

HONG KONG CASES

1992

Volume 2

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Butterworths Asia

Singapore • Kuala Lumpur • Hong Kong

The Butterworth Group of Companies

Singapore	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01 International Plaza, Singapore 0207
Hong Kong	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA (HONG KONG) 19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 9651400 Fax: 9760840
Malaysia	MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur
Australia	BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra
Canada	BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver
Ireland	BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin
New Zealand	BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland
Puerto Rico	BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan
UK	BUTTERWORTH & CO (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh
USA	BUTTERWORTH LEGAL PUBLISHERS Salem, New Hampshire and Carlsbad, California
Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed International (Singapore) Pte Ltd.	

© Butterworths Asia, 1994

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

ISBN 0-409-99730-7

Typeset by Butterworths Asia and Superskill Graphics
Produced by Mandarin Offset Ltd
Printed and bound in Hong Kong

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Associate Editors

Grenville Cross QC

Ruy Barretto, Barrister

Michael Ozorio, Barrister

Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister

Susan Kwan, Barrister

Peter Garland, Barrister

Malcolm Merry, Barrister

Aarif Barma, Barrister

Andrew Cheung, Barrister

Peter Ng, Barrister

Joseph Fok, Barrister

Anderson Chow, Barrister

Teresa Cheng, Barrister

David Fitzpatrick, Barrister

Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister

Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University

Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

Reporters in this volume

Danny Choi, Barrister

George F Chu, Barrister

Simon CK Chui, Barrister

Victor T Gidwani, Barrister

Anne-Marie Gordon, Barrister

Paul Harris, Barrister

MJ Kenny, Barrister

Gary Kwan, Barrister

Christopher Lam, Barrister

Godfrey Lam, Barrister

Osmond Lam, Barrister

Raymond Lau Wai Man, Barrister

Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister

Raymond Leung, Barrister

PY Lo, Barrister

Lawrence Ng, Barrister

Raymond Tsui Wai Nam, Barrister

Daniel Wan, Barrister

Anthony P Kinnear

Butterworths Asia

Managing Editor: Anthony P Kinnear

Deputy Managing Editor: Zarinah Marican

Publisher: David Catterall

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

List of abbreviations used in this volume (excluding reports):

A	High Court Action
ACJ	Acting Chief Justice
A-G	Attorney General
AR	Application for Review
Adm	Admiralty Action
App	Appendix
art	article
Aust	Australia
CA	Court of Appeal
CA	Civil Appeal Number in references to unreported cases (eg CA 2/92)
CJ	Chief Justice
Cap	Chapter (as in Chapter Number of an Ordinance)
Crim App	Criminal Appeal
Comm L	Commercial List
Con L	Construction List
ch	chapter (as in chapter number of a book)
cl(l)	clause(s)
DC	District Court
DCA	District Court Action
DJ	District Judge
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
EC	European Communities
ECC	Economic Compensation Case
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities
EEC	European Economic Communities
Ed	Edition
Ex Ch	Court of Exchequer Chamber
exh	exhibit
HC	High Court
HL	House of Lords
HMSO	Her Majesty's Stationery Office
J(J)	Justice(s)
J(JA)	Justice(s) of Appeal
LTA	Labour Tribunal Appeal
LC	Lord Chancellor
MA	Magistracy Appeal
MCA	Magistracy Criminal Appeal
MP	Miscellaneous Proceedings
MR	Master of the Rolls
n	note
NSW	New South Wales
O	Order (of the Rules of the Supreme Court)
PC	Privy Council
PCA	Privy Council Appeal

Hong Kong Cases

Pt	Part
para	paragraph
RSC	Rules of the Supreme Court
r(r)	rule(s)
reg	regulation
s	section
sub-s	subsection
Sch	Schedule
TMR	Trade Marks Registry
UN	United Nations
USDC	United States District Court
Uncitral	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
VCJ	Victoria District Court Civil Jurisdiction Action
VP(P)	Vice-President(s)
WCC	Workers' Compensation Case

