

HONG KONG CASES

1991

Volume 2

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Butterworths Asia

Singapore • Kuala Lumpur • Hong Kong

The Butterworth Group of Companies

Singapore	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01 International Plaza, Singapore 0207
Hong Kong	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA (HONG KONG) 19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 9651400 Fax: 9760840
Malaysia	MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur
Australia	BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra
Canada	BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver
Ireland	BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin
New Zealand	BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland
Puerto Rico	BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan
UK	BUTTERWORTH & Co (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh
USA	BUTTERWORTH LEGAL PUBLISHERS Salem, New Hampshire and Carlsbad, California
Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed International (Singapore) Pte Ltd.	

© Butterworths Asia, 1995

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

ISBN 0-409-99734-X

Typeset by Butterworths Asia and Corporate Press (HK) Ltd
Produced by Mandarin Offset Ltd
Printed and bound in Hong Kong

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Associate Editors

Grenville Cross QC

Ruy Barretto, Barrister

Michael Ozorio, Barrister

Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister

Susan Kwan, Barrister

Peter Garland, Barrister

Malcolm Merry, Barrister

Aarif Barma, Barrister

Andrew Cheung, Barrister

Peter Ng, Barrister

Joseph Fok, Barrister

Anderson Chow, Barrister

Teresa Cheng, Barrister

David Fitzpatrick, Barrister

Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister

Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University

Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

Reporters in this volume

Danny Choi, Barrister

George F Chu, Barrister

Simon CK Chui, Barrister

Paul Harris, Barrister

Gary Kwan, Barrister

Godfrey Lam, Barrister

Osmond Lam, Barrister

Raymond Lau Wai Man, Barrister

Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister

Raymond Leung, Barrister

PY Lo, Barrister

Judith O'Hare

Raymond Tsui Wai Nam, Barrister

Anthony P Kinnear

Butterworths Asia

Managing Editor: Anthony P Kinnear

Deputy Managing Editor: Zarinah Marican

Publisher: David Catterall

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The publishers are grateful to and acknowledge the significant contribution and support of the Hong Kong Superior Court Judgments Database project, directed by the four members of the Faculty of Law, whose names are mentioned below. The judgments database project (1989–1994) was funded primarily by the University of Hong Kong's Conference and Research Grants Committee with assistance from the Department of Professional Legal Education, at the Faculty of Law. The Faculty members responsible for the project are (in alphabetical order) Andrew Byrnes, Lecturer, Department of Law; Rick Glofcheski, Lecturer, Department of Law; Gary N Heilbronn, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education; and Sarah Nield, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education (until 1992). The project administrator is James Garritty, Research Officer, Faculty of Law.

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

List of abbreviations used in this volume (excluding reports):

A	High Court Action
ACJ	Acting Chief Justice
A-G	Attorney General
AR	Application for Review
Adm	Admiralty Action
App	Appendix
art	article
Aust	Australia
CA	Court of Appeal
CA	Civil Appeal Number in references to unreported cases (eg CA 2/92)
CC	High Court Criminal Case
CJ	Chief Justice
Cap	Chapter (as in Chapter Number of an Ordinance)
Crim App	Criminal Appeal
Comm L	Commercial List
Con L	Construction List
ch	chapter (as in chapter number of a book)
cl(l)	clause(s)
DC	District Court
DCA	District Court Action
DJ	District Judge
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
EC	European Communities
ECC	Economic Compensation Case
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities
EEC	European Economic Communities
Ed	Edition
Ex Ch	Court of Exchequer Chamber
exh	exhibit
fn	footnote
HC	High Court
HL	House of Lords
HMSO	Her Majesty's Stationery Office
J(J)	Justice(s)
J(J)A	Justice(s) of Appeal
LTA	Labour Tribunal Appeal
LC	Lord Chancellor
Ld T	Lands Tribunal
MA	Magistracy Appeal
MCA	Magistracy Criminal Appeal
MP	Miscellaneous Proceedings
MR	Master of the Rolls
n	note
NSW	New South Wales
O	Order (of the Rules of the Supreme Court)

