

# HONG KONG CASES

1987

Volume 3

*General Editor*  
Gerard McCoy, Barrister

*Butterworths Asia*  
Hong Kong • Singapore • Kuala Lumpur

## **The Butterworth Group of Companies**

Singapore	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01 International Plaza, Singapore 0207
Hong Kong	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA (HONG KONG) 19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 29651400 Fax: 29760840
Malaysia	MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur
Australia	BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra
Canada	BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver
Ireland	BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin
New Zealand	BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland
Puerto Rico	BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan
UK	BUTTERWORTH & CO (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh
USA	MICHIE BUTTERWORTH Charlottesville Virginia

©

Butterworths Asia\*  
1995

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

\*Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed Elsevier (Singapore) Pte Ltd.

ISSN 0218-7809

Typeset by Butterworths Asia, Superskill Graphics  
and Graphicraft Typesetters  
Produced by Mandarin Offset Ltd  
Printed and bound in Hong Kong

## *General Editor*

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

## *Associate Editors*

Grenville Cross QC

Ruy Barretto, Barrister

Michael Ozorio, Barrister

Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister

Susan Kwan, Barrister

Peter Garland, Barrister

Malcolm Merry, Barrister

Aarif Barma, Barrister

Andrew Cheung, Barrister

Peter Ng, Barrister

Joseph Fok, Barrister

Anderson Chow, Barrister

Teresa Cheng, Barrister

David Fitzpatrick, Barrister

Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister

Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University

Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

## *Reporters in this volume*

Peter Cheuk, Barrister

Danny Choi, Barrister

TC Chong, Barrister

Charles P Chiu, Barrister

Simon CK Chui, Barrister

Anne-Marie Gordon, Barrister

Victor T Gidwani, Barrister

Christopher Lam, Barrister

Godfrey Lam, Barrister

Osmond Lam, Barrister

Julia Lau, Barrister

Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister

Raymond Leung, Barrister

PY Lo, Barrister

Victor Luk, Barrister

Judith O'Hare, City University

Herman LH Poon, Barrister

James Rice, Barrister

Jennifer Tsang, Barrister

Raymond Tsui Wai Nam, Barrister

Dominic Yeung, Barrister

Hareed Zafrullah, City University

## **Butterworths Asia**

Managing Editor: Anthony P Kinnear

Deputy Managing Editor: Zarinah Marican

Editors: Noorunnisa Ibrahim Kutty, Teoh Swee Leng, Bala Shanmugam,

Sharon Kaur

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The publishers are grateful to and acknowledge the significant contribution and support of the Hong Kong Superior Court Judgments Database project, directed by the four members of the Faculty of Law, whose names are mentioned below. The judgments database project (1989–1994) was funded primarily by the University of Hong Kong's Conference and Research Grants Committee with assistance from the Department of Professional Legal Education, at the Faculty of Law. The Faculty members responsible for the project are (in alphabetical order) Andrew Byrnes, Lecturer, Department of Law; Rick Glofcheski, Lecturer, Department of Law; Gary N Heilbronn, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education; and Sarah Nield, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education (until 1992). The project administrator is James Garritty, Research Officer, Faculty of Law.

# SUBJECT INDEX

## ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

### Civil Service Regulations

Delegation of power – Whether delegation authorized under Civil Service Regulations – Validity of departmental circular by Director of Public Works issued under authority of Establishment Secretary – Effect of authority to director to exercise ‘discretion’ – Civil Service Regulations CSR 3(d)

*Lau Hon Cheong & Anor v Attorney General* CA 1

### Judicial review

Discretion – Illegal immigrant – Permission to remain in Hong Kong – Interference of court – Immigration Ordinance (Cap 115) s 13

*Choy Siu Hung v Attorney General & Anor* HC 365

Legitimate expectation – Permission to remain in Hong Kong – Illegal entrant – Time of entry – Immigration Ordinance (Cap 115) s 8(1)

*Choy Siu Hung v Attorney General & Anor* HC 365

Meaning of ‘hear and determine’ – Whether court has jurisdiction to amend the order

*Attorney General v Paterson-Todd* HC 266

Notice by Building Authority to pay for remedial works – Liability to pay and apportionment of costs – Whether Authority’s decision open to challenge – Buildings Ordinance (Cap 123) ss 27, 27A

*Government Teachers’ Co-Operative Building Society Ltd v Attorney General* HC 530

