

HONG KONG CASES

1993

Volume 1

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Butterworths Asia

Singapore • Kuala Lumpur • Hong Kong

The Butterworth Group of Companies

Singapore	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01 International Plaza, Singapore 0207
Hong Kong	19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 9651400 Fax: 9760840
Malaysia	MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur
Australia	BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra and Hobart
Canada	BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver
Ireland	BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin
New Zealand	BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland
Puerto Rico	BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan
UK	BUTTERWORTH & CO (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh
USA	BUTTERWORTH LEGAL PUBLISHERS Salem, New Hampshire and Carlsbad, California
Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed International (Singapore) Pte Ltd.	

© Butterworths Asia, 1994

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

ISBN 0-409-99710-2

Typeset by: Butterworths Asia and Superskill Graphics
Produced in Hong Kong by Mandarin Offset

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Associate Editors

Grenville Cross QC

Ruy Baretto, Barrister

Michael Ozorio, Barrister

Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister

Susan Kwan, Barrister

Peter Garland, Barrister

Malcolm Merry, Barrister

Aarif Barma, Barrister

Andrew Cheung, Barrister

Peter Ng, Barrister

Joseph Fok, Barrister

Anderson Chow, Barrister

Teresa Cheng, Barrister

David Fitzpatrick, Barrister

Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister

Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University

Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

Reporters in this volume

Danny Choi, Barrister

George F Chu, Barrister

Simon CK Chui, Barrister

Anne-Marie Gordon, Barrister

Paul Harris, Barrister

MJ Kenny, Barrister

Gary Kwan, Barrister

Christopher Lam, Barrister

Godfrey Lam, Barrister

Osmond Lam, Barrister

Raymond Lau Wai Man, Barrister

Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister

Raymond Leung, Barrister

PY Lo, Barrister

Raymond Tsui Wai Nam, Barrister

Daniel Wan, Barrister

Anthony P Kinnear

Butterworths Asia

Managing Editor: Anthony P Kinnear

Senior Editor, Reports: Zarinah Marican

Publisher: David Catterall

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

List of abbreviations used in this volume (excluding reports):

A	High Court Action
ACJ	Acting Chief Justice
A-G	Attorney General
AR	Application for Review
App	Appendix
art	article
Aust	Australia
CA	Court of Appeal
CA	Civil Appeal Number in references to unreported cases (eg CA 2/92)
CJ	Chief Justice
Can	Canada
Cap	Chapter (as in Chapter Number of an Ordinance)
Crim App	Criminal Appeal
Comm L	Commercial List
ch	chapter (as in chapter number of a book)
cl(l)	clause(s)
DC	District Court
DCA	District Court Action
DJ	District Judge
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
EC	European Communities
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities
EEC	European Economic Communities
Ed	Edition
Ex Ch	Court of Exchequer Chamber
exh	exhibit
HC	High Court
HL	House of Lords
Ind	India
J(J)	Justice(s)
J(J)A	Justice(s) of Appeal
LC	Lord Chancellor
MA	Magistracy Appeal
MP	Miscellaneous Proceedings
MR	Master of the Rolls
n	note
NZ	New Zealand
O	Order (of the Rules of the Supreme Court)
PC	Privy Council
Pt	Part
para	paragraph
RSC	Rules of the Supreme Court
r(r)	rule(s)
reg	regulation

Hong Kong Cases

s	section
sub-s	subsection
Sch	Schedule
TMR	Trade Marks Registry
UN	United Nations
VP(P)	Vice-President(s)

List of abbreviations of law reports:

AC	Law Reports, Appeal Cases (HL and PC); since 1890
ADRLJ	Arbitration and Dispute Resolution Law Journal
ALR	Australian Law Reports
AIR	All India Reporter
All ER	All England Law Reports; since 1936
B & S	Best & Smith, 10 volumes (KB); 1861–1871 (Vols 7–10 do not appear in the ER)
BCC	British Company Law Cases; since 1983
BCLC	Butterworths Company Law Cases; since 1978
BGHSt	Bundes Gerichts Hof Strafsachen (Federal Supreme Court of Germany Criminal Decisions)
CB(NS)	Common Bench Reports, New Series, 20 volumes; 1856–1865
CCC (3d)	Canadian Criminal Cases, Annotated (Third Series); since 1983
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports; since 1903
Ch	Law Reports, Chancery Division; since 1890
Ch D	Law Reports, Chancery Division, 45 volumes; 1875–1890
Cr App R	Criminal Appeal Reports (HL and CA(UK)); since 1908
Cr App R (S)	Criminal Appeal Reports (Sentencing); since 1979
Crim LR	Criminal Law Review; since 1954
D & R	Decisions and Reports of the European Commission on Human Rights
Doug	Douglas' Reports (KB), 4 volumes; 1778–1785
Drew	Drewry's Reports (Ch), 4 volumes; 1852–1859
EHRR	European Human Rights Reports
ER	English Reports, 178 volumes; 1220–1865
F & F	Foster and Finlayson's Reports (Nisi Prius), 4 volumes; 1856–1867
FLR	Family Law Reports; since 1977
FSR	Fleet Street Reports; since 1975
Fam	Law Reports, Family Division; since 1972
Fiji LR	Fiji Law Reports
HKCL	Hong Kong Current Law
HKCLR	Hong Kong Criminal Law Reports
HKLD	Hong Kong Law Digest
HKLR	Hong Kong Law Reports

Abbreviations

HRLJ	Human Rights Law Journal
Hare	Hare's Reports (Ch), 11 volumes; 1841–1853
Imm AR	Immigration Appeal Reports
ICR	Industrial Cases Reports; since 1975
ILR	Indian Law Reports
IR	Irish Reports; since 1893
IRLR	Industrial Relations Law Reports; since 1972
JP	Justice of the Peace; since 1837
K & J	Kay and Johnson's Reports (Ch) 4 volumes; 1853–1858
KB	Law Reports, King's Bench Division, 53 volumes; 1901–1952
LJCh	Law Journal, Chancery; 1831–1946
LJKB/QB	Law Journal, King's or Queen's Bench; 1831–1946
LRQB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench, 10 volumes; 1865–1875
Lloyd LR	Lloyd's List Law Reports; 1919–1950
Lloyd's Rep	Lloyd's List Law Reports; since 1951
M & W	Meeson and Welsby's Reports (Ex Ch), 16 volumes; 1836–1847
MLJ	Malayan Law Journal
NLJ	New Law Journal; since 1965
NZLR	New Zealand Law Reports; since 1883
NYS 2d	New York Supplement, Second Series; since 1938
OGHBZSt	Oberstes Gerichtes Hof British Zone Strafsachen (Supreme Court of the British Occupied Zone in Germany; 1945–1949)
P	Law Reports, Probate, Divorce and Admiralty Division; 1891–1971
QB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1891–1900, and since 1952
QBD	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1875–1890
RPC	Reports of Patent Cases; since 1884
SA	South African Law Reports; since 1947
SR	Reports of the High Court of Southern Rhodesia; 1911–1955
TLR	The Times Law Reports, 71 volumes; 1884–1950
TLR	The Times Law Reports; since 1951
WLR	Weekly Law Reports; since 1953
WN	Law Reports, Weekly Notes, 87 volumes; 1866–1952
WR	Weekly Reporter, 54 volumes; 1852–1906

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

The mode of citation of cases reported in this volume of *Hong Kong Cases* is [1993] 1 HKC (page).

