Public Policy

AN EVOLUTIONARY APPROACH

JAMES P. LESTER JOSEPH STEWART, JR.

PUBLIC POLICY

An Evolutionary Approach

SECOND EDITION

JAMES P. LESTER
Colorado State University

JOSEPH STEWART, JR.
University of New Mexico



Editor: Clark Baxter

Development Editor: Sharon Adams Poore

Assistant Editor: Cherie Hackelberg Editorial Assistant: Melissa Gleason Marketing Manager: Jay Hu Cover Design: Laurie Anderson Printer: Malloy Lithographing

COPYRIGHT © 2000 by Wadsworth, a division of Thomson Learning

All rights reserved. No part of this work covered by the copyright hereon may be reproduced or used in any form or by any means—graphic, electronic, or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, taping, or information storage and retrieval systems—without the written permission of the publisher.

For permission to use material from this text, contact us:

Web:

www.thomsonrights.com

Fax:

1-800-730-2215

Phone: 1-800-730-2214

Printed in the United States of America

4 5 6 7 8 9 10 07 06 05 04

Wadsworth/Thomson Learning 10 Davis Drive Belmont, CA 94002-3098 USA www.wadsworth.com

International Headquarters

Thomson Learning 290 Harbor Drive, 2nd Floor Stamford, CT 06902-7477 USA

UK/Europe/Middle East

Thomson Learning Berkshire House 168-173 High Holborn London WC1V 7AA United Kingdom

Asia

Thomson Learning 60 Albert Street #15-01 Albert Complex Singapore 189969

Canada

Nelson/Thomson Learning 1120 Birchmount Road Scarborough, Ontario M1K 5G4 Canada

ISBN: 0-534-55008-8

To William Howard Lester and Paula F. Sutherland

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

James P. Lester is Professor of Political Science at Colorado State University. He received his Ph.D. from the George Washington University in 1980 and has also taught at Texas A&M University, the University of Kentucky, the University of Oklahoma, and Denver University. He is the author or coauthor of over sixty publications in the areas of public policy and environmental studies. His most recent book is *Environmental Politics and Policy: Theories and Evidence*, Second Edition (Duke University Press, 1995). During 1999–2000, he is the Fulbright Distinguished Chair of American Studies at Humboldt University in Berlin, Germany.

Joseph Stewart, Jr., is Professor of Political Science at the University of New Mexico. He received his Ph.D. from the University of Houston in 1977 and has also taught at the University of Texas—Dallas, the University of New Orleans, and West Virginia University. He is the author or coauthor of over forty publications in the areas of public policy and American politics. His most recent book (with Paula McClain) is Can We All Get Along? Racial and Ethnic Minorities in American Politics, Second Edition (Westview Press, 1998).

PREFACE

Moreover, it is likely to continue to be so for the foreseeable future. First, public policy study has become one of the fastest-growing subfields in political science. In less than 30 years we have seen enormous growth in student interest in this area, in course offerings at both undergraduate and graduate levels, in graduate programs, in policy institutes, and in research conducted in this subfield. Second, the existing literature on policy studies has witnessed enormous intellectual growth over the past two decades, and many new conceptual developments have occurred. Finally, the nature of American public policy increasingly requires policy analysis as a guide to policy design and redesign. Governments at all levels (i.e., federal, state, and local) will continue to need advice from policy analysts in the years to come as policy debates continue to proliferate in such areas as welfare reform, environmental problems, crime policy, and educational reform.

Many areas of the policy cycle have witnessed significant intellectual growth as far as understanding the determinants of each phase. Yet, the major problem for students of public policy (and perhaps the major challenge for teachers) is that a sense of history is missing in most contemporary policy analysis texts. So little of this evolutionary development has been accumulated in a single textbook that students may not fully appreciate the amount of intellectual growth that has taken place over the past 30 years. To appreciate more fully the extent of policy evolution, it is necessary to examine substantive policy across time. Most recently, a number of scholars have suggested that we may gain a substantially better understanding of the contours of public policy by examining its evolution over a period of at least a decade. By doing so, we begin to appreciate how systematic patterns have developed over time and across several areas of policy.