## AGENCY

### Vicarious liability

Driver driving with owner’s permission – Whether driver agent of owner – Whether owner liable for damage caused by driver

*Kwong Kwok Kin v Observatory Watch & Jewellery Co Ltd* CA 138

## ARBITRATION

### Extension of time

Failure of plaintiff to refer dispute for arbitration – Discretion of court under s 29 of Arbitration Ordinance – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 29

*Ching Yick Manufactory v Tai Ping Insurance Co Ltd* HC 583

### Jurisdiction

Discretion of court under s 6 of Arbitration Ordinance – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 6

*Ching Yick Manufactory v Tai Ping Insurance Co Ltd* HC 583

### Non-domestic arbitration

Application for summary judgment and stay – Factors to be considered by court – Architect’s certificate – Whether set-off permissible – Whether dispute had arisen to be referred to arbitration

*Nin Hing Electronic Engineering Ltd v Aoki Corp* HC 516

## BANKING AND FINANCE

### Moneylenders

Loan to pay off former indebtedness – Whether provided for payment of compound interest and illegal – Sufficiency of memorandum – Moneylenders Ordinance (Cap 163) ss 18, 22

*New Japan Securities International (HK) Ltd v Lim Yiong Lin* CA 153

## BANKRUPTCY

### Act of bankruptcy

Notice of commission – Notice issued by administrators of estate of deceased debtor – Whether act of administrators equivalent to act of debtor – Bankruptcy Ordinance (Cap 6) s 3(1)(h)

*Official Receiver v Daylight Industrial Co Ltd* CA 29

### Bankruptcy notice

Validity – Failure to set out correct amount due to judgment creditor – Sum paid to creditor's account by debtor

*ReLau Yat Ming t/a Hong Kong Packets Corp, ex p Bank of Communications* HC 449

### Charging order nisi

Operative date of registration – Whether doctrine of relation back applicable – Bankruptcy Ordinance (Cap 6) s 45

*Dah Sing Bank Ltd v Daylight Industrial Co Ltd & Anor* HC 25

### Substituted service

Debtor living overseas – Whether writ likely to reach defendant – Whether just in circumstances to make order for substituted service – Prejudice suffered by debtor and creditor to be taken into account

*Re Grandeur Construction Co, ex p Law Hoi Chuen* HC 480

## BETTING, GAMBLING AND LOTTERIES

### Sentencing

Fine – Repeated offender – Appropriate amount of fine – Suspended sentence – Activation – Magistrate's discretion to activate – Appellate court not to interfere if magistrate states reason for exercise of discretion

*Attorney General v Wong Ho Ming* CA 162

## BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION

### Building contract

Performance bond – Construction – Relevance of the underlying contract – Difference between 'single bond' and 'double or conditional bond'

*Kono Insurance Ltd v Tins' Industrial Co Ltd* CA 71

### Slope maintenance

Whether cut surface of slope a 'construction' – Notice from Building Authority to pay for remedial works – Whether cost of remedial works correctly apportioned by Building Authority – Buildings Ordinance (Cap 123) s 27, 27A

<i>Government Teachers' Co-Operative Building Society Ltd v Attorney General</i>	HC	530
--	----	-----

## **CARRIERS**

### **Bill of lading**

Variation of terms by shipper – Effect on rights and duties of carrier – Construction of varied terms		
<i>Wombat Lines Inc v Bee Kay &amp; Co (HK) Ltd</i>	CA	167

## **CIVIL PROCEDURE**

### **Appeal**

Divided opinion in Court of Appeal – Majority judgment not reached – Appeal dismissed		
<i>Hong Kong and Shanghai Banking Corp v Chan Yiu Wah &amp; Anor</i>	CA	219

### **Certificate for counsel**

Local junior counsel – Whether necessary when London silk and junior admitted on ad hoc basis – Hong Kong Bar Code of Conduct r 171(c)		
<i>Lakhan v Wu Wing Tat &amp; Anor</i>	CA	54

### **Costs**

Party and party or common fund – Whether facts of case constituted special features – Approach of appellate court to appeal on costs		
<i>Lakhan v Wu Wing Tat &amp; Anor</i>	CA	54

Proceedings in lunacy – Appointment of receiver to estate – Proceedings for appointment dismissed – Whether costs to be paid out of estate – Inherent jurisdiction of court – Action had been taken in best interests of all parties		
<i>Sellett &amp; Ors v Sellett</i>	HC	359