Abbreviations

PC	Privy Council
PRC	People's Republic of China
PCA	Privy Council Appeal
Pt	Part
para	paragraph
RSC	Rules of the Supreme Court
r(r)	rule(s)
reg	regulation
s	section
sub-s	subsection
Sch	Schedule
UN	United Nations
Uncitral	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
VP(P)	Vice-President(s)
WCC	Workers' Compensation Case

List of abbreviations of law reports:

AC	Law Reports, Appeal Cases (HL and PC); since 1890
All ER	All England Law Reports; since 1936
All ER Rep	All England Law Reports Reprint; 1558–1935
App Cas	Law Reports, Appeal Cases, House of Lords, 15 volumes; 1875–1890
ALR	Argus Law Reports (Australia); 1895–(current)
B & Ald	Barnewall and Alderson's Reports, Kings Bench, 5 volumes; 1817–1822
BCC	British Company Law Cases
BLR	Business Law Review
Brown & Lush	Browning and Lushington's Reports, Admiralty, 1 volume; 1863–1866
Build LR	Building LR
CB	Common Bench Reports, 18 volumes; 1845–1856
CBNS	Common Bench Reports; New Series, 20 volumes; 1856–1865
CMLR	Common Market Law Reports; since 1962
COD	Crown Office Digest
CPD	Law Reports, Common Pleas Division, 5 volumes; 1875–1880
Ch	Law Reports, Chancery Division; since 1890
Ch D	Law Reports, Chancery Division, 45 volumes; 1875–1890
Const	Const's edition of Bott's Poor Laws, 3 volumes; 1807
Cox CC	EW Cox's Criminal Law Cases, 31 volumes; 1843–1941
Cr App R	Criminal Appeal Reports (HL and CA(UK)); since 1908
Crim LR	Criminal Law Review; since 1954

Hong Kong Cases

Dr & War	Drury and Warren's Reports, Chancery (Ireland), 4 volumes; 1841–1843
ER	English Reports, 178 volumes; 1220–1865
EG	Estate Gazette; since 1858
ECR	European Court Reports
FSR	Fleet Street Reports; since 1975
H & N	Hurlstone and Norman's Reports, Exchequer, 7 volumes; 1856–1862
HKC	Hong Kong Cases
HKLJ	Hong Kong Law Journal
HKLR	Hong Kong Law Reports
HKLY	Hong Kong Law Yearbook
KB	Law Reports, King's Bench Division, 53 volumes; 1901–1952
LRHL	Law Reports, English and Irish Peerage Claims, House of Lords, 7 volumes; 1866–1875
LJ Adm	Law Journal, Admiralty; 1865–1875
LJ Ch	Law Journal, Chancery; 1831–1946
LT	Law Times Reports, 177 volumes; 1879–1947
Lloyd's Rep	Lloyd's List Law Reports; since 1951
M & W	Meeson and Welsby's Reports, Exchequer, 16 volumes; 1836–1847
Mans	Manson's Bankruptcy and Company Cases, 21 volumes; 1893–1914
NSWLR	New South Wales Law Reports, since 1971
NSWR	New South Wales Reports; 1960–1970
NZLR	New Zealand Law Reports; since 1883
P	Law Reports, Probate, Divorce and Admiralty Division; 1891–1971
QB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1891–1900, and since 1952
QBD	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1875–1890
RPC	Reports of Patent Cases; since 1884
SALR	South African Law Reports; 1865–1920
Sol Jo	Solicitor's Journal; since 1856
TLR	The Times Law Reports, 71 volumes; 1884–1950
TR	The Times Law Reports; since 1951
VLR	Taxation Reports; since 1939
VR	Victorian Law Reports; 1875–1956
WLR	Victorian Reports; 1870–1872 and since 1957
WN	Weekly Law Reports; since 1953
	Law Reports, Weekly Notes; 1866–1952

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

The mode of citation of cases reported in this volume of *Hong Kong Cases* is [1991] 2 HKC (page).

