

EXAMPLES & EXPLANATIONS

# Family Law

**Robert E. Oliphant**  
**Nancy Ver Steegh**



**ASPEN**  
PUBLISHERS

# FAMILY LAW

---

## Examples and Explanations

Robert E.

*Professor of Law*

*William Mitchell College of Law*

Nancy Ver Steegh

*Associate Professor of Law*

*William Mitchell College of Law*

**ASPEN**  
PUBLISHERS

1185 Avenue of the American, New York, NY 10036  
[www.aspenpublishers.com](http://www.aspenpublishers.com)

© 2004 Aspen Publishers, Inc.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission to make copies of any part of this publication should be mailed to:

Permissions  
Aspen Publishers  
1185 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, NY 10036

Printed in the United States of America.

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

ISBN 0-7355-4420-4

**Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Oliphant, Robert E., 1938-

Family law: examples and explanations / Robert E. Oliphant, Nancy Ver Steegh. — 1st ed.

p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 0-7355-4420-4 (pbk.)

1. Domestic relations — United States — Outlines, syllabi, etc.

I. Ver Steegh, Nancy, 1953- II. Title.

KF505.Z9.O43 2004

346.7301'5 — dc22

2003027977

# *Preface*

This book is designed to assist students in their mastery of the broad range of doctrines examined and discussed in family law courses. Because we recognize that some areas of family law reflect state and local perspectives, we have attempted to highlight differing views while focusing on nationally accepted principles.

The tapestry of family law is complex; however, we have broken the subject into discrete segments and organized them by chapter. Our goal is to provide a student with a balanced, in-depth but less than overwhelming analysis of family law with a straight-forward explanation of doctrine, problems, solutions to the problems, and citations for additional exploration. All of the material is integrated within the confines of specific well-recognized areas of family law study.

This book provides a student with much more than a bare bones outline of family law, a collection of rules, or a blizzard of family law citations. Rather, we have written it with three objectives. First, we have provided straight-forward explanations of existing family law doctrine. Second, we have enhanced a student's potential for learning by providing relevant examples that challenge a student's comprehension of the doctrine. To guide and assist a student in comprehending the doctrine, we have included suggested answers to the problems. Finally, we have provided citations to relevant decisions in those areas where we believed they might stimulate additional research and analysis.

We welcome comments on the book. We cannot promise that we'll respond directly to you, however, we will consider every point made. Our e-mail addresses are:

boliphant@wmitchell.edu  
nversteegh@wmitchell.edu

Our sincere hope for every reader of this book is that it has helped you learn family law in a friendly, coherent and challenging manner.

*Robert E. Oliphant  
Nancy Ver Steegh*

February 2004

# *Acknowledgments*

We are grateful for the hard work, assistance, encouragement and sacrifice of many terrific people who helped in so many ways in the creation of this manuscript. Foremost among all of our supporters are Aspen editors Lynn Churchill and Eric Holt. They were always there to encourage and provide us with needed moral support.

We are thankful for the support of William Mitchell College of Law President and Dean Harry Haynsworth and Vice Dean Matthew Downs. We are also grateful for the work of Faculty Publication Specialists, Lynda Thorstad and Cal Bonde, who were tireless in their commitment to the tedious task of producing a final, understandable, manuscript from our many, many drafts. Jennifer Miller provided wonderful assistance with the final production and proof reading of the manuscript. Our students also contributed many helpful comments on the illustrations used throughout the book, which we believe will make the final product much more useable. William Mitchell research assistants Mr. Arthur Boylan, Mr. Peter Hendricks, Mr. Chris Iijima, Ms. Katherine Kelly, and Ms. Tammy Schemmel were tireless in their constant work with the citations and suggestions for changes in the body of the book.

We especially wish to thank our respective book widow and widower spouses, Susan and Jack, for their tolerance and unwearied support as well as family members Nick, Andy, Jon and Frank Molland.

