

# Transitions in European Patent Law

Influences of the Unitary Patent  
Package

---

EDITED BY  
ROSA MARIA BALLARDINI  
MARCUS NORRGÅRD  
NIKLAS BRUUN



Wolters Kluwer  
Law & Business

# Transitions in European Patent Law

Influences of the Unitary Patent Package

Edited by

Rosa Maria Ballardini

Marcus Norrgård

Niklas Bruun



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

*Published by:*

Kluwer Law International  
PO Box 316  
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn  
The Netherlands  
Website: [www.kluwerlaw.com](http://www.kluwerlaw.com)

*Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:*

Aspen Publishers, Inc.  
7201 McKinney Circle  
Frederick, MD 21704  
United States of America  
Email: [customer.service@aspublishers.com](mailto:customer.service@aspublishers.com)

*Sold and distributed in all other countries by:*

Turpin Distribution Services Ltd  
Stratton Business Park  
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade  
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ  
United Kingdom  
Email: [kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com](mailto:kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com)

*Printed on acid-free paper.*

ISBN 978-90-411-5605-1

© 2015 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA. Email: [permissions@kluwerlaw.com](mailto:permissions@kluwerlaw.com)

Printed and Bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY.

# Transitions in European Patent Law

## Editors and Contributors

**Rosa Maria Ballardini**, Assistant Professor, HANKEN School of Economics (Helsinki, Finland).

**Pia Björkwall**, Post-Doctoral Researcher, Luleå University of Technology (Luleå, Sweden).

**Niklas Bruun**, Professor of Commercial Law, especially Intellectual Property Law, HANKEN School of Economics (Helsinki, Finland).

**Heikki Kempainen**, Law Clerk Helsinki Court of Appeals (Finland).

**Jukka Kempainen**, Professor (retired), Docent of Cultural History, University of Turku (Turku, Finland), Docent of Jurisprudence, University of Helsinki (Helsinki, Finland), Principal Scientist at Aalto University Helsinki Institute for Information technology – HIIT (Espoo, Finland).

**Seppo Kempainen**, Attorney-at-law at Borenius Lawyers (Helsinki, Finland).

**Kelli Larson**, Doctoral Candidate, Hanken School of Economics (Helsinki, Finland).

**Pamela Lönnqvist**, Doctoral Candidate, University of Helsinki (Finland) & IP Lawyer at Boco IP Oy Ab (Helsinki, Finland).

**Nari Lee**, Professor of Intellectual Property Law, Hanken School of Economics (Helsinki, Finland).

**Jonas Ledendal**, Post-Doctoral Researcher, University of Lund (Sweden).

**Marcus Norrgård**, Professor of Law, University of Helsinki (Finland).

**Alicia Nylund**, Doctoral Candidate, University of Helsinki (Finland).

**Thomas Riis**, Professor, University of Copenhagen (Denmark).

**Clement Salung Petersen**, Associate Professor, University of Copenhagen (Denmark).

**Jens Schovsbo**, Professor, University of Copenhagen (Denmark).

**Juha Vesala**, Doctoral Candidate, University of Helsinki (Finland).

**Perttu Virtanen**, Post-doctoral researcher at Helsinki Institute for Information Technology – HIIT (Espoo, Finland).

**Andrea Wechsler**, Professor of Economic Law, Pforzheim University (Germany).

**Esther van Zimmeren**, Research Professor, University of Antwerp (Antwerp, The Netherlands).

## Preface

The idea for this book derives from a larger project titled 'Inner and outer limits of patent protection (PatLim)', a collaborative academic study financed by the Academy of Finland and aiming at providing a richer understanding of the ways that patent law reacts to and provokes complex technological phenomena. PatLim is an international research project that combines Finnish academic expertise from the Hanken School of Economics, the Helsinki Institute of Information Technology/HIIT and the University of Helsinki with ample help from Finnish and foreign partners, such as the IPR University Centre in Helsinki and the Centre for Information and Innovation Law at the University of Copenhagen. In one way or the other, all the authors of this book have been working in the context of the PatLim project.

'Transitions in European Patent Law. *Influences of the Unitary Patent Package*' is a collection of peer-reviewed book chapters that explore several patent related problems existing with the current European patent system in light of the EU Unified Patent Package. The book discusses how substantive and procedural patent law rules in highly complex technologies such as software and biotechnology interact within each other's framework, within the overall IP framework, as well as within the framework of other fields of law, such as competition law and copyright law. Overall, this book hopes to introduce new perspectives to the European patent law discussion offering tentative solutions and interpretations both to the currently existing and to the potentially arising problems within the European patent framework.

