

HONG KONG CASES

1989

Volume 1

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Butterworths Asia
Hong Kong • Singapore • Kuala Lumpur

The Butterworth Group of Companies

Singapore	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01 International Plaza, Singapore 0207
Hong Kong	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA (HONG KONG) 19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 9651400 Fax: 9760840
Malaysia	MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur
Australia	BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra
Canada	BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver
Ireland	BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin
New Zealand	BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland
Puerto Rico	BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan
UK	BUTTERWORTH & Co (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh
USA	BUTTERWORTH LEGAL PUBLISHERS Salem, New Hampshire and Carlsbad, California

©
Butterworths Asia*
1995

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

*Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed Elsevier (Singapore) Pte Ltd.

ISSN 0218-7809
Typeset by Butterworths Asia, Superskill Graphics
and Corporate Press (HK) Ltd
Produced by Mandarin Offset Ltd
Printed and bound in Hong Kong

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Associate Editors

Grenville Cross QC

Peter Garland QC

Ruy Barretto, Barrister

Michael Ozorio, Barrister

Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister

Susan Kwan, Barrister

Malcolm Merry, Barrister

Aarif Barma, Barrister

Andrew Cheung, Barrister

Peter Ng, Barrister

Joseph Fok, Barrister

Anderson Chow, Barrister

Teresa Cheng, Barrister

David Fitzpatrick, Barrister

Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister

Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University

Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

Reporters in this volume

Edmund Cham, Solicitor

Ernest WH Cheung, Barrister

Charles P Chiu, Barrister

Danny Choi, Barrister

George F Chu, Barrister

Simon CK Chui, Barrister

Lindy Course, Barrister

Victor T Gidwani, Barrister

Paul Harris, Barrister

Gary Kwan, Barrister

Christopher Lam, Barrister

Godfrey Lam, Barrister

Osmond Lam, Barrister

Raymond Lau Wai Man, Barrister

Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister

Raymond Leung, Barrister

PY Lo, Barrister

Raymond Lo Wai Keung, Barrister

Raymond Tsui Wai Nam, Barrister

Dominic Yeung, Barrister

Judith O'Hare, City University

Catriona Simpson

Angela Ho

Anthony P Kinnear

Butterworths Asia

Managing Editor: Anthony P Kinnear

Deputy Managing Editor: Zarinah Marican

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The publishers are grateful to and acknowledge the significant contribution and support of the Hong Kong Superior Court Judgments Database project, directed by the four members of the Faculty of Law, whose names are mentioned below. The judgments database project (1989–1994) was funded primarily by the University of Hong Kong's Conference and Research Grants Committee with assistance from the Department of Professional Legal Education, at the Faculty of Law. The Faculty members responsible for the project are (in alphabetical order) Andrew Byrnes, Lecturer, Department of Law; Rick Glofcheski, Lecturer, Department of Law; Gary N Heilbronn, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education; and Sarah Nield, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education (until 1992). The project administrator is James Garritty, Research Officer, Faculty of Law.

Abbreviations

PC	Privy Council
PRC	People's Republic of China
PCA	Privy Council Appeal
Pt	Part
para	paragraph
RSC	Rules of the Supreme Court
r(r)	rule(s)
reg	regulation
s	section
sub-s	subsection
Sch	Schedule
UN	United Nations
Uncitral	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
VP(P)	Vice-President(s)
WCC	Workers' Compensation Case

List of abbreviations of law reports:

AC	Law Reports, Appeal Cases (HL and PC); since 1890
ALJR	Australian Law Journal Reports; 1958–(current)
ALR	Australian Law Reports
All ER	All England Law Reports; since 1936
App Cas	Law Reports, Appeal Cases, House of Lords, 15 vols; 1875–1890
BCLC	Butterworths Company Law Cases
BLR	Building Law Reports
Bligh NS	Bligh's Reports, House of Lords, New Series, 11 Vols; 1827–1837
CBNS	Common Bench Reports, New Series, 20 vols; 1856–1865
CCC	Canadian Criminal Cases, Annotated
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports; since 1903
Ch	Law Reports, Chancery Division; since 1890
Ch D	Law Reports, Chancery Division, 45 volumes; 1875–1890
Com LR	Commercial Law Reports
Con LR	Construction Law Reports
Cr App R	Criminal Appeal Reports (HL and CA(UK)); since 1908
Crim LR	Criminal Law Review; since 1954
DLR (3d)	Dominion Law Reports
ER	English Reports, 178 volumes; 1220–1865
Ex	Exchequer Reports (Welsby, Hurlestone and Gordon), 11 Vols; 1847–1856
FLR	Family Law Reports
Fam	Law Reports, Family Division, 1972–(current)
Freeman	Freeman's Reports

Hong Kong Cases

H & N	Hurlstone and Norman's Reports, Exchequer, 7 Vols; 1856–1862
HKC	Hong Kong Cases
HKLR	Hong Kong Law Reports
ICR	Industrial Cases Reports; since 1975
IRLR	Industrial Relations Law Reports
KB	Law Reports, King's Bench Division, 53 vols, 1901– 1952
LJQB	Law Journal, Queen's Bench; 1831–1946
LR Exch	Law Reports, Exchequer, 10 Vols; 1865–1875
LRQB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench, 10 vols, 1865–1875
LT	Law Times Reports, 177 vols, 1859–1947
LI LR	Lloyd's List Law Reports; 1919–1950
Lloyd's Rep	Lloyd's List Law Reports; since 1951
M & W	Meeson and Welsby's Reports, Exchequer, 16 vols, 1836–1847
NLJ	New Law Journal; 1965–(current)
NZLR	New Zealand Law Reports; since 1883
P	Law Reports, Probate, Divorce and Admiralty Division; 1891–1971
QB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1891–1900, and since 1952
QBD	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1875–1890
RTR	Road Traffic Reports; 1970–(current)
SJ	Solicitor's Journal; since 1856
St Tr	State Trials, 34 Vols; 1163–1820
Strange	Strange's Reports, King's Bench, 2 Vols; 1716–1749
TLR	The Times Law Reports, 71 volumes; 1884–1950 The Times Law Reports; since 1951
TR	Taxation Reports; 1939–(current)
VR	Victorian Reports; 1870–1872; 1957–(current)
WLR	Weekly Law Reports; since 1953
WN (NSW)	New South Wales Weekly Notes

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

The mode of citation of cases reported in this volume of *Hong Kong Cases* is [1989] 1 HKC (page).

	Page		Page
A		B	
Ability Manufactory Ltd; C Art Ltd v [HC]	320	Au Kwok Hing; R v [CA]	66
Air Pollution Control Authority; Asia Dyeing Co Ltd & Ors v [HC]	447	B	
American Airlines & Anor; Musharaf Din v [HC]	341	Bis Consultants Ltd; Dao Heng Bank Ltd v [CA]	87
Amoy Properties Ltd v Committee on Takeovers and Mergers and Commissioner for Securities [CA]	1	Brilliant Star Investment Ltd v NZI International Acceptances Ltd & Ors [HC]	375
Asia Construction Co v Crown Pacific Ltd [HC]	387	Building Authority; Yeung Pui Yee v [HC]	356
Asia Dyeing Co Ltd & Ors v Air Pollution Control Authority [HC]	447	C	
Attorney General v Chan Tak King [CA]	48	C Art Ltd v Ability Manufactory Ltd [HC]	320
Attorney General v Chan Yuen Lung & Ors [HC]	470	Castlespring Enterprises Ltd v Core Resource (HK) Ltd [HC]	283
Attorney General v Cheung Man Woon [HC]	406	Chai Shang Yi & Ors; R v [CA]	334
Attorney General v Choi Yan Kwong [CA]	131	Chan Chi Lun; R v [CA]	70
Attorney General v Fong Ming Yuen [CA]	327	Chan Chun Ching; R v [HC]	546
Attorney General v Ip Pui Leung [HC]	498	Chan Hon Wing & Ors; Nanyang Commercial Bank Ltd v [HC]	256
Attorney General v Li Chi Wing [HC]	365	Chan Kit v Sam Wo Industrial Manufactory [CA]	115
Attorney General v Ng Hok Ming [HC]	555	Chan Kwok Cheung; R v [HC]	303
Attorney General v Suen Yuen Ming [CA]	430	Chan Sek Hung & Anor; R v [HC]	441
Attorney General v Tin Shui Wai Development Ltd & Ors [HC]	360	Chan Siu Lan & Anor; One Queen Co Ltd v [CA]	146
Attorney General v Van Sou Leng [CA]	27	Chan Tak King; Attorney General v [CA]	48
Attorney General; Hanson Jay & Associates Ltd v [CA]	74	Chan Yuen; R v [HC]	370
Attorney General; Wong Siu Kwan v [HC]	484	Chan Yuen Lung & Ors; Attorney General v [HC]	470
		Chau Shui Hing (No 1); Ong Constantino Erminda v [HC]	237
		Chau Shui Hing (No 2); Ong Constantino Erminda v [HC]	246
		Cheung Man Woon; Attorney General v [HC]	406
		Cheung Sau Ching & Ors; — Fashion Garment Manufactory Ltd v [CA]	177
		Cheung Shing Kin; R v [CA]	105