# Summary of Contents

<i>Contents</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>xxxi</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xxxiii</i>
Chapter 1. Marriage — History, Restrictions, and Requirements	1
Chapter 2. Annulments	37
Chapter 3. Who May Divorce? Restrictions and Requirements	53
Chapter 4. Jurisdiction	73
Chapter 5. Child Custody	97
Chapter 6. Modifying Custody — Relocation	115
Chapter 7. Interstate Custody Struggles: The Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction Act and the Parental Kidnapping Prevention Act — History, Restrictions, and Requirements	133
Chapter 8. Visitation and Parenting Time	147
Chapter 9. Child Support	159
Chapter 10. Child Support Modification and Enforcement	179
Chapter 11. Alimony and Necessaries	197
Chapter 12. Modifying Alimony	213
Chapter 13. Dividing the Marital Estate upon Divorce	225
Chapter 14. Premarital (Antenuptial or Prenuptial) Agreements, — History, Requirements, and Restrictions	243
Chapter 15. Cohabitation Without Formal Marriage	259
Chapter 16. Determining Paternity	279
Chapter 17. Adoption	295
Chapter 18. Alternative Reproduction — History, Restrictions, and Requirements	315
Chapter 19. Medical Rights of Minors	337
Chapter 20. Domestic Violence	349
Chapter 21. Child Abuse and Termination of Parental Rights	361
Chapter 22. Tax Issues in Family Law Matters	379
Chapter 23. Name Changes	393
Chapter 24. Family Privacy and Wiretaps	401
Chapter 25. Mediation	407
Chapter 26. Professional Responsibility	417
<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>425</i>
<i>Index</i>	<i>441</i>

# Contents

*Preface*  
*Acknowledgments*

*xxxi*  
*xxxiii*

<b>Chapter 1. Marriage — History, Restrictions, and Requirements</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Introduction	1
History —	1
1.2 Early Principles and Practices	1
1.3 Protestant Reformation	2
1.4 Colonial America	3
1.5 Nineteenth-Century Patriarchic Model	4
Marriage Requirements —	4
1.6 Marriage Contracts Differ from Ordinary Contracts	4
1.7 Capacity — Generally	5
1.8 Capacity — Guardian's Consent	5
1.9 Capacity — Age Restrictions	5
1.10 Marriage License	7
1.11 Premarital Medical Testing	9
1.12 Premarital Education	10
1.13 Form of Marriage	11
1.14 Solemnizing a Marriage	11
Common Law Marriages —	12
1.15 History of Common Law Marriage	12
1.16 Common Law Marriage Defined	12
1.17 Common Law Conflicts of Law	13
1.18 Reviving Common Law Marriage	13
Putative Spouse Doctrine —	16
1.19 Putative Spouse Doctrine — History	16
1.20 Putative Spouse Doctrine — UMDA	16
1.21 Putative Spouse — Community Property Jurisdiction	17
Forms of Marriage —	18
1.22 Proxy Marriage	18
1.23 Confidential Marriages	19
1.24 Tribal Marriages	19
1.25 Covenant Marriage	20
Marriage Restrictions Removed —	20
1.26 Race	20
1.27 Poverty	21
1.28 Prisoners	23
1.29 Gender	23

Marriage Restrictions in Place —	24
1.30 Polygamy	24
1.31 Bigamy	24
1.32 Sham Marriages — Immigration Fraud	25
1.33 Consanguinity	27
1.34 Affinity	28
1.35 Adoption	28
Homosexual Relationships —	29
1.36 Defense of Marriage Act	29
1.37 <i>Lawrence v. Texas</i>	30
1.38 Formal Registration of Homosexual Relationships	30
1.39 Canada Allows Gays and Lesbians to Marry	31
1.40 Common Benefits Relationships	32
Transsexual Relationships —	33
1.41 Recognizing Transsexual Marriages	33
Other Principles —	34
1.42 Removal of Impediment to Marriage	34
1.43 The Rule of <i>Lex Loci</i>	35
 <b>Chapter 2. Annulments</b>	 <b>37</b>
2.1 Introduction	37
History and Development —	37
2.2 History	37
2.3 Annulments Are Rare	38
2.4 Distinct Concepts: Annulment and Divorce	38
Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act —	39
2.5 Consequences of an Annulment	39
“Void” and “Voidable” Defined —	39
2.6 Importance of Distinction	39
2.7 Defining a Void Marriage	40
2.8 Defining a Voidable Marriage	40
2.9 Standing to Pursue Voiding a Marriage	40
2.10 Retroactivity of Annulment Ruling	41
Annulment Actions Involving Mental Capacity, Age, Drugs, or Jest —	41
2.11 Mental Capacity	41
2.12 Age	42
2.13 Influence of Drugs or Alcohol	43
2.14 Marriage Made in Jest	44
Annulment Actions Involving Fraud —	45
2.15 Misrepresentation	45
2.16 Pregnancy Claims	46
2.17 Religious Claims	47