This book offers a unique approach to introducing students to policy studies by using a diachronic, or evolutionary, approach so that the students may fully appreciate the dynamic developments that have taken place in our understanding of both the policy process and several substantive areas of public policy. In fact, one of the clearest trends to emerge in the entire discipline of political science over the past 30 years is the need for historical or longitudinal analysis instead of contemporary or cross-sectional analysis. Therefore, we explicitly adopt the position that we can more fully appreciate and understand public policy

developments by viewing them from an historical or evolutionary perspective. This simply means that we propose to use an historical (or longitudinal) approach in a conceptual, rather than a statistical, sense.

In developing this theme, the book is organized into four sections. The first section of the book introduces the student to the subfield of policy studies and notes several tensions in the field. It also discusses alternative approaches to policy analysis, what we mean by "models," and means of evaluating models. The second section of the book is devoted to the evolution of research and thinking about various aspects of the policy cycle, noting the evolution of our conceptual understanding from the origin of the concept of each stage to the present time. The third section of the book explores the evolution of our thinking in four substantive areas of public policy, including education, welfare, crime, and the environment. This section provides an analysis of public policy from an historical perspective and thus complements our approach in the first two sections by drawing together the various trends identified in them. The final section provides an explanation about the tendency for policy analyses to be utilized (or not to be utilized) by decision makers and draws conclusions from the other three sections with regard to the evolution of public policy and policy studies.

TO THE INSTRUCTORS USING THIS BOOK:

The following discussion provides some useful advice to the professors adopting this book and the students who take a course in public policy studies. For the instructors, we have found that an old Chinese proverb provides much insight into how students learn and how professors might approach this course. The old Chinese proverb says, "Tell me and I will forget...Show me and I might remember... Involve me and I will remember." Thus, it is clear that students learn in at least three ways. First, all students need some basic information about the topic. They also need some type of experience with the topic at hand. Finally, they need to reflect upon and apply what they have been told or exposed to that week. Therefore, one could adopt three separate activities directed toward the students. First, each week might begin with a brief lecture on the topic for that particular week. Students are expected to come to class prepared to discuss the assigned readings for that week's topic within the context of a large group. The second meeting each week could then be devoted to a *videotape* (or guest lecture) in order to provide the students with some *experience* with the topic. Finally, the week may end with a small group discussion for reflection and application of the material that has been presented that particular week. These three sets of activities are mutually reinforcing and they provide the student with multiple kinds of learning activities that hold their interest and make the course more stimulating and engaging. Guest lecturers and small group discussions represent powerful

alternatives (as well as supplements) to the traditional lecture format. By augmenting large class meetings and lectures with these other activities, teachers can share some of the responsibility for instruction with their students. The students thus become more active participants in this learning context, unlike in the traditional, more passive, approach wherein they are constrained by listening and notetaking.

TO THE STUDENTS WHO DO PUBLIC POLICY RESEARCH:

The Internet (or the World Wide Web) is a tremendous resource for you as you conduct your policy analysis for the course. Using the Internet, you can gather all kinds of statistical information from government agencies, get other kinds of useful information from Congress or the White House, and even order books and obtain articles on your chosen topic. The purpose of this brief guide is to get you started on the Internet so that you can access the kind of information that is readily available to you for your research.

For starters, you may want to consult Andrew T. Stull's *Political Science on the Internet* (Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1997) and Gregory M. Scott and Stephen M. Garrison's *The Political Science Student Writer's Manual* (Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1998). See Chapter 13 on how to do policy analysis papers.

We strongly recommend that you consider a very useful research resource called www.policy.com, which is the Internet's largest and most widely used policy news and information service, offering daily, in-depth policy news and analysis from the world's leading think tanks, advocacy groups, trade associations, foundations, and government agencies. It provides nonpartisan policy information and thus does not take policy positions; rather, it aggregates policy content from various independent content providers, which range widely in viewpoint and area of expertise. It is entirely free, meaning that it has no registration fee and no subscription fee. It covers today's pressing issues in such areas as the environment, education, crime, welfare, and immigration, to name only a few.

