

HONG KONG CASES

1993

Volume 2

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Butterworths Asia

Singapore • Kuala Lumpur • Hong Kong

The Butterworth Group of Companies

Singapore	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01 International Plaza, Singapore 0207
Hong Kong	19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 9651400 Fax: 9760840
Malaysia	MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur
Australia	BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra
Canada	BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver
Ireland	BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin
New Zealand	BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland
Puerto Rico	BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan
UK	BUTTERWORTH & CO (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh
USA	BUTTERWORTH LEGAL PUBLISHERS Salem, New Hampshire and Carlsbad, California
Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed International (Singapore) Pte Ltd.	

© Butterworths Asia, 1994

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

ISBN 0-409-99727-7

Typeset by: Butterworths Asia and Superskill Graphics
Produced in Hong Kong by Mandarin Offset

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Associate Editors

Grenville Cross QC

Ruy Barretto, Barrister

Michael Ozorio, Barrister

Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister

Susan Kwan, Barrister

Peter Garland, Barrister

Malcolm Merry, Barrister

Aarif Barma, Barrister

Andrew Cheung, Barrister

Peter Ng, Barrister

Joseph Fok, Barrister

Anderson Chow, Barrister

Teresa Cheng, Barrister

David Fitzpatrick, Barrister

Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister

Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University

Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

Reporters in this volume

Danny Choi, Barrister

George F Chu, Barrister

Simon CK Chui, Barrister

Anne-Marie Gordon, Barrister

Paul Harris, Barrister

MJ Kenny, Barrister

Gary Kwan, Barrister

Christopher Lam, Barrister

Godfrey Lam, Barrister

Osmond Lam, Barrister

Raymond Lau Wai Man, Barrister

Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister

Raymond Leung, Barrister

PY Lo, Barrister

Lawrence Ng

Raymond Tsui Wai Nam, Barrister

Daniel Wan, Barrister

Anthony P Kinnear

Butterworths Asia

Managing Editor: Anthony P Kinnear

Senior Editor, Reports: Zarinah Marican

Publisher: David Catterall

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

List of abbreviations used in this volume (excluding reports):

A	High Court Action
ACJ	Acting Chief Justice
A-G	Attorney General
AR	Application for Review
App	Appendix
art	article
Aust	Australia
CA	Court of Appeal
CA	Civil Appeal Number in references to unreported cases (eg CA 2/92)
CJ	Chief Justice
Can	Canada
Cap	Chapter (as in Chapter Number of an Ordinance)
Crim App	Criminal Appeal
Comm L	Commercial List
ch	chapter (as in chapter number of a book)
cl(l)	clause(s)
DC	District Court
DCA	District Court Action
DJ	District Judge
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
EC	European Communities
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities
EEC	European Economic Communities
Ed	Edition
Ex Ch	Court of Exchequer Chamber
exh	exhibit
HC	High Court
HL	House of Lords
Ind	India
J(J)	Justice(s)
J(J)A	Justice(s) of Appeal
LTA	Labour Tribunal Appeal
LC	Lord Chancellor
MA	Magistracy Appeal
MCA	Magistracy Criminal Appeal
MP	Miscellaneous Proceedings
MR	Master of the Rolls
n	note
NZ	New Zealand
O	Order (of the Rules of the Supreme Court)
PC	Privy Council
PCA	Privy Council Appeal
Pt	Part
para	paragraph

Abbreviations

RSC	Rules of the Supreme Court
r(r)	rule(s)
reg	regulation
s	section
sub-s	subsection
Sch	Schedule
TMR	Trade Marks Registry
UN	United Nations
Uncitral	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
VP(P)	Vice-President(s)

List of abbreviations of law reports:

A Crim R	Australian Criminal Reports; since 1979
AC	Law Reports, Appeal Cases (HL and PC); since 1890
ALR	Australian Law Reports
ALJR	Australian Journal Law Reports
All ER	All England Law Reports; since 1936
App Cas	Law Reports, Appeal Cases, House of Lords, 15 volumes; 1875–1890
BCC	British Company Law Cases; since 1983
BCLC	Butterworths Company Law Cases; since 1978
CB(NS)	Common Bench Reports, New Series, 20 volumes; 1856–1865
CCC (3d)	Canadian Criminal Cases, Annotated (Third Series); since 1983
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports; since 1903
Camp	Campbell's Reports, Nisi Prius, 4 vols; 1807–1816
Car & K	Carrington & Kirwan's Reports, Nisi Prius, 3 vols; 1843–1853
Car & P	Carrington and Payne's Reports, Nisi Prius, 9 volumes; 1823–1841
Cox CC	EW Cox's Criminal Law Cases, 31 volumes; 1843–1941
Ch	Law Reports, Chancery Division; since 1890
Ch App	Law Reports, Chancery Appeals, 10 volumes; 1865–1875
Ch D	Law Reports, Chancery Division, 45 volumes; 1875–1890
Cr App R	Criminal Appeal Reports (HL and CA(UK)); since 1908
Cr App R (S)	Criminal Appeal Reports (Sentencing); since 1979
Crim LR	Criminal Law Review; since 1954
DLR	Dominion Law Reports
EGD	Estate Gazette Digest of Cases; since 1902
ER	English Reports, 178 volumes; 1220–1865
FSR	Fleet Street Reports; since 1975

Hong Kong Cases

Fam	Law Reports, Family Division; since 1972
HKCL	Hong Kong Current Law
HKCLR	Hong Kong Criminal Law Reports
HKLD	Hong Kong Law Digest
HKLR	Hong Kong Law Reports
HKLJ	Hong Kong Law Journal
HLR	Housing Law Reports
ICR	Industrial Cases Reports; since 1975
IR	Irish Reports; since 1893
IRLR	Industrial Relations Law Reports; since 1972
JP	Justice of the Peace; since 1837
KB	Law Reports, King's Bench Division, 53 volumes; 1901–1952
KIR	Knight's Industrial Reports; since 1966
LJCh	Law Journal, Chancery; 1831–1946
LJKB/QB	Law Journal, King's or Queen's Bench; 1831–1946
LR HL	Law Reports, English and Irish Peerage Claims, House of Lords, 7 volumes; 1866–1875
LRQB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench, 10 volumes; 1865–1875
Lew CC	Lewin's Crown Cases on the Northern Circuit, 2 volumes; 1822–1838
Lloyd LR	Lloyd's List Law Reports; 1919–1950
Lloyd's Rep	Lloyd's List Law Reports; since 1951
MLJ	Malayan Law Journal
NLJ	New Law Journal; since 1965
NSWLR	New South Wales Law Reports; since 1971
NZLR	New Zealand Law Reports; since 1883
P	Law Reports, Probate, Divorce and Admiralty Division; 1891–1971
QB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1891–1900, and since 1952
QBD	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1875–1890
RPC	Reports of Patent Cases; since 1884
RTR	Road Traffic Reports; since 1970
SC	Court of Sessions Cases (Scotland); since 1906
SJ	Solicitors Journal
SLT	Scots Law Times; since 1893
SR	Reports of the High Court of Southern Rhodesia; 1911–1955
Sim (NS)	Simon's Reports, Chancery, New Series, 2 volumes; 1850–1852
TLR	The Times Law Reports, 71 volumes; 1884–1950
TLR	The Times Law Reports; since 1951
US	United States Reports
VLJR	Victorian Law Reports
VR	Victorian Reports; 1870–1872 and since 1957
WLR	Weekly Law Reports; since 1953
WN	Law Reports, Weekly Notes, 87 volumes; 1866–1952
WR	Weekly Reporter, 54 volumes; 1852–1906

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

The mode of citation of cases reported in this volume of *Hong Kong Cases* is [1993] 2 HKC (page).