### **Interlocutory injunction**

Balance of convenience – Court to take the course carrying the ‘lower risk of injustice’		
<i>Laidler &amp; Anor v Lui Patrick &amp; Ors</i>	HC	411

### **Judgments and orders**

Ex parte order – Application to set aside – Material non-disclosure – Time limit – Expiration – Inherent jurisdiction – Rules of the Supreme Court O 32 r 6		
<i>Wo Fung Paper Making Factory Ltd v Sappi Kraft (Pty) Ltd</i>	HC	603

### **Mareva injunction**

Duty of disclosure – Effect of failure to disclose – Whether non-disclosure material – Whether injunction to be set aside		
<i>Dah Yung Leasing Pte Ltd v Ho Hua Min &amp; Ors</i>	HC	462

Purpose of granting Mareva injunction – Good arguable case – Risk of dissipation of assets		
<i>Anglo-Eastern (1985) Ltd &amp; Anor v Knutz &amp; Ors</i>	CA	80

### Stay of proceedings

Stay obtained by defendant on basis that claim had been settled – Plaintiffs made honest mistake as to terms of settlement – Defendant would have known of the mistake – Whether stay was equitable

*Wong Tak Sing & Anor v Amertex International Ltd* HC 439

### Striking out

Extension of time to appeal – Claims under LARCO and FAO – Appellants acted in personal capacity and for infant – Time extended for infant but not appellants in their personal capacity – Whether partial striking out possible

*Chan Po Kuen & Anor v China Light & Power Co Ltd* CA 231

### Title of proceedings

Application by receiver for directions – Description of parties to proceedings – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 298

*Man Kou Tan & Anor v Timewin Development Ltd* HC 504

### Vexatious litigant

Order made under s 27 of Supreme Court Ordinance – Requirement of leave to institute or continue proceedings – Approach to be taken when leave is sought – Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) s 27

*Wong Yu Kwong v Hong Kong Society for the Blind* CA 186

### Writ

Extension of validity – Relevant considerations – Lack of diligence, delay and prejudice to defendant – Concurrent writ – Service out of jurisdiction – Double litigation – Rules of the Supreme Court O 6, O 11

*Siy Ramon & Anor v BPI International Finance Ltd & Ors* HC 317

Service out of jurisdiction – Challenge to court's jurisdiction – Time limit – Extension of time – Inherent jurisdiction – Rules of the Supreme Court O 12 r 8(2)

*Wo Fung Paper Making Factory Ltd v Sappi Kraft (Pty) Ltd* HC 603

## COMPANIES AND CORPORATIONS

### Fraud on the minority

Scope of fraud – Whether fraud restricted to common law fraud

*Anglo-Eastern (1985) Ltd & Anor v Knutz & Ors* CA 80

### Receivership

Power of receiver – Declaration as to power of sale – Whether receivers appointed under debenture under seal have power to convey property belonging to the company in the name of company and to affix their own seals on behalf of company to conveyance – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 298

*Man Kou Tan & Anor v Timewin Development Ltd* HC 504

### Shareholders' right to sue company

Whether action by shareholders wrongly constituted – Shareholders not in minority – Shareholders not suing majority shareholders – No allegation of fraud



- Exception to rule in *Foss v Harbottle* – Whether exception applicable  
*Anglo-Eastern (1985) Ltd & Anor v Knutz & Ors* CA 80

### Transfer of shares

- Directors' meeting effecting transfer invalid under articles of association –  
 No intention to defraud – Whether inequitable to remove the name of the  
 respondent's name from the register – Validity under s 67 of Companies Ordinance  
 – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) ss 67, 100  
*Re Safe Steel Furniture Factory Ltd* HC 485

### Winding up

- Just and equitable ground – Deadlock in company's management – Whether  
 petitioners had sufficient interest to obtain a winding up order – Whether required  
 to show there would be surplus available for distribution – Whether petitioners  
 had 'clean hands' – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 180(1)  
*Re Cirtex Co Ltd* HC 13

### Winding-up

- Just and equitable ground – Deadlock in company's management – Whether  
 petitioners had sufficient interest to obtain a winding-up order – Whether required  
 to show there would be surplus available for distribution – Whether petitioners  
 had 'clean hands' – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 180(1)  
*Re Cirtex Co Ltd* HC 13

- Ownership of shares of petitioners disputed – Whether petition should be  
 stayed  
*Cheung Donald Quintin & Ors v Fester Corp Ltd & Ors* HC 270