List of abbreviations of law reports:

A Crim R	Australian Criminal Reports; since 1979
AC	Law Reports, Appeal Cases (HL and PC); since 1890
ALR	Australian Law Reports
All ER	All England Law Reports; since 1936
All ER Rep	All England Law Reports Reprint; 1558–1935
App Cas	Law Reports, Appeal Cases, House of Lords, 15 volumes; 1875–1890
Asp MLC	Aspinall's Maritime Law Cases, 22 volumes; 1870–1943
B & C	Barnewall & Cresswell's Reports, King's Bench, 10 volumes; 1822–1830
B & CR	Reports of Bankruptcy and Companies Winding up Cases, 20 volumes; 1918–1947
BLR	Business Law Review
C & P	Carrington and Payne's Reports, Nisi Prius, 9 volumes; 1823–1841
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports; since 1903
COD	Crown Office Digest
Ch	Law Reports, Chancery Division; since 1890
Ch App	Law Reports, Chancery Appeals, 10 volumes; 1865–1875
Ch D	Law Reports, Chancery Division, 45 volumes; 1875–1890
Cons LJ	Construction Law Journal
Cox Eq	EW Cox's Equity Cases, 2 volumes; 1745–1797
Cr App R	Criminal Appeal Reports (HL and CA(UK)); since 1908
Cr App R (S)	Criminal Appeal Reports (Sentencing); since 1979
Crim LR	Criminal Law Review; since 1954
DLR	Dominion Law Reports

Abbreviations

De GM & G	De Gex, Macnaghten and Gordon's Reports, Chancery, 8 volumes; 1851–1857
Dears CC	Dearsly's Crown Cases Reserved, 1 volume, 1852–1856
E & B	Ellis & Blackburn's Reports, Queen's Bench, 8 volumes; 1852–1858
EG	Estate Gazette; since 1858
ER	English Reports, 178 volumes; 1220–1865
F & F	Foster and Finlayson's Reports (Nisi Prius), 4 volumes; 1856–1867
FLR	Family Law Reports
FSR	Fleet Street Reports; since 1975
HKLR	Hong Kong Law Reports
HKLJ	Hong Kong Law Journal
Hare	Hare's Reports (Ch), 11 volumes; 1841–1853
ICR	Industrial Cases Reports; since 1975
IR	Irish Reports; since 1893
IRL	Industrial Relations Law Reports; since 1972
ITR	Industrial Tribunal Reports
Imm AR	Immigration Appeals Reports
KB	Law Reports, King's Bench Division, 53 volumes; 1901–1952
LJKB/QB	Law Journal, King's or Queen's Bench; 1831–1946
LRHL	Law Reports, English and Irish Peerage Claims, House of Lords, 7 volumes; 1866–1875
LRQB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench, 10 volumes; 1865–1875
LS Gaz	Law Society's Gazette (now known as the <i>Gazette</i>)
LT	Law Times Reports, 177 volumes; 1859–1947
Ll Rep	Lloyd's List Law Reports; 1919–1950
Lloyd's Rep	Lloyd's List Law Reports; since 1951
MLR	Modern Law Review
Moo & S	Moore & Scott's Reports, Comon Pleas, 4 volumes, 1831–1834
NZLR	New Zealand Law Reports; since 1883
P	Law Reports, Probate, Divorce and Admiralty Division; 1891–1971
P & CR	Planning (Property) and Compensation Reports; since 1950
PD	Law Reports, Probate, Divorce and Admiralty Division; 1875–1890
QB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1891–1900, and since 1952
QBD	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1875–1890
Qd R	Queensland Law Reports; 1958–1972
	Queensland Reports; since 1972
RPC	Reports of Patent Cases; since 1884
SJ	Solicitors Journal
TLR	The Times Law Reports, 71 volumes; 1884–1950
	The Times Law Reports; since 1951

Hong Kong Cases

VR	Victorian Reports; 1870–1872 and since 1957
Ves	Vesey Junior's Chancery Reports, 19 volumes; 1789–1817
WLR	Weekly Law Reports; since 1953
WN	Law Reports, Weekly Notes, 87 volumes; 1866–1952

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

The mode of citation of cases reported in this volume of *Hong Kong Cases* is [1992] 2 HKC (page).

