A FUTURE SOUTH AFRICA

VISIONS, STRATEGIES, AND REALITIES

edited by Peter L. Berger
and Bobby Godsell

Westview Press

A Future South Africa

Visions, Strategies, and Realities

EDITED BY

Peter L. Berger
and Bobby Godsell

Westview Press
BOULDER • SAN FRANCISCO • LONDON

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

Copyright © 1988 SABA Foundation

Published in 1988 in the United States of America by Westview Press, Inc., 5500 Central Avenue, Boulder, Colorado 80301

First published in 1988 jointly by Human & Rousseau Ltd. and Tafelberg Publishers Ltd.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
A Future South Africa.
1. South Africa—Politics and government—1978–
2. Apartheid—South Africa. I. Berger, Peter L.
II. Godsell, Bobby.
DT779.952.F88 1988 968.06'3 88-37885
ISBN 0-8133-0868-2
ISBN 0-8133-7720-X (pbk.)

Printed and bound in the United States of America

The paper used in this publication meets the requirements of the American National Standard for Permanence of Paper for Printed Library Materials Z39.48-1984.

10 9

Note for the U.S. Edition

Thanks to the remarkable cooperation and efficiency of Westview Press, the publication of this book in the United States is following hard upon the heels of its publication in South Africa. All the same, with events seemingly moving swiftly in the South African drama, readers may ask themselves how quickly the analyses contained here might be overtaken by these events. However, that situation is unlikely to occur—for two reasons. First, while history always comes up with surprises, one of the results of the present inquiry is the expectation that the South African drama will unfold at much lesser speed than many believe (be it in hope or fear). Second, the purpose of the analyses contained in this book is to disclose the fundamental values, perceptions and strategies of the major groups, and these change much less quickly than day-by-day events and the tactics dictated by the latter. No matter what may occur in the immediate future, these principal actors will all remain on the ground and in play, and anyone seeking to understand the South African situation will have to understand what these actors believe about the world and what future they aspire to.

When the book was published in South Africa in July 1988, it was received with considerable public interest. Comparably intense interest is hardly to be expected in the United States. Yet, especially in recent years, many Americans have become aware of South Africa, often to the accompaniment of strong moral passion. The fact that this book is an exercise in cool, dispassionate analysis in no way implies that the editors and authors are morally unconcerned. The very opposite is the case. But voicing moral convictions and judgments is hardly a useful contribution for a group of intellectuals. For better or for worse, intellectuals do not

have even one iota of moral superiority over any other human beings, and there is no reason why anyone should pay particular attention to sermons propounded by intellectuals. The proper task of an intellectual is to provide insights and to make these available to public discourse. This is what the book intends to do—no more, but also no less. In the United States as in South Africa, the book is addressed to a broad audience—scholars, political activists, policy makers and all those in the educated public with a concern for that beautiful, outrageous and endlessly bewildering country on the southern tip of the African continent.

Peter L. Berger
Bobby Godsell

试读结束，需要全本PDF请购买 www.ertongbook.com

Contents

Note for the U.S. Edition xi
Preface 1

1 South Africa's National Party government
LAWRENCE SCHLEMMER

Introduction: analysis versus letting the apartheid state off the hook 7
The beginnings of change? 8
The South African government's response to pressure 14
The interest base of the National Party and the influence of the business sector 19
The National Party and Afrikaner ethnicity 24
The National Party and white self-determination 25
The first world in Africa 26
The role of the security agencies 28
The size and composition of the security services (28); South African security agencies in comparative perspective (30); The role of the security agencies in the political process (32); The June 1986 State of Emergency (35); Visions of the future (36)
Current priorities and constraints 37
Initiatives for change (37); Constraints on change: the white right wing (38); Negative pressures on the government (39)
Concluding assessment 40
The nature of the National Party government: indigenous post-colonialism (40); Policy orientation: separation, domination or conciliation? (44); Civilian rule versus security in a deeply divided society (44); Prospects for change (46); Strategies of power-sharing (49)
A future beyond apartheid 50

2 The right wing in South African politics
HELEN ZILLE

Introduction 55
The organisations described 56
The Herstigte Nasionale Party (56); The Conservative Party (57); Die

Afrikanervolkswag (The Afrikaner People's Guard) (58); the South African Bureau of Racial Affairs (SABRA) (58); Die Vereniging van Oranjewerkers (The Society of Orange Workers) (58); Toekomsgesprek (Forum for the Future) (58); The Stallard Foundation (59); Die Afrikaner-Weerstandsbeweging (The Afrikaner Resistance Movement) (AWB) (59); Die Blanke Bevrydingsbeweging (The White Liberation Movement) (BBB) (61)