	Page
China and South Sea Bank Ltd v Tan Soon Gin George [PC]	155
China Trade Omni Development Centre Ltd & Ors v Ramada International Inc & Anor [HC]	417
Choi Yan Kwong; Attorney General v [CA]	131
Chow Paul; Richardson Greenshields of Canada (Pacific) Ltd v [HC]	261
Chu Cheuk Tao & Ors; Tam Yuk Kwan v [HC]	231
Committee on Takeovers and Mergers and Commissioner for Securities; Amoy Properties Ltd v [CA]	1
Core Resource (HK) Ltd; Castlespring Enterprises Ltd v [HC]	283
Coro Tejapaibui & Ors; First Bangkok City Finance Ltd & Anor v [HC]	453
Crocodile Garments Ltd v The Prudential Enterprise Ltd [HC]	474
Crown Pacific Ltd; Asia Construction Co v [HC]	387
D	
Dandenong Estate Co Ltd v Yu Kai To & Ors t/a Sze Hing Loong Metal Co [HC]	587
Dao Heng Bank Ltd v Bis Consultants Ltd [CA]	87
Director of Immigration, ex p Santiago; R v [HC]	293
Director of Immigration; Wong Lai Yik v [HC]	354
E	
Eagle Queen Co Ltd & Anor v First Bangkok City Finance Ltd [CA]	59
Emery Air freight Corp v Equus Tricots Ltd [HC]	541
Equus Tricots Ltd; Emery Air freight Corp v [HC]	541

	Page
F	
Fashion Garment Manufactory Ltd v Cheung Sau Ching & Ors [CA]	177
First Bangkok City Finance Ltd; Eagle Queen Co Ltd & Anor v [CA]	59
First Bangkok City Finance Ltd & Anor v Coro Tejapaibui & Ors [HC]	453
Fong Ming Yuen; Attorney General v [CA]	327
Fung Robert; Hong Nin Bank Ltd v [HC]	347
Fung Wai Chung; R v [HC]	518
G	
Goldstock International Holding Ltd v Io Sio Hong .. [HC]	220
Governor-in-Council & Anor, The; Liew Kar Seng v [HC]	215
H	
Hanson Jay & Associates Ltd v Attorney General [CA]	74
Hong Nin Bank Ltd v Fung Robert [HC]	347
Hui Chung Wing; R v [CA]	112
Hui Dik Lun & Ors; R v [HC]	503
Hwa Aun Co (Hong Kong) Ltd & Ors; Lou Thiam Siong v [HC]	443
I	
Improver Corp & Ors v Raymond Industrial Ltd & Anor [HC]	397
Incorporated Owners of Dragon View v Nalpak Ltd .. [HC]	549
Incorporated Owners of Sun On Building; Leung Yun v .. [HC]	524
Io Sio Hong; Goldstock International Holding Ltd v .. [HC]	220
Ip Pui Leung; Attorney General v [HC]	498

Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
J		Leung Sing Kiu & Anor	
Joint-Effort Engineering Co & Anor; Yip Fong Ming v ... [DC]	505	(Administrators of the Estate of Chan Lai Wah, deceased) v Wong Shek Keung & Anor	[HC] 206
Julian Electrical Centre Ltd; Kin Tak Fung Co Ltd v	[HC] 490	Leung Tin Kan & Anor; Law Hing v	[HC] 572
K		Leung Yun v Incorporated Owners of Sun On Building .	[HC] 524
Kamenar International Ltd; Suen Ho Sun v	[CA] 135	Li Chi Wing; Attorney General v	[HC] 365
Keung Chak Kiu (Hong Kong Futures Exchange Ltd, Third Party); Richardson Greenshields of Canada (Pacific) Ltd v	[HC] 275	Liew Kar Seng v The Governor-in-Council & Anor	[HC] 215
Kin Tak Fung Co Ltd v Julian Electrical Centre Ltd ..	[HC] 490	Liu Wai Keung & Anor; R v ..	[HC] 480
Kutex International Ltd v Shui Hing Investment Co Ltd & Anor	[CA] 192	Lo Lai Hoi (Administratrix of the Estate of Wong Yiu Ping, deceased) v Wong Hau On & Anor	[HC] 528
Kwan Siu Keung & Anor; Ng Wan Kong v	[HC] 460	Lou Thiam Siong v Hwa Aun Co (Hong Kong) Ltd & Ors .	[HC] 443
Kwok Mei Sheung & Ors; R v	[CA] 290	Luk Shau Chun v Kwong Hon Wah	[HC] 593
Kwong Cheuk Wah; R v	[CA] 122	M	
Kwong Hon Wah; Luk Shau Chun v	[HC] 593	Mandarin Resources Corp Ltd, Re	[HC] 393
Kwong Wing Kei; R v	[HC] 544	Molesworth Ltd; R v	[HC] 607
Kwun Tong Island Lot No 386, Re	[HC] 411	Morison, Son & Jones (Hong Kong) Ltd v Yiu Wing Construction Co Ltd ...	[CA] 11
L		Musharaf Din v American Airlines & Anor	[HC] 341
L (an infant), Re	[CA] 187	N	
Lai Kwok Cheung; R v	[HC] 534	Nalpak Ltd; Incorporated Owners of Dragon View v ...	[HC] 549
Lam Chun Sing & Ors; R v	[HC] 538	Nanyang Commercial Bank Ltd v Chan Hon Wing & Ors	[HC] 256
Lam Sou Wing Stephen; Wing On Finance Co Ltd v ..	[HC] 307	Ng Hok Ming; Attorney General v	[HC] 555
Law Hing v Leung Tin Kan & Anor	[HC] 572	Ng So Ching; R v	[CA] 79
Le Hong Phong; R v	[CA] 152	Ng Wan Kong v Kwan Siu Keung & Anor	[HC] 460
Lee Kwok Tsun; R v	[HC] 581	NZI International Acceptances Ltd & Ors; Brilliant Star Investment Ltd v	[HC] 375
Leung Sing Kiu & Anor (Administrators of the Estate of Chan Lai Wah, deceased); Wong Shek Keung & Anor v	[CA] 202		

