal of Law and Religion*. Major published works include: *Religious Liberty and International Law in Europe* (CUP 1997), *Preventing Torture* (OUP 1998), *Combating Torture in Europe* (Council of Europe 2002), *Manual on the Wearing of Religious Symbols in Public Areas* (Council of Europe/Brill 2009), *The Optional Protocol to the UN Convention against Torture* (OUP 2011). He is Editor of *International Law* (4th edn, OUP 2014), *Blackstone's International Law Documents* (12th edn, OUP 2015) and *The Changing Nature of Religious Rights under International Law* (OUP 2015).

Dr Jonathan Fisher

is a Senior Lecturer in African Politics at the University of Birmingham. Jonathan's DPhil, undertaken at the University of Oxford and completed in 2011, focussed on the agency of Eastern African States in the international system with a particular focus on the areas of security, governance and human rights. He has since published on this topic in a variety of leading peer-reviewed journals (*African Affairs*, *Conflict, Security and Development*, *International Affairs*, *Journal of Modern African Studies* and *World Development*) and is currently writing a book on the interface between conflict, security and development in Africa. His research explores state approaches to security challenges in the East African region and he is particularly interested in the regional politics of conflict and conflict resolution. He has carried out fieldwork in Uganda, Eritrea, Ethiopia, Rwanda, Djibouti and Kenya and held an Honorary Research Fellowship in the UK Foreign and Commonwealth Office between 2013–14. He has been based in the University of Birmingham's International Development Department since 2011.

Professor Rosa Freedman

is Professor of Law, Conflict and Global Development at the University of Reading. Her research focusses on the UN and human rights, in particular the impact of politics upon the creation and protection of international human rights law. Rosa has published extensively on the UN human rights bodies and

on UN peacekeeping and accountability for human rights abuses committed during such operations. Rosa has published two books, *Failing to Protect: The UN and the Politicization of Human Rights* (Hurst; OUP 2014) and *The United Nations Human Rights Council: A Critique and Early Assessment* (Routledge 2013), and academic articles in journals including the *European Journal of International Law* and *Human Rights Quarterly*. She writes for national and on-line media, works closely with the UN and with state governments, and sits on the advisory boards of several international NGOs.

Ms Felice D. Gaer

is director of the Jacob Blaustein Institute for the Advancement of Human Rights. The Institute conducts research and advocacy to strengthen international human rights protections and institutions worldwide. She is an independent expert member on, and currently Vice-Chair of, the United Nations Committee Against Torture and was its Rapporteur on Follow-up to Country Conclusions (2003–14). From 2001 to 2012, Felice served five terms (including three times as Chair) on the bipartisan federal US Commission on International Religious Freedom. She is a member of the Council on Foreign Relations. Felice was appointed as Regents Professor at the University of California at Los Angeles in 2010. She is the author of many articles about human rights and the UN, including the article 'And Never the Twain Shall Meet? The Struggle to Establish Women's Rights as International Human Rights' in the American Bar Association's book, *The International Human Rights of Women: Instruments of Change*. She is co-editor with Christen Broecker of *The United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights: Conscience for the World* (Brill 2013), in which she also wrote a chapter on Special Rapporteurs.

Dr Jessie Hohmann

has been a lecturer in law at Queen Mary, University of London, since 2012. She was previously a British Academy Post-Doctoral Research Fellow at the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge. She has held visiting research positions at the University of Sydney and Osgoode Hall (York University), Canada. Jessie has broad research interests in the fields of human rights and international law, including particular interests in: the right to housing and economic, social and cultural rights more broadly; indigenous rights; the material culture and objects of international law; and the role of human rights in social struggles. Her monograph *The Right to Housing: Law, Concepts, Possibilities* (Hart Publishing 2013) explores these areas, and was shortlisted for the SLS Peter Birks Prize for Outstanding Legal Scholarship in 2013. Jessie teaches in these areas, and in UK Public Law. Dr Hohmann is a member of the

Human Rights Collegium at Queen Mary, where among other roles she is editor of the *Queen Mary Human Rights Law Review*. She is also a member of the Centre for Law and Society in a Global Context (CLSGC). As a member of the Law Society of Upper Canada, she is a fully qualified barrister and solicitor in Ontario.