	Page		Page
A			
A-Mayson Development Co Ltd v Betterfit Ltd	[HC] 533	Chan Suk Bing Angie v Harbour Phoenix Ltd & Anor	[HC] 459
Alka's Industrial Co Ltd v Bright Power Industries Ltd & Anor	[HC] 642	Cheong Hing Ha Kee Construction Co Ltd & Anor; Ma Hui Tung Kuk & Anor v	[HC] 391
Attorney General v Chung Kwan Wai	[HC] 388	Cheuk Tze Kwok v Leung Yin King & Anor	[CA] 179
Attorney General v Lam Man Wah (No 1)	[CA] 67	Cheung Kam Moon & Ors; Golden Bay Investment Ltd & Anor v	[HC] 478
Attorney General v Lam Man Wah (No 2)	[CA] 70	Chingtung Futures Ltd (in liquidation) v Lai Cheuk Kwan Arthur & Ors	[HC] 637
Attorney General v Ng Yuk Tung	[CA] 204	Chui Shui On v Tang Koon Yung & Ors	[HC] 323
Attorney General v Shiu Kam Fung	[HC] 552	Chung Kwan Wai; Attorney General v	[HC] 388
Attorney General v Wong Man Kei	[CA] 52	Clearwater Bay Golf and Country Club; Chan Ho Har Wane Daisy & Anor v ..	[HC] 604
Au Lai Hong; R v	[CA] 217	Commercial Union Assurance Co plc & Ors; Young Conqueror Co Ltd v	[HC] 486
B		Commissioner of Inland Revenue v Malaysian Airline System Bhd	[HC] 468
Bentley & Anor; Parry & Anor v	[HC] 524	Copiluck Ltd; Yeung Dallah Rudia v	[HC] 575
Betterfit Ltd; A-Mayson Development Co Ltd v	[HC] 533	Countess of Cromer; Earl of Cromer v	[CA] 54
Billiongold Co Ltd; Taisei Kogyo Kaisha Ltd v	[CA] 153	D	
Bouygues SA & Ors; Red Sea Insurance Ltd v	[CA] 84	D & Anor; C & Anor v	[HC] 248
Bright Power Industries Ltd & Anor; Alka's Industrial Co Ltd v	[HC] 642	de los Santos Rodolpho v The Queen	[PC] 1
C		Dong Do, The	[CA] 116
C & Anor v D & Anor	[HC] 248	E	
Chan Chu Ngan v Wong Woon Pui & Anor	[CA] 193	Earl of Cromer v Countess of Cromer	[CA] 54
Chan Fok Kei & Ors; Tang Tim Fat & Anor v	[HC] 623	Eversonic Inc; Wong Kwok Mei Sanrita & Ors v ..	[CA] 62
Chan Ho Har Wane Daisy & Anor v Clearwater Bay Golf and Country Club	[HC] 604	Excelling Profit Investments Ltd v Sera Ltd	[HC] 262
Chan Siu Mee Sandie; Yeung Siu Hong v	[HC] 559		

Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
G		Lam Hau Yee & Ors;	
Gatewood Ltd v Silver		Gloria Weaving And	
Noble Investment Ltd [HC]	473	Knitting Factory Ltd v [HC]	497
Gloria Weaving and		Lam Hing; Lam Kee On v [HC]	317
Knitting Factory Ltd v		Lam Kee On v Lam Hing [HC]	317
Lam Hau Yee & Ors [HC]	497	Lam Man Wah (No 1);	
Golden Bay Investment Ltd		Attorney General v [CA]	67
& Anor v Cheung Kam		Lam Man Wah (No 2);	
Moon & Ors [HC]	478	Attorney General v [CA]	70
Good Profit Development		Lam Yau (Administratrix of	
Ltd v Leung Hoi [HC]	539	Estate of Lam Yuk Kwai,	
		deceased) v Shun Shing	
H		Construction & Engineering	
Harbour Phoenix Ltd &		Co Ltd & Anor [HC]	407
Anor; Chan Suk Bing		Lam Yau Tim; R v [CA]	199
Angie v [HC]	459	Lee Yee Hung & Ors;	
Hoi Tat Rubber Factory;		Mardulyn & Ors v [CA]	164
Pang Wai Chung v [HC]	447	Leung Hoi; Good Profit	
Hon Sau Ling & Anor;		Development Ltd v [HC]	539
Leung Lai Ha v [CA]	109	Leung Kwok Hing v	
		Sanyo Electric Trading	
I		Co Ltd [HC]	509
Inchcape Hong Kong Ltd		Leung Lai Ha v Hon Sau	
t/a Gilman Business		Ling & Anor [CA]	109
Systems v Performa		Leung Yin King & Anor;	
(Asia) Ltd [HC]	364	Cheuk Tze Kwok v [CA]	179
J		Li Tung Hing; R v [HC]	427
Jardine Engineering Corp		Lion Will Investment Ltd v	
Ltd & Ors v Shimizu		Triple Will Ltd [HC]	430
Corp [HC]	271	Lo Chi Ping v Ma Chi Hung .. [CA]	187
Jim Beam Brands Co v		Lo Sui Han v Personal	
Kentucky Importers Pty		Representative of the Estate	
Ltd & Anor [HC]	581	of Chan Wah Hing [HC]	570
K			
Kan Paul, Re [HC]	331	M	
Kentucky Importers Pty Ltd		Ma Chi Hung; Lo Chi Ping v . [CA]	187
& Anor; Jim Beam Brands		Ma Hui Tung Kuk & Anor	
Co v [HC]	581	v Cheong Hing Ha Kee	
Kwok Kwok Yu & Ors v		Construction Co Ltd &	
Shanshin Trading Co Ltd [CA]	159	Anor [HC]	391
Kwok Sing Leung & Anor;		Mak Woon Shui, deceased,	
Wong Shiu Hung v [HC]	369	Re [CA]	144
L		Malaysian Airline System	
Lai Cheuk Kwan Arthur &		Bhd; Commissioner of	
Ors; Chingtung Futures Ltd		Inland Revenue v [HC]	468
(in liquidation) v [HC]	637	Mardulyn & Ors v Lee Yee	
Lam Chun Chuen; R v [CA]	37	Hung & Ors [CA]	164