	Page		Page
O		R v Wong Kin Wa	[CA] 143
One Queen Co Ltd v Chan		R v Wong Sai Wai	[CA] 166
Siu Lan & Anor	[CA] 146	R v Yip Wai Por	[CA] 182
Ong Constantino Erminda v		Ram Isardas Mahtani;	
Chau Shui Hing (No 1)	[HC] 237	Wong Kwok Tai v	[CA] 100
Ong Constantino Erminda v		Ramada International Inc &	
Chau Shui Hing (No 2)	[HC] 246	Anor; China Trade Omni	
P		Development Centre Ltd	
Pappadis & Anor;		& Ors v	[HC] 417
Yip Chiu Yin Cris v	[CA] 33	Raymond Industrial Ltd &	
Petroliam Nasional Berhad &		Anor; Improver Corp	
Ors; Tan Soon Gin George v [CA]	125	& Ors v	[HC] 397
Prudential Enterprise Ltd, The;		Richardson Greenshields of	
Crocodile Garments Ltd v	[HC] 474	Canada (Pacific) Ltd v	
R		Chow Paul	[HC] 261
R v Au Kwok Hing	[CA] 66	Richardson Greenshields of	
R v Chai Shang Yi & Ors	[CA] 334	Canada (Pacific) Ltd v	
R v Chan Chi Lun	[CA] 70	Keung Chak Kiu (Hong	
R v Chan Chun Ching	[HC] 546	Kong Futures Exchange Ltd,	
R v Chan Kwok Cheung	[HC] 303	Third Party)	[HC] 275
R v Chan Sek Hung & Anor ...	[HC] 441	Rolita, The	[CA] 160
R v Chan Yuen	[HC] 370	S	
R v Cheung Shing Kin	[CA] 105	Sam Wo Industrial Manufactory;	
R v Director of Immigration,		Chan Kit v	[CA] 115
ex p Santiago	[HC] 293	Shee Kok Chong; Tung Yu	
R v Fung Wai Chung	[HC] 518	Lien Margaret v	[HC] 559
R v Hui Chung Wing	[CA] 112	Shui Hing Investment Co Ltd	
R v Hui Dik Lun & Ors	[HC] 503	& Anor; Kutex International	
R v Kwok Mei Sheung & Ors [CA]	290	Ltd v	[CA] 192
R v Kwong Cheuk Wah	[CA] 122	Suen Ho Sun v Kamenar	
R v Kwong Wing Kei	[HC] 544	International Ltd	[CA] 135
R v Lai Kwok Cheung	[HC] 534	Suen Yuen Ming;	
R v Lam Chun Sing & Ors	[HC] 538	Attorney General v	[CA] 430
R v Le Hong Phong	[CA] 152	T	
R v Lee Kwok Tsun	[HC] 581	Tam Yuk Kwan v Chu	
R v Liu Wai Keung & Anor ...	[HC] 480	Cheuk Tao & Ors	[HC] 231
R v Molesworth Ltd	[HC] 607	Tan Soon Gin George v	
R v Ng So Ching	[CA] 79	Petroliam Nasional Berhad	
R v Tse Yuk Ming & Anor	[HC] 521	& Ors	[CA] 125
R v Tsou Shing Hing	[CA] 93	Tan Soon Gin George; China	
R v Tsutsumi Motonobu		and South Sea Bank Ltd v	[PC] 155
& Ors	[HC] 434	Tin Shui Wai Development Ltd	
		& Ors; Attorney General v ...	[HC] 360
		Tse Yuk Ming & Anor; R v ...	[HC] 521

Table of Cases Reported

Tsing Lung Investment Co Ltd v Yu Sai Kin [HC]	513	Leung Sing Kiu & Anor (Administrators of the Estate of Chan Lai Wah, deceased) [CA]	202
Tsou Shing Hing; R v [CA]	93	Wong Shek Keung & Anor; Leung Sing Kiu & Anor (Administrators of the estate of Chan Lai Wah, deceased) v [HC]	206
Tsutsumi Motonobu & Ors; R v [HC]	434	Wong Siu Kwan v Attorney General [HC]	484
Tung Yu Lien Margaret v Shee Kok Chong [HC]	559		
V		Y	
Van Sou Leng; Attorney General v [CA]	27	Yeung Pui Yee v Building Authority [HC]	356
W		Yip Chiu Yin Cris v Pappadis & Anor [CA]	33
Wing On Finance Co Ltd v Lam Sou Wing Stephen [HC]	307	Yip Fong Ming v Joint-Effort Engineering Co & Anor [DC]	505
Wong Hau On & Anor; Lo Lai Hoi (Administratrix of the Estate of Wong Yiu Ping, deceased) v [HC]	528	Yip Wai Por; R v [CA]	182
Wong Kin Wa; R v [CA]	143	Yiu Wing Construction Co Ltd; Morison, Son & Jones (Hong Kong) Ltd v [CA]	11
Wong Kwok Tai v Ram Isardas Mahtani [CA]	100	Yu Kai To & Ors t/a Sze Hing Loong Metal Co; Dandenong Estate Co Ltd v [HC]	587
Wong Lai Yik v Director of Immigration [HC]	354	Yu Sai Kin; Tsing Lung Investment Co Ltd v [HC]	513
Wong Sai Wai; R v [CA]	166		
Wong Shek Keung & Anor v			