	Page		Page
A			
ACL Electronics (HK) Ltd; Bulmer Ltd & Anor v	[HC] 544	Chan Lai Pang & Co (a firm); Extramoney Ltd & Anor v ...	[CA] 125
Amigo, The	[HC] 491	Cheung Kwok Lun & Ors; R v	[CA] 67
Attorney General v South China Morning Post Publishers Ltd & Anor	[HC] 603	Cheung Man Cheung; Inchroy Credit Corp Ltd v	[HC] 619
Attorney General v Wang Chong Construction Co Ltd	[CA] 30	Chintung Securities Ltd; Lim Ban Thoon v	[CA] 204
Attorney General; Ng Kam Chuen v	[HC] 560	Chiu Shing t/a BC Property & Trading Co; Guangdong New Technology Import & Export Corp Jiangmen Branch v	[HC] 459
Au Yeung Bik Tai & Anor; Kok Yun Kuen v	[HC] 522	Choi Pui Kei Stephen & Anor; Lee Tat Kwong v	[CA] 109
B		Choi Wing Hing t/a Wing Hing Electrical Co & Ors; Tsang Yuk Ming v	[HC] 322
Bu Xue Bun v Director of Immigration	[HC] 609	Choy v Nissei Sangyo America Ltd	[CA] 173
Bulmer Ltd & Anor v ACL Electronics (HK) Ltd	[HC] 544	Chung Wing Kwong v Leung Kam Fai	[HC] 625
Bylax Investments Ltd; Qualihold Investments Ltd v	[HC] 589	Cohen; R v	[HC] 465
C		Commissioner of Inland Revenue & Anor; Lee Sap Pat v	[CA] 251
CG&L Investment Ltd & Anor v Gala Land Investment Co Ltd	[CA] 55	D	
Chan Chi Wah & Ors; R v	[CA] 136	Denholm Ship Management Ltd & Ors; Lam Yau Tai v ..	[HC] 554
Chan Chin Pang & Ors; R v ...	[HC] 378	Director of Immigration; Bu Xue Bun v	[HC] 609
Chan Chiu & Anor; Kong Lap Hung v	[HC] 470	Doveridge Co Ltd v Fundscore Development Ltd	[HC] 597
Chan Foon Tai; Lo Chun Tak v	[DC] 650	Dr Ma Chung Ho Kei; Queen's Electronic Manufacturing Co Ltd v	[CA] 218
Chan Hau Man t/a Chong Yip Transport Co & Anor; Shiu Wai Kuen v	[DC] 654	E	
Chan Kung Ling; R v	[CA] 158	Enterprise Lacasa & Associates Ltd & Anor; R v	[HC] 486
Chan Shui Man v Tsang Hing Shan t/a Yick Luen Furniture Design	[CA] 243	Extramoney Ltd & Anor v Chan Lai Pang & Co (a firm)	[CA] 125
Chan Sing Chuk & Ors v Innovisions Ltd	[CA] 305		
Chan Wing Lung & Anor; R v	[CA] 116		