Common perspectives 61

Nationalism (63); Christianity (66); Culture (69); Partition (70); Opposition to reform (76); Reform and revolution (77); 'Foreign meddling' (79); 'First world/Third world' (80); Economic policy (82); Foreign investment (85)

Constitutional versus other methods of opposition 85

Postscript 93

3 Exile and resistance: the African National Congress, the South African Communist Party and the Pan Africanist Congress
HERIBERT ADAM 95

The military versus the political option 97

Negotiations 104

Political education, religion and women 107

Political education in the ANC (107); Religion and the ANC (110); Women and the ANC (112)

The post-apartheid economy and socialism 113

The Communist Party 119

Competing exile forces – the Pan Africanist Congress 122

4 The politics of internal resistance groupings
PAULUS ZULU

The internal resistance in context 125

A theoretical overview (126); An historical overview (126); The present environment (129); The government's strategy (131)

Mapping out the forces of resistance 132

Social composition and structure (132); The youth (134); The United Democratic Front (135); The National Forum and AZAPO (137); The churches (138); Black professional and business groupings (141); Tactical alliances (143)

The nature of resistance 144
Philosophical assumptions 145
Political visions of the future 146
Economic visions of the future 148
Educational visions of the future 149
Policy, strategy and tactics 151
Critique 156
Conscientisation and mobilisation (156); Precipitating a legitimacy crisis in government (157); Isolating South Africa internationally (157); Strategies and tactics: a review (157)
Conclusion 162
Pronouncements (162); Actions (163)

5 The incrementalists

ANN BERNSTEIN AND BOBBY GODSELL

Introduction: incrementalism – a category of logic, not a collective actor 164
The actors described 168
The business community (168); Inkatha (173); The Progressive Federal Party (178); The Labour Party (181)
Some questions for the incrementalists 184
General concerns (186); Method of change (186); Participation (189); Business (191); Questions for political groups (193)
Concluding remarks 198

6 The economics of conflict and negotiation

PIETER LE ROUX

Introduction 200
Three scenarios of the future 200
Unexpected similarities in perceptions and the possibility of negotiation (202); An economic focus (202)
Towards a siege economy 203
The neo-conservative reforms (204); The right-wing critique of government strategy (206); Reform, repression and the emerging siege economy (207); A review of the siege-economy strategy (210)
Destroying the structures of domination 213
Why the structures must be 'smashed' (214); An assessment of the radical revolutionary 'solution' (217)
An economic system compatible with a negotiated settlement 218

Free marketeer visions of the future (219); Democratic socialism (221); A social democracy – the uneasy compromise (223); Equalising the social and infrastructural investment (224); Unemployment – the South African time bomb (227); The relationship between income redistribution and economic growth (228); Difficult compromises (231); A unilateral social democracy? (234)
Expanding conflict or a negotiated settlement? 235
The South African government and negotiation (235); The ANC and negotiations (237); A prediction (239)

7 The United States and the world

JOHN MARCUM, HELEN KITCHEN AND MICHAEL SPICER

The United States and other external participants 240
The United States (242); Western Europe and Japan (255); The Soviet Union (258); South Africa's neighbours (260)
Conclusion 264

8 South Africa in comparative context

PETER L. BERGER AND BOBBY GODSELL

Unhelpful analogies: the world's last colony 267
Why is this type of analogy unhelpful? (267); Rhodesia revisited (268); Algeria revisited (271); Selma is not Soweto (271); The last days of the Shah (274); Philippine-style people power (275)
Some less common but more useful comparisons 278
The Meiji restoration in Japan (278); Deng Xiaoping's China (282)
A choice of words: totalitarian versus authoritarian regimes 283
Where first world and third world meet? 285
The dependency/modernisation debate 286
The apartheid paradigm 289
How accurate are these assumptions? (290)
South Africa beyond apartheid: is it possible? 291
Breaking the apartheid mould: new institutions, new leaders and above all new symbols 295
Capitalism versus socialism: which road to development? 296
An open future 297

Addenda

Footnotes 301
Appendix 1 – Biographical notes on the academic team 314
Appendix 2 – South African/American Academic Research Project 318
Appendix 3 – South Africa Beyond Apartheid's sponsors 319
Appendix 4 – Analytic scheme 320
Appendix 5 – Peter L. Berger: Suggested analytic scheme for the South Africa Beyond Apartheid project reality-testing 322
Bibliography 324
Index 335

Preface

This research project, which was entitled 'South Africa Beyond Apartheid', had its origins in the belief of a group of South Africans and North Americans that the debate about the nature of change in South Africa should be deepened. This group, concerned that the debate is often characterised more by passion than by enlightenment, believed that there was a need both for a more faithful description of contemporary realities and a more reflective presentation of future possibilities.