Policy.com includes such organizations as the American Civil Liberties Union, the American Enterprise Institute, The Brookings Institution, The Cato Institute, Common Cause, The Economic Policy Institute, The Heritage Foundation, The Levy Institute, The National League of Cities, Resources for the Future, RAND, The Sierra Club, and the Urban Institute, just to name a few. Gaining access to these top public policy research organizations could not be easier. To access these resources, visit www.policy.com or use Keyword: policy on America Online or e-mail info@policy.com, or call 202-737-4900.

To access this site, type in www.policy.com for your search. Then, go to the Policy.com Homepage or Policy.com-Policy Update or Policy.com sites. This site

will then give you a list of research areas by issue (e.g., agriculture, crime, environment, education, welfare and housing, immigration, etc.). Select the broad issue area that interests you (e.g., education, environment, etc.). The display will then provide you with more specific issue areas within a broad area such as education (e.g., bilingual education, school choice, higher education, etc.). Select the specific issue within the broad topic that interests you. For example, if you are interested in doing a paper on environmental policy, then you might search the topic of "global warming." Point the mouse to that locale and you will see a display of recent research on this topic from various think tanks and interest groups. You might also want to search the U.S. government agencies for this topic. For example, you might want to know what publications or documents are available from the executive branch on the subject of "global warming." The possibilities are endless for your search.

Another useful resource is InfoTrac College Edition, which is a fully searchable online university library containing complete articles and their images. Its database gives you access to over 600 scholarly and popular publications including magazines, journals, encyclopedias, and newsletters. It is updated daily and includes articles dating back as much as four years. Every article within the database can be easily printed for reading and reference purposes or quickly arranged into a bibliography. Student subscribers must purchase a personalized "account ID number" that gives them unlimited access to InfoTrac for four full months at any hour of the day, anywhere they happen to be. For more information on this resource, point your web browser to http://www.infotrac-college.com/wadsworth.

Still another useful resource is **Primary Source Media**, which provides students with declassified government documents. To access this resource, point your web browser to **www.psmedia.com/ddrs.htm**. With this information, you can research, analyze, and evaluate post—World War II trends and events and bring your understanding of domestic and international events to new heights. Released by presidential libraries, these records of the twentieth century provide a foundation for research in political science and public policy. These easily accessible digital facsimiles can be downloaded and printed as required.

After first consulting these three resources, you will also want to access the Internet's (cost-free) search engines, including Lycos, Yahoo, Infoseek, WebCrawler, HotBot, etc. Any of these search engines will work for you, and you should probably consult all of them to be comprehensive in your various searches. Next, you must identify your keyword(s) for your search. For example, let's say you are doing a paper on welfare policy in the United States. Various keywords might be "poverty rates United States" or "welfare policy United States" or "welfare reform," etc. Try any number of keywords to access what you need.

Another way to obtain information is to go directly to the government organization's Web page. For example, see the following sites:

Congress:

See http://thomas.loc.gov/ for bills introduced and how members voted.

See http://thorplus.lib.purdue.edu:80/gpo/ for a history of the bills pending and passed.

See http://www.vote-smart.org/reference/primer/clead.html for leadership of the 105th Congress.

See http://voter96.cqalert.com for background stories on legislation, analysis of major issues, voting records, and election results.

The Presidency:

See http://www.whitehouse.gov for the home page of the White House.

See http://www.tamu.edu/whitehouse/ for documents and other academic resources concerning the presidency.

See http://www.whitehouse.gov/WH/Welcome.html for the best all-around introduction to various types of government information on policy issues.

See http://www.gpo.ucop.edu/search/budget97.html for the budget.

The Bureaucracy:

See http://www.fedworld.gov for links to numerous federal agencies and other government information.

