

INTERNATIONAL LAW IN THEORY AND PRACTICE

by

OSCAR SCHACHTER



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LONDON

INTERNATIONAL LAW IN THEORY AND PRACTICE

by

OSCAR SCHACHTER



MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LONDON

Developments in International Law

VOLUME 13

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Schachter, Oscar, 1915-

International law in theory and practice / by Oscar Schachter.
p. cm. -- (Developments in international law ; v. 13)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-7923-1024-1 (HB)

1. International law. I. Title. II. Series.

JX3091.S264 1991

341--dc20

90-49542

ISBN 0-7923-1024-1

Published by Martinus Nijhoff Publishers,
P.O. Box 163, 3300 AD Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Sold and distributed in the U.S.A. and Canada
by Kluwer Academic Publishers,
101 Philip Drive, Norwell, MA 02061, U.S.A.

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Academic Publishers Group,
P.O. Box 322, 3000 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands.

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved
© 1991 by Kluwer Academic Publishers
Kluwer Academic Publishers incorporates the publishing programmes of
Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or
utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical
including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and
retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in The Netherlands

Developments in International Law

1. C. R. Symmons: *The Maritime Zones of Islands in International Law*. 1979
ISBN 90-247-2171-7
2. B. H. Dubner: *The Law of International Sea Piracy*. 1980
ISBN 90-247-2191-1
3. R. P. Anand (ed.): *Law of the Sea, Caracas and Beyond*. 1980
ISBN 90-247-2366-3
4. V. S. Mani: *International Adjudication. Procedural Aspects*. 1980
ISBN 90-247-2367-1
5. G. M. Badr: *State Immunity. An Analytical and Prognostic View*. 1984
ISBN 90-247-2880-0
6. R. St. J. Macdonald and D. M. Johnston: *The Structure and Process of International Law. Essays in Legal Philosophy, Doctrine and Theory*. 1986
ISBN Hb: 90-247-2882-7; Pb: 90-247-3273-5
7. M. E. Villiger: *Customary International Law and Treaties. A Study of Their Interactions and Interrelations with Special Consideration of the 1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties*. 1985
ISBN 90-247-2980-7
8. M. Sornarajah: *The Pursuit of Nationalized Property*. 1985
ISBN 90-247-3130-5
9. C. F. Murphy, Jr.: *The Search for World Order. A Study of Thought and Action*. 1986
ISBN 90-247-3188-7
10. A. Cassese (ed.): *The Current Legal Regulation of the Use of Force*. 1986
ISBN 90-247-3247-6
11. N. Singh and E. McWhinney: *Nuclear Weapons and Contemporary International Law*. 2nd revised edition, 1989
ISBN 90-247-3637-4
12. J. Makarczyk: *Principles of a New International Economic Order. A Study of International Law in the Making*. 1988
ISBN 90-247-3746-X
13. O. Schachter: *International Law in Theory and Practice*. 1991
ISBN 0-7923-1024-1

PREFACE

Law is eminently a practical subject and its practitioners generally have little interest in theory. Those whom Montesquieu called "*les grands décisionnaires*" are content to make and apply rules and leave it to others to worry about the system as a whole or its basic premises. However, a purely technocratic approach to international law has its perils, even for the practitioner. In a non-hierarchical system, lacking a supreme authority, a claim of legal force ultimately rests on the underlying postulates of the system. Disputes as to the applicable principle of law are more likely than not to implicate such premises. In many cases, the "rules of recognition" (in international law, the "sources") cannot be applied without understanding the broader theory and function of the system as a whole.

This book considers how that system operates in its unity and diversity. It recognizes that international law is not an ideal construct but part of a broader political process, shaped and applied in response to perceived needs, societal forces and disparities in power. However, the law is not reducible to politics; it has its distinctive character and relative autonomy. To show this in a realistic and coherent manner calls for both a broad perspective and concrete examples.

My attempt to do this in a single volume is a response to the challenge presented initially by the invitation of the Hague Academy of International Law to give its General Course in 1982. The lectures given subsequently appeared as volume 178 of the Academy's *Recueil des Cours*. The present book has substantially revised and supplemented those lectures. It has done so especially in the chapters on the use of force and self-defense (chapters VII and VIII), and on human rights (chapter XV). It also has added new chapters on International Environmental Law (chapter XVI) and on Collective Security (chapter XVII).