	Page		Page
A			
Acker Trading Ltd; Sharp		Chan Ming Man; Attorney	
Kabushiki Kaisha v [HC]	490	General v [CA]	230
Alabama Investment Co Ltd v		Chan Tak Ming; Chow Chiu	
Chaintext Co Ltd & Anor [CA]	295	Tai v [HC]	582
Asia Television Ltd;		Chang Ka Pio v Niceson	
Hutchvision Asia Ltd v [HC]	510	Investment Ltd [HC]	393
Attorney General v Chan		Chau Wai Keung & Anor;	
Ming Man [CA]	230	R v [CA]	332
Attorney General v Covo		Cheng Cheuk Ming; R v [HC]	537
Knitters Ltd [HC]	571	Cheng Yun Sing & Ors; Ho	
Attorney General v Hui Shu		Sai Chu & Anor v [HC]	506
Sang [HC]	526	Cheong Oi Sum Ader;	
Attorney General v Lam		Lee Leo v [DC]	736
Sau Ki [CA]	330	Cheung Kai Wing v Mok	
Attorney General v Lau Chi		Sheung Shum t/a Mok	
Yung & Anor [CA]	63	Sum Kee & Anor (Tugu	
Attorney General v Wan		Insurance Co Ltd,	
Wing Tak [CA]	234	third party) [CA]	113
Attorney General; Cinat		China Light & Power Co Ltd	
Co Ltd v [CA]	280	& Ors v Wong To Sau	
Au Shui Yuen Alick; R v [CA]	219	Heung & Ors [CA]	238
Au Yeung Chi Kwan; R v [CA]	134	Chiu Heung Wah; R v [CA]	209
B		Chong Lai Fee & Anor;	
Beautiglory Investment Ltd v		Hendrarsin & Ors v [CA]	243
Tang Yet Tai Tong & Ors [HC]	591	Chow Chi Hing; R v [CA]	214
Brasimet Comercio E		Chow Chiu Tai v Chan	
Industria SA & Ors; Tung		Tak Ming [HC]	582
Wing Steel Co Ltd v [CA]	249	Chu Kong Agency Co Ltd	
C		& Anor; William Co v [HC]	377
Camaclang v Schleiter		Chua Michael & Anor; R v [CA]	35
& Ors [CA]	353	Cinat Co Ltd v Attorney	
Capacious Investment Ltd;		General [CA]	280
Tang Wing Hong Alan		Commodore Electronics Ltd;	
(Personal Representative of		Taiwan Via Versand Ltd v ... [HC]	650
the Estate of Tang Man Sit,		Covo Knitters Ltd; Attorney	
deceased) v [HC]	416	General v [HC]	571
Cargill Hong Kong Ltd v		D	
Hoecheong Products		DH Shuttlecocks Ltd v	
Co Ltd [CA]	103	Keung Shiu Tang [HC]	600
Chaintext Co Ltd & Anor;		Dei Chuen Ho Industrial Ltd	
Alabama Investment		v Leung Yin Por & Anor [HC]	495
Co Ltd v [CA]	295	Dr Lam Tai Hing v Dr Koo Chih	
		Ling Linda & Anor [CA]	1

Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Dr Koo Chih Ling Linda & Anor; Dr Lam Tai Hing v [CA]	1	Hong Kong Dongil Trading Co Ltd; Korea Building Materials Trading Corp v [HC]	423
E		Hui Shu Sang; Attorney General v [HC]	526
Euro-America Insurance Ltd v Speedbird Tours Ltd [HC]	552	Hutchvision Asia Ltd v Asia Television Ltd [HC]	510
Ever Eagle Co Ltd v Kincheng Banking Corp [CA]	157	I	
F		International Merona Ltd; Technalloy Chemical Corp v [CA]	94
Fok Kau; R v [CA]	276	J	
Four Seas Industrial Co Ltd v Sheen Long Industries Ltd ... [HC]	706	JA Moeller (Hong Kong) Ltd & Anor; Jialing (Hong Kong) Co Ltd v [HC]	637
Freeman Holdings Ltd; Obscene Articles Tribunal & Anor v [CA]	300	Jeuro Container Transport (HK) Ltd & Anor; He-ro Chemicals Ltd v [HC]	368
Fung Law & Ng & Ors; Tong Yi Sang & Anor v [HC]	665	Jialing (Hong Kong) Co Ltd v JA Moeller (Hong Kong) Ltd & Anor [HC]	637
H		K	
HB Electronics Ltd v Telemate Telesystems Inc [CA]	47	Kent v Mak Kit Man [HC]	673
He-ro Chemicals Ltd v Jeuro Container Transport (HK) Ltd & Anor [HC]	368	Keung Shiu Tang; DH Shuttlecocks Ltd v [HC]	600
Hendrarsin & Ors v Chong Lai Fee & Anor [CA]	243	Kincheng Banking Corp; Ever Eagle Co Ltd v [CA]	157
Hill & Delamain (Hong Kong) Ltd; Manohar t/a Vinamito Trading House v [CA]	342	Korea Building Materials Trading Corp v Hong Kong Dongil Trading Co Ltd [HC]	423
Hiroyuki; R v [CA]	327	L	
Ho Chan Yuet Lan & Anor; Yuen Tam Wan v [CA]	66	Lai Kam Hon & Anor; Yuen Kong Ling Cana & Anor v [HC]	728
Ho Nga Sheung v Ma Fook Leung [HC]	647	Lai Lam Hing; R v [HC]	723
Ho Sai Chu & Anor v Cheng Yun Sing & Ors [HC]	506	Lam Fung Ying v Ho Tung Sing & Anor [CA]	28
Ho Sau Ling Fanny & Anor; Leung Lai Ha & Anor v [HC]	476	Lam Fung Ying v Ho Tung Sing & Anor [HC]	436
Ho Tung Sing & Anor; Lam Fung Ying v [CA]	28	Lam Sau Ki; Attorney General v [CA]	330
Ho Tung Sing & Anor; Lam Fung Ying v [HC]	436	Lam Wai Keung; R v [CA]	162
Ho Wai Ling Rebecca; Sae Jung Jongthai v [HC]	545	Lam Yuet Siu; R v [CA]	272
Hoecheong Products Co Ltd; Cargill Hong Kong Ltd v [CA]	103		