The group (whose full membership is set out in Appendix 1) was in an important sense self-recruited. Its members share four basic beliefs about South Africa:

- Apartheid is morally reprehensible and should be abolished.
- It should be replaced by a democracy and not a tyranny.
- In the process of transition the productive capacity of the economy should not be destroyed.
- The costs of transition, especially in human terms, should be kept to the minimum.

Beyond these four broadly defined and shared convictions, the group has a diversity of opinions and levels of commitment. These have greatly enriched the research project. They have also precluded us from making policy recommendations, which was never our intention. Instead we have tried to produce faithful description, clarification and, we hope, some insight.

The project's intended audience is all those concerned with the future of South Africa, and especially those who share the four beliefs set out above. From the very start, project members were open about what they were doing. At the group's first meeting, a one-page 'charter' was agreed upon (this is set out in Appendix 2). This was shown to all the individuals and groups who took part in

试读结束，需要全本PDF请购买 www.ertongbook.com

the research. The research findings have been made available to any group who requested them during the course of the project. (Many such briefings have taken place.)

The project's first task was to identify the key 'actors' whose visions and strategies are crucial to the pattern which change will take in South Africa. The term 'actor' as used here includes important organisations (such as political parties and movements), institutions (such as governments, churches and universities) and categories (such as 'youth'). Particular care has been taken to check the group's understanding of the nature, future visions and strategic logic of each actor researched with authoritative proponents of that actor's point of view. The actors identified by the group are listed below. Inevitably, no such list can be comprehensive, and some actors have been researched in greater detail then others.

Funding for this project was raised from corporate and philanthropic sources both in South Africa and the United States. (A list of these donors is included in Appendix 3.) The principle that costs incurred in South Africa were to be met from funds generated in South Africa, whilst American costs were to be met with American funds, was observed. Trusts were created in each country to ensure that the project was faithfully executed, and that the funds were properly expended. Control over the research process, however, remained entirely in the hands of the group itself.

The project adopted a simple methodology. Firstly, some twenty-five key actors were identified both in South Africa and the United States. In South Africa these consisted of:

- White right-wing groups (researched by *Helen Zille*).
- The state and the National Party (researched by *Lawrence Schlemmer*).
- The state as an economic actor/agent (researched by *Pieter le Roux*).
- State security agencies (researched by *Bobby Godsell*).
- The Labour Party (researched by *Helen Zille*).
- Inkatha (researched by *Vicki Cadman* and *Bobby Godsell*).
- The business community (researched by *Ann Bernstein*).
- The Progressive Federal Party (researched by *Bobby Godsell*).

- Black political groups – internal and external (researched by *Heribert Adam*).
- Resistance groups in Natal and the Eastern Cape, as well as the United Democratic Front and its affiliates (researched by *Paulus Zulu*).
- Resistance groups in the Transvaal as well as AZAPO and the National Forum (researched by *Vincent Maphai*).
- Educational and religious actors (researched by *James Leatt*).
- Black professional organisations (researched by *Reuel Khoza*).
- Trade unions (researched by *Bobby Godsell*).

In the United States the actors researched were:
- 'Washington' (researched by *Helen Kitchen*).
- The United States business community (researched by *David Hauck*).
- State and city legislators (researched by *David Hauck*).
- Anti-apartheid groups (researched by *Shelley Green*).
- United States colleges (researched by *Ronald Goldman*).
- Religious actors (researched by *Richard Neuhaus*).

Other aspects of the 'world' also researched were:
- The frontline states: Angola and Mozambique (researched by *John Marcum*).
- The frontline states: Zimbabwe and the BLS (Botswana, Lesotho, Swaziland) territories (researched by *Michael Spicer*).
- Europe (researched by *Michael Spicer*).

All of these actors were researched as to their nature, their future vision of South African society and their 'core' strategies to achieve this desired future. The project chairman, *Peter Berger*, produced a schema to guide this research. (This is presented in Appendix 4.)

Secondly, these actors, their visions and 'strategic logic' were subjected to a critique by their researchers in the light of contemporary South African 'realities'. Again *Peter Berger* provided an analytic schema for this 'reality testing', which is included in this report as Appendix 5. We hope to be able to publish the individual

research papers, as they constitute a valuable overview of contemporary South African politics.

The third phase of the project was the preparation of this report. For this purpose the twenty-five actors were grouped into five categories. The first four represent competing strategic logic in South Africa, as pursued by:

The South African government (Chapter 1), written by *Lawrence Schlemmer*.

The right wing in South Africa (Chapter 2), written by *Helen Zille*.

A description of resistance in exile (Chapter 3) written by *Heribert Adam*.

A description of internally based resistance groups (Chapter 4) written by *Paulus Zulu*.