Hong Kong Cases

F	Page	K	Page
Fundscore Development Ltd; Doveridge Co Ltd v	[HC] 597	Kai Sun Sea Products & Food Co Ltd; Fung Sang Trading Ltd v	[HC] 526
Fung Sang Trading Ltd v Kai Sun Sea Products & Food Co Ltd	[HC] 526	Kok Yun Kuen v Au Yeung Bik Tai & Anor	[HC] 522
Fung Tak Sing; Sun Hung Kai Investment Services Ltd & Anor v	[HC] 515	Kong Lap Hung v Chan Chiu & Anor	[HC] 470
G		Kowloon Motor Bus Co (1933) Ltd v Yick Kwok Keung & Anor	[DC] 632
Gala Land Investment Co Ltd; CG&L Investment Ltd & Anor v	[CA] 55	Kuscene Development Ltd; Parasram & Ors v	[CA] 13
Guangdong New Technology Import & Export Corp Jiangmen Branch v Chiu Shing t/a BC Property & Trading Co	[HC] 459	L	
H		Lam Nai Sum Robin & Anor; R v	[HC] 582
Hang Seng Finance Ltd v Lin Kwok Man	[DC] 613	Lam Tun Ming & Anor v Hu Chun Leung	[CA] 285
Ho Chun Wai; R v	[HC] 332	Lam Yau Tai v Denholm Ship Management Ltd & Ors	[HC] 554
Ho Sik Yin; R v	[CA] 212	Lau Ka Shui v Yiu Wing Construction Co Ltd & Anor [DC]	644
Hong Leong Investment Co Ltd; Tai Ping Insurance Co Ltd v	[CA] 8	Lau Wing Mou (a firm) v Lo Kong & Anor	[HC] 569
Hu Chun Leung; Lam Tun Ming & Anor v	[CA] 285	Lee Chee Ngor Moreta v Prudential Enterprise Ltd	[HC] 499
I		Lee Sap Pat v Commissioner of Inland Revenue & Anor ...	[CA] 251
Improver Corp & Anor v Raymond Industrial Ltd & Anor	[CA] 300	Lee Tat Kwong v Choi Pui Kei Stephen & Anor	[CA] 109
Inchroy Credit Corp Ltd v Cheung Man Cheung	[HC] 619	Lee Yuk Wah & Anor; R v	[CA] 97
Incorporated Owners of Chungking Mansions v Shamdasani	[HC] 342	Leung Kam Fai; Chung Wing Kwong v	[HC] 625
Industrial Equity (Pacific) Ltd, Re	[HC] 364	Li Chung I t/a VF Electric Manufacturing Co; Li Man Yuen v	[CA] 230
Innovisions Ltd; Chan Sing Chuk & Ors v	[CA] 305	Li Man Yuen v Li Chung I t/a VF Electric Manufacturing ...	[CA] 230
Ip Lam Yuk Lin v Yeung Fat & Anor	[HC] 480	Lim Ban Thoon v Chintung Securities Ltd	[CA] 204
Ip Mou Yuen; R v	[CA] 280	Lin Kwok Man; Hang Seng Finance Ltd v	[DC] 613
		Lo Chun Tak v Chan Foon Tai	[DC] 650

Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Lo Kong & Anor; Lau Wing Mou (a firm) v	[HC] 569	R v Chan Kung Ling	[CA] 158
Lo Wing Chai; R v	[CA] 198	R v Chan Wing Lung & Anor	[CA] 116
Long Year Development Ltd v Tse Fuk Man Norman & Ors (Ho Shiu Kwan Tony & Anor, third parties)	[HC] 393	R v Cheung Kwok Lun & Ors	[CA] 67
Lui Kwok Wai; R v	[CA] 149	R v Cohen	[HC] 465
M		R v Enterprise Lacasa & Associates Ltd & Anor	[HC] 486
Manohar Chugh t/a Electric & Electronic Industries v Oka Electronics Ltd	[CA] 1	R v Ho Chun Wai	[HC] 332
Mattel Inc v Tonka Corp	[HC] 411	R v Ho Sik Yin	[CA] 212
Mok Wing Hung; R v	[CA] 145	R v Ip Mou Yuen	[CA] 280
Multi-More Industries Ltd v Tung Hoo Fai & Anor	[CA] 261	R v Lam Nai Sum Robin & Anor	[HC] 582
Murjani, ex p Bank of India, Re	[HC] 432	R v Lee Yuk Wah & Anor	[CA] 97
N		R v Lo Wing Chai	[CA] 198
Ng Kam Chuen v Attorney General	[HC] 560	R v Lui Kwok Wai	[CA] 149
Nissei Sangyo America Ltd; Choy v	[CA] 173	R v Mok Wing Hung	[CA] 145
O		R v Tang Yuk Yan	[CA] 214
Oka Electronics Ltd; Manohar Chugh t/a Electric & Electronics Industries v	[CA] 1	R v Vu Van Thang & Anor	[CA] 90
P		R v Wong Tse Shing	[HC] 468
Parasram & Ors v Kuscene Development Ltd	[CA] 13	R v Yeung Lung Fai	[CA] 102
Parnip Investment Ltd, Re	[CA] 272	R v Yeung Mau Lam	[CA] 296
Pointer Apitong, The	[HC] 503	Raymond Industrial Ltd & Anor; Improver Corp & Anor v	[CA] 300
Prudential Enterprise Ltd; Lee Chee Ngor Moreta v	[HC] 499	S	
Q		Shamdasani; Incorporated Owners of Chungking Mansions v	[HC] 342
Qualihold Investments Ltd v Bylax Investments Ltd	[HC] 589	Shiu Wai Kuen v Chan Hau Man t/a Chong Yip Transport Co & Anor	[DC] 654
Queen's Electronic Manufacturing Co Ltd v Dr Ma Chung Ho Kei	[CA] 218	Shum Yuen Nim; United Venture Navigation Co Ltd v	[CA] 73
R		Singapore-Johore Express (Pte) Ltd; Tay Choo Wah & Anor v	[CA] 180
R v Chan Chi Wah & Ors	[CA] 136	South China Morning Post Publishers Ltd & Anor; Attorney General v	[HC] 603
R v Chan Chin Pang & Ors	[HC] 378	Stock Exchange of Hong Kong Ltd, Re the	[HC] 328

