

Anaphoric Repair in Conversation  
— A Study Based on Data from Chinese Drama Dialogues

◎ 马文 著

# 会话中的回指修正研究

——基于汉语戏剧会话的语料分析

Anaphoric Repair in Conversation  
— A Study Based on Data from Chinese Drama Dialogues

山东大学出版社

# 会话中的回指修正研究

——基于汉语戏剧会话的语料分析

## **Anaphoric Repair in Conversation**

—A Study Based on Data from  
Chinese Drama Dialogues

马文 著

山东大学出版社

**图书在版编目(CIP)数据**

会话中的回指修正研究:基于汉语戏剧会话的语料  
分析/马文著. — 济南:山东大学出版社, 2007. 8  
ISBN 978-7-5607-3445-3

I. 会...

II. 马...

III. 戏剧—表演—语言艺术—研究

IV. J812.3

中国版本图书馆 CIP 数据核字(2007)第 135604 号

**山东大学出版社出版发行**

(山东省济南市山大南路 27 号 邮政编码:250100)

**山东省新华书店经销**

**济南景升印业有限公司印刷**

850×1168 毫米 1/32 10.25 印张 256 千字

2007 年 8 月第 1 版 2007 年 8 月第 1 次印刷

**定价:23.60 元**

**版权所有,盗印必究**

凡购本书,如有缺页、倒页、脱页,由本社营销部负责调换

## 序 言

本书的基础是作者于2004年在上海外国语大学完成的博士学位论文。作为一篇学位论文,无疑应当具有一定的创新性和研究深度。

那么,什么是创新性呢?我觉得,下面一句据说是尼采说过的名言很有道理(我没有查到出处,所以只能说是“据说”)——“独创性并不是首次观察某种新事物,而是把旧的、很早就是已知的,或者是人人都视而不见的事物当新事物观察,这才证明是有真正的独创头脑”。说其有道理,是因为牛顿发现万有引力、瓦特发明蒸汽机,都是对成熟的苹果落地、水开后蒸汽顶起壶盖等诸如此类人们熟知的常见现象进行深入观察和思考的结果。自然科学如此,人文科学大概也是这样的吧。

马文博士在此书中研究的是汉语会话中的回指修正现象,属于语篇回指研究领域中的一个课题。回指(anaphora)是指如下的一种语言现象,即一个(往往是简略的)语言表达式用来指代同一语篇中(通常是上文已出现过的,但也不排除是下文中的)另一个语言表达式所表达的事物或意义。前一个语言表达式称为回指语(anaphor),后一个语言表达式称为先行语(antecedent)(见许余龙,2004:1)。

回指所研究的,是日常生活中的一种常见语言现象。在言语交际中,人们往往也能轻易地相互理解语篇中出现的回指。例如,



在“John cheated Mike, and he cheated Steve, too”和“张三欺骗了李四,也欺骗了王五”这两个英汉句子中,英语代词“he”和汉语零形代词“?”,都不难理解为分别与“John”和“张三”指的是同一个人。但是,要对其作出合理的解释,探求其本质,寻求其使用规律,找出其理解机制,就不那么容易了。而且,由于回指的使用和理解几乎涉及语音、语义、形态、句法、篇章、语用等语言学研究的所有层面,因而回指研究也成了检验各种语言学理论的合理性和解释力的试金石,以及探视不同语言层面和系统之间的接面(interface)问题的窗口。

因此,在最近的四十年中,语言学界将其作为“新事物”,从句法学、语义学、语用学、篇章语言学、文体学、语言普遍现象和语言类型学、语言认知和语言习得等不同的视角,对其进行观察。并且基于这些观察,提出了不同的理论模型。

本书采用的是会话分析的视角,将会话中的语篇回指,视为交际双方在基本会话合作原则指导下,采用的指称照应管理手段及其结果,着重探讨说话者为了纠正会话交际中实际存在或可能出现的回指指代不清或误解而作出的修正。从这一视角研究语篇回指的好处是,可以从说话者何时、何处、在何种情况下作出何种回指修正中,反观和逆向推测交际双方在使用回指时所遵循的合作原则。本书的创新性也就表现在从这一视角对语篇回指的深入观察和思考中,主要体现在如下观察、描述和解释三个方面。

首先,本书采用会话语料,首次对汉语会话中的回指修正现象进行了较为系统、深入和全面的观察。

正如 Levinson (1983: 321) 和黄衍 (Huang, 2000: 164) 所指出,与非会话语料相比,会话语料具有这样的特点:在会话交际中,后一话步(turn)是对前一话步的应对,显现出前一话步的受话者对该话步的分析,从而也为会话分析者提供了宝贵的分析资源。采用会话语料研究回指,虽然增添了分析的复杂性,但同时却为我