- Stay of winding-up order – Whether order of stay should be discharged –  
 Protection of creditors – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 182  
*Re Cirtex Co Ltd* CA 21

## CONTEMPT OF COURT

### Committal proceedings

- Failure to comply with Anton Piller order by defendant companies – Whether  
 proprietor and director of companies liable for contempt – Appropriate period of  
 detention  
*Le Clip SA & Ors v Wai Tat Metal Enterprise Co (a firm) & Ors* HC 354

## CONTRACT

### Damages

- Special damages – Proof of relevant figures required to recover more than  
 nominal sum  
*World Realty Ltd v Kwan Ngar Yin* CA 148

### Mistake

- Mistake honestly made – Defendant knew of mistake made by plaintiffs in  
 stipulating amount to be paid – Defendant accepted offer – Whether contract void  
*Wong Tak Sing & Anor v Amertex International Ltd* HC 439

**Specific performance**

Honest mistake – Equitable relief not to be granted where honest mistake in contract had been made

*Wong Tak Sing & Anor v Amertex International Ltd* HC 439

**COURTS AND JUDICIAL SYSTEM**

**District Court**

Powers – Detention of witness for contempt and perjury – Whether court had power to temporarily detain witness while considering whether or not to commit witness according to statutory provisions – District Court Ordinance (Cap 336) s 3(2)

*R v Wai Hin Keung* CA 92

**Jury**

List of jurors – Removal of name – Extensive travel commitments – Power of judge to exempt juror – Jury Ordinance (Cap 3) s 28(1)

*Re Dewar* HC 576

**Magistrates' court**

Power to remand – First appearance of defendant – Refusal to remand – Whether reasonable exercise of discretion – Police Force Ordinance (Cap 232) s 52

*Attorney General v Tsai Lai Shing* HC 445

**CRIMINAL LAW AND PROCEDURE**

**Accomplice**

Living on earnings of prostitution – Whether a prostitute engaged in a vice establishment should be treated as an accomplice

*R v Cheung Man Ming* CA 212

**Admissibility of evidence**

Discrepancy of prosecution witness' evidence – Direction – Magistrate's failure in ignoring the possibility of the prosecution evidence 'casting doubts' upon itself independently of the defence evidence

*R v Fan Kai Chuen* HC 303

**Appeal**

Trial judge's records – Content – Whether necessary to include reference to detention of witnesses

*R v Wai Hin Keung* CA 92

Whether appellate court should interfere with findings of trial court – Lurking doubt that injustice had been done – Subjective test – Doubt to be resolved by experience of the judge

*R v Cheung Ching Leung* HC 378

**Application for review**

Transcript of the whole proceedings 'shall' accompany the application – Whether the word 'shall' mandatory – Failure to include parts of trial transcript – Whether respondent prejudiced – Criminal Procedure Ordinance (Cap 221)

s 81A(2)(b)		
<i>Attorney General v Lau Shek Man &amp; Ors</i>	CA	62

### Case stated

Major differences in evidential findings in three versions of the case stated		
– Court may order retrial – District Court Ordinance (Cap 336) s 84		
<i>Attorney General v Chum Kin Man</i>	CA	216

### Charge

Theft – Amendment of charge – Magistrate failed to amend charge in accordance with proper procedures – Magistrates Ordinance (Cap 227) s 27 – Theft Ordinance (Cap 210) ss 18A(1), 18C(1)		
<i>Attorney General v Hamilton</i>	HC	455

### Conduct of trial

Detention of witnesses in the course of giving and at the close of evidence		
– Jurisdiction of court – Whether judge could be seen as having lost impartiality		
– District Court Ordinance (Cap 336) ss 20 & 21		
<i>R v Wai Hin Keung</i>	CA	92

### Forfeiture

Hawking without licence – Effect of forfeiture order out of proportion to gravity of hawking offence – Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Cap 132) ss 83 & 86(1)(a)		
<i>R v Cheung Lai Lin</i>	HC	580

### Handling stolen goods

Error in the reasons for sentence – Recent possession – Failure to disclose reasons for conviction		
<i>R v Chan Chung Chiu</i>	CA	141

### Identification

Corroboration – <i>Turnbull</i> warning – Whether the warning was only a guideline – Whether corroboration required in case of visual identification		
<i>R v Leung Chi Fai &amp; Anor</i>	CA	224