Annulment Based on Coercion or Duress —	49
2.18 Duress	49
Annulment Because of Physical Incapacity —	49
2.19 Impotence	49
Annulment and Cohabitation —	50
2.20 Annulment Barred by Cohabitation	50
Support and Property Distribution —	50
2.21 Support	50
2.22 Alimony and Property Division	51
2.23 Reviving a Former Spouse's Support Obligation	51
Other Issues —	51
2.24 Enoch Arden Statute	51
<b>Chapter 3. Who May Divorce? Restrictions and Requirements</b>	<b>53</b>
3.1 Introduction	53
History —	53
3.2 Ancient History	53
3.3 Ecclesiastical Courts and Fault	54
3.4 Sixteenth-Century Revolution	54
3.5 Parliamentary Divorce	55
3.6 Colonial Divorce	56
3.7 Divorce After the American Revolution	56
Traditional Grounds for Divorce —	56
3.8 Background	56
3.9 Adultery	57
3.10 Cruel and Inhuman Treatment	58
3.11 Mental Cruelty	59
3.12 Desertion	60
3.13 Constructive Desertion	60
3.14 Habitual Drunkenness	60
3.15 Insanity	61
3.16 Indignities	61
3.17 Provocation	61
Defenses to the Traditional Action for Divorce —	61
3.18 Overview — Affirmative Defenses	61
3.19 Unclean Hands	62
3.20 Recrimination	62
3.21 Condonation	63
3.22 Collusion	64
3.23 Connivance	65
3.24 Undue Delay	65
3.25 Insanity	65
Separation — <i>Divorce Mensa et Thoro</i> —	66
3.26 History	66

3.27	Separate Maintenance	66
3.28	Legal Separation	66
	The Modern Reform Movement —	67
3.29	Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act	67
3.30	“No-Fault”	67
3.31	Religious Objections	70
	Jurisdiction —	71
3.32	Generally	71
<b>Chapter 4.</b>	<b>Jurisdiction</b>	<b>73</b>
4.1	Introduction	73
	Subject Matter Jurisdiction in Federal Court —	73
4.2	Domestic Relations Exception	73
4.3	Federal Question Jurisdiction	75
4.4	Abstention Doctrine	76
	Subject Matter Jurisdiction in State Court —	77
4.5	Residency Requirements	77
4.6	Are Residency Requirements Subject Matter Requirements?	78
4.7	State Power to Grant <i>Ex Parte</i> Divorce — The Divisible Divorce Theory	79
	Full Faith and Credit —	80
4.8	State Recognition of <i>Ex Parte</i> Divorce — Full Faith and Credit	80
4.9	Full Faith and Credit for Child Support Orders Act	80
	Long-Arm Statutes —	81
4.10	Requirements	81
4.11	Due Process Barriers to Application of Long-arm Statutes	83
	Personal Jurisdiction —	85
4.12	Traditional View	85
4.13	Continuing Jurisdiction	87
4.14	Waiving Personal Jurisdiction	88
	Status as a Jurisdictional Theory —	88
4.15	Overview of Status Theory	88
4.16	Restatement of Conflict of Laws — Status	90
	Indian Child Welfare Act —	90
4.17	Overview of Act	90
	Uniform Acts —	93
4.18	Uniform Interstate Family Support Act (UIFSA)	93
4.19	Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction Enforcement Act	94
	Soldiers and Sailors Civil Relief Act —	94
4.20	Overview of the Act	94