A		Page			Page
Alfa Sea Ltd; Yeung Wah			Compagnie Europeene		
James v	[HC]	440	d'Assurances Industrielles		
Argos Engineering & Heavy			SA; TS Wong & Co Ltd v ...	[HC]	397
Industries Co Ltd & Ors;			Custodian of Victoria		
Wong Chi Shing v	[HC]	598	Immigration Centre;		
Attorney General v Lo Chak			Tolentino v	[CA]	19
Man Joseph & Ors	[HC]	548	D		
Attorney General v			De-Etco International Ltd		
Lui Kam Chi	[CA]	215	(in liquidation) v Desirable		
Attorney General v			Enterprise Co Ltd & Ors	[CA]	251
Tai Chin Wah	[CA]	1	Desirable Enterprise Co Ltd &		
B			Ors; De-Etco International		
Bank of Communications;			Ltd (in liquidation) v	[CA]	251
Peking Fur Store Ltd v	[HC]	625	Director of Immigration;		
Bentley & Anor v Parry			Wong King Lung & Ors v ...	[HC]	461
& Anor	[CA]	298	Dragages et Travaux Public		
Borsalini Trade Mark, Re	[HC]	587	v Hong Kong Chinese		
Bugatti Trade Mark, Re	[TMR]	557	Insurance Co Ltd & Anor		
C			(Multi Sky Ltd & Anor,		
CEC Finance Ltd; R v	[CA]	127	third parties)	[HC]	617
Chak Wai Man; Lam Tam Yi			E		
& Anor v	[HC]	537	Edwards; Kao Lee & Yip v	[CA]	314
Chan Choi Hung & Anor			Edwards; Kao Lee & Yip v	[HC]	366
(minors) v Immigration			Euro-America Insurance Ltd		
Tribunal	[HC]	422	v Lite Best Co Ltd	[HC]	333
Chan Choi Wah; Cheng			Express Engineering Ltd v		
Yuk Lin v	[CA]	52	Cheng Chun Ying & Anor ...	[HC]	410
Chan Chuen Kam & Ors; R v ..	[CA]	241	F		
Chan Hon Wai; R v	[HC]	531	Fong Chee Kin & Anor; R v ..	[CA]	203
Cheer Hope Investments Ltd;			Fook Gee Trading Co Ltd &		
Goldenfix Properties Ltd v ...	[HC]	360	Anor; Sun Kan Biu Nina &		
Cheng Chun Ying & Anor;			Ors v	[HC]	553
Express Engineering Ltd v ...	[HC]	410	Formking Development Ltd v		
Cheng Yuk Lin v			Lee Kwok Hung Robert	[HC]	412
Chan Choi Wah	[CA]	52	G		
Cheung Hon Yeung; R v	[CA]	26	Gee Tai Trading Co Ltd;		
China Xinxing Corp v			Sun Wah Oil & Cereals		
Mid-Point Development Ltd	[HC]	629	Ltd v	[CA]	132
Chow Po Bor & Anor v			Goldenfix Properties Ltd v		
Timothy Lee & Anor	[CA]	271	Cheer Hope Investments		
Chu Li Yuen; R v	[HC]	416	Ltd	[HC]	360
Chung Kam Fai; R v	[CA]	42	Goodtex Land Co Ltd v Lung		
			Kwong Emporium Co Ltd ...	[HC]	645

Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Grand Subject Investment Ltd v Mable Road Co Ltd & Anor [HC]	499	Lee Kwok Hung Robert; Formking Development Ltd v [HC]	412
H		Lee Ming Ching Stephen; Man Sun Finance (International) Corp v [CA]	113
Hillier Development Ltd v Tread East Ltd [CA]	285	Leung Hing; R v [HC]	479
Ho Lee Man v Wong Wai Kai [CA]	183	Leung Tin Wai & Ors; Yung Chi Kin Larry v [CA]	143
Ho Lee Man v Wong Wai Kai (No 2) [CA]	193	Leung Wing Hong; R v [HC]	353
Hong Kong Chinese Insurance Co Ltd & Anor (Multi Sky Ltd & Anor, third parties); Dragages et Travaux Public v [HC]	617	Lion Marketing Inc t/a Business Innovations v Time Concepts(Hong Kong) Ltd ... [HC]	642
Hui Yiu Fai; R v [CA]	223	Lite Best Co Ltd; Euro-America Insurance Ltd v [HC]	333
I		Lo Chak Man Joseph & Ors; Attorney General v [HC]	548
Immigration Tribunal; Chan Choi Hung & Anor (minors) v [HC]	422	Lucky-Goldstar International (HK) Ltd v Ng Moo Kee Engineering Ltd [HC]	404
Ip Ming Wai & Anor; World Ford Development Ltd v [CA]	98	Lui Kam Chi; Attorney General v [CA]	215
K		Luk Wai Kit; R v [CA]	77
Kao Lee & Yip v Edwards [CA]	314	Lung Kwong Emporium Co Ltd; Goodtex Land Co Ltd v [HC]	645
Kao Lee & Yip v Edwards [HC]	366	M	
Ki Ming Po v Yeung Wai Hong & Ors [HC]	595	Mable Road Co Ltd & Anor; Grand Subject Investment Ltd v [HC]	499
Kleinwort Benson (Hong Kong) Trustees Ltd v Wong Foon Hang & Ors [HC]	649	Mak Lai Man v Lam Siu Yui Peter [HC]	452
Kotron Industrial Ltd v Su Shun Juan & Ors [HC]	327	Man Sun Finance (International) Corp v Lee Ming Ching Stephen [CA]	113
Kwan Yam Tong; R v [CA]	276	Mid-Point Development Ltd; China Xinxing Corp v [HC]	629
L		Mita Kogyo Kabushiki Kaisha v Mitac Inc [CA]	207
Lai Arthur & Ors; Standard Charter Securities Ltd v [HC]	375	Mitac Inc; Mita Kogyo Kabushiki Kaisha v [CA]	207
Lai Hon Man; R v [CA]	219	N	
Lam King Wa & Anor; R v [CA]	83	Nanyang Credit Card Co Ltd; Ying Wei (Hop Yick) Cargo Service v [CA]	56
Lam Siu Yui Peter; Mak Lai Man v [HC]	452		
Lam Tam Yi & Anor v Chak Wai Man [HC]	537		
Lam Wing Nin & Anor; R v [HC]	670		