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
Suen Yiu Pan t/a Chiu Kee Saw Mill & Anor; Wong Wan Tak v [CA]	63	U	
Sun Hung Kai Investment Services Ltd & Anor v Fung Tak Sing [HC]	515	United Venture Navigation Co Ltd v Shum Yuen Nim ... [CA]	73
T		V	
Tai Ping Insurance Co Ltd v Hong Leong Investment Co Ltd [CA]	8	Vu Van Thang & Anor; R v ... [CA]	90
Taiyo Maritime SA; Yee Sang Metal And Building Supplies Co Ltd v [CA]	291	W	
Tam Kwok Hung t/a Hang Mei Record Co & Anor; Tam Wing Lun Alan & Ors v [HC]	384	Wang Chong Construction Co Ltd; Attorney General v . [CA]	30
Tam Wing Lun Alan & Ors v Tam Kwok Hung t/a Hang Mei Record Co & Anor [HC]	384	Warner Banks Esq. Coroner; Yu Kin Lung v [HC]	336
Tang Yuk Yan; R v [CA]	214	Wong Tse Shing; R v [HC]	468
Tay Choo Wah & Anor v Singapore-Johore Express (Pte) Ltd [CA]	180	Wong Wan Tak v Suen Yiu Pan t/a Chiu Kee Saw Mill & Anor [CA]	63
Thomson v Thomson [CA]	119	Y	
Tonka Corp; Mattel Inc v [HC]	411	Yiu Wing Construction Co Ltd & Anor; Lau Ka Shui v . [DC]	644
Tsang Hing Shan t/a Yick Luen Furniture Design; Chan Shui Man v [CA]	243	Yee Sang Metal And Building Supplies Co Ltd v Taiyo Maritime SA [CA]	291
Tsang Yuk Ming v Choi Wing Hing t/a Wing Hing Electrical Co & Ors [HC]	322	Yeung Fat & Anor; Ip Lam Yuk Lin v [HC]	480
Tse Fuk Man Norman & Ors (Ho Shiu Kwan Tony & Anor, third parties); Long Year Development Ltd v [HC]	393	Yeung Lung Fai; R v [CA]	102
Tung Hoo Fai & Anor; Multi-More Industries Ltd v [CA]	261	Yeung Mau Lam; R v [CA]	296
		Yick Kwok Keung & Anor; Kowloon Motor Bus Co (1933) Ltd v [DC]	632
		Yu Kin Lung v Warner Banks Esq. Coroner [HC]	336

SUBJECT INDEX

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Judicial review

Commissioner of Inland Revenue – Commissioner of Police – Exercise of statutory powers – Court entitled and bound to see whether statutory powers exercised arbitrarily or irrationally so as to amount to an abuse – Whether notice issued by Commissioner in conflict with magistrate's order

Lee Sap Pat v Commissioner of Inland Revenue & Anor CA 251

AGENCY

Customer and broker

Purchase of shares – Relationship of principal and agent between customer and broker – Bank instructed by customer to place order with broker for purchase of shares – Customer later refused to take shares – Privity of contract between broker and customer – Nature of mistake not so fundamental as to deprive broker of right to reimbursement and indemnity

Sun Hung Kai Investment Services Ltd & Anor v Fung Tak Sing HC 515

Power of attorney

Power of attorney related to one property only – Whether a general power of attorney within the meaning of s 7 of Powers of Attorney Ordinance – Whether power of attorney valid at common law – Powers of Attorney Ordinance (Cap 31) s 7