<b>Chapter 5. Child Custody</b>	<b>97</b>
5.1 Introduction	97
The Impact of Divorce —	97
5.2 Effects of Divorce on Children	97
5.3 Impact on Parenting	98
Defining Custodial Relationships —	98
5.4 Overview	98
5.5 Legal Custody	99
5.6 Physical Custody	99
5.7 Joint Legal and Physical Custody	99
5.8 Parenting Plans	100
Presumptions —	101
5.9 Overview	101
5.10 Historic Paternal Presumption	101
5.11 Historic Maternal Presumption	102
5.12 Primary Caretaker Presumption	103
5.13 Natural Parent Presumption	104
Model Acts —	105
5.14 Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act	105
5.15 American Law Institute	106
Standards for Determining the Best Interests of the Child —	106
5.16 Race	106
5.17 Religion	107
5.18 Disability	107
5.19 Child's Preference	107
5.20 Separating Siblings	108
5.21 Parental Conduct Not Affecting the Child: The Nexus Test	109
5.22 Gay and Lesbian Parents	109
5.23 Cohabitation	109
5.24 Careers	110
5.25 Friendly Parent Provision	110
5.26 Domestic Violence	111
5.27 ALI View of Domestic Violence and Custody	111
Court Services: Investigation and Education —	112
5.28 Reports of Professionals	112
5.29 Parent Education	113
 <b>Chapter 6. Modifying Custody — Relocation</b>	 <b>115</b>
6.1 Introduction	115
Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act —	115
6.2 Stability Is Primary Goal	115
6.3 Limit on Number of Modification Actions	116

Standards for Modification —	116
6.4 Overview	116
6.5 Illustration — Arizona	116
6.6 Illustration — Michigan	117
6.7 Illustration — North Dakota	117
6.8 Illustration — Minnesota	117
Typical Modification Claims —	118
6.9 Unwarranted Denial of Visitation	118
6.10 Integration into Noncustodial Parent's Home	119
Presumptions —	120
6.11 Stipulations — Agreements Between the Parties	120
General Considerations —	121
6.12 Findings Required	121
6.13 When is a Guardian Ad Litem Required?	122
6.14 Child's Preference	122
Relocating to Another State: Sole Physical Custody —	123
6.15 Overview	123
6.16 When Is Initial Burden on Custodial Parent?	123
6.17 Exceptional Circumstances Standard	124
6.18 Other Standards	124
6.19 Recognition That a "New Family" May Exist Following Divorce	125
Presumptions —	126
6.20 Favoring Custodial Parent's Relocation	126
Joint Physical Custody —	127
6.21 Overview	127
America Law Institute —	129
6.22 Standard	129
Relocating to a Foreign Country —	129
6.23 Hague Convention	129
 <b>Chapter 7. Interstate Custody Struggles: The Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction Act and the Parental Kidnapping Prevention Act — History, Restrictions, and Requirements</b>	 <b>133</b>
7.1 Introduction	133
History —	134
7.2 Overview	134
7.3 Traditional Perspective	134
7.4 Early Decisions	134
7.5 <i>May v. Anderson</i>	134
Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction Act —	137
7.6 Overview	137