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
Mightyton Ltd; Pilecon (Hong Kong) Ltd v [HC]	346	R v Udeoji [CA]	105
Miller Stephen Henry, Re, ex p Jeong Hee Shin [HC]	422	R v Wong Shiu Lun [HC]	555
Mita Kogyo Kabushiki Kaisha v Mitac Inc [CA]	30	R v Wong Wing Yau [CA]	233
Mitac Inc, Mita Kogyo Kabushiki Kaisha v [CA]	30	R v Yiu Lai Kuen [CA]	73
Mitac, Re [HC]	22	Red Sea Insurance Ltd v Bouygues SA & Ors [CA]	84
N		S	
Neo-Concept Industrial Co Ltd v Sportex Industrial Ltd. [HC]	452	Santiago & Ors; R v [HC]	521
Ng Kin Chit; R v [CA]	210	Sanyo Electric Trading Co Ltd; Leung Kwok Hing v [HC]	509
Ng Sau Ching; Ng Wai Lin v. [CA]	45	Sera Ltd; Excelling Profit Investments Ltd v [HC]	262
Ng Wai Lin v Ng Sau Ching .. [CA]	45	Shanshin Trading Co Ltd; Kwok Kwok Yu & Ors v [CA]	159
Ng Yuk Tung; Attorney General v [CA]	204	Shimizu Corp; Jardine Engineering Corp Ltd & Ors v [HC]	271
P		Shiu Kam Fung; Attorney General v [HC]	552
Pang Wai Chung v Hoi Tat Rubber Factory [HC]	447	Shun Shing Construction & Engineering Co Ltd & Anor; Lam Yau (Administratrix of Estate of Lam Yuk Kwai, deceased) v [HC]	407
Parry & Anor v Bentley & Anor [HC]	524	Silver Noble Investment Ltd; Gatewood Ltd v [HC]	473
Performa (Asia) Ltd; Inchcape Hong Kong Ltd t/a Gilman Business Systems v [HC]	364	South China Finance Co Ltd & Anor v Teo Bee Hiong & Anor [CA]	240
Personal Representative of the Estate of Chan Wah Hing; Lo Sui Han v [HC]	570	Sportex Industrial Ltd; Neo-Concept Industrial Co Ltd v [HC]	452
Pilecon (Hong Kong) Ltd v Mightyton Ltd [HC]	346	T	
Q		Taisei Kogyo Kaisha Ltd v Billiongold Co Ltd [CA]	153
Queen, The; de los Santos Rodolpho v [PC]	1	Tang Bing Lun & Anor; R v .. [CA]	92
R		Tang Koon Yung & Ors; Chui Shui On v [HC]	323
R v Au Lai Hong [CA]	217	Tang Tim Fat & Anor v Chan Fok Kei & Ors [HC]	623
R v Lam Chun Chuen [CA]	37	Teo Bee Hiong & Anor; South China Finance Co Ltd & Anor v [CA]	240
R v Lam Yau Tim [CA]	199	Triple Will Ltd; Lion Will Investment Ltd v [HC]	430
R v Li Tung Hing [HC]	427		
R v Ng Kin Chit [CA]	210		
R v Santiago & Ors [HC]	521		
R v Tang Bing Lun & Anor ... [CA]	92		
R v Tse Chung Fat [CA]	221		

Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Tsang Lun & Anor; Tsang Wing Lung v [HC]	440	Wong Shiu Hung v Kwok Sing Leung & Anor [HC]	369
Tsang Wing Lung v Tsang Lun & Anor [HC]	440	Wong Shiu Lun; R v [HC]	555
Tse Chung Fat; R v [CA]	221	Wong Wing Yau; R [CA]	233
U		Wong Woon Pui & Anor; Chan Chu Ngan v [CA]	193
Udeoji; R v [CA]	105	Y	
W		Yeung Dallah Rudia v Copiluck Ltd [HC]	575
Wenden Engineering Service Co Ltd v Wing Hong Contractors Ltd [HC]	380	Yeung Siu Hong v Chan Siu Mee Sandie [HC]	559
Wing Hong Contractors Ltd; Wenden Engineering Service Co Ltd v [HC]	380	Yick Fung Garment Factory Ltd, Re [HC]	417
Wong Kwok Mei Sanrita & Ors v Eversonic Inc [CA]	62	Yiu Lai Kuen; R v [CA]	73
Wong Man Kei; Attorney General v [CA]	52	Young Conqueror Co Ltd v Commercial Union Assurance Co plc & Ors [HC]	486

SUBJECT INDEX

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Judicial review

Renewed application for leave – Material non-disclosure in first attempt – Demolition order by Building Authority – Service of demolition order – Posting at applicant's premises – Computation of time – Potential arguability – Buildings Ordinance (Cap 123) s 35

Re Yick Fung Garment Factory Ltd HC 417

Natural justice

Suspension from club membership for alleged contravention of club by-law – Adequate opportunity to defend allegation which led to suspension – Estoppel
Chan Ho Har Wane Daisy & Anor v Clearwater Bay Golf and Country Club