Hong Kong Cases

	Page
Lau Chi Yung & Anor; Attorney General v	[CA] 63
Lau Fat Wai & Anor; R v	[HC] 542
Lau Hon Man & Ors; So John & Anor v	[CA] 356
Lau Kwong Kun; Law Chee Sing v	[CA] 201
Law Chee Sing v Lau Kwong Kun	[CA] 201
Lee Leo v Cheong Oi Sum Ader	[DC] 736
Leung Lai Ha & Anor v Ho Sau Ling Fanny & Anor	[HC] 476
Leung Lam Tung; R v	[HC] 432
Leung Yin Por & Anor; Dei Chuen Ho Industrial Ltd v	[HC] 495
Li Chun Yam; Wan Hung Shu t/a Paris Wan's Co v	[HC] 714
Lifton Investment Ltd; Pang Chor Ying Annie v	[CA] 57
Liu Ping Kin; R v	[CA] 192
Lo Hing Wai; R v	[HC] 623
Luc Thiet Thuan & Ors; R v ..	[CA] 177
Lucky Time Finance Co Ltd; Rich Circle Co Ltd v	[HC] 429
M	
Ma Fook Leung; Ho Nga Sheung v	[HC] 647
Mahkutai, The	[CA] 71
Mak Kit Man; Kent v	[HC] 673
Man Hung Pui; R v	[CA] 174
Man Ming Hing; R v	[HC] 522
Manohar t/a Vinamito Trading House v Hill & Delamain (Hong Kong) Ltd	[CA] 342
Many Wise Investments Ltd v Tech Profit Development Ltd	[HC] 517
Mediavision Ltd, Re	[HC] 629
Mok Sheung Shum t/a Mok Sum Kee & Anor (Tugu Insurance Co Ltd,	

	Page
third party); Cheung Kai Wing v	[CA] 113
N	
Ng Chun Keung; R v	[CA] 171
Ng Kin Yee; R v	[CA] 148
Ng Kit Yuen; R v	[CA] 364
Niceson Investment Ltd; Chang Ka Pio v	[HC] 393
O	
Obscene Articles Tribunal & Anor v Freeman Holdings Ltd	[CA] 300
P	
Pang Chor Ying Annie v Lifton Investment Ltd	[CA] 57
R	
R v Au Shui Yuen Alick	[CA] 219
R v Au Yeung Chi Kwan	[CA] 134
R v Chau Wai Keung & Anor ..	[CA] 332
R v Cheng Cheuk Ming	[HC] 537
R v Chiu Heung Wah	[CA] 209
R v Chow Chi Hing	[CA] 214
R v Chua Michael & Anor	[CA] 35
R v Fok Kau	[CA] 276
R v Hiroyuki	[CA] 327
R v Lai Lam Hing	[HC] 723
R v Lam Wai Keung	[CA] 162
R v Lam Yuet Siu	[CA] 272
R v Lau Fat Wai & Anor	[HC] 542
R v Leung Lam Tung	[HC] 432
R v Liu Ping Kin	[CA] 192
R v Lo Hing Wai	[HC] 623
R v Luc Thiet Thuan & Ors ...	[CA] 177
R v Man Hung Pui	[CA] 174
R v Man Ming Hing	[HC] 522
R v Ng Chun Keung	[CA] 171
R v Ng Kin Yee	[CA] 148
R v Ng Kit Yuen	[CA] 364
R v Sime Darby Property Services Ltd	[HC] 485
R v Siu Yin King	[CA] 254