The Courts:

See http://www.uscourts.gov for information about the federal courts.

See http://lawlib.wuacc.edu/washlaw/searchlaw.html for information and decisions at the state court level.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

A number of individuals have helped to make this book a reality. First, we owe an enormous intellectual debt to numerous scholars who, over the past two decades, have contributed greatly to our own intellectual development. Among these are (alphabetically): James Anderson, Ann O'M. Bowman, Charles Bullock, Richard Cole, Peter DeLeon, William Dunn, Malcolm Goggin, David Hedge, Richard Hofferbert, Helen Ingram, Hank Jenkins-Smith, Michael Kraft, Dean Mann, Peter May, Daniel Mazmanian, Paula McClain, Kenneth Meier, Henry Nau, Walter Rosenbaum, Paul Sabatier, Anne L. Schneider, Robert Stoker, Harvey Tucker, Richard Waterman, and David Webber, among others. By their prolific writings, and often their willingness to provide constructive comments on our work, they have contributed in a very direct way to whatever success this book enjoys. We are very grateful for their help. Second, several external reviewers or adopters of this book offered their constructive criticisms and advice on the first or second editions, including Les Alm, Brian Cook, Charles Davis, Malcolm Goggin, Jeffrey Greene, Bernie Kolasa, John Piskulich, James Sheffield, Andrew Skalaban, and James Wunsch. We adopted many of their suggestions, and the book is much improved as a consequence. We extend our sincere thanks to all of them for their helpful advice.

We are also grateful for the encouragement and assistance we received from Wadsworth Publishing Company. Several individuals, including Clark Baxter, Lauren Larsen, Cherie Hackelberg, Amy Guastello, and Sharon Adams Poore, provided a great deal of help that made this book much better than it otherwise might have been. Finally, we are indebted to our families for creating an environment within which we were able to work. This book is dedicated to special members of our families who have stood by us in difficult times in years past. Of course, we are also appreciative of the support and encouragement we have received over the years from our students in public policy studies. It is our hope that this book will further enhance their perspectives and understanding about American public policy. Lastly, we will, of course, blame all errors and omissions contained in the following book on each other.

James P. Lester and Joseph Stewart, Jr.

CONTENTS

	PREFACE	xi
PART ON	E THE CONTEXT OF PUBLIC POLICY STUDIES	1
		_
	1 The Nature of Public Policy	2
	What Do We Mean by Public Policy and	_
	Policy Analysis?	4
	What Is the Policy Cycle?	5
	Types of Public Policies	8
	Characteristics of the American Political	
	System	10
	Federalism	10
	Separation of Powers	11
	Political Culture	12
	Pluralism	13
	Ideology and Public Opinion	15
	History	15
	The Plan of the Book	16
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS SUGGESTED READINGS	18 18
	NOTES	19
	2 The Evolution of Public Policy and	
	Policy Studies	22
	The Evolution of American Public Policy	23
	The Near-Term View: American Values in Transition	23
	The Long-Term View: Some Recurring Patterns in	
	American Public Policy	24
	The Evolution of Policy Studies	26
	Some Tensions in the Subfield	27
	The Policy Cycle: Evolution of Our Understanding	29
	Stages in the Research Process	30
	Summary	31
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	32
	SUGGESTED READINGS	32
	NOTES	33
	3 Approaches to Policy Analysis	35
	Specific Approaches to Policy Analysis	36
	The Process Approach	36
	The Substantive Approach	37
	The Logical-Positivist Approach	3.8