们提供了研究语篇回指使用规律的独特机会。因此,黄衍(Huang, 2000)在总结了已有的三种语篇回指语言学研究理论模型后,便是以会话中的回指修正为例,提出了自己的语篇回指研究的语用模型。

但是,黄衍的研究是例示性的,目的是探讨将其主要用于阐释句内回指现象的语用模型拓展到语篇回指研究领域的可行性。这一研究虽具有较大的启示意义,却并未对会话中的回指修正现象作系统的观察和研究。马文博士的研究则进了一步,他从95部现代中国剧本中穷尽性地耙梳出280个含有回指修正的会话片段,从形式、功能和类型等方面,分门别类地对其进行系统深入的观察。从而在研究方法上,保证了研究结果符合所观察到的语言事实。

其次,基于上述观察,本书采用定量统计和定性分析相结合的研究方法,首次对汉语会话中的回指修正现象进行了深入细致、符合语言事实的描述。

对事物或现象的充分描述是进一步探究其本质和规律的基础。通过对语料的深入观察,本书作者主要从如下五个方面对汉语会话中的回指修正现象作了详尽的描述:①描述了回指修正的四种基本类型及其在语料中的出现频率。②描述了回指修正所采用的主要修正引导类型和引导手段,以及它们在语料中的出现频率。③描述了在执行回指修正时所采用的各种修正策略及其在语料中的出现频率。④描述了在含有回指修正的会话片段中,不同类型的待修正语的分布情况及其与不同修正功能之间的联系。⑤描述了在含有回指修正的会话片段中,不同类型的修正语的分布情况及其与不同类型的待修正语之间的共现情况。这些描述,不仅为研究回指修正在不同语言或不同文体中的特点、分析不同语言或文体之间在使用方面的异同、探讨造成这种异同的原因等



研究,提供了可靠的基础,同时也是进一步探究回指修正的本质和规律,进而推测语篇回指的本质和规律的前提。

最后,在上述观察和描述的基础上,本书致力于对汉语会话中的回指修正现象作出解释,首次提出了一些具体的、可验证的、符合所描写语言事实的理论假设。

科学研究的根本目的是探寻事物或现象的本质和规律。从本质上来说,语篇回指的运用和理解是一个认知过程,最适宜从“语篇认知”的角度来进行研究(关于这一观点,参见 Cornish, 2006)。就会话中的回指修正这一语言现象而言,需要探究的本质和规律性问题包括:在语篇产生和理解的认知过程中,①是什么原因使交际者感到有必要作出回指修正?②怎样才能确定是否需要作出回指修正?③说话者在选用不同的回指修正的引导手段时遵循的基本原则是什么?④说话者在选用不同的回指修正语时遵循的基本原则又是什么?

通过对汉语会话中回指修正现象的仔细观察和翔实描述,马文博士对上述四个问题作出了较为合理的回答,这些回答构成了本书最大的理论贡献。其要点包括:①提出了一个由明晰性、可理解性和恰切性为主要准则的“指称合作原则”,认为该原则统摄回指修正全过程;正是由于交际者觉得自己或对方在会话交际某一环节违反了该原则,因而感到需要作出回指修正。②设计提出了一个具体检查是否需要作出回指修正的流程图,清楚地说明何处、何故需要作出回指修正。③提出了一个具体的“回指修正引导手段的自然等级”,认为这是说话者在选用不同的回指修正的引导手段时所遵循的基本原则。④提出了一个综合性的“回指修正的语用认知模型”,进一步从认知、语用、语言形式和会话交际的不同层面上,清楚地说明何处、何故、采用何种语言形式的修正语来实施回指修正。

那么,是否本书对汉语会话中回指修正现象的研究已经是尽善尽美了呢?根据 Popper (1972) 的科学观,所有客观知识都是在解决问题的过程中发展起来的。在此过程中,假设(即尝试性理论)被提出、接受检验、被推翻,导致对假设的修正或新假设的提出。修正后的新假设又接受新一轮的检验与修正,如此不断循环发展,使我们对世界的认识不断提高。也就是说,科学研究是无止境的;在科学发展的每一阶段,所有客观知识(即科学理论)都是暂时性的、猜想型的和假说性的。这些知识只能暂时性地证实(confirm),或结论性地证伪和推翻,却永远不能最终证明(prove)。或许,这就是科学研究的永久魅力之所在,也是我们永远需要科学研究的原因。