SUBJECT INDEX

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Habeas corpus

Person subject of deportation order – Detained pending removal from Hong Kong – Duration – Reasonable period – Immigration Ordinance (Cap 115) s 32(3)
Liew Kar Seng v The Governor-in-Council & Anor HC 215

Person subject of removal order – Detained pending removal from Hong Kong – Reasonable period – Heavier burden on authorities to justify detention the longer the period of detention – Immigration Ordinance (Cap 115) s 32(3A)
R v Director of Immigration, ex p Santiago HC 293

Judicial review

Removal order – Appeal against order dismissed by Immigration Tribunal – Whether decision irrational or unreasonable
Wong Lai Yik v Director of Immigration HC 354

AGENCY

Liability of agent

Sale of goods – Test for determining liability – Contract ‘made for and on behalf of’ a foreign buyer – Effect of ‘made for and on behalf of’ – Relevance of principal being foreign
Castlespring Enterprises Ltd v Core Resource (HK) Ltd HC 283

Travel agent

Duty of care – Travel agent’s special duty of care to customer
Musharaf Din v American Airlines & Anor HC 341

ARBITRATION

Arbitration clause

Frustration of contract by breach – Whether arbitration clause in contract came to an end – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 6A
China Trade Omni Development Centre Ltd & Ors v Ramada International Inc & Anor HC 417

Arbitrator

Application for removal – Test – Real likelihood that reasonable person would think that issue would not be fairly determined – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 25
Asia Construction Co v Crown Pacific Ltd HC 387

BANKING AND FINANCE

Banker and customer

Repayment of unpaid balance – Whether repayment was of principal or interest – Debtor’s common law right to elect appropriation of payment as principal or interest – Effect of failure to elect
Nanyang Commercial Bank Ltd v Chan Hon Wing & Ors HC 256

Charge on shares as security for loan

Lender's right of disposition or appropriation on default – Sale of shares by lender upon default – Lender appropriating shares to itself before sale – Whether lender had sold shares as owner or mortgagee – Power of sale could still be validly exercised even if earlier disposition invalid

Brilliant Star Investment Ltd v NZI International Acceptances Ltd
& Ors

HC 375

Closing of commodity market

Defendant unable to close position – Third party proceedings against Futures Exchange – Whether closure of Futures Exchange gave rise to civil action for damages for breach of duty – Whether the Exchange owed a duty to the investing public – Whether duty a statutory duty under the Commodities Trading Ordinance (Cap 250)

Richardson Greenshields of Canada (Pacific) Ltd v Keung Chak Kiu
(*Hong Kong Futures Exchange Ltd, Third Party*)

HC 275

Futures contract

Agreement with dealer to open account to enable the customer to enter into futures contract – Whether agreement was a futures contract within meaning of Commodities Trading Ordinance (Cap 250) – Commodities Trading Ordinance (Cap 250) s 26(1) & (6)

Goldstock International Holding Ltd v Io Sio Hong

HC 220

Non-registration of dealer – Whether contract void or voidable – Commodities Trading Ordinance (Cap 250) s 26(1) & (6)

Goldstock International Holding Ltd v Io Sio Hong

HC 220

Securities contract

Contract between broker and customer in respect of dealings in quoted shares on margin – Broker failed to follow customer's instructions to sell shares at best – Whether broker was in breach of contract – Consequences of breach