	The Econometric Approach	38
	The Phenomenological (Postpositivist) Approach	39
	The Participatory Approach	40
	The Normative or Prescriptive Approach	41
	The Ideological Approach	41
	The Historical Approach	41
	Still Other Approaches	42
	On Becoming a Better Policy Analyst	45
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	47
	SUGGESTED READINGS	47
	NOTES	48
	TO TES	40
4	Models and Public Policy Studies	51
	Models	51
	The Uses and Forms of Models	51
	Criteria for Evaluating Models	53
	Some Examples of Models	54
	Steps in Building Conceptual Models	57
	Typologies	
	, , ,	58
	Criteria for Evaluating Typologies Where Do We Go From Here?	60
	VIDEOTAPES	61
		62
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	62
	SUGGESTED READINGS	62
	NOTES	63
PART TWO	ANALYSIS IN THE POLICY PROCESS	65
5	Agenda Setting	66
	The Nature of Policy Problems	67
	Types of Agendas	68
	Types of Issues	69
	Evolution of the Literature on the Agenda-	
	Setting Process	69
	Who Sets Agendas?	73
	The Elitist Perspective	73
	The Pluralist Perspective	74
	The Subgovernment Perspective	74
	Summary	76
	Case Studies	76
	Superfund	76
	Acid Rain	80
	The Problem of Nondecisions	83
	Conclusions	83
	VIDEOTAPES	84
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	
	SUGGESTED READINGS	84
	NOTES	84

6	Policy Formulation	87
	The Nature of Policy Solutions	87
	Actors in Policy Formulation	88
	Governmental Agencies	88
	The Presidency	88
	Congress	89
	Interest Groups	89
	Explaining Policy Formulation	90
	The Rational-Comprehensive Model	90
	The Incremental Model	92
	The Systems Model	94
	Case Study	96
	At-Sea Incineration of Toxic Waste	96
	The Evolution of Our Understanding of Policy	
	Formulation	100
	Summary	100
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	101
	SUGGESTED READINGS	101
	NOTES	101
7	Policy Implementation	104
	The Concept of Policy Implementation	104
	Who Implements Policy?	105
	Techniques of Policy Implementation	108
	The Evolution of Policy Implementation Research	109
	Case Studies, 1970–1975	109
	Policy Implementation Frameworks, 1975–1980	110
	Applications of the Frameworks, 1980–1985	113
	Syntheses and Revisions, 1985–Present	113
	Where Are We Now? The Current Status of	113
	Implementation Research	116
	Where Are We Going? Toward a Third Generation of	110
	Research	117
	Case Study	119
		119
	Toxic Waste Management Summary	120
	VIDEOTAPES	120
		120
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS SUGGESTED READINGS	120
	NOTES	121
	NOTES	121
8	Policy Evaluation	125
	The Concept of Policy Evaluation	126
	The Evolution of Evaluation Research	126
	What Does Evaluation Research Study?	127
	Types of Policy Evaluation	128
	Who Does Evaluation?	129
	Research Designs in Evaluation Research	131
	Problems in Evaluating the Impact of Public Policy	134
	Case Study	136
	Compensatory Education	136

viii

	Some Obstacles to Utilization of Evaluation	
	Research	137
	Contextual Factors	137
	Technical Factors	138
	Human Factors	138
	Summary	139
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	141
	SUGGESTED READINGS	141
	NOTES	141
0	Polisy Change and Tonningtion	144
9	Policy Change and Termination	144
	The Concept of Policy Change	145
	Some Reasons for Change	145
	Types of Policy Change	146
	Models of Policy Change	147
	Case Study	153
	Intergovernmental Relations and Ocean Policy Change	153
	The Concept of Policy Termination	155
	Types of Termination	156
	Approaches to Termination	157
	Reasons for Termination and Types of Terminators	157
	Some Rules for Would-Be Terminators	158
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	160
	SUGGESTED READINGS	160
	NOTES	161
PART THREE	ANALYZING PUBLIC POLICY CHOICES	163
10	Educational Policy	164
	Education in America	165
	The Locus of Educational Policymaking	165
		167
	Federal Government State Governments	167
	The Local Role	169 170
	Other Actors in Educational Policy	170
	Teachers	171
	The Courts	171
	Approaches to Educational Policy	172
	The Liberal (Structural) View	173
	The Conservative (Individualist) View	173
	The Evolution of Educational Policy	175
	The 1960s and 1970s: Inadequate Resources and	1/3
	Compensatory Education	175
	The 1980s: Poor Student Performance and Back to Basics	173
	The 1990s: Cultural Hegemony and Multiculturalism	178
	Evaluating Educational Reforms	179
	Compensatory Education	179
	Back to Basics and Accountability	181
	Multiculturalism	182
	Educational Policy in the Future	182
		102