We would like to thank the Academy of Finland for providing the funding for the PatLim project, its researchers and, as a result, this book. We would also like to thank the Hanken School of Economics, the Helsinki Institute of Information Technology/HIIT at Aalto University and the University of Helsinki for providing us with the necessary structural support that was needed for the successful realization of this project. Many thanks also to the IPR University Centre that has helped us establish a working community where the PatLim scholars have been able to interact with researchers located at different universities in Finland and abroad. Thank you to all the external participants and commentators who took part in the PatLim mini-seminars series for providing invaluable insights into and feedback on previous versions of the

book chapters appearing in this book. Last, but not least, thank you Alicia and Teemu for your incredible job in editing the book.

*Helsinki, May 2015*  
*Dr Rosa Maria Ballardini*  
*Professor Marcus Norrgård*  
*Professor Niklas Bruun*



# Summary of Contents

Editors and Contributors	v
Preface	xix
PART I	
Introduction	1
CHAPTER 1	
European Patent Law: The Case for Reform	
<i>Rosa Maria Ballardini, Marcus Norrgård &amp; Niklas Bruun</i>	3
PART II	
European Patent Reforms: General Perspectives	13
CHAPTER 2	
Patent Reforms at Both Sides of the Atlantic: An Analysis of the Patent Package and the America Invents Act through the Lens of 'Dynamic Patent Governance'	
<i>Esther van Zimmeren</i>	15
CHAPTER 3	
The Unified Patent Court (UPC) <i>in Action</i> : How Will the Design of the UPC Affect Patent Law?	
<i>Clement Salung Petersen, Thomas Riis &amp; Jens Schovsbo</i>	37
PART III	
The Substantive Patent Law Framework	59
CHAPTER 4	
Legal Certainty and Software Patents: A European Perspective	
<i>Rosa Maria Ballardini</i>	61

## Summary of Contents

---

CHAPTER 5	
The Unified Patent Court and the Inventive Step	
<i>Pia Björkwall</i>	85
CHAPTER 6	
Secret Prior Art: The Many Faces of Article 54(3) EPC	
<i>Pamela Lönnqvist</i>	105
CHAPTER 7	
Patent Specification: Articles 83 and 84 Appeal before the Boards of Appeal of EPO Concerning Computer Programs	
<i>Perttu Virtanen</i>	127
PART IV	
Enforcement and Procedural European Patent Law	
	145
CHAPTER 8	
Enforcement: Legal Implications of the European and Unitary Patent Systems for Non-practicing Entity Patent Enforcement in Europe	
<i>Kelli Larson</i>	147
CHAPTER 9	
The Doctrine of Equivalents and the Interpretation of the Extent of Protection Conferred by a Patent	
<i>Heikki Kemppinen, Jukka Kemppinen &amp; Seppo Kemppinen</i>	167
CHAPTER 10	
The Requirements for Preliminary Injunctions in the Unified Patent Court	
<i>Marcus Norrgård &amp; Alicia Nylund</i>	189
CHAPTER 11	
Adding Fuel to Fire: A Complex Case of Unifying Patent Limitations and Exceptions through the EU Patent Package	
<i>Nari Lee</i>	207
PART V	
European Patent Law: Perspectives from Other Fields of Law	
	229
CHAPTER 12	
The Relationship between Copyright and Patent Protection in European Union Law	
<i>Jonas Ledendal</i>	231

CHAPTER 13

Competition Policies for Software Innovations in and beyond Markets:  
An Investigation into the Complementarity of Competition Law and  
Patents in the European Union

*Andrea Wechsler* 253

CHAPTER 14

Misuse of Patent Application Procedures: A Case for Condemning  
Non-misleading Strategies?

*Juha Vesala* 269

Bibliography 291

Table of Legislation 313

Table of Cases 315

Index 323

# Table of Contents

Editors and Contributors	v
Preface	xix
PART I	
Introduction	1
CHAPTER 1	
European Patent Law: The Case for Reform	
<i>Rosa Maria Ballardini, Marcus Norrgård &amp; Niklas Bruun</i>	3
§1.01 Introduction	3
§1.02 From European Community Patent to Unified Patent Package: History and Objectives of the Reforms	5
§1.03 The Final Package	8
[A] European Patent with Unitary Effect and Enhanced Role of the EPO	8
[B] Enforcing European Patents: The UPC	9
[C] Legitimacy of the New System	11
PART II	
European Patent Reforms: General Perspectives	13
CHAPTER 2	
Patent Reforms at Both Sides of the Atlantic: An Analysis of the Patent Package and the America Invents Act through the Lens of 'Dynamic Patent Governance'	
<i>Esther van Zimmeren</i>	15
§2.01 Introduction	15
§2.02 Dynamic Patent Governance	18
[A] Heterogeneity of Formal Actors	19