Cases Reported

	Page		Page
R v Tsui Wai Ping [HC]	675	Electronics Ltd [HC]	650
R v Wan Yiu Ling [HC]	688	Tang Wing Hong Alan (Personal Representative of the Estate of Tang Man Sit, deceased) v Capacious Investment Ltd [HC]	416
R v Wong Kam Chiu [HC]	700	Tang Yet Tai Tong & Ors; Beautiglory Investment Ltd v [HC]	591
R v Wong Kim Wah & Anor [CA]	305	Tech Profit Development Ltd; Many Wise Investments Ltd v [HC]	517
R v Wong Lee [CA]	264	Technalloy Chemical Corp v International Merona Ltd [CA]	94
R v Wu Man Hon & Ors [CA]	267	Telemate Telesystems Inc; HB Electronics Ltd v [CA]	47
R v Yeung Kwan Ming & Ors [HC]	662	Tillemont Shipping Corp Sa & Anor v Taitexma Enterprise Corp & Ors [CA]	129
R v Yeung Tak Sing & Anor [HC]	656	Tong Yi Sang & Anor v Fung Law & Ng & Ors [HC]	665
R v Yip Kam Fai & Anor [CA]	196	Tsang Iu Hung v Tsang Tak Wah & Anor [HC]	471
R v Yiu Ka Yin [CA]	313	Tsang Tak Wah & Anor; Tsang Iu Hung v [HC]	471
Rich Circle Co Ltd v Lucky Time Finance Co Ltd [HC]	429	Tsui Wai Ping; R v [HC]	675
Roseric Ltd v West River Development (Chan Lau & Wai (a firm), third party) [HC]	404	Tung Wing Steel Co Ltd v Brasimet Comercio E Industria SA & Ors [CA]	249
S		U	
Sae Jung Jongthai v Ho Wai Ling Rebecca [HC]	545	UBC (Construction) Ltd v Sung Foo Kee Ltd [HC]	458
Schleiter & Ors; Camaclang v [CA]	353	W	
Sharp Kabushiki Kaisha v Acker Trading Ltd [HC]	490	Wan Hung Shu t/a Paris Wan's Co v Li Chun Yam ... [HC]	714
Sheen Long Industries Ltd; Four Seas Industrial Co Ltd v [HC]	700	Wan Wing Tak; Attorney General v [CA]	234
Sime Darby Property Services Ltd; R v [HC]	485	Wan Yiu Ling; R v [HC]	688
Siu Yin King; R v [CA]	254	West River Development (Chan Lau & Wai (a firm), third party); Roseric Ltd v [HC]	404
So John & Anor v Lau Hon Man & Ors [CA]	356	William Co v Chu Kong Agency Co Ltd & Anor [HC]	377
Speedbird Tours Ltd; Euro- America Insurance Ltd v [HC]	552	Wong Kam Chiu; R v [HC]	700
Sung Foo Kee Ltd; UBC (Construction) Ltd v [HC]	458		
T			
Taitexma Enterprise Corp & Ors; Tillemont Shipping Corp Sa & Anor v [CA]	129		
Taiwan Via Versand Ltd v Commodore			