This book appears at a time when international law has undergone a vast expansion into virtually every area of human activity extending across national lines. It is invoked and applied in countless decisions, accessible in many cases only to specialists. At the same time, some of its basic postulates seem to be challenged by calls for a "new world order", and for a strengthened system of global governance. Moreover, new structures of authority are emerging as economic interdependence renders national boundaries of minor significance and demands for human rights and ethnic autonomy erode the exclusive domain of nation States. Even powerful States can no longer insulate themselves from external conflicts, or transboundary environmental damage or migrants driven by poverty and oppression.

International law will surely change in response to these factors and become more complex and pervasive. However, its principal features are likely to remain as long as a pluralist society of self-ruling territorial entities has the support of most peoples.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The conception and ideas for this book were initially developed during a month as a resident scholar at the Rockefeller Foundation Center in Bellagio, Italy. The author gratefully acknowledges that opportunity. As already noted, the Hague Academy of International Law is owed particular thanks for its invitation to give the General Course in International Law. Columbia Law School provided research funds and valuable library help for which I am grateful. The coincidence of my work on this book and the preparation of the revised Restatement of the Foreign Relations Law of the United States (in connection with which I was an adviser) proved most helpful. I thank the Rapporteur, Professor Louis Henkin, the associate rapporteurs and other advisers for stimulating discussions.

I was also assisted in the final stages of this work by Ayesha Dias, LL.M., Columbia Law School. Her diligent assistance in the revision of chapters VII and VIII is greatly appreciated.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	ix
Acknowledgements	xi
Chapter I. The nature and reality of international law	1
The uses of law and the role of power	5
The dependency of international law on the will of States	9
Notes. Chapter I	15
Bibliography. Chapter I	16
Chapter II. Policies, purposes and rules in a divided world	18
The policy-orientation of the practitioner	18
The proper and improper uses of policy and purpose in the application of international law	23
The shared purposes of States	27
Rules of necessity in a pluralist society	30
Notes. Chapter II	32
Bibliography. Chapter II	33
Chapter III. The quest for objectivity: sources, scholars and judges	34
The doctrine of sources and the inductive science of law	35
The scholarly works of the publicists	38
Judicial decisions as mediating positivism	39
The politics and beliefs of judges	43
Notes. Chapter III	46
Bibliography. Chapter III	48
Chapter IV. General principles and equity	49
The broad expanse of general principles of law	50
The diverse manifestations of equity	55
Equitable principles applied to resources and boundaries	58
Notes. Chapter IV	62
Bibliography. Chapter IV	64
Chapter V. The international <i>lex scripta</i>	66
Codification: scientific and political	66
Law making treaties and international régimes	74
The proliferation of treaties and their significance in changing international society	76
Notes. Chapter V	81
Bibliography. Chapter V	83
Chapter VI. Resolutions and political texts	84
Resolutions of the United Nations General Assembly as evidence of law	85
The effect of majority resolutions for non-concurring States	90

The political texts: agreements and declarations of a non-legal character	94
Legal implications of the purely political "non-legal" instruments	99
Notes. Chapter VI	101
Bibliography. Chapter VI	104
 Chapter VII. The prohibition of force	 106
The United Nations context	107
The meaning of Article 2(4)	110
Consent to armed intervention	114
Territorial claims	116
The use of force for human rights	117
Self-determination and national liberation	119
Overthrow of repressive regimes	120
Protection of life	123
The use of force to safeguard legal rights	126
Has Article 2(4) lost its legal force?	129
Notes. Chapter VII	131
Bibliography. Chapter VII	133
 Chapter VIII. The use of force in self-defense	 135
Can self-defense be subject to law?	135
International scrutiny	138
The <i>lex specialis</i> of defense	141
Law and accountability	146
Anticipatory defense and armed attack	150
Requirements of necessity and proportionality	152
Collective self-defense	155
Armed intervention in internal conflicts	158
Use of force against terrorists in another country	162
Requirements of Necessity and Proportionality for Anti-Terrorist Activity	167
Necessity as excuse	169
Concluding comments on law of force	174
Notes. Chapter VIII	175
Bibliography. Chapter VIII	182
 Chapter IX. Peaceful means of redress: self-help and counter-measures	 184
Reprisals and retorsion as counter-measures	185
Notification and good faith requirements	186
Is recourse to peaceful settlements a condition of reprisals?	188
Non-performance of treaty obligations as reprisal	190
The requirement of proportionality	193
Limits on counter-measures against individuals	194
Violations of common concern: rights of third States to take counter-measures	196
Legal limits of retorsion	198
Notes. Chapter IX	200
Bibliography. Chapter IX	201
 Chapter X. International remedies	 202
Objective responsibility and obligation of redress	203
The requirement of legal interest and injury	205