就马文博士的研究而言,他在本书中提出的一些原则和模型也是一种理论假设。他运用大量的语料来证实,他的理论假设可以解释汉语会话中的回指修正现象。但是,无论语料的量有多大,总是有限的,而且总是有一定的局限性。(这不应成为不作实证研究的理由,而是恰恰说明,在科学研究中有大量细致的实证工作要做。)例如,本书采用的语料是中国现代剧本。尽管剧本中的对话通常会充分反映现实生活中的实际使用情况,但毕竟不是真实的会话,其中的一些回指修正,很可能是剧作家为了剧情的需要或取得某种艺术效果而特意设置的。当然,这种人为操纵不能无视会话的一般原则,因而剧本会话中出现的回指修正可能与真实会话中的实际使用情况并无本质上的区别。不过,两者之间的一些具体差别仍值得研究。而且,一些社会语言学因素,如会话的场合、交际双方的相对社会地位等,在一定程度上也会影响回指修正的引导手段和实施策略的运用,因而也值得进一步研究。在此基础上,理论假设本身也还可以进一步完善,使其具有更强的内部一致性、更强的解释力和预测力。



总之,本书的研究是认真严谨的。读者至少可以从其观察、描述和解释语言现象的方法中获益。

许余龙

上海外国语大学

2007年4月25日

### 参考文献

Cornish, F. 2006. Discourse anaphora. In K. Brown *et al.* (eds.), *Encyclopedia of Language and Linguistics*, 2nd ed. Oxford: Elsevier, 631-638.

Huang, Y. 2000. Discourse anaphora: Four theoretical models. *Journal of Pragmatics* 32:151-176.

Levinson, S. C. 1983. *Pragmatics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Popper, K. 1972. *Objective Knowledge: An Evolutionary Approach*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

许余龙:《篇章回指的功能语用探索——一项基于汉语民间故事和报刊语料的研究》,上海外语教育出版社2004年版。

## Acknowledgements

I wish to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisor Professor Xu Yulong for seeing me through this programme with his dedicated and inspiring guidance and unfailing support. His illuminating insights, accurate criticism and useful suggestions have contributed greatly to the completion of my PhD dissertation, from which the current book is originated. And his devotion to academic work, insistence on preciseness, and integrity in teaching have influenced me enormously and will benefit my career in the future.

My sincerest thanks go to Professor He Zhaoxiong, Mei Deming, Li Ji'an and Shu Dingfang, and Professor Huang Yan for their enlightening and absorbing lectures from which I have benefited a lot.

I am deeply indebted to Professor Tao Liang and Professor Kawai Chui for their valuable and stimulating advice on anaphora and repair study, and for their kindly sharing with me some important literature.

I would like to express my sincere thanks to Professor Jiang Wangqi for his support and guidance during and after my dissertation stage. His persistent encouragement has inspired me to



continue to conduct more systematic research in this field.

My deep gratitude goes to Professor Shu Dingfang, Professor Huang Ren, Professor Shao Zhihong, Professor Hong Gang, Professor Yu Dongming, Professor Jia Weiguo, and Professor Zhou Guoqiang for their kindly reading my dissertation and giving their illuminating comments and constructive suggestions.

I wish to acknowledge a debt to all my teachers, friends and colleagues who have inspired and supported me over the years. I am tremendously grateful to College of Foreign Language and Literature, Shandong University, for their continuing help and unfailing support, which make the publication of this book come true.

Finally, I would like to express my most hearty thanks to my family which have always been an unfailing source of energy and support in this and all endeavors. I owe the biggest debt of gratitude to my father, Professor Ma Kejie, my mother, Zheng Ruilan, and my brothers for their unwavering love, support and encouragement, and to Dr. Hu Chunxia, my wife, whose wholehearted support and constant encouragement have sustained me through the years. I gratefully dedicate this book to them.