HC 604

ARBITRATION

Stay of proceedings

Whether dispute must have arisen at time writ was issued – Whether dispute existed at time writ was issued – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 6

Pilecon (Hong Kong) Ltd v Mightyton Ltd HC 346

Time limit

Clause in arbitration agreement – Extension of time for commencement of arbitration proceedings – Date at which time limit in agreement commences – Whether delay excessive – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 29

Wenden Engineering Service Co Ltd v Wing Hong Contractors Ltd HC 380

BANKRUPTCY AND INSOLVENCY

Bankruptcy notice

Whether notice is bad for failure to give debtor option to pay creditor – Bankruptcy Ordinance (Cap 6) s 4

Re Miller Stephen Henry, ex p Jeong Hee Shin HC 422

BILLS OF EXCHANGE AND OTHER NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENTS

Payment on cheque

Whether delivery of cheque was conditional – Whether there was oral agreement that payment on cheque conditional on delivery of documents – Whether evidence of alleged oral agreement admissible – Evidential value of written contemporaneous contract from which cheque emanated – Bills of Exchange Ordinance (Cap 19) s 21(2)(b)

Neo-Concept Industrial Co Ltd v Sportex Industrial Ltd HC 452

BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION

Contract

Implied terms – Whether implied terms in sub-contracts that sub-contractors entitled to compensation for loss caused by delay not their fault – Main contractor

entitled to compensation and extensions of time – Whether sub-contractor entitled to equivalent rights – Whether terms can be implied into government's standard form contracts – Relevant principles – Whether main contractor in breach of contract

Jardine Engineering Corp Ltd & Ors v Shimizu Corp HC 271

Interim certificate

Whether can be challenged by employer of architect – Duty of architect
Pilecon (Hong Kong) Ltd v Mighyton Ltd HC 346

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Appeal

Extension of time to file notice of appeal – Court's discretion to allow extension – Merits of appeal – Lengthy and inexcusable delay – Balancing exercise required real prospect of success of appeal

Leung Kwok Hing v Sanyo Electric Trading Co Ltd HC 509

Liability of insurer – Application to court for award of compensation – Whether leave of court required for appeal – District Court Ordinance (Cap 336) s 63 – Employees' Compensation Ordinance (Cap 282) s 23

Chan Chu Ngan v Wong Woon Pui & Anor CA 193

Review of decision of Registrar of Trade Marks – Extension of time for filing of appeal – Whether s 79(1)(c) Trade Marks Ordinance (Cap 43) or s 14(1) Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) governs appeal procedure – Rules of the Supreme Court O 3 r 5(1) & O 59 r 4(1)

Mita Kogyo Kabushiki Kaisha v Mitac Inc CA 30

Costs

Bullock/Sanderson order – Whether plaintiff could get costs of successful defendant from unsuccessful defendant

Leung Lai Ha v Hon Sau Ling & Anor CA 109

Security for costs – Overseas company – Discretion of court to take account of merits of plaintiff's claim – Rules of the Supreme Court O 23

Wong Kwok Mei Sanrita & Ors v Eversonic Inc CA 62

Defence

Amendment – Withdrawal of admission made in error
Taisei Kogyo Kaisha Ltd v Billiongold Co Ltd CA 153

Discovery

Defamation proceedings – Documents obtained from discovery sought to be used for the purpose of counterclaim – Whether party receiving discovery to be released from implied undertaking – Whether leave required – Counterclaim an independent action – Exercise of discretion – Rules of the Supreme Court O 24 r 14A

Parry & Anor v Bentley & Anor HC 524

Evidence

Witnesses – Oral examination – Power of judge to hear evidence of witness not called by either party