Table of Contents

vii

Violations of multilateral treaties and of obligations <i>erga omnes</i>	208
Requirements of prior negotiations and exhaustion of local remedies	213
Non-adjudicatory means of settlement	214
The limited use of adjudication	217
Justiciable and political issues	220
Notes. Chapter X	223
Bibliography. Chapter X	225
 Chapter XI. Enforcement	 227
Ambivalence toward enforcement	227
Enforcement by the International Court of Justice	229
Enforcement of judgments of the International Court by the United Nations	233
Action by the successful State to enforce judgment	235
Enforcement of non-judicial decisions by international organizations	237
Enforcement through private litigation	239
Notes. Chapter XI	246
Bibliography. Chapter XI	248
 Chapter XII. The jurisdiction of States	 250
The theoretical controversy over the <i>Lotus</i> case	250
Contemporary controversies	252
The bases of jurisdiction to prescribe	253
Adjudicatory and enforcement jurisdiction	255
The requirement of reasonableness	258
The "effects doctrine"	261
Orders for disclosure and foreign government compulsion	264
The expanding area of universal jurisdiction	267
Notes. Chapter XII	270
Bibliography. Chapter XII	272
 Chapter XIII. The new law of the sea	 274
The erosion of freedom in the oceans	274
The complex structure of the new law of the sea in treaty and custom	281
The balance of rights between coastal and maritime States	285
The common heritage beyond national jurisdiction	291
Notes. Chapter XIII	296
Bibliography. Chapter XIII	298
 Chapter XIV. Sovereign rights and international business	 300
Permanent sovereignty over natural resources	301
"Internationalized" contracts between States and foreign nationals	305
States responsibility for breach of contract	311
Stabilization clauses	314
Discrimination against foreign business enterprise	315
Compensation for expropriation	321
Liberalization and privatization	325
Notes. Chapter XIV	325
Bibliography. Chapter XIV	328

✓ Chapter XV. International human rights	330
Some basic antinomies and dilemmas	331
Human rights as customary international law	335
Human rights as <i>jus cogens</i> and obligations <i>erga omnes</i>	342
Politics and human rights	345
Human rights and economic development	348
Economic and social rights and State accountability	352
Notes. Chapter XV	356
Bibliography. Chapter XV	360
Chapter XVI. Protecting the environment	362
Concepts and principles	362
Defining environmental harm and risk	365
The qualified duty of prevention in the light of conflicting interests	368
The duty to inform, assess and consult	373
Liability and compensation	375
Enforcement and remedies	381
Notes. Chapter XVI	384
Bibliography. Chapter XVI	388
✓ Chapter XVII. Collective security redux	389
The use of force under Chapter VII	391
The special agreements under Article 43	392
Implications for national constitutional requirements	394
Authority and command	396
Legal limits on ends and means	399
Application of law of armed conflict to United Nations forces	400
Self-defense and United Nations authority	401
The use of armed force in United Nations peacekeeping	404
Limits on peacekeeping	407
Use of force in peacekeeping	408
Force authorized by regional organization	410
Concluding comments	413
Notes. Chapter XVII	413
Bibliography. Chapter XVII	416
Index	418

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	ix
Acknowledgements	xi
Chapter I. The nature and reality of international law	1
The uses of law and the role of power	5
The dependency of international law on the will of States	9
Notes. Chapter I	15
Bibliography. Chapter I	16
Chapter II. Policies, purposes and rules in a divided world	18
The policy-orientation of the practitioner	18
The proper and improper uses of policy and purpose in the application of international law	23
The shared purposes of States	27
Rules of necessity in a pluralist society	30
Notes. Chapter II	32
Bibliography. Chapter II	33
Chapter III. The quest for objectivity: sources, scholars and judges	34
The doctrine of sources and the inductive science of law	35
The scholarly works of the publicists	38
Judicial decisions as mediating positivism	39
The politics and beliefs of judges	43
Notes. Chapter III	46
Bibliography. Chapter III	48
Chapter IV. General principles and equity	49
The broad expanse of general principles of law	50
The diverse manifestations of equity	55
Equitable principles applied to resources and boundaries	58
Notes. Chapter IV	62
Bibliography. Chapter IV	64
Chapter V. The international <i>lex scripta</i>	66
Codification: scientific and political	66
Law making treaties and international régimes	74
The proliferation of treaties and their significance in changing international society	76
Notes. Chapter V	81
Bibliography. Chapter V	83
Chapter VI. Resolutions and political texts	84
Resolutions of the United Nations General Assembly as evidence of law	85
The effect of majority resolutions for non-concurring States	90