### Informer

Disclosure of identity – Whether identity of informer could be disclosed – Dangerous Drugs Ordinance (Cap 134) s 57(2)		
<i>R v Ko Hing Hung</i>	CA	238

### Judge's direction

Lie – Murder – Defence of suicide pact – Whether <i>Broadhurst</i> direction should be given		
<i>R v Lam Hon Wing</i>	CA	173

### Living on earnings of prostitution

Presumption – Proof of payment irrelevant – Crimes Ordinances (Cap 200) s 137(2)		
<i>R v Ip Ping Kan</i>	HC	569

**Making false information**

- Import and Export Ordinance (Cap 60) s 36  
*R v Dettenthaler* HC 593

**Murder**

- Diminished responsibility – Meaning of ‘inherent causes’ – Whether defendant under effects of drugs or withdrawal – Homicide Ordinance (Cap 339) s 3  
*R v Lo Pun Man* CA 46

**Rape**

- Consent – Material misdirection on issue of consent – Relevance of victim’s cohabitation with accused  
*R v Hui Chiu Keung* CA 204
- Gang rape – Indictment – Acting in a group pursuant to common design or whether each individually guilty of rape – One count sufficient  
*R v Hui Chiu Keung* CA 204

**Recognizance**

- Breach – Show cause hearing for forfeiture of recognizance – Whether Court of Appeal had power to deal with breach of recognizance – District Court Ordinance (Cap 336) s 84(b) – Criminal Procedure Ordinance (Cap 221) s 114  
*Attorney General v Dawe* CA 132

**Remand**

- Remand pending legal advice – Application for remand refused – Whether reasonable exercise of discretion  
*Attorney General v Tsai Lai Ching* HC 445

**Sentencing**

- Bigamy – Deception of innocent party and injury resulting – Immediate custodial sentence – Length depended on gravity of injury  
*R v Sze Tin Sin* HC 333

- Bribery – Conspiracy of corruption involving police officers – Accused operated gambling establishments and procured under-aged girls for unlawful sex – Whether starting point of four years’ imprisonment appropriate – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) s 41A  
*Attorney General v Lau Shek Man & Ors (No 2)* CA 64

- Compensation order – Relevant considerations when making order – Whether court had power to fix compensation sum by reference to amount of bail provided – Magistrates Ordinance (Cap 227) s 98  
*R v Fung Wai Keung* HC 452

- Conspiracy to defraud – Suspended sentence imposed – Immediate custodial sentence necessary unless exceptional circumstances existed – Relevance of sentence imposed on co-conspirator  
*Attorney General v Ngan Suen Kee* CA 190

Illegal immigrant – Age under 21 and above 16 – Whether court should call for background report before passing sentence – Criminal Procedure Ordinance (Cap 221) s 109A

*R v Yip Yuk Ching* HC 234

Importing unmanifested frozen meat – Danger to public health – Whether immediate custodial sentence required as deterrent – Whether six months' imprisonment excessive

*R v Tam Hok Ling* HC 578

Longer sentence imposed at retrial – Whether manifestly excessive – Criminal Procedure Ordinance (Cap 221) s 83F(4) & Sch VI para 2(1)

*R v Chan Chung Chiu (No 2)* CA 144

Manslaughter – Death following beating by more than one attacker – Sentencing guidelines – Sentence of three years' imprisonment appropriate

*Attorney General v Chuk Chi Hoi* CA 599

Review by Court of Appeal – Scope of power of review – Whether sentence was in the circumstances reasonable

*Attorney General v Lau Shek Man & Ors (No 2)* CA 64

Totality principle – Multiple counts of deception – Operating illegal chit fund – Breach of trust over long period

*R v Cheng Yuk Kwei* CA 130

## Stay of proceedings

Inordinate delay – Prejudice to the defence – Proper approach of the judge – Prosecution ought to be asked to explain delay

*R v Leung Hung & Anor* CA 207

## Theft

Whether de minimis non curat lex principle applicable – Defendant admitted the truth of the information – Magistrate bound to convict or make an order – Magistrates Ordinance (Cap 227) s 19

*Attorney General v Tsang Pui Yee* HC 435

## Trial

Cross-examination – Appropriateness of questions put to witness

*R v Lam Hon Wing* CA 173

Magistrate ruled 'no case' before hearing all prosecution witness – Whether proper