# Contents

|                                                              |             |
|--------------------------------------------------------------|-------------|
| <b>Chapter One Introduction .....</b>                        | <b>(1)</b>  |
| 1.1 Conversational Repair and Anaphoric Repair .....         | (1)         |
| 1.1.1 Definition of conversational repair .....              | (1)         |
| 1.1.2 Toward a definition of anaphoric repair .....          | (2)         |
| 1.2 A Brief Literature Review .....                          | (5)         |
| 1.3 General Aims and Objectives .....                        | (14)        |
| 1.4 Methodology .....                                        | (18)        |
| 1.5 Data Used for Analysis .....                             | (20)        |
| 1.6 Organization of the Present Study .....                  | (22)        |
| <b>Chapter Two Classifications of Anaphoric Repair .....</b> | <b>(24)</b> |
| 2.1 Introduction .....                                       | (24)        |
| 2.2 A Functional Classification .....                        | (26)        |
| 2.2.1 Anaphoric repair for referential unclearness .....     | (27)        |
| 2.2.2 Anaphoric repair for lexical understanding .....       | (29)        |
| 2.2.3 Anaphoric repair for identity negotiation .....        | (32)        |
| 2.2.4 Anaphoric repair for listening problem .....           | (36)        |
| 2.2.5 Anaphoric repair for speaking error .....              | (38)        |
| 2.3 Appropriateness-repair Versus Error-repair .....         | (40)        |
| 2.4 A Formal Classification .....                            | (42)        |
| 2.4.1 Repair of a pronominal form .....                      | (43)        |



|                                                                  |                                                                             |              |
|------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------|
| 2.4.2                                                            | Repair of a non-pronominal form .....                                       | (43)         |
| 2.5                                                              | Summary .....                                                               | (44)         |
| <b>Chapter Three Basic Patterns and Structural Preferences</b>   |                                                                             |              |
|                                                                  | <b>of Anaphoric Repair .....</b>                                            | <b>(45)</b>  |
| 3.1                                                              | Introduction .....                                                          | (45)         |
| 3.2                                                              | Basic Patterns and Structural Preferences of<br>Conversational Repair ..... | (45)         |
| 3.3                                                              | Four Patterns of Anaphoric Repair .....                                     | (54)         |
| 3.3.1                                                            | Self-initiated self-repair .....                                            | (56)         |
| 3.3.2                                                            | Other-initiated self-repair .....                                           | (70)         |
| 3.3.3                                                            | Other-initiated other-repair .....                                          | (92)         |
| 3.3.4                                                            | Self-initiated other-repair .....                                           | (113)        |
| 3.4                                                              | Structural Preferences of Anaphoric Repair in<br>Chinese Conversation ..... | (115)        |
| 3.4.1                                                            | Distribution of the four basic patterns of anaphoric<br>repair .....        | (115)        |
| 3.4.2                                                            | Self-initiation versus other-initiation .....                               | (117)        |
| 3.4.3                                                            | Self-repair versus other-repair .....                                       | (119)        |
| 3.5                                                              | Summary .....                                                               | (120)        |
| <b>Chapter Four Initiation Types and Techniques in Anaphoric</b> |                                                                             |              |
|                                                                  | <b>Repair .....</b>                                                         | <b>(122)</b> |
| 4.1                                                              | Introduction .....                                                          | (122)        |
| 4.2                                                              | Initiation Types .....                                                      | (123)        |
| 4.2.1                                                            | Specific information request .....                                          | (125)        |
| 4.2.2                                                            | Non-specific request for repetition .....                                   | (130)        |
| 4.2.3                                                            | Expression of lexical uncertainty .....                                     | (133)        |
| 4.2.4                                                            | Candidate understanding .....                                               | (136)        |
| 4.2.5                                                            | Clarification request .....                                                 | (141)        |

|                                                                 |                                                                       |              |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------|
| 4.2.6                                                           | Objection .....                                                       | (144)        |
| 4.2.7                                                           | Preemptive initiation .....                                           | (146)        |
| 4.2.8                                                           | Minimal dysfluency .....                                              | (150)        |
| 4.2.9                                                           | Without explicit initiation marker .....                              | (153)        |
| 4.3                                                             | Initiation Techniques .....                                           | (154)        |
| 4.3.1                                                           | Question particle or question word .....                              | (156)        |
| 4.3.2                                                           | Repeat of the trouble source .....                                    | (158)        |
| 4.3.3                                                           | Repeat of the trouble source+question word .....                      | (159)        |
| 4.3.4                                                           | Question .....                                                        | (160)        |
| 4.3.5                                                           | Candidate alternative .....                                           | (163)        |
| 4.3.6                                                           | Negative word or clause .....                                         | (166)        |
| 4.3.7                                                           | Sound stretch, cut-off or non-lexical filler .....                    | (167)        |
| 4.3.8                                                           | Without separable initiator .....                                     | (168)        |
| 4.3.9                                                           | The scale of initiation techniques .....                              | (169)        |
| 4.3.10                                                          | Practices of combining different techniques .....                     | (171)        |
| 4.4                                                             | Summary .....                                                         | (176)        |
| <b>Chapter Five Repair Strategies in Anaphoric Repair .....</b> |                                                                       | <b>(177)</b> |
| 5.1                                                             | Introduction .....                                                    | (177)        |
| 5.2                                                             | Repair Strategies .....                                               | (179)        |
| 5.2.1                                                           | Replacement .....                                                     | (179)        |
| 5.2.2                                                           | Addition .....                                                        | (185)        |
| 5.2.3                                                           | Completion .....                                                      | (188)        |
| 5.2.4                                                           | Repetition .....                                                      | (190)        |
| 5.2.5                                                           | Rejection .....                                                       | (192)        |
| 5.2.6                                                           | Explanation .....                                                     | (194)        |
| 5.3                                                             | Repair Strategies Used in the Five Types of<br>Anaphoric Repair ..... | (197)        |
| 5.4                                                             | Summary .....                                                         | (200)        |