Multi-More Industries Ltd v Tung Hoo Fai & Anor CA 261

ARBITRATION

Arbitrators

Jurisdiction – Whether arbitrators can decide question as to their jurisdiction – Claim that there was no concluded contract between the parties – Principle of separability – Options for arbitrators when faced with challenge to jurisdiction – Uncitral Model Law art 16

Fung Sang Trading Ltd v Kai Sun Sea Products & Food Co Ltd HC 526

Award

Enforcement – Document affirmed as true copy of duly authenticated original arbitration award – Whether document properly authenticated – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 43(a)

Guangdong New Technology Import & Export Corp Jiangmen Branch v Chiu Shing t/a BC Property & Trading Co HC 459

Enforcement – Document containing arbitration clause not signed by both parties – Whether an arbitration agreement within meaning of Arbitration Ordinance
Guangdong New Technology Import & Export Corp Jiangmen Branch v Chiu Shing t/a BC Property & Trading Co HC 459

Enforcement – Late notice of arbitration proceedings served on defendant – Whether defendant prejudiced – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) 44(2)(c)
Guangdong New Technology Import & Export Corp Jiangmen Branch v Chiu Shing t/a BC Property & Trading Co HC 459

Model Law

Whether arbitration domestic or international – Place where substantial part of the obligations of the commercial relationship is to be performed – Delivery of goods to China – Uncitral Model Law art 1

Fung Sang Trading Ltd v Kai Sun Sea Products & Food Co Ltd HC 526

BANKING AND FINANCE

Purchase of shares

Bank received instructions from customer for purchase of shares which were passed on to broker – Customer later refusing to take shares – Bank indemnifying broker – Agreement with broker that proceeds from sale of shares would be divided between them equally – Whether bank a proper plaintiff in action against customer

Sun Hung Kai Investment Services Ltd & Anor v Fung Tak Sing HC 515

Whether agency relationship existed between bank and customer in purchase of shares through broker – Whether agency relationship existed between customer and broker – Whether broker to be reimbursed and indemnified by customer

Sun Hung Kai Investment Services Ltd & Anor v Fung Tak Sing HC 515

BANKRUPTCY

Discovery

Whether creditor may obtain discovery against debtor prior to the issue of receiving order – Use of information obtained in examination under O 49B to support petition – Rules of the Supreme Court O 49B

Re Murjani, ex p Bank of India HC 432

Trustee in bankruptcy

Whether joinder of trustee in bankruptcy as defendant in proceedings would breach s 12(1) of Bankruptcy Ordinance (Cap 6) – Bankruptcy Ordinance (Cap 6) s 12(1)

Tai Ping Insurance Co Ltd v Hong Leong Investment Co Ltd CA 8

BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION

Construction contract

Claim that specified quality of materials not used – Maintenance certificate issued – Whether issue of maintenance certificate precluded re-opening of contract – Whether matters in dispute ‘excepted matters’ under contract

Attorney General v Wang Chong Construction Co Ltd CA 30

Government contract

Identification of ‘architect’ under contract – Restructuring of Public Works Department – Requirement of certainty – Reference to public officer in contract – Whether contract with Government an ‘instrument’ – Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap 1) s 54

Attorney General v Wang Chong Construction Co Ltd CA 30

Party structures

Demolition – Notice required to be given to adjoining owner – Shoring works – Demolition of common staircase and adjoining wall – Whether sufficient notice had been given – Whether injunction ought to be granted to prevent demolition works

Doveridge Co Ltd v Fundscore Development Ltd HC 597

Rights of owners of adjoining properties with regard to party structures – Rights governed by legislation and not common law – Buildings Ordinance (Cap 123) Second Schedule

Doveridge Co Ltd v Fundscore Development Ltd HC 597

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Costs

Apportionment of costs of appeal in intellectual property litigation – Plaintiffs succeeding on one issue but failing on another – Defendants appealing on issue which failed at first instance – Both appeals dismissed – Proper order to do justice between parties

Improver Corp & Anor v Raymond Industrial Ltd & Anor CA 300

Attorney General instituting action for contempt of court – Negotiations between parties resulting in Attorney General allowing respondents to apply for action to be dismissed before trial – Whether costs to be awarded to respondents – Form of costs order – Bill of Rights Ordinance (Cap 383) s 6, art 16(2), (3)