*Attorney General v Wong Kwok Hip* HC 432

## Witness

Inconsistencies in testimony – Bribery offence – Whether evidence evaluated with care – Substitution of verdict on evidence accepted by the trial judge – Criminal Procedure Ordinance (Cap 221) s 83A

*R v Lam Kwing Kei* CA 107

Inconsistency of witness – Whether an irresistible inference can be drawn  
*R v Cheung Man Ming* CA 212

## **EMPLOYMENT**

### **Employees' compensation**

Appellant injured while working on respondent's premises – Whether appellant employee independent contractor – Relevant factors – Employees' Compensation Ordinance (Cap 282)

*Wong Sai Yee v Kong Kwan t/a Hop Hing Saw Mill* CA 134

Eligibility – Whether workman an 'outworker' – Company providing materials to workman and requiring him to carry out work on their premises whenever he was required – Workman having another job elsewhere

*Li Chung I t/a VF Electric Trading Manufacturing Co v Li Man Yuen* CA 120

Partial dependancy – Claim by father of deceased – Relevant factors in assessing compensation – Employees' Compensation Ordinance (Cap 282) s 6(1)(a)

*Wong Shuk Suen & Ors v Chan Wai Ming t/a Wai Ming Transportation* DC 490

### **Employment contract**

Breach by employee – Whether there was acceptance of repudiation by employer – Application to enjoin employees from working for competitor – Whether interlocutory injunction should be granted to the plaintiff

*Jademan (Holdings) Ltd v Cheng Kam Wai & Ors* HC 525

### **Employment of children**

Whether magistrate entitled to take judicial notice of processes incidental to shirt making business – Whether deeming provision under reg 3(3) of the Employment of Children Regulations applied – Employment of Children Regulations reg 3(3)

*Attorney General v Ho Yuk Chun* HC 561

### **Labour Tribunal**

Appeal – Findings of fact could not be interfered with on appeal – Labour Tribunal (Cap 25) s 35(2)

*Hong Kong & China Gas Co Ltd v Wong Yuen Kwong* HC 508

### **Payment of employees**

Contract work – Liability of principal contractor where sub-contractor failed to pay its employees – Notice to principal contractor – Whether such notice must comply strictly with relevant provisions – Object of ss 43C and 43D of Employment Ordinance – Employment Ordinance (Cap 57) ss 43C & 43D

*Tunis Ltd v Ng Yick & Ors* HC 426

### **Redundancy**

Severance pay – Former semi-shift fitter no longer required to work in

shifts and not entitled to shift allowance – Whether employee carrying out ‘work of a particular kind’ which ceased to be required – Employment Ordinance (Cap 57) s 31B(2)(c)

*Hong Kong & China Gas Co Ltd v Wong Yuen Kwong* HC 508

## EVIDENCE

### Admissibility

Banker’s records – Absence of certificate to prove the bank’s computers had not been interfered with – Whether judge was wrong to allow prosecution to rectify failure

*R v Ng Chi Wai* CA 124

### Circumstantial evidence

Drawing inferences from circumstantial evidence – Whether inferences were irresistible

*R v Ng Chi Wai* CA 124

### Documentary evidence

Admissibility – Authority to examine and take copies – Whether dispensed with requirements of proof – Import and Export Ordinance (Cap 60) s 20(1)(d)

*R v Phoenflite Ltd* HC 345

Admissibility – Documents in language other than English – Failure to provide certified translations

*R v Lam Kwing Kei* CA 107

Admissibility – Documents received by witness in the ordinary course of business and produced by him from his custody as part of business record – Whether facts stated therein become evidence by reason of cross-examination by opposing party

*R v Dettenthaler* HC 593

Admissibility – Identification of handwriting by witness – Witness not a handwriting expert

*R v Ng Chi Wai* CA 124

Admissibility – Whether documents ‘banking documents’ – Documents admissible in criminal proceedings – Whether requirements for admissibility satisfied – Evidence Ordinance (Cap 8) ss 20(1), 22(1)

*R v Phoenflite Ltd* HC 345

Letter from defendant to investigation officer containing confession – Voluntariness not disputed – Whether inadmissible by lack of caution

*R v Dettenthaler* HC 593

Public document – Vessel’s manifest – Evidence Ordinance (Cap 8) s 19

*R v Phoenflite Ltd* HC 345

Public documents – Requirements – Documents must be produced to Director of Trade or other authorized officer – Import and Export Ordinance (Cap 60)

ss 11(1), (2), 33(3), (4)  
*R v Phoenixlite Ltd*

HC 345

### Hearsay

Reliance of expert witnesses on information from other experts – Whether such evidence was admissible – Expert evidence as to nature of dangerous drugs  
*R v Wan Pui Hay*