Federal Parental Kidnapping Prevention Act —	137
7.7 Overview	137
7.8 PKPA Application and Limitations	138
7.9 Which State Determines Continuing Jurisdiction?	139
7.10 Home State Preference	139
7.11 Private Right of Action	140
Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction and Enforcement Act —	140
7.12 Overview	140
7.13 Scope	141
7.14 Subject Matter Jurisdiction	141
7.15 Exclusive Continuing Jurisdiction	141
7.16 Home State Jurisdiction	143
7.17 No “Home State” — Significant Connection	144
7.18 Emergency Jurisdiction	144
7.19 International Application of UCCJEA	146
<b>Chapter 8. Visitation and Parenting Time</b>	<b>147</b>
8.1 Introduction	147
Model Acts —	148
8.2 Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act	148
8.3 American Law Institute	148
Standards for Denying or Limiting Visitation —	149
8.4 Court Denial of Parenting Time or Visitation	149
8.5 Restrictions on Parenting Time or Visitation	150
8.6 Child Abuse and Domestic Violence	150
8.7 Alcohol and Substance Abuse	151
8.8 Child Abduction	151
8.9 Cohabitation	151
8.10 Gay or Lesbian Parent	152
8.11 HIV-Positive Parent	152
8.12 Religious Differences	152
Expanding the Definition of Parent —	152
8.13 Stepparent Visitation	152
8.14 Lesbian and Gay Co-parent Visitation	153
8.15 Parents by Estoppel and De Facto Parents	154
Enforcing Visitation (Parenting Time) —	154
8.16 Overview	154
8.17 Contempt and Modification of Custody	154
8.18 Compensatory Visitation	155
8.19 Withholding Child Support	155
8.20 Wishes of the Child	155
Modifying Visitation (Parenting Time) —	155
8.21 Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act Provisions	155

Grandparent Visitation —	156
8.22 History	156
8.23 State Statutes after Troxel v. Granville	156
<b>Chapter 9. Child Support</b>	<b>159</b>
9.1 Introduction	159
History —	159
9.2 Elizabethan Poor Laws	159
9.3 Common Law	160
9.4 European View	160
Role of Federal Government —	161
9.5 Child Support and Establishment of Paternity Act of 1974	161
9.6 State Guidelines Mandated	161
9.7 Child Support Recovery Act of 1992	162
9.8 Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act of 1993	162
9.9 Full Faith and Credit Act of 1994	162
9.10 The Welfare Reform Act of 1996	163
9.11 Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act of 1996	163
Child Support Defined —	163
9.12 Generally	163
What Is Income for Support?	164
9.13 Generally	164
9.14 College Student's Obligation	165
9.15 Deducting Monthly Amounts Paid to Bankruptcy Court	165
9.16 Student Loans Payments	165
9.17 Vested Stock Options	166
9.18 Employer's Contribution to Pension Plan	166
9.19 Stepparent Income	166
9.20 Lump-sum Payments and Commissions	166
9.21 Seasonal Employment	167
9.22 Overtime	167
9.23 Military Retirement Pay and Allowances	167
Establishing Child Support —	167
9.24 Overview	167
9.25 Income Shares Model	168
9.26 Percentage of Income Model	168
9.27 Melson Model	171
9.28 California Model	171
Deviating from Guidelines —	171
9.29 Limited Discretion	171
9.30 Special Circumstances	172

Additional Support —	172
9.31 Medical Support	172
9.32 Child Care Costs	173
Other Support Considerations —	174
9.33 Overview	174
9.34 Monitoring Support	175
9.35 Bankruptcy	175
9.36 Employer Limitation on Withholding Income	175
9.37 Federal Income Tax Treatment	176
9.38 Obligor Withholds Visitation	176
9.39 Stepparent Liability	177
<b>Chapter 10. Child Support Modification and Enforcement</b>	<b>179</b>
10.1 Introduction	179
Standards for Modifying Existing Award —	179
10.2 Substantial Change in Circumstances	179
10.3 Statutory Presumption — Substantial Change	180
10.4 Standard Cost of Living Adjustment	181
10.5 Standard for Making Award Retroactive	181
10.6 Standard When Obligor Changes Jobs	182
Duration of Child Support —	184
10.7 Obligor's Death	184
10.8 Emancipation of Child	185
Enforcement Efforts —	187
10.9 Contempt of Court	187
10.10 Interception of Tax Refunds	188
10.11 Criminal Nonsupport	188
10.12 Extradition for Criminal Nonsupport	189
10.13 Burden of Proof in Criminal Cases	189
10.14 Garnishment	190
10.15 Credit Bureau Reporting	190
10.16 Driver's License Suspension	190
10.17 Recreational License Suspension	190
10.18 Publication of a "Most Wanted"	
List of "Deadbeat Obligor"	190
10.19 Occupational License Suspension	191
10.20 Passport Denial	191
10.21 Seizing Awards	191
10.22 Seizing Assets Held	191
10.23 Obtaining a Wage Assignment	191
Federal Collection Efforts —	192
10.24 Federal Crime	192
10.25 Uniform Interstate Family Support Act (UIFSA)	192
10.26 Other Jurisdictional Issues	196