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
Wong Kim Wah		Y	
& Anor; R v [CA]	305	Yeung Kwan Ming	
Wong Lee; R v [CA]	264	& Ors; R v [HC]	662
Wong To Sau Heung &		Yeung Tak Sing &	
Ors; China Light &		Anor; R v [HC]	656
Power Co Ltd & Ors v [CA]	238	Yip Kam Fai & Anor; R v [CA]	196
Wu Kit Ping t/a Lee		Yiu Ka Yin; R v [CA]	313
Yuen Electrical Co. Re.		Yuen Kong Ling Cana &	
ex p Golam Electrical		Anor v Lai Kam Hon	
Co Ltd [HC]	614	& Anor [HC]	728
Wu Man Hon		Yuen Tam Wan v Ho Chan	
& Ors; R v [CA]	267	Yuet Lan & Anor [CA]	66

SUBJECT INDEX

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Judicial review

Ultra vires – Declaration – Certiorari – Mandamus – Whether building authority's disapproval void and of no legal effect

Cinat Co Ltd v Attorney General CA 280

AGENCY

Undisclosed principal

Whether agent can bring action in own name – Whether undisclosed principal can be joined as a plaintiff

Cargill Hong Kong Ltd v Hoecheong Products Co Ltd CA 103

ARBITRATION

Agreement

Agreement providing for either arbitration or litigation – Whether arbitration agreement void for uncertainty – Effect of Hague-Visby Rules on contractual exemption and limitation clauses – Whether application of Hague-Visby Rules precludes stay – Uncitral Model Law, arts 7 & 8

William Co v Chu Kong Agency Co Ltd & Anor HC 377

Record of agreement in contemporaneous correspondence within art 7(1) of Model Law – Whether such contemporaneous correspondence showed agreement to arbitrate – Whether correspondence which is post-dated can be a record of agreement – Uncitral Model Law art 7

William Co v Chu Kong Agency Co Ltd & Anor HC 377

Stay of proceedings

Party disentitled to a stay if he has taken a step in the action before doing so – Whether filing of an affidavit in court proceedings is a step in the action – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 6

Jialing (Hong Kong) Co Ltd v JA Moeller (Hong Kong) Ltd & Anor HC 637

BAILMENT AND LIEN

Bailee

Duty of care to goods under bailment – Breach of duty

He-ro Chemicals Ltd v Jeuro Container Transport (HK) Ltd & Anor HC 368

BANKING AND FINANCE

Foreign exchange trading on margin

Plaintiff's margin trading account not frozen in defendant's computer by mistake – Margin call made but trading continued – Whether waiver of margin call – Plaintiff continued trading to his detriment due to defendant's conduct – Whether transaction between parties can be challenged as invalid – Estoppel – Relief claimed under Rules of the Supreme Court O 14

Chang Ka Pio v Niceson Investment Ltd HC 393

Letter of credit

Injunction restraining bank from honouring letter of credit – Circumstances for court to intervene – Fraud

Ever Eagle Co Ltd v Kincheng Banking Corp CA 157

Money lending

Excessive interest rate – Reopening of transaction – Whether transfer of flat by borrower to lender subsequent to loan a ‘transaction’ which could be reopened – Series of related transactions – Whether just to reopen – Justice between the parties – Degree of greed and illegality – Money Lenders Ordinance (Cap 163) ss 24(1) & 25(1)

Lee Leo v Cheong Oi Sum Ader DC 736

BANKRUPTCY AND INSOLVENCY

Priorities

Application by creditor for priority payment – Whether application to set aside charging order is protecting or preserving the assets of a bankrupt – ‘Payment of moneys’ – Whether legal costs incurred in setting aside charging order constitute the payment of moneys – Bankruptcy Ordinance (Cap 6) s 38(5B)

Re Wu Kit Ping t/a Lee Yuen Electrical Co, ex p Golam Electrical Co Ltd HC 614

Discretion of court to give priority – Powers under s 97 do not extend to creating new priorities – Bankruptcy Ordinance (Cap 6) s 97(1)

Re Wu Kit Ping t/a Lee Yuen Electrical Co, ex p Golam Electrical Co Ltd HC 614

BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION

Construction site

Whether roofs of metal structures on the ground floor of the premises are part of the construction site – Construction Sites (Safety) Regulations reg 2(1)

R v Tsui Wai Ping HC 675

Construction site safety

Persons protected by Regulations – Whether ‘person’ on the construction site is confined only to employees of a contractor – Construction Sites (Safety) Regulations regs 38A(b) & 38P(1)