CA 179

### Judicial notice

Whether magistrate entitled to rely on general knowledge to hold that stamping serial numbers and attaching labels on shirts were processes incidental to shirt making business  
*Attorney General v Ho Yuk Chun*

HC 561

### Letter of request

Possibility that witness would evade giving of evidence pursuant to request – Whether prejudice to defendant in granting letter of request – Judge's discretion – Evidence Ordinance (Cap 8) s 77E  
*Chan Wai Lim v Attorney General*

CA 158

Proceedings in the United States – Whether request amounted to pre-trial discovery – Whether proceedings of a political nature – Evidence Ordinance (Cap 8) s 77B – Rules of the Supreme Court O 70  
*Re Moreno and the District Court for the Eastern District of Virginia, United States of America*

HC 279

## HEALTH AND SAFETY

### Storing dangerous goods without a licence

Whether strict liability offence – Knowledge as to nature of goods – Whether prosecution required to prove knowledge – Dangerous Goods Ordinance (Cap 295) s 6  
*R v Cheng Kam Ming*

HC 335

## IMMIGRATION

### Removal order

Validity – Relevance of government policy at time applicant arrived in Hong Kong – Effect of arrival in Hong Kong before enactment of Immigration Ordinance – Whether applicant a permanent resident – Immigration Ordinance (Cap 115) ss 8(1) & 64  
*Wong Leung Foo v Director of Immigration*

HC 475

### Discretion

Illegal immigrant – Permission to remain in Hong Kong – Interference of court – Immigration Ordinance (Cap 115) s 13  
*Choy Siu Hung v Attorney General & Anor*

HC 365

## LAND

### Easement

Registration – Easement in deed of grant – Right to specific relief – Subject



matter of grant destroyed – Whether *lis pendens* had been properly vacated from the Land Office register

*Wong Kwok Chiang & Ors v Wai Hing Construction Co Ltd* CA 41

### Land registration

*Lis pendens* – Types of action registrable – When registration of *lis pendens* could be removed – Rights of plaintiffs not in dispute – Land Registration Ordinance (Cap 128)

*Wong Kwok Chiang & Ors v Longo Construction Ltd & Anor* HC 34

### Multi-storey building

Management fees – Payment of monthly contributions and deposit – Validity of the resolution passed at extraordinary general meeting of corporation – Whether owners bound – Multi-Storey Buildings (Owners Incorporation) Ordinance (Cap 344) ss 14(1), 21 & 22

*Incorporated Owners of Evelyn Towers & Anor v Darlingford Ltd & Ors* CA 127

### Resumption of land

Whether notice under the Roads (Works, Use and Compensation) Ordinance (Cap 370) s 8(2) is of similar nature to notice under the Crown Lands Resumption Ordinance (Cap 124) or the Mass Transit Railway (Land Resumption and Related Provisions) Ordinance (Cap 276)

*Waybill Development Ltd v Chung Luen Dyeing Factory Ltd* HC 258

### Sale of land

Title – Defects in title – Discrepancy in description of land – Assignment by company in liquidation – Power of attorney – No express power to execute reassignment – Redelivery of a deed by letter – Estoppel – Risk of assertion of equities – Missing power of attorney – No speculation about scope of attorney's powers

*Chan Pak Ho v Standard Chartered Asia Ltd* HC 241

Title – Power of attorney – Donee's implied power to execute a conveyance to give effect to sale authorized by donor

*Wong Shui Yun Bernadette v Lau Wai Pui* HC 513

Title – Production of memorial of conveyance instead of conveyance itself – Marketable title as opposed to good title – Defective title cured by undisturbed possession up to defect – Conveyancing and Property Ordinance (Cap 219) s 12

*Lai Chung Yue & Anor v Chau Shing & Anor* HC 406

## LANDLORD AND TENANT

### Authorization to sell

Landlord deemed to have obtained order for possession – Old premises demolished – New building under construction – Whether tribunal had power to authorize sale where old premises demolished – Landlord and Tenant (Consolidation) Ordinance (Cap 7) ss 53(7A), 119H(2)

*Gonwah Properties Ltd v Nam Ah Restaurant & Ors* Ld T 371

### Lease

Provision for rent review – Rent review agreed in letter headed 'subject to