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
Ng Chu Fai Stephen v Tamco Electrical & Electronics (Hong Kong) Ltd (formerly t/a Newey & Eyre (HK) Ltd)..... [CA]	160	R v Wong Siu Tat [CA]	69
Ng Man Ho; R v [HC]	632	R v Wong Tim Choi [HC]	419
Ng Moo Kee Engineering Ltd; Lucky-Goldstar International (HK) Ltd v [HC]	404	R v Wong Yam Yin [HC]	429
O		R v Yuen Kwok Wing & Anor [CA]	259
Ocean Plastic Manufactory Ltd v TCA (Hong Kong) Ltd & Anor [CA]	23	S	
P		Sin Hua Bank Ltd v Sung Foo Kee Ltd [CA]	65
Pang Chun Wai; R v [CA]	233	Standard Charter Securities Ltd v Lai Arthur & Ors [HC]	375
Pang Yiu Chang John & Anor v Winstar Development Co .. [CA]	95	Su Shun Juan & Ors; Kotron Industrial Ltd v [HC]	327
Parry & Anor; Bentley & Anor v [CA]	298	Sun Kan Biu Nina & Ors v Fook Gee Trading Co Ltd & Anor [HC]	553
Peking Fur Store Ltd v Bank of Communications [HC]	625	Sun Wah Oil & Cereals Ltd v Gee Tai Trading Co Ltd [CA]	132
R		Sung Foo Kee Ltd; Sin Hua Bank Ltd v [CA]	65
R v CEC Finance Ltd [CA]	127	T	
R v Chan Chuen Kam & Ors .. [CA]	241	TCA (Hong Kong) Ltd & Anor; Ocean Plastic Manufactory Ltd v [CA]	23
R v Chan Hon Wai [HC]	531	TS Wong & Co Ltd v Compagnie Europeene d'Assurances Industrielles SA [HC]	397
R v Cheung Hon Yeung [CA]	26	Tai Chin Wah; Attorney General v [CA]	1
R v Chu Li Yuen [HC]	416	Tai Hsiuo Ming; Tao Chen Pi O v [CA]	279
R v Chung Kam Fai [CA]	42	Tamco Electrical & Electronics (Hong Kong) Ltd (formerly t/a Newey & Eyre (HK) Ltd); Ng Chu Fai Stephen v [CA]	160
R v Fong Chee Kin & Anor ... [CA]	203	Tang Tat Chi; Wong Wai Ming v [HC]	341
R v Hui Yiu Fai [CA]	223	Tao Chen Pi O v Tai Hsiuo Ming [CA]	279
R v Kwan Yam Tong [CA]	276	Time Concepts (Hong Kong) Ltd; Lion Marketing Inc t/a Business Innovations v [HC]	642
R v Lai Hon Man [CA]	219	Timothy Lee & Anor; Chow Po Bor & Anor v [CA]	271
R v Lam King Wa & Anor [CA]	83	To Chark Wah & Anor; Wong Yiu Ming v [DC]	510
R v Lam Wing Nin & Anor [HC]	670		
R v Leung Hing [HC]	479		
R v Leung Wing Hong [HC]	353		
R v Luk Wai Kit [CA]	77		
R v Ng Man Ho [HC]	632		
R v Pang Chun Wai [CA]	233		
R v Tsang Yip Fong [CA]	308		
R v Wong Man [CA]	80		
R v Wong Po Wing [CA]	230		

Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Tolentino v Custodian of Victoria Immigration Centre [CA]	19	Wong Wai Kai (No 2); Ho Lee Man v [CA]	193
Tread East Ltd; Hillier Development Ltd v [CA]	285	Wong Wai Kai; Ho Lee Man v [CA]	183
Tsang Yip Fong; R v [CA]	308	Wong Wai Ming v Tang Tat Chi [HC]	341
Tse Shek To & Ors; Yip Lung Kong v [DC]	542	Wong Yam Yin; R v [HC]	429
W		Wong Yiu Ming v To Chark Wah & Anor [DC]	510
Winster Development Co; Pang Yiu Chang John & Anor v [CA]	95	World Ford Development Ltd v Ip Ming Wai & Anor [CA]	98
Wong Chi Shing v Argos Engineering & Heavy Industries Co Ltd & Ors [HC]	598	Y	
Wong Chiu Ming; Wong Lai Suk Chun v [DC]	522	Yasaki International Co Ltd, Re [HC]	349
Wong Foon Hang & Ors; Kleinwort Benson (Hong Kong) Trustees Ltd v [HC]	649	Yeung Wah James v Alfa Sea Ltd [HC]	440
Wong King Lung & Ors v Director of Immigration [HC]	461	Yeung Wai Hong & Ors; Ki Ming Po v [HC]	595
Wong Lai Suk Chun v Wong Chiu Ming [DC]	522	Ying Wei (Hop Yick) Cargo Service v Nanyang Credit Card Co Ltd [CA]	56
Wong Man; R v [CA]	80	Yip Lung Kong v Tse Shek To & Ors [DC]	542
Wong Po Wing; R v [CA]	230	Yuen Kwok Wing & Anor; R v [CA]	259
Wong Siu Tat; R v [CA]	69	Yung Chi Kin Larry v Leung Tin Wai & Ors [CA]	143
Wong Tim Choi; R v [HC]	419		

SUBJECT INDEX

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Habeas corpus

Illegal detention – Immigration offence – Refusal by Director of Immigration to release applicant on recognizance following removal order – Whether Director took into account irrelevant considerations – Interests of justice

Tolentino v Custodian of Victoria Immigration Centre CA 19

Judicial review

Rules of natural justice – Probative evidence – Duty on adjudicator to base his decision only on evidence which has probative value – Duty to allow person before inquiry opportunity to adduce probative evidence in his favour – Duty to allow cross-examination of witnesses whose evidence adjudicator tended to disbelieve – Duty of adjudicators to indicate with clarity in their decisions their views of evidence adduced

Chan Choi Hung & Anor (minors) v Immigration Tribunal HC 422

AGENCY

Representation by agent

Negligent misrepresentation – Breach of warranty of authority – Damages

Grand Subject Investment Ltd v Mable Road Co Ltd & Anor HC 499

ARBITRATION

Commencement

Extension of time for commencing arbitration – Arbitration clause in *Scott v Avery* form – Insurers disclaiming liability – When time for commencing arbitration starts to run – Whether delay in commencing arbitration significant – Prejudice to defendants

TS Wong & Co Ltd v Compagnie Europeene d'Assurances Industrielles SA
HC 397

Domestic

Application to extend time for commencing arbitration – Whether court to take into account contract sum and plaintiffs' paid up capital – Arbitration Ordinance s 29