R v Tsui Wai Ping HC 675

Responsibility – Whether principal contractor is a ‘contractor responsible for the construction site’ – Whether there was a failure to take necessary safety measures – Construction Sites (Safety) Regulations regs 2(1), (2)(a), 38A(b) & 38P(1)

R v Tsui Wai Ping HC 675

Contract

Variation orders – Agreement to pay additional sum for no extra work – Whether void for want of consideration – Commercial benefit gained by additional

payments – Unconscionable to plead lack of consideration <i>UBC (Construction) Ltd v Sung Foo Kee Ltd</i>	HC	458
--	----	-----

CARRIERS

Carriage of goods

Meaning of ‘carriage by air’ – Transfer to final destination by road – Whether term ‘carriage by air’ based on or restricted to carriage on aircraft – Warsaw Convention art 18

<i>Manohar (t/a Vinamito Trading House) v Hill & Delamain (Hong Kong) Ltd</i>	CA	342
---	----	-----

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Appeal

Affidavit on merits not filed – Defence not verified – Requirement that particulars of defence on merits be provided – Preferred form of affidavit

<i>Tong Yi Sang & Anor v Fung Law & Ng & Ors</i>	HC	665
--	----	-----

Leave to appeal out of time – Court’s discretion

<i>Tong Yi Sang & Anor v Fung Law & Ng & Ors</i>	HC	665
--	----	-----

Compromise

Effect on original cause of action – Election – Requisite knowledge – Default judgment – Burden of proof – Striking out

<i>Lam Fung Ying v Ho Tung Sing & Anor</i>	HC	436
--	----	-----

Compromise agreed by solicitors

Whether to enforce compromise – Whether estopped by conduct in litigation to set up the compromise

<i>Lam Fung Ying v Ho Tung Sing & Anor</i>	CA	28
--	----	----

Costs

Scope of costs awarded – Whether limited to counsel’s fees, solicitor’s costs and disbursements and witness expenses – Whether costs should cover transporting and storing seized goods – Whether notional costs incurred by Crown covered – Trade Descriptions Ordinance (Cap 362) s 28

<i>Attorney General v Covo Knitters Ltd</i>	HC	571
---	----	-----

Whether trial judge can make costs order that binds Court of Appeal – Indemnification of third party’s costs incurred in compliance with injunction order – Whether binding on Court of Appeal hearing appeal concerning the injunction

<i>Tung Wing Steel Co Ltd v Brasimet Comercio E Industria SA & Ors</i>	CA	249
--	----	-----

Direction on witness statements to be exchanged

Whether statements should stand as examination-in-chief – Practice of the court in making an order under O 38 r 2A – Rules of the Supreme Court

O 38 r 2A

Cheung Kai Wing v Mok Sheung Shum t/a Mok Sum Kee & Anor (Tugu Insurance Co Ltd, third party) CA 113

Disclosure of documents

Whether documents relevant and necessary – Whether insurer able to apply for such disclosure under the Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) s 42(1) – Rules of the Supreme Court O 24 r 7A – Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) s 42(1) *Cheung Kai Wing v Mok Sheung Shum t/a Mok Sum Kee & Anor (Tugu Insurance Co Ltd, third party)* CA 113

Hearsay notice

Documents and witnesses' statements – Hearsay notices not served within time – No explanation for delay – Court's discretion to admit – Weight and admissibility not to be considered – Rules of the Supreme Court O 38 rr 21(1) & 29(1)(a) *Technalloy Chemical Corp v International Merona Ltd* CA 94

Just allowances

Court's discretion in granting such allowances – Whether accounting party in breach of trust case to be granted such allowances – Rules of the Supreme Court O 43 r 6 *Tang Wing Hong Alan (Personal Representative of the Estate of Tang Man Sit, deceased) v Capacious Investment Ltd* HC 416

Pleadings

Striking out defence – Inherent jurisdiction of court to strike out defence – Exceptional cases only – Sham, dishonest or no bona fide defence *Hutchvision Asia Ltd v Asia Television Ltd* HC 510

Practice Directions

Non-compliance – Consequences of non-compliance *Tong Yi Sang & Anor v Fung Law & Ng & Ors* HC 665

Stay of proceedings

Jurisdiction – Exclusive jurisdiction clause *The Mahkutai* CA 71

Striking out

Delay by plaintiff – Whether delay prejudiced defendant – Difficulty in producing evidence – Whether fair trial possible *Sharp Kabushiki Kaisha v Acker Trading Ltd* HC 490