Actors broadly grouped together as 'incrementalists' (Chapter 5) written jointly by *Ann Bernstein* and *Bobby Godsell*.

A chapter (Chapter 6) which examines critical economic decisions, written by *Pieter le Roux*.

A seventh chapter, which has been given the title of 'The United States and the World'. This has been written jointly by *Helen Kitchen*, *John Marcum* and *Michael Spicer*.

Chapter 8 attempts to place South Africa in a comparative context. This chapter has been written jointly by *Peter Berger* and *Bobby Godsell*, who are also the book's general editors.

It cannot be stated too strongly that this research project has the character of a debate. Perhaps it can best be understood as a colloquium spanning two continents and continuing over a period of two years. As the word colloquium implies, it represented an exchange of views. The group itself does not have a unified view of the South African problem, neither of the past, the present nor the future. All that unites the group are the four common beliefs mentioned above (and even these produce widely differing interpretations within the group). The second uniting characteristic is a belief in the value of reflection and reason.

It is both impossible and undesirable to be neutral or 'objective' about South Africa. It is a land whose problems produce passionate commitment and beliefs amongst its citizens and those from

beyond its borders who become entangled in its affairs. It is hoped that this book clearly illustrates some of the dimensions of difference and debate. In questions ranging from the meta-theoretical (such as approaches to social order and social change) to the empirical (such as the nature of 'street violence') members of the group hold widely differing views. These differences have enriched the research process, resulting in a more faithful reflection of the divergent positions of the actors themselves – a reflection which would have been impossible for some key actors if the group had shared a unified perspective. These differences have also caused this to be a book without a concluding chapter. The concluding chapter will be written by South Africans themselves, helped or hindered by those beyond this country's borders who are concerned about her destiny.

An exercise of this breadth, spanning two continents, some twenty-three researchers and continuing over two years accumulates a significant burden of gratitude. Four types of assistance require particular acknowledgement.

Our sincere thanks are extended to the following:

Firstly, those who funded this venture in both generosity and faith. Not only did they make the funds possible to conduct this research, but they also gave the team full freedom to pursue their objectives as they saw fit. Responsibility for the report vests fully within the group, but creating the possibility of such a report is the action of the funders.

Secondly, a New York City and a Johannesburg law firm, Shearman & Sterling and Webber Wentzel & Company, respectively, who provided legal and administrative services on a *pro bono publico* basis. In particular, profound thanks are due to *Stephen A. Oxman* in New York and *Carveth Geach* and *Ronny Napier* in Johannesburg who gave their time, efforts and especially their wise counsel.

Further acknowledgement is due to all those individuals who gave significant amounts of time and effort in helping group members understand the nature, vision and strategic logic of their organisation. Indeed, the openness of individuals and organisations, particularly those inside South Africa, to the pedestrian

demands of reason and research is itself a source of hope for that country's future.

The programme administrators (*Bonnie McShane*, *Liz van Niekerk*, *Charles Carter* and *Annette McKenzie*) without whose efforts this bi-national effort could never have succeeded.

In the end the existence of the book is a tribute to the diligence, patience and endurance of *Liz van Niekerk*.

Margaret Hitge helped convert academic jargon into accessible prose. A team of editors at Human & Rousseau and Tafelberg under the leadership of *Koos Human* and *Danie van Niekerk* completed the metamorphosis from a collection of academic papers into a book.

1 South Africa's National Party government

LAWRENCE SCHLEMMER

Introduction: analysis versus letting the apartheid state off the hook[1]

At a press conference held in Dakar, Senegal during the July 1987 visit by a number of South Africans to meet ANC (African National Congress) representatives, a senior ANC member took exception to a remark by a South African academic that 'apartheid' had developed over centuries of South African history. Whether this was true or not, the ANC member retorted, one should not let the apartheid government 'off the hook'.

This conversation illustrates a major difficulty in describing and analysing South Africa's National Party government. Most social scientists in South Africa and abroad are totally opposed to a government which bases its rationale and programme on a formal classification of the South African population in terms of race groups. This author is no exception. Yet these moral concerns should not preclude analysis.

The tendency to regard what is frequently referred to as 'the apartheid regime' as a unique instance of official racism frequently carries with it the inclination to be wary of or even to refrain from an analysis which might indicate that the South African political structure is a variant of patterns which have occurred throughout world history. There is often a feeling that the evil of apartheid dare not be cloaked by approaches which regard (in political terms) the National Party politicians as part of the human race.

On the contrary, however, efforts directed at change in South Africa can only be properly pursued if the factors which underlie the resilience of the National Party are fully understood and taken into account. If some of these factors are universal political proclivities, or perhaps even attributes regarded as positive in other

试读结束，需要全本PDF请购买 www.ertongbook.com