Richardson Greenshields of Canada (Pacific) Ltd v Chow Paul

HC 261

Illegality – Person handling customer's account had not been registered as a dealer's representative – Whether this rendered contract between broker and customer unenforceable

Richardson Greenshields of Canada (Pacific) Ltd v Chow Paul

HC 261

BETTING, GAMBLING AND LOTTERIES

Gambling authorization – Validity – Rank of officer purporting to issue authorization not stated on form – Application of presumption of regularity – Gambling Ordinance (Cap 148) s 23

R v Kwok Mei Sheung & Ors

CA 290

BILLS OF EXCHANGE

Claim on dishonoured cheque

Whether conditional delivery of cheque – Whether defence of partial failure

of consideration available – Order 14 summons		
<i>Suen Ho Sun v Kamenar International Ltd</i>	CA	135

BRIBERY AND CORRUPTION

Accepting advantage as an agent

Mens rea – Payment of an advantage to an agent for the general purpose of ‘keeping sweet’ – Judicial notice of ‘tea money’ – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) s 9(1)(b)

<i>R v Tsou Shing Hing</i>	CA	93
----------------------------	----	----

Amended charge

Jurisdiction of magistrate to deal with amended charge – Accepting an advantage – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) ss 31 & 32

<i>R v Lee Kwok Tsun</i>	HC	581
--------------------------	----	-----

Charges

Discrepancies between statement of offence and the particulars of offence ‘Soliciting an advantage’ and ‘accepting an advantage’ – Whether material irregularity

<i>R v Chan Yuen</i>	HC	370
----------------------	----	-----

Soliciting an advantage

Charge – Amount stated in charge greater than amount actually received – Whether conviction on charge could stand

<i>R v Chan Yuen</i>	HC	370
----------------------	----	-----

Whether prosecution witnesses were accomplices – Circumstances in which a person who paid the bribe would be regarded as an accomplice – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) s 22

<i>R v Chan Yuen</i>	HC	370
----------------------	----	-----

BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION

Alterations and additions

Approval – Approval for original construction of building not obtained under s 14 of Buildings Ordinance (Cap 123) – Practice note by Building Authority requiring approval and consent for all building works – Whether included works of alteration and additions – Buildings Ordinance (Cap 123) s 14

<i>Yeung Pui Yee v Building Authority</i>	HC	356
---	----	-----

CARRIERS

Claim on freight

Right to deduct amount owing from transportation charges – Whether excluded by contract

<i>Emery Air freight Corp v Equus Tricots Ltd</i>	HC	541
---	----	-----

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Appeal

Extension of time – Summary judgment – Appeal brought after expiry of appeal period – Whether time for appeal could be extended – Offer of applicant

to pay costs and prejudice suffered by other party not the only considerations –
Rules of the Supreme Court O 3 r 5

Luk Shau Chun v Kwong Hon Wah HC 593

First appeal withdrawn – Whether second notice of appeal could be filed –
Extension of time

Luk Shau Chun v Kwong Hon Wah HC 593

Contempt of court

Body corporate – Liability of director – Requirement of service of notice of
motion – Dispensation – Rules of the Supreme Court O 45 rr 5(1), 7(3) & 7(7)

Yip Chiu Yin Cris v Pappadis & Anor CA 33

Wilful defiance of an order of court – Elements of offence

Yip Chiu Yin Cris v Pappadis & Anor CA 33

Costs

Dismissal of winding-up petition – Whether winding-up petition an abuse
of process – Whether creditor knew debtor was able to pay debt – Demand for
payment within 24 hours unreasonable

Re Mandarin Resources Corp Ltd HC 393

Default judgment

Setting aside – Whether affidavit of merits required – Whether arguable
defence must be established – Rules of the Supreme Court O 13 r 9

*Morison, Son & Jones (Hong Kong) Ltd v Yiu Wing
Construction Co Ltd* CA 11

Discovery

Legal professional privilege – Disclosure by mistake – Separate action for
injunction restraining disclosure – Whether action to be heard together with main