Summary judgment

Foreign corporation from state not recognized by Hong Kong government – Locus standi to sue in Hong Kong – Judicial notice of laws of Taiwan – Foreign Corporations Ordinance (Cap 437) s 2(1) & (3) – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14 & O 14A

Taiwan Via Versand Ltd v Commodore Electronics Ltd HC 650

Obligation on defendant to make out a positive case – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14

He-ro Chemicals Ltd v Jeuro Container Transport (HK) Ltd & Anor HC 368

Tomlin order

Default of execution – Whether the court can enforce the order – Whether unconscionable to enforce it

Tsang Iu Hung v Tsang Tak Wah & Anor HC 471

Vendor and purchaser proceedings

Amendment of originating process – Application for leave – Final order in favour of vendor already perfected – Jurisdiction of court to give leave to amend originating process

Rich Circle Co Ltd v Lucky Time Finance Co Ltd HC 429

Writ

Substituted service – Service out of jurisdiction – Defendant company incorporated in Panama but not resident anywhere – Domicile of company – Whether to allow substituted service in Hong Kong – Considerations including ground for service out of jurisdiction – Rules of the Supreme Court O 11 r 1, O 65 r 4

Tillemont Shipping Corp SA & Anor v Taitexma Enterprise Corp & Ors CA 129

COMPANIES AND CORPORATIONS

Foreign corporation

Company incorporated in Taiwan – Locus standi to sue in Hong Kong – Whether to be regarded as having legal personality in Hong Kong – Foreign Corporations Ordinance (Cap 347) s 2(1) & (3)

Taiwan Via Versand Ltd v Commodore Electronics Ltd HC 650

Winding up

Jurisdiction of Registrar of the Supreme Court to wind up company on unopposed petition – Whether affidavit necessary to enter opposition to petition – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 180A(1)

Hendrarsin & Ors v Chong Lai Fee & Anor CA 243

Application to strike out petition – Whether affairs of company conducted in manner unfairly prejudicial to minority – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 168A

Re Mediavision Ltd HC 629

Application to strike out petition – Whether just and equitable ground – Whether substratum of company's business had gone – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 177(1)(f)

Re Mediavision Ltd HC 629

CONFLICT OF LAWS

Domicile

- Corporation with no residence – Incorporated in Panama
Tillemont Shipping Corp Sa & Anor v Taitexma Enterprise Corp & Ors
CA 129

Foreign court

- Injunction to restrain proceedings in foreign court – Whether injunction would impeach jurisdiction of foreign court – Whether arguable case that proceedings vexatious and oppressive – Right of court to exercise jurisdiction over persons resident in Hong Kong
China Light & Power Co Ltd & Ors v Wong To Sau Heung & Ors
CA 238

CONTRACT

‘Entrusting letter’

- Construction – Demand for return of goods – Whether ‘reasonable time’ to be read into ‘forthwith upon demand at any time’ – Whether implied term that return could be delayed to suit defendants’ commercial advantage
HB Electronics Ltd v Telemate Telesystems Inc
CA 47

Breach

- Damages – Deed of mutual covenant – Burst water pipe – Whether pipe came within defendants’ ‘part of the building’ – Whether general damages for inconvenience and discomfort in a breach of contract action
So John & Anor v Lau Hon Man & Ors
CA 356

Sale and purchase of land

- Whether variation of terms amount to repudiation sale and purchase of land
DH Shuttlecocks Ltd v Keung Shiu Tang
HC 600

COURTS AND JUDICIAL SYSTEM

District Court

- Jurisdiction – Order for payment of \$422,515 to borrower pursuant to Money Lenders Ordinance (Cap 163) – Jurisdiction based on amount claimed by lender not amount recovered by borrower
Lee Leo v Cheong Oi Sum Ader
DC 736

Stare decisis

- Whether Hong Kong courts are bound by House of Lords’ decisions —
Whether *R v Kearley* binds Hong Kong courts
R v Ng Kin Yee
CA 148

CRIMINAL LAW AND PROCEDURE

Abuse of process

- Alleged breach of terms of immunity from prosecution – Whether unfairness established