Attorney General v South China Morning Post Publishers Ltd HC 603

Discontinuance of action – General rule that defendant entitled to costs – Whether circumstances justify departure from general rule – Necessity to prove that discontinuance equated with defeat or acknowledgment of defeat – Rules of the Supreme Court O 21 rr 2 & 3

Inchroy Credit Corp Ltd v Cheung Man Cheung HC 619

Delay

Dismissal for want of prosecution – Limited power of appellate court to interfere with exercise of discretion by judge below – Inordinate and inexcusable post-writ delay – Additional prejudice – No sufficient evidence of financial prejudice – Periods allowed by rules not culpable delays – Rules of the Supreme Court O 10 r 1(7)

United Venture Navigation Co Ltd v Shum Yuen Nim CA 73

Discontinuance of action

Condition against further proceedings – Possibility of future title problems – Whether plaintiffs should be shut out from possible future claim

Inchroy Credit Corp Ltd v Cheung Man Cheung HC 619

Discovery

Lands Tribunal – Discretion of tribunal to order discovery – Document must be material to determination of matter before tribunal – Relevance of

documents – Lands Tribunal Ordinance (Cap 17) s 10(1), (2)(a) & (b) – Rules of the Supreme Court O 24 rr 8 & 13

Parasram & Ors v Kuscene Developments Ltd CA 13

Joinder of parties

Joinder of trustee in bankruptcy as defendant in proceedings – Whether joinder would infringe s 12(1) of Bankruptcy Ordinance (Cap 6) – Rules of the Supreme Court O 15 r 6(1) & (2) – Bankruptcy Ordinance (Cap 6) s 12(1)

Tai Ping Insurance Co Ltd v Hong Leong Investment Co Ltd CA 8

Pleadings

Amendment of defence – Ex turpi causa – Insider dealing – Whether plaintiff's claim unenforceable on grounds of illegality – Question of culpability a matter for insider dealing tribunal rather than court – Securities Ordinance (Cap 333) s 141B(1), C(6), D(1) & H(3)

Chan Sing Chuk & Ors v Innovisions Ltd CA 305

Amendment of statement of claim – Whether new claim time-barred – Trust property – Whether distinction between express and constructive trustee for the purposes of limitation – Amendment to be allowed unless it be shown to be useless – Whether amendment would cause prejudice to other party which could not be compensated for in costs – Limitation Ordinance (Cap 347) s 20 – Rules of the Supreme Court O 20

Extramoney Ltd & Anor v Chan Lai Pang & Co (a firm) CA 125

Amendment of statement of claim – Whether proposed amendments gave rise to new causes of action – Whether new cause of action arose from same or substantially the same facts – Discretion of court to give leave to amend – Rules of the Supreme Court O 20 r 5(2) & (5)

Ng Kam Chuen v Attorney General HC 560

Re-amendment of writ and statement of claim – Addition of new defendants – Whether plaintiff's action against additional defendants time-barred – Date on which limitation is to be considered – Limitation Ordinance (Cap 347) s 35(1)(b) & (2)(b) – Rules of the Supreme Court O 15 r 6

Lim Ban Thoon v Chintung Securities Ltd CA 204

Striking out statement of claim – Damages for deceit – Allegation of false representations – Absence of averment in statement of claim that the representations or assurances relied upon had been made in writing – Law Amendment and Reform (Consolidation) Ordinance (Cap 23) s 13 – Rules of the Supreme Court O 18 r 19(1)

Choy v Nissei Sangyo America Ltd CA 173

Prohibition order

Restraint of an alleged debtor to prevent him from doing anything which would affect enforcement of judgment obtained – Whether words of s 21B of Supreme Court Ordinance wide enough for such restraint – Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) s 21B

Re Murjani, ex p Bank of India HC 432

Service out of jurisdiction

Application for extension of time to file defence pending appeal dismissed – Whether filing of defence amounted to submission to jurisdiction