The political texts: agreements and declarations of a non-legal character	94
Legal implications of the purely political "non-legal" instruments	99
Notes. Chapter VI	101
Bibliography. Chapter VI	104
Chapter VII. The prohibition of force	106
The United Nations context	107
The meaning of Article 2(4)	110
Consent to armed intervention	114
Territorial claims	116
The use of force for human rights	117
Self-determination and national liberation	119
Overthrow of repressive regimes	120
Protection of life	123
The use of force to safeguard legal rights	126
Has Article 2(4) lost its legal force?	129
Notes. Chapter VII	131
Bibliography. Chapter VII	133
Chapter VIII. The use of force in self-defense	135
Can self-defense be subject to law?	135
International scrutiny	138
The <i>lex specialis</i> of defense	141
Law and accountability	146
Anticipatory defense and armed attack	150
Requirements of necessity and proportionality	152
Collective self-defense	155
Armed intervention in internal conflicts	158
Use of force against terrorists in another country	162
Requirements of Necessity and Proportionality for Anti-Terrorist Activity	167
Necessity as excuse	169
Concluding comments on law of force	174
Notes. Chapter VIII	175
Bibliography. Chapter VIII	182
Chapter IX. Peaceful means of redress: self-help and counter-measures	184
Reprisals and retorsion as counter-measures	185
Notification and good faith requirements	186
Is recourse to peaceful settlements a condition of reprisals?	188
Non-performance of treaty obligations as reprisal	190
The requirement of proportionality	193
Limits on counter-measures against individuals	194
Violations of common concern: rights of third States to take counter-measures	196
Legal limits of retorsion	198
Notes. Chapter IX	200
Bibliography. Chapter IX	201
Chapter X. International remedies	202
Objective responsibility and obligation of redress	203
The requirement of legal interest and injury	205

Table of Contents

vii

Violations of multilateral treaties and of obligations <i>erga omnes</i>	208
Requirements of prior negotiations and exhaustion of local remedies	213
Non-adjudicatory means of settlement	214
The limited use of adjudication	217
Justiciable and political issues	220
Notes. Chapter X	223
Bibliography. Chapter X	225
Chapter XI. Enforcement	227
Ambivalence toward enforcement	227
Enforcement by the International Court of Justice	229
Enforcement of judgments of the International Court by the United Nations	233
Action by the successful State to enforce judgment	235
Enforcement of non-judicial decisions by international organizations	237
Enforcement through private litigation	239
Notes. Chapter XI	246
Bibliography. Chapter XI	248
Chapter XII. The jurisdiction of States	250
The theoretical controversy over the <i>Lotus</i> case	250
Contemporary controversies	252
The bases of jurisdiction to prescribe	253
Adjudicatory and enforcement jurisdiction	255
The requirement of reasonableness	258
The "effects doctrine"	261
Orders for disclosure and foreign government compulsion	264
The expanding area of universal jurisdiction	267
Notes. Chapter XII	270
Bibliography. Chapter XII	272
Chapter XIII. The new law of the sea	274
The erosion of freedom in the oceans	274
The complex structure of the new law of the sea in treaty and custom	281
The balance of rights between coastal and maritime States	285
The common heritage beyond national jurisdiction	291
Notes. Chapter XIII	296
Bibliography. Chapter XIII	298
Chapter XIV. Sovereign rights and international business	300
Permanent sovereignty over natural resources	301
"Internationalized" contracts between States and foreign nationals	305
States responsibility for breach of contract	311
Stabilization clauses	314
Discrimination against foreign business enterprise	315
Compensation for expropriation	321
Liberalization and privatization	325
Notes. Chapter XIV	325
Bibliography. Chapter XIV	328

✓ Chapter XV. International human rights	330
Some basic antinomies and dilemmas	331
Human rights as customary international law	335
Human rights as <i>jus cogens</i> and obligations <i>erga omnes</i>	342
Politics and human rights	345
Human rights and economic development	348
Economic and social rights and State accountability	352
Notes. Chapter XV	356
Bibliography. Chapter XV	360
Chapter XVI. Protecting the environment	362
Concepts and principles	362
Defining environmental harm and risk	365
The qualified duty of prevention in the light of conflicting interests	368
The duty to inform, assess and consult	373
Liability and compensation	375
Enforcement and remedies	381
Notes. Chapter XVI	384
Bibliography. Chapter XVI	388
✓ Chapter XVII. Collective security redux	389
The use of force under Chapter VII	391
The special agreements under Article 43	392
Implications for national constitutional requirements	394
Authority and command	396
Legal limits on ends and means	399
Application of law of armed conflict to United Nations forces	400
Self-defense and United Nations authority	401
The use of armed force in United Nations peacekeeping	404
Limits on peacekeeping	407
Use of force in peacekeeping	408
Force authorized by regional organization	410
Concluding comments	413
Notes. Chapter XVII	413
Bibliography. Chapter XVII	416
Index	418