Professor Paul Hunt

is a Professor in Law at Essex University and Adjunct Professor at Waikato University. He served as an independent expert on the UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1999–2002) and UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to the Highest Attainable Standard of Health (2002–08). Between 2011 and 2013, he advised WHO Assistant Director-General, Dr Flavia Bustreo, on human rights issues. He has written extensively on economic, social and cultural rights, especially the right to health. His books include: *Reclaiming Social Rights: International and Comparative Perspectives* (Dartmouth 1996); *Culture, Rights and Cultural Rights: Perspectives from the South Pacific* (Huia 2000, co-edited with Margaret Wilson); *The World Bank, IMF and Human Rights* (Wolf Legal Publishers 2003, co-edited with Susan Matthews and Willem van Genugten); *Maternal Mortality, Human Rights and Accountability* (Routledge 2013, co-edited with Tony Gray); and *Women's and Children's Health: Evidence of Impact of Human Rights* (WHO 2013, co-authored). He has an Honorary Doctorate from the Nordic School of Public Health.

Mr Marc Limon

is Executive Director of the Universal Rights Group (URG), a Geneva-based think tank focussed on international human rights policy. Prior to founding the URG in 2013, Marc worked as a diplomat at the UN Human Rights Council from the body's establishment in 2006 until the end of 2012. This included participating in the negotiations on the institution-building package, on the Council's mid-term review, and on a wide range of thematic and country-specific issues. He was lead negotiator on nine different UN resolutions dealing with issues including human rights and climate change, human rights and the environment, freedom of assembly and association, and the Third Optional Protocol to the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child. Between 2006 and 2012, Marc also prepared reports for and interacted with all UN human rights treaty bodies, drafted national reports under the Universal Periodic Review, and organised five Special Procedure country missions. Marc has written extensively on the international human rights system including on Special Procedures. He has published articles in the *Harvard Environmental Law Review*, the *Review of European Community and International Environmental Law*, and the *Georgia*

Journal of International and Comparative Law. He holds Masters degrees from the University of Cambridge, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven and the Université libre de Bruxelles.

Mr Phil Lynch

is Director of the International Service for Human Rights (ISHR). ISHR works to support and protect human rights defenders, strengthen human rights systems and ensure the effective implementation of the UN Declaration on Human Rights Defenders at the national level. From 2006 to 2012, Phil was Executive Director of the Human Rights Law Centre in Australia. Before this he worked as Manager of Homeless Law (2001–05) and as a lawyer with global law firm Allens Linklaters. Phil has published more than 20 refereed journal articles in publications including the *Melbourne University Law Review*, the *Sydney Law Review*, the *Alternative Law Journal* and the *Australian Journal of Human Rights* and has contributed numerous chapters on contemporary issues in international human rights to edited collections published by Cambridge University Press, Thomson Reuters, and Intersentia, amongst others.

Dr Najat Maalla M'jid

served as UN Special Rapporteur on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography between May 2008 and June 2014. Najat is a medical doctor in paediatrics, and has been engaged for the past three decades in the protection of vulnerable children. Najat also works as Expert-Consultant in the development and monitoring of national policies on the protection of the child in her native country of Morocco, as well as in Africa, Latin America, Europe, Asia and MENA countries. She also works as a lecturer on child rights in Moroccan and international universities, as well as on social and development policies. Najat is a member of the Moroccan National Council on Human Rights, and the founder and an active member of the nongovernmental organisation BAYTI, the pioneering programme addressing the situation of children living and working in the streets in Morocco. She is also a member of several regional and international child rights organisations, platforms and networks. Najat is the author of several reports and articles on child rights protection, including child sexual exploitation online, child sexual exploitation in travel and tourism, child prostitution, child labour, street children, child sensitive complaint mechanisms, child participation, child protection systems, and prevention of sale and sexual exploitation of children. Najat has won several national and international awards for her strong commitment to protecting the rights of the child.