Tay Choo Wah & Anor v Singapore-Johore Express (Pte) Ltd CA 180

Application for leave – Test to be adopted – Dispute of fact – Function of judge – Whether good arguable case – Rules of the Supreme Court O 11 r 1

Yee Sang Metal and Building Supplies v Taiyo Maritime SA CA 291

Ex parte order obtained – Whether service irregular if not effected at specified address in order – Misstatement as to material evidence relevant to the exercise of court's discretion – Whether sufficient to discharge order – Rules of the Supreme Court O 11

Mattel Inc v Tonka Corp HC 411

Setting aside – Whether party served with writ was a necessary and proper party to the proceedings – Plaintiff failing to specify precise grounds relied upon when applying for leave for service before Master – Necessity of showing a good arguable case on the merits – Rules of the Supreme Court O 11 r 1(c), (d)(i) & (ii)

Lam Yau Tai v Denholm Ship Management Ltd & Ors HC 554

Whether real issue existed between plaintiff and party on whom writ had been served – Whether cause of action lay in conversion as between second plaintiff had good arguable case – Form of affidavit – Rules of the Supreme Court O 11 rr 1(1)(c), 4(1)(d)

Tay Choo Wah & Anor v Singapore-Johore Express (Pte) Ltd CA 180

COMPANIES AND CORPORATIONS

Insider dealing

Whether insider dealing illegal or immoral – Whether false information could be 'relevant information' – Whether insider dealing a matter to be dealt with by court – Securities Ordinance (Cap 333) s 141B(1), C(6), D(1) & H(3)

Chan Sing Chuk & Ors v Innovisions Ltd CA 305

Scheme of arrangement

Whether class of shareholders for court meeting properly constituted – Whether failure to disclose necessary information and to present the scheme fairly – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) ss 166, 166A

Re Industrial Equity (Pacific) Ltd HC 364

Shareholders

Classes of shareholders – Different classes determined by dissimilarity of rights not dissimilarity of interests

Re Industrial Equity (Pacific) Ltd HC 364

Short selling of shares

Whether strict liability offence – Onus on Crown to prove beyond reasonable doubt no honest and reasonable belief on part of defendant – Securities Ordinance (Cap 333) s 80(1)

R v Lam Nai Sum Robin & Anor HC 582

Stock Exchange of Hong Kong Ltd

Membership – Effect of revocation of registration as dealer on membership
– Whether member's share extinguished or automatically surrendered or confiscated
– Whether membership automatically terminated – Power to expel members –
Securities Ordinance (Cap 333) Pt VI s 55(2) – Stock Exchanges Unification
Ordinance (Cap 361) s 11 – Securities and Futures Commission Ordinance (Cap
24) s 50(1)

Re The Stock Exchange Of Hong Kong Ltd HC 328

Transfer of shares

Death of registered owner – Transfer to personal representative – Whether
subject to the right of pre-emption – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 69(1B)
Lee Chee Ngor Moreta v Prudential Enterprise Ltd HC 499

Ultra vires

Conveyance not signed by two directors as required by memorandum and
articles – Effect on subsequent transfers of land conveyed
Qualihold Investments Ltd v Bylax Investment Ltd HC 589

Winding up

Application by company for payment of legal costs to oppose petition and
take other legal action be made out of company funds – Company insolvent and
not trading – Factors to consider in sanctioning payment – Exercise of court's
discretion – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 182
Re Parnip Investment Ltd CA 272

Winding up petition

Delay – Whether petition ought to be struck out for want of prosecution –
Whether delay inordinate and inexcusable – Whether a fair trial was possible –
Whether prejudice suffered
CG&L Investment Ltd & Anor v Gala Land Investment Co Ltd CA 55

CONTRACT

Collateral agreement

Exception to parol evidence rule – Whether admissible to contradict written
agreement – Whether document a complete record
Lam Tun Ming & Anor v Hu Chun Leung CA 285

Hire purchase agreement

Breach – Express provision making time of payment of essence – Non
payment of instalments a breach going to the root of the contract – Express
provision allowing claim for damages for loss of whole transaction upon termination
– Whether such clause enforceable – Whether clause a penalty
Hang Seng Finance Ltd v Lin Kwok Man DC 613

Specific performance

Payment as alternative to performance – Contract for sale of land – Clause