Lo Chi Ping v Ma Chi Hung CA 187

Obtaining evidence for foreign court

Letters rogatory – Order for examination of witnesses – Legal professional privilege – Public interest in overriding privilege or confidentiality – Whether defendants can object to the examination of professional witnesses on the ground that the matters of the examination are privileged – Evidence Ordinance (Cap 8) s 77(1)(a) – Rules of the Supreme Court O 39 r 10

Jim Beam Brands Co v Kentucky Importers Pty Ltd & Anor HC 581

Letters rogatory – Order for examination of witnesses – Object of request – Whether examination of witnesses for facts material to proceedings or for discovery of documents – Evidence Ordinance (Cap 8) s 75

Jim Beam Brands Co v Kentucky Importers Pty Ltd & Anor HC 581

Letters rogatory – Order for examination of witnesses – Particulars of documents requested – Evidence Ordinance (Cap 8) s 76(4)

Jim Beam Brands Co v Kentucky Importers Pty Ltd & Anor HC 581

Letters rogatory – Order for examination of witnesses – Practice – Time limit for examination to take place – Notice for non-party to the application

Jim Beam Brands Co v Kentucky Importers Pty Ltd & Anor HC 581

Order for inquiry

Mareva injunction discharged by the Court of Appeal – No reference to order for inquiry made in judgment – Whether subsequent issue of summons to High Court for an order for inquiry is an abuse of process – Whether Court of Appeal had jurisdiction to entertain an application for an order for inquiry

Kwok Kwok Yu & Ors v Shansin Trading Co Ltd CA 159

Pleadings

Amendment – Meaning of ‘new cause of action’ – Limitation Ordinance s 35 – Rules of the Supreme Court O 25 r 5

Red Sea Insurance Ltd v Bouygues SA & Ors CA 84

Striking out – Party joined for declaratory relief – Necessary and proper party – No cause of action – Whether just and convenient to be joined – Rules of the Supreme Court O 15 r 6(2)(b)(ii)

Good Profit Development Ltd v Leung Hoi HC 539

Striking out of statement of claim – Whether defendant’s point plainly and obviously good such that it is manifestly and immediately destructive of plaintiff’s claim

Lam Kee On v Lam Hing HC 317

Relitigation

Relitigation of question raised or could have been raised in previous litigation – Proper remedy for challenging an adverse order was by way of appeal – Applications dismissed without consideration of merits – Whether relitigation can be allowed on this ground

Leung Kwok Hing v Sanyo Electric Trading Co Ltd HC 509

Statement of claim

Application for striking out – Rules of the Supreme Court O 18 r 19
Cheuk Tze Kwok v Leung Yin King & Anor CA 179

Application to amend – Claim against broker for breach of fiduciary duty – Sale of shares at an undervalue – Whether claim that shares were not really ‘sold’ could be added

South China Finance Co Ltd & Anor v Teo Bee Hiong & Anor CA 240

Stay of execution of judgment

Repeated applications – Whether judgment debtor entitled to make repeated applications under O 47 r 1 – Applications dismissed by Master without consideration of merits – Whether this permitted relitigation – Appeal against orders – Merits of appeal – Rules of the Supreme Court O 47 r 1

Leung Kwok Hing v Sanyo Electric Trading Co Ltd HC 509

Striking out

Relationship between O 18 r 19 and O 33 r 3 of Rules of the Supreme Court – Whether court can in a striking out application proceed to resolve issue as if it was raised as a preliminary issue under O 33 r 3 – Rules of the Supreme Court O 18 r 19 & O 33 r 3

Lam Kee On v Lam Hing HC 317

Summary judgment

Stay of proceedings – Whether defendant raised any bona fide dispute or triable issue – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14

Pilecon (Hong Kong) Ltd v Mighyton Ltd HC 346

Transfer of cases from High Court to District Court

Power to order transfer – When transfer may be ordered
Inchcape Hong Kong Ltd t/a Gilman Business Systems v Performa (Asia) Ltd
 HC 364

COMPANIES AND CORPORATIONS

‘Corporation aggregate’