## Table of Contents

---

	[B] Heterogeneity of Informal Actors and Interaction between Formal and Informal Actors	21
§2.03	Patent Reforms in Europe and the US: Analysis of the History, Reform Processes and Objectives	22
	[A] The Patent Package: Analysis of the History, Reform Process and Objectives	23
	[B] US AIA: Analysis of the History, Reform Process and Objectives	30
§2.04	Concluding Remarks	34
CHAPTER 3		
The Unified Patent Court (UPC) <i>in Action</i> : How Will the Design of the UPC Affect Patent Law?		
<i>Clement Salung Petersen, Thomas Riis &amp; Jens Schovsbo</i>		
		37
§3.01	Introduction	37
§3.02	The Future Role of the UPC	38
	[A] Patent Law and Patent Policy	38
	[B] The UPC and the European Patent Organisation	39
	[C] The UPC as a Central Policymaker	40
§3.03	Challenges Caused by the Institutional Design of the UPC	42
	[A] Policy Implications from Specialization	42
	[1] Judges of the UPC	42
	[2] Policymaking and Biases: The US Experience	44
	[B] Specialization <i>in Action</i>	46
	[1] <i>Ordre Public</i> and Morality	46
	[2] Discussion	49
	[C] Scope of Protection	52
	[1] Discussion	54
§3.04	Conclusion	56
PART III		
The Substantive Patent Law Framework		
		59
CHAPTER 4		
Legal Certainty and Software Patents: A European Perspective		
<i>Rosa Maria Ballardini</i>		
		61
§4.01	Introduction	61
§4.02	Causes of Uncertainty	63
	[A] Intrinsic Characteristics	63
	[B] Acquired Characteristics	65
§4.03	Uncertainties with the Requirement of Technicality	67
	[A] Invention and Inventiveness in the Law	67
	[B] Interpreting Invention and Inventiveness	68

§4.04	CII and AHA: Some Empirical Evidence	69
[A]	Quantitative Study	70
[1]	Data Analysis	71
[B]	Qualitative Study	74
[1]	AHA and Invention	75
[2]	AHA and Inventiveness	75
[C]	Conclusion	78
§4.05	CII Patent Uncertainties and the EU Unitary Patent Package	79
[A]	EPO and UPC Joint Efforts towards Keeping the Inventiveness Threshold High	81
CHAPTER 5		
The Unified Patent Court and the Inventive Step		
<i>Pia Björkwall</i>		85
§5.01	Introduction	85
§5.02	The Inventive Step at Grant	85
§5.03	The Inventive Step in Court	89
§5.04	The Inventive Step and Patent Policy	91
[A]	Technological Neutrality and Its Consequences	91
[B]	The 'Right' Level	97
§5.05	The Role of the UPC in Relation to the Inventive Step	100
CHAPTER 6		
Secret Prior Art: The Many Faces of Article 54(3) EPC		
<i>Pamela Lönnqvist</i>		105
§6.01	Introduction	105
§6.02	The Treatment of Prior Post-published Patent Applications	107
[A]	Prior Rights under Article 54(3) EPC	107
[B]	The Territorial Effect of Article 54(3) EPC Prior Rights	109
[C]	The Treatment of Article 54(3) EPC Prior Rights	110
[1]	From a Prior Claims Approach to a Whole Contents Approach	110
[2]	Narrow Concept of Novelty	112
[3]	Poisonous Priority and Toxic Divisionals	113
§6.03	The Treatment of National Prior Rights	116
[A]	National Prior Rights and Classical European Patents	116
[B]	National Prior Rights and European Patents with Unitary Effect	118
[1]	National Prior Rights Preventing Registration of Unitary Effect	118
[2]	Effect of National Prior Rights when Unitary Effect Has Been Registered	119