TS Wong & Co Ltd v Compagnie Europeene d'Assurances Industrielles SA
HC 397

Enforcement of award

Application to set aside – No evidence filed by applicant – Abuse of process – Indemnity costs

China Xinxing Corp v Mid-Point Development Ltd HC 629

Stay of proceedings

International – Reference in arbitration agreement to rules of nonexistent arbitration association – Whether arbitration agreement is null and void, inoperative or incapable of being performed – Model Law art 8

Lucky-Goldstar International (HK) Ltd v Ng Moo Kee Engineering Ltd
HC 404

Whether any steps had been taken in proceedings – Whether applicant had been ready and willing to do all things necessary to the proper conduct of the arbitration – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 6
Euro-America Insurance Ltd v Lite Best Co Ltd HC 333

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Abuse of process

Possession of land – Whether two sets of proceedings in existence claiming possession of these premises was an abuse of process – Drug Trafficking (Recovery of Proceeds) Ordinance (Cap 405) – Drug Trafficking (Recovery of Proceeds) (Designated Countries and Territories) Order – Rules of the Supreme Court O 113
Attorney General v Lo Chak Man Joseph & Ors HC 548

Anton Piller order

Ex parte application – Relevant principles
Ng Chun Fai Stephen v Tamco Electrical & Electronics (Hong Kong) Ltd (formerly t/a Newey & Eyre (HK) Ltd) CA 160

Suspension, variation or discharge – Risk of contempt of court – Oral application to suspend the operation of certain parts of the order with no evidence in support of application – Oppressive, unreasonable and unjustified order – Mandatory orders set aside
Ng Chun Fai Stephen v Tamco Electrical & Electronics (Hong Kong) Ltd (formerly t/a Newey & Eyre (HK) Ltd) CA 160

Appeal

Admission of fresh evidence – Appellant seeking to admit evidence in conflict with evidence heard at first instance – Grounds on which court will exercise its discretion to admit such evidence – Rules of the Supreme Court O 59 r 10
Ocean Plastic Manufactory Ltd v TCA (Hong Kong) Ltd & Anor CA 23

Appeal from decision of Registrar of Trade Marks – Extension of time for filing of appeal – Whether s 79(1)(c) of Trade Marks Ordinance (Cap 43) or s 14(1) of Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) governs appeal procedure – Supreme Court Rules O 3 r 5(1) & O 59 r 14(1)
Mita Kogyo Kabushiki Kaisha v Mitac Inc CA 207

Application for judicial review dismissed – Order ‘given or made’ when pronounced – Jurisdiction – Whether appeal incompetent – Supreme Court (Amendment) Ordinance 1993 (No 2 of 1993) ss 2 & 14A – Rules of the Supreme Court O 42 r 3
Chow Po Bor & Anor v Timothy Lee & Anor CA 271

Costs – Scherer principle — Requirement of leave to appeal – Applicability of the *Scherer* principle to Hong Kong – Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) s 14(3)(e)
Ho Lee Man v Wong Wai Kai CA 183

Costs

Jurisdiction of Master – Counterclaim of action falling within District Court's monetary jurisdiction – Applicability of District Court Ordinance – District Court Ordinance (Cap 336) s 43(2)

Express Engineering Ltd v Cheng Chun Ying & Anor HC 410

Personal liability of solicitor for costs – Principles for ordering solicitor to bear cost personally – Rules of the Supreme Court O 62 r 8

Ho Lee Man v Wong Wai Kai (No 2) CA 193

Discovery

Implied undertaking not to use discovered document for a collateral or ulterior purpose – Whether leave of court is required for defendant to raise a cause of action by way of counterclaim

Bentley & Anor v Parry & Anor CA 298

Mareva injunction

Application for discharge – Full and frank disclosure – Duty of disclosure of applicant – Whether material non-disclosure – Whether real risk of dissipation – Whether should grant order against third party – Whether third parties nominees of defendants – Whether to grant fresh application

Standard Charter Securities Ltd v Lai Arthur & Ors HC 375

Pleadings

Cause of action pleaded limited to breach of covenant of quiet enjoyment – Whether plaintiff can obtain remedy for tort of trespass if not specifically pleaded