## Chapter Six Referential Choice and Interpretation of

|                                                                         |       |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|
| <b>Anaphoric Repair</b>                                                 | (201) |
| 6.1 Introduction                                                        | (201) |
| 6.2 Referential Choice in Anaphoric Repair                              | (202) |
| 6.2.1 Distribution of reparanda                                         | (204) |
| 6.2.2 Distribution of reparans for repairing reparanda                  | (206) |
| 6.2.3 Referential choice in repairing non-pronominal<br>reparanda       | (213) |
| 6.3 Interpretation of Anaphoric Repair in General                       | (222) |
| 6.3.1 CP of anaphoric reference                                         | (223) |
| 6.3.2 A general procedure of anaphoric repair                           | (226) |
| 6.4 A Pragmatic and Cognitive Account of Repairs<br>of Pronominal Forms | (251) |
| 6.4.1 A pragmatic perspective of repairs of pronominal<br>forms         | (252) |
| 6.4.2 A cognitive perspective of anaphoric repair                       | (266) |
| 6.4.3 A pragmatic and cognitive model of anaphoric<br>repair            | (279) |
| 6.5 Summary                                                             | (281) |
| <b>Chapter Seven Conclusion</b>                                         | (283) |
| 7.1 Summary of Major Findings                                           | (283) |
| 7.2 Theoretical Implications                                            | (287) |
| 7.3 Limitations of This Study                                           | (289) |
| 7.4 Suggestions for Future Research                                     | (289) |
| <b>附录 中国现代戏剧</b>                                                        | (291) |
| <b>Bibliography</b>                                                     | (296) |

# **Chapter One Introduction**

## **1.1 Conversational Repair and Anaphoric Repair**

“Successful management of conversation involves a co-operative process in which partners take turns at talk, inform each other of problems and monitor conversational breakdown and repair by clarifying misunderstandings and ambiguities” (Aviezer, 2003: 117). In our conversation, we may quite frequently experience dysfluencies, inappropriateness and errors in various forms, and may constantly take efforts to deal with the problems to facilitate the communication. Specifically, when a participant has a difficulty expressing himself clearly, a difficulty hearing what was said, or a difficulty understanding something another has said, or figures the wrong, inaccurate or perhaps inapposite expressions by others, he or she may probably take steps to rectify the trouble spot by initiating its repair (Drew, 1997: 69–70).

### **1.1.1 Definition of conversational repair**

A possible first understanding of conversational repair might

be that repair is the process for speakers to correct errors they have made in their immediately prior talk (Fox & Jasperson, 1995: 80). But Schegloff, Jefferson and Sacks (1977: 34) (henceforth SJS) note that repair is far beyond error-correction, for repair can also occur when there is no audible error, and the audible error does not always result in correction. Therefore error-correction is just one category of repair. Conversational repair thus can be defined as “any instance in which an emerging utterance is stopped in some way, and is then aborted, recast, or redone” (Fox & Jasperson, 1995: 80), or in other words, “the efforts of participants to deal with trouble in speaking, hearing or understanding” (Weber, 1993: 30). Repairs are instigated by trouble in the talk. The “trouble” we use here not only refers to a real problem in conversation, but also a potential one. Sometimes potential troubles in conversation may also lead to participants’ efforts to make repairs. Since efforts at repair may sometimes fail<sup>①</sup>, what is labeled as “repair” refers to “the success of a repair procedure” (SJS, 1977: 378). Therefore in the current study, we only focus on those repair practices that have been successfully performed.

### 1.1.2 Toward a definition of anaphoric repair

Sometimes trouble may arise from anaphoric problems in speaking, hearing or understanding. Such a special type of repair

---

① It is noted by SJS(1977: 364) that there are also cases in which an apparent trouble has occurred, but no effort to repair it is undertaken or the participant fails to repair it. However, “in the vast majority of cases repair is successful and quick”.