Whether limited to a Hong Kong registered company – Includes a foreign company – Conveyancing and Property Ordinance (Cap 219) s 20(1)

Excelling Profit Investments Ltd v Sera Ltd HC 262

Director

Negligence – Whether negligent conduct capable of ratification by company
– Nature of exposure brought about by negligence – Negligence resulting in insolvency of company – Ratification cannot operate to defeat claim against negligent director to ultimate detriment of creditors

Chingtung Futures Ltd (in liquidation) v Lai Cheuk Kwan Arthur & Ors
HC 637

Piercing the corporate veil

Whether company a trustee for members or directors – Whether company alter ego of members or directors

Good Profit Development Ltd v Leung Hoi HC 539

CONFLICT OF LAWS

Torts committed beyond jurisdiction

Principles applicable – Application of *Dicey & Morris* r 205(2) in Hong Kong

Red Sea Insurance Ltd v Bouygues SA & Ors CA 84

CONTRACT

Building contract

Implied term – Labour only sub-contract – Whether appropriate to imply safe access to place of work

Ma Hui Tung Kuk & Anor v Cheong Hing Ha Kee Construction Co Ltd & Anor HC 391

Implied terms – Whether implied terms in sub-contracts that sub-contractors entitled to compensation for loss caused by delay not their fault – Main contractor entitled to compensation and extensions of time – Whether sub-contractor entitled to equivalent rights – Whether terms can be implied into standard form contracts – Relevant principles – Whether main contractor in breach of contract

Jardine Engineering Corp Ltd & Ors v Shimizu Corp HC 271

Preliminary agreement

Effect – Non-compliance – Consequences – Damages for breach of contract – Specific performance

Yeung Siu Hong v Chan Siu Mee Sandie HC 559

CRIMINAL LAW AND PROCEDURE

Additional evidence

Whether admissible after close of prosecution case

R v Yiu Lai Kuen CA 73

Alibi

Name of alibi witness not given to police at the first opportunity – Whether delay reason to doubt truth of alibi – Delay not later than that prescribed by statute

for giving of notice of alibi – Dangers in judges indicating they have prejudged prosecution witness – District Court Ordinance (Cap 336) s 75A
R v Lam Chun Chuen CA 37

Appeal

Admission of fresh evidence – Test of admissibility – Whether counsel incompetent in conduct of defence – Criminal Procedure Ordinance (Cap 221) s 83V
de los Santos Rodolpho v The Queen PC 1

Conviction upon apparently unequivocal plea of guilty – Charges not supported by admitted facts – Whether court had jurisdiction to entertain appeal despite plea of guilty – Magistrates Ordinance (Cap 227) s 113(1)
R v Li Tung Hing HC 427

Appeal by way of case stated

Service of case stated to respondent – Whether service by registered post sufficient service – District Court Ordinance (Cap 336) s 84 – Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap 1) s 8
Attorney General v Lam Man Wah (No 1) CA 67

Discharge of accused

Equivocal evidence – Galbraith test – Criminal Procedure Ordinance (Cap 221) s 16
Attorney General v Ng Yuk Tung CA 204

Forfeiture

Deterioration of goods – Power of judge to order percentage forfeiture
R v Wong Shiu Lun HC 555

Discretion of judge – Exercise of discretion – Relevant considerations
R v Wong Shiu Lun HC 555

Forgery

Forgery of document and uttering a forged document with intent to defraud – Bona fide claim of right to payment raised as defence – Demand for payment never quantified – Crimes Ordinance (Cap 200) ss 72(1) & 74(1)
R v Tse Chung Fat CA 221

Inchoate offence

Attempted rape – Judge's direction to jury on essential elements of inchoate offence – Criminal Attempts Act 1981 [UK]
R v Ng Kin Chit CA 210

Magistrate

Conviction pursuant to s 19 of Magistrates Ordinance – Plea of guilty on information laid – Complaints and information distinguished – Whether magistrate