Yeung Wah James v Alfa Sea Ltd HC 440

Purpose – Failure to raise issue which could have been raised – Application for leave to amend defence at late stage refused

Wong Chi Shing v Argos Engineering & Heavy Industries Co Ltd & Ors HC 598

Security for costs

Whether defendant a nominal plaintiff – Whether order for security will stifle its counterclaim – Factors to be taken in account in exercising the discretion – Whether permissible for the court to order a smaller sum of security than that claimed by the plaintiff – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 357 – Rules of the Supreme Court O 23 r 1(b)

Dragages et Travaux Public v Hong Kong Chinese Insurance Co Ltd & Anor (Multi Sky Ltd & Anor, third parties) HC 617

Summary judgment

Arguable defence – Action for conversion – Whether delivery of goods to party claiming copyright in goods an arguable defence to claim in conversion – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14 – Copyright Act 1956 [UK] s 18

Lion Marketing Inc t/a Business Innovations v Time Concepts (Hong Kong) Ltd HC 642

Whether triable issue raised – Triability depending on evidence – Approach of appellate court

Sin Hua Bank Ltd v Sung Foo Kee Ltd CA 65

Summary order for account

Appropriateness of process – Rules of the Supreme Court O 43

Ho Lee Man v Wong Wai Kai CA 183

Summary procedure

Volume of evidence and background issues to be determined – Summary procedure under r 27 of District Court (Civil Procedure) Rules not appropriate

Pang Yiu Chang John & Anor v Winster Development Co CA 95

COMPANIES AND CORPORATIONS

Company meeting

Court order for meeting to be held – Whether court's discretion wrongly exercised in ordering meeting – Whether applicant beneficial owner of shares – Cross-examination as to beneficial ownership disallowed – Whether injustice to respondent – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 114B

Cheng Yuk Lin v Chan Choi Wah CA 52

Liquidation

Settlement – Costs against the Official Liquidator – Whether wrong in principle – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 199

De-Itco International Ltd (in liquidation) v Desirable Enterprise Co Ltd & Ors CA 251

CONTRACT

Exemption clause

Construction – 'Not damage claim' – No mention of negligence in clause – Whether wide enough to cover negligence – Whether damage could be based on ground other than negligence – Whether nature of negligence relevant – Damage to computer equipment during hoisting operation

Ying Wei (Hop Yick) Cargo Service v Nanyang Credit Card Co Ltd CA 56

Construction – 'Not damage claim' – Whether effective against liability in bailment – Damage to computer equipment during hoisting operation

Ying Wei (Hop Yick) Cargo Service v Nanyang Credit Card Co Ltd CA 56

Formation

Whether contract concluded – Telex exchange between the parties

Sun Wah Oil & Cereals Ltd v Gee Tai Trading Co Ltd CA 132

Repudiation

Sale and purchase of land – Whether contract repudiated by purchaser's

refusal to sign formal sale and purchase agreement – Forfeiture of deposit by the seller – Specific performance of contract of sale and purchase of land
Mak Lai Man v Lam Siu Yui Peter HC 452

Sale of land

Provisional agreement – Provision for execution of formal agreement – Vendor's payment of double deposit – Whether time of the essence in equity – Whether time of the essence under the provisional agreement – Observations on the nature of provisional agreement

Man Sun Finance (International) Corp v Lee Ming Ching Stephen CA 113

Terms

Meaningless term – Whether severable from contract – Validity of agreement
Sun Wah Oil & Cereals Ltd v Gee Tai Trading Co Ltd CA 132

CRIMINAL LAW AND PROCEDURE

Accepting an advantage as an agent

Ingredients of offence – What amounts to an advantage – Whether defendant acting as agent – Causal link between payment and favour – Defendant's state of mind

R v Ng Man Ho HC 632

Blackmail

Unwarranted demand with menaces – Menace made to a third party and never communicated to the intended victim – Whether sufficient to establish blackmail of that intended victim

R v Tsang Yip Fong CA 308

Broadhurst direction

Finding of lies by witness – Whether direction should have been given

R v Fong Chee Kin & Anor CA 203

Lies told by defendant – Direction to jury – Whether *Broadhurst* direction needed where Crown does not rely on evidence of defendant's lies