	VIDEOTAPES	183
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	184
	SUGGESTED READINGS	184
	NOTES	185
11	Welfare Policy	188
	Poverty in America	189
	Defining Poverty	189
	Who Are the Poor?	192
	Alternative Perspectives on Welfare Policy	195
	The Liberal (Structural) View	195
	The Conservative (Individualist) View	196
	Intergovernmental Roles in Welfare Policy	197
	The Federal Role	197
	State Roles	197
	Local Roles	198
	The Evolution of Welfare Policy	198
	The Elizabethan Poor Laws	199
	The Political Machine	199
	The Great Depression of 1929	199
	Welfare Reforms, 1960–1990	200
	Structures of Welfare Policy	202
	Preventive Strategy: Social Insurance	202 203
	Alleviative Strategy: Welfare Assistance Evaluating the Impact of Social Welfare	203
	Programs	203
	Welfare Policy in the Next Millennium	206
	VIDEOTAPES	208
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	208
	SUGGESTED READINGS	209
	NOTES	209
12	Crime Policy	211
	What Is Crime?	211
	Intergovernmental Roles in Crime Policy	214
	The Federal Role	214
	The State Role	215
	The Local Role	215
	Alternative Perspectives on Crime	217
	The Conservative (Individualist) View	217
	The Liberal (Structural) View	218
	A Brief History of Crime Policy	218
	Evaluating Criminal Justice Policy	219
	The Conservative (Deterrence) Approach	220
	The Liberal (Rehabilitation) Approach	221
	The Future of Criminal Justice Policy	221
	VIDEOTAPES	223
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	223
	SUGGESTED READINGS NOTES	223 224
	IN CALES	2.7.4

13	Environmental Policy	226
10	The Evolution of Environmental Politics and Policy	227
	The Conservation-Efficiency Movement, 1890–1920	228
	The Conservation-Preservation Movement, 1920–1960	229
	The Environmental Movement, 1960–1990	230
	Environmental Policy and Politics in the New Century:	, =
	A New Federalism?	232
	The States' Response to New Federalism, 1970–1996	233
	Environmental Policy Innovations	233
	State Commitments and Environmental Management	234
	Environmental Policy Implementation	236
	The Future of Environmental Politics and Policy	239
	The Progressives	240
	The Strugglers	240
	The Delayers	241
	The Regressives	241
	Summary	242
	VIDEOTAPES	242
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	243
	SUGGESTED READINGS	243
	NOTES	243
PART FOUR	CONCLUSIONS	247
14	Utilizing Policy Analysis	248
	Using Policy Analysis	248
	Defining Knowledge Utilization: Previous Research	249
	Some Criticisms of Previous Research	250
	Knowledge Utilization: A Conceptual Framework	251
	Contextual Inducements and Constraints	252
	Technical Inducements and Constraints	253
	User Attitudes as Inducements and Constraints	254
	Some Summary Observations and Implications for	
	Future Research	254
	DISCUSSION QUESTIONS	256
	SUGGESTED READINGS	256
	NOTES	256
15	Taking Stock: The Evolution of Policy Studies	258
	The Evolution of Policy Studies, 1950–2000	259
	The Evolution of Research on the Policy Cycle	260
	The Evolution of Public Policy	262
	The Cyclical Thesis	262
	The Evolutionary or Policy-Learning Thesis	263
	The Backlash or Zigzag Thesis	264
	A Comparison of Models of Policy Change	264
	Educational Policy Change	264
	Welfare Policy Change	265
	Crime Policy Change	265
	Environmental Policy Change	266
	Summary NOTES	266 267
	INDEX	268