## Table of Contents

---

	[3] Late Validation or Conversion to Nationally Validated Patents?	123
§6.04	Conclusions	124
CHAPTER 7		
Patent Specification: Articles 83 and 84 Appeal before the Boards of Appeal of EPO Concerning Computer Programs		
	<i>Perttu Virtanen</i>	127
§7.01	Introduction: The Patent Specification Fundamentals	127
§7.02	The Normative Background and Its Context	129
§7.03	Software Specification: Claims and Description	134
§7.04	Claim Clarity and Full Disclosure of Invention in the EPO Boards of Appeal Practice Concerning Software	136
§7.05	Conclusion	140
PART IV		
Enforcement and Procedural European Patent Law		145
CHAPTER 8		
Enforcement: Legal Implications of the European and Unitary Patent Systems for Non-practicing Entity Patent Enforcement in Europe		
	<i>Kelli Larson</i>	147
§8.01	Introduction	147
§8.02	Non-practicing Entity Patent Enforcement	151
	[A] The <i>Modus Operandi</i> of NPE Business Models	151
	[B] Asymmetrical Advantages	152
§8.03	Legal Implications of the European Patent System for Non-practicing Entity Patent Enforcement	153
	[A] <i>Positive</i> Legal Implications of the European Patent System for Non-practicing Entity Patent Enforcement	153
	[B] <i>Negative</i> Legal Implications of the European Patent System for Non-practicing Entity Patent Enforcement	155
§8.04	Potential Legal Implications of the Unitary Patent System for Non-practicing Entity Patent Enforcement	157
	[A] Potential <i>Positive</i> Legal Implications of the Unitary Patent System for Non-practicing Entity Patent Enforcement	157
	[B] Potential <i>Negative</i> Implications of the Unitary Patent System for Non-practicing Entity Patent Enforcement	161
§8.05	Concluding Remarks	164

## CHAPTER 9

## The Doctrine of Equivalents and the Interpretation of the Extent of Protection Conferred by a Patent

<i>Heikki Kempainen, Jukka Kempainen &amp; Seppo Kempainen</i>	167
§9.01 Introduction	167
§9.02 The European Patent Convention and the Protocol for the Interpretation of Article 69	169
§9.03 Equivalence-Based Interpretation as Part of the Interpretation Tradition of Patent Law	170
[A] On the Interpretation Traditions	170
[B] On Interpreting Rights in Patent Law and Other Intellectual Property Law	173
[C] Problems Related to Patent Interpretation and the Doctrine of Equivalents	175
[D] The Test Questions	178
§9.04 The Doctrine of Equivalents in Recent Finnish Legal Practice	182
§9.05 Practical Issues Related to the Doctrine of Equivalents	185
§9.06 In Conclusion	187

## CHAPTER 10

## The Requirements for Preliminary Injunctions in the Unified Patent Court

<i>Marcus Norrgård &amp; Alicia Nylund</i>	189
§10.01 Introduction	189
§10.02 Provisional Measures in the UPC	190
§10.03 The Preliminary Injunction Proceedings in the UPC	192
[A] Protective Letter	196
§10.04 The Standard for Preliminary Injunctions	198
[A] The Legal Provisions	198
[B] Different Models: Two Extremes	199
§10.05 The UPC Standard for Preliminary Injunctions	203
[A] Normative Decision Theory	203
[B] The Seesaw Model	204
§10.06 Conclusion	205

## CHAPTER 11

## Adding Fuel to Fire: A Complex Case of Unifying Patent Limitations and Exceptions through the EU Patent Package

<i>Nari Lee</i>	207
§11.01 Introduction	207
§11.02 Paths of Substantive Harmonization of Patent Rights in Europe	209



## Table of Contents

[A]	Harmonization or Unification?	209
[B]	European Harmonization and Influence of International Treaty	211
§11.03	Limitations and Exceptions in Patent Laws in Europe	215
[A]	Limitations and Exceptions: Some Conceptual Distinctions	216
[B]	Patent Limitation in Europe before and after UPCA	217
[1]	Limitation through Excluded Subject Matters in Europe	219
[2]	Limitations on Biotechnology Patents: Purpose Bound Limitation and Exhaustion	221
[3]	Potential Fragmentation in Judicial Competence on Patent Limitations	223
[C]	Exceptions in Unitary Patent Package	224
[1]	Exceptions in the UPCA	225
[2]	Unitary in Principle Only?	226
§11.04	Conclusion	227
PART V		
European Patent Law: Perspectives from Other Fields of Law		229
CHAPTER 12		
The Relationship between Copyright and Patent Protection in European Union Law		
<i>Jonas Ledendal</i>		231
§12.01	Introduction	231
§12.02	Theories on Exclusion of Technical Function	231
§12.03	Exclusion of Technical Function under Protection of Industrial Property	235
[A]	Trademark Protection	235
[B]	Design Protection	238
§12.04	Exclusion of Technical Function under Copyright Law	240
[A]	Harmonization of the Object of Protection and Originality	240
[B]	Harmonization of Technical Exclusion	241
[C]	Works of Applied Art	243
[D]	Computer Programs	244
§12.05	Exclusion of Technical Function from a Systemic Perspective	248
§12.06	Conclusions	250
CHAPTER 13		
Competition Policies for Software Innovations in and beyond Markets: An Investigation into the Complementarity of Competition Law and Patents in the European Union		
<i>Andrea Wechsler</i>		253
§13.01	Introduction	253