CHAPTER I

THE NATURE AND REALITY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

International law today is a dense, intricate body of rules and practices. It has spread far and wide into virtually all human activities that extend beyond national boundaries. Business and finance, air and sea transport, resource exploitation, television and radio, health, the rights of women and children, the conduct of war, the movement of artistic treasures – the list could go on – are all governed in one way or another by international law. Multilateral law-making treaties have proliferated as have international institutions. It is no longer possible for a “generalist” to cope with the volume and complexity of the various branches of international law. Increasingly, the professional international lawyer, whether practitioner or scholar, is a specialist in a particular branch of the law and each branch develops its own complicated and often arcane doctrine.

It may be illuminating to apply a metaphor once suggested by the atomic physicist Robert Oppenheimer for his discipline¹. We may envisage international law as a large terrain made up of towns and villages with interconnecting paths and highways. The specialized branches of the law form the separate towns and villages, each centred on its own affairs. Narrow paths run from one to another, used occasionally. Across the entire terrain are the superhighways, the connecting links, which in the metaphor convey the general principles and concepts. Those who travel on the highways are generally only dimly aware of the lively activities in the towns and villages. Those who remain only in the local communities immersed in their specialities tend to lose sight of the interconnections and coherence of the larger whole. It may well be in the present complicated world of international relations that the real work of international law must fall to the specialists and that the generalists cannot fully understand the intricacies of the specialized areas. (This seems to be the case generally in the natural sciences.) Even if this is the case, it is still important to have the superhighways. International law seen as a unified system, with a core of basic concepts and processes, is much more than a congery of separate legal régimes in particular fields. Just as facts become meaningful when they are linked to ideas and norms, so do ideas and norms gather strength as they become part of a coherent inter-related system. One of the principal functions of this book is to delineate the overall system and to clarify the general ideas, concepts and principles that give that system its unity. At the same time we must not lose sight of the specifics, and of the specialized régimes that flourish away from the superhighways, yet are influenced and strengthened by the general system.

In sum, the immense expansion of international law and its specialization do not mean that it no longer has an operative doctrinal core of basic concepts and general principles. But it has become even more important because of the expansion to understand the relation of the core doctrine to the concrete body of rules and practices in each area. An aphorism of Kant is in point: “concepts without percepts are empty; percepts without concepts blind”. We need to relate concepts to practice and thus give them content. We need to relate practices to concepts in order to give practice meaning and direction.

If we are to relate doctrine and practice, we need also to widen the boundaries of our subject. This is not a simple task. Can we understand the relation of doctrine and practice, the connections between principles and specific decisions, without broadening our conception of international law to embrace the aims, interests and values of those engaged in making and applying the law? Do we not have to consider the effect of the law on those aims, interests and purposes? And is it not essential to our analysis to take into account the concrete problems and conflicts that give rise to legal rules and legal solutions? And finally, ought we not also to consider the socio-historical dimension, especially those major transformations in society that profoundly affect the structure and process of international law?

These questions virtually answer themselves. They remind us, if we need reminding, that international law is not “a brooding omnipresence in the sky”. It is more than a given body of rules and obligations. It involves purposive activities undertaken by governments, directed to a variety of social ends. These activities are conditioned and limited by constraints on the voluntary choices of the government – constraints related to factors of power, resources, ideology, felt needs. Underlying these factors are the less perceptible societal conditions, especially those that mark historical transformations such as the spread of industrialism and capitalism, the movements for democracy and socialism, the break-up of the great empires, the nuclear weapon and the other new military technologies. Government decisions that bear on law are also affected by their assessments of the means and strategies to achieve their ends. In many cases internal politics and struggles for power can be decisive. All these factors are extra-legal, outside of the body of law. They could in fact include any event or condition that has an impact on the perception of a State’s interests or its capabilities. Not only are such factors endlessly diverse for any particular State but the international environment is itself so variable as to multiply the circumstances that affect the development and application of law. For example, the disparity in power among States is a pervasive and ever-changing set of circumstances of particular importance to law (as we will discuss later). So, of course, are material conditions: technology, population, usable resources; these too are always in movement, bringing new pressures and conflicts to bear on law. Nor can we overlook the less tangible realm of ideas and ideals that both reflect and influence the demands of people and the conduct of governments. No account of the role