R v Yuen Kwok Wing & Anor CA 259

Confession

Direction to jury – Whether jury should be directed specifically to look at oppressive treatment in assessing reliability

R v Yuen Kwok Wing & Anor CA 259

Statement relating to more than one count – Whether conviction on one count inconsistent with acquittal on another count

R v Yuen Kwok Wing & Anor CA 259

Contempt

Contempt of court by media

Attorney General v Tai Chin Wah CA 1

Conviction

Setting aside – Conviction based on testimony of witnesses – Judge's belief in the veracity of witnesses – Whether justified

R v Kwan Yam Tong CA 276

Credibility

Good character – Whether there was a material misdirection as to relevance of good character to credibility – Effect of omission to do so

R v Chan Chuen Kam & Ors CA 241

Direction to jury

Character of accused – Necessary both on credibility and propensity

R v Lai Hon Man CA 219

Provocation – Use of standard directions preferred

R v Lai Hon Man CA 219

Disclosure

Duty on prosecution to disclose relevant material – Whether late disclosure crucial – Whether conviction unsafe and unsatisfactory

R v Wong Siu Tat CA 69

Evidence

Cautioned statement – Defendant acquitted of some counts referred to in the cautioned statement but convicted of other counts referred to in the same cautioned statement – Whether conviction unsafe and unsatisfactory in light of evidential weight accorded to cautioned statement by jury

R v Pang Chun Wai CA 233

Forfeiture

Discretion of court – Import and Export Ordinance (Cap 60) s 28(7)

R v CEC Finance Ltd CA 127

Gambling

Burden of proof as to lawful gambling – Test of social occasion – Whether food and drinks purchased from common fund contributed by winners amount to private gain – Meaning of 'operator'

R v Leung Hing HC 479

Identification of defendant

Direction to jury – Whether specific direction necessary as respects physical disability of defendant

R v Yuen Kwok Wing & Anor CA 259

Murder

Broadhurst direction – Direction as to confession statements of accused

R v Lam King Wa & Anor CA 83

Provocation – Burden of proof

R v Lai Hon Man CA 219

Plea

Withdrawal – Sentence already passed – Whether defendant misled as to seriousness of offences – Magistrate's failure to investigate basis for withdrawal of plea – Immigration Ordinance (Cap 115) s 42

R v Chu Li Yuen HC 416

Robbery

Recent possession – Direction to jury – Whether necessary to follow verbatim direction found in precedents – Whether sufficient to use words to similar effect

R v Yuen Kwok Wing & Anor CA 259

Sentence

Burglary of domestic premises – Multiplicity of offences – Whether sentence 'manifestly excessive'

R v Luk Wai Kit CA 77

Review of sentence – Ex parte leave to apply for review of sentence – Duty of Attorney General – Delay in filing the application for review – Review of ex parte leave by Court of Appeal – Criminal Procedure Ordinance (Cap 221) s 81A

Attorney General v Tai Chin Wah CA 1

Robbery – Life imprisonment – Criteria – Theft Ordinance (Cap 210) s 10 – Firearms and Ammunition Ordinance s 17(2)

R v Pang Chun Wai CA 233

Trafficking by importation – Evidence in mitigation – Whether trial judge should have indicated that mitigation was not accepted – Evidence in support of mitigation not called – *Newton* enquiry should have been held – Use of drugs for personal consumption

R v Chung Kam Fai CA 42

Sentencing

Burglary – Non-domestic premises – Multiple count – Guilt plea – Offences committed with considerable planning and efficiently executed – Applicant obtained keys in his capacity as employee for use in the offence – Whether an aggravating factor

R v Wong Man CA 80

Discount – Enhancement of sentence after application for review – Enhancement by substituting consecutive sentences in lieu of concurrent sentences

Attorney General v Lui Kam Chi CA 215

Disqualification from holding or obtaining a driving licence – Driving only means of livelihood – Road Traffic Ordinance (Cap 374) s 69(1)(d)

R v Wong Po Wing CA 230

Forgery – False professional qualifications – Continuing deception – Gravity of offences – Appropriateness of suspended sentence

Attorney General v Tai Chin Wah CA 1