<b>Chapter 11. Alimony and Necessaries</b>	<b>197</b>
11.1 Introduction	197
History —	198
11.2 Ancient Customs	198
11.3 Ecclesiastical Courts	198
11.4 Divorce from Bed and Board	198
11.5 Fault Adopted by Secular Systems	199
11.6 Common Law	199
11.7 Alimony for Husbands	200
The Necessaries Doctrine —	201
11.8 Husband's Common Law Duty	201
11.9 Gender-neutral Application	201
Uniform Acts —	202
11.10 The Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act	202
11.11 Standard for Determining Amount and Duration under UMDA	203
11.12 American Law Institute Standards	203
State Grounds and Standards for Determining Need for Alimony	204
11.13 Fault	204
11.14 Two-step Process to Determine Eligibility	206
Forms and Duration of Alimony —	207
11.15 Rehabilitative Alimony	207
11.16 Reimbursement Alimony	208
11.17 Limited Durational Alimony	208
11.18 Incapacity Alimony	208
11.19 Caregiver Alimony	209
11.20 Permanent Alimony	209
11.21 Long-term Marriage	209
Other Issues Regarding Alimony —	211
11.22 Percentage Formulas	211
11.23 Life Insurance	212
11.24 Tax Treatment of Alimony	212
 <b>Chapter 12. Modifying Alimony</b>	 <b>213</b>
12.1 Introduction	213
Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act (UMDA) —	214
12.2 UMDA's Unconscionability Standard	214
12.3 States Impose Standards Lower Than UMDA	214
Preliminary Procedural Considerations —	214
12.4 Burden of Proof and Prerequisites for Change	214
12.5 "Bad Bargain" Not a Reason for Modification	215
Impact of Agreements on Subsequent Motions for Change —	215



12.6	Stipulations — Nonmodification Clauses	215
	Obligor's Change in Circumstances —	216
12.7	Obligor's Unanticipated Increased Income	216
12.8	Obligor's Retirement	217
12.9	Obligor's Change of Occupation	218
	Obligee's Change in Circumstances —	220
12.10	Obligee Takes a Job Outside the Home	220
	Terminating Alimony —	221
12.11	Recipient Cohabits	221
12.12	Constitutional Challenges	222
12.13	Remarriage	223
12.14	Death	224
12.15	Annulment	224
12.16	Retroactivity	224
<b>Chapter 13.</b>	<b>Dividing the Marital Estate upon Divorce</b>	<b>225</b>
13.1	Introduction	225
	Separate Property System —	226
13.2	State Options When Considering Marital Assets	226
13.3	Title Is Determining Factor	226
	Community Property —	227
13.4	Overview	227
13.5	Community Property Theory	227
13.6	Death of Partner	227
	Equitable Distribution Jurisdictions —	228
13.7	Equitable Distribution Theory	228
13.8	Presumption of Ownership During Marriage	228
	Uniform Acts —	229
13.9	Uniform Marriage and Divorce Act (UMDA)	229
13.10	Uniform Marital Property Act (UMPA)	229
	Nonmarital Property —	230
13.11	Defined	230
13.12	Calculating Nonmarital Interest	230
13.13	Active and Passive Appreciation — Stock	232
	Source of Funds Theories —	233
13.14	Transmutation	233
13.15	Source of Funds Rule	234
13.16	No Source of Funds Theory	234
	Dividing Property —	236
13.17	Equitable Not Necessarily Equal	236
13.18	Fault	236
	Professional Licenses and Degrees —	236
13.19	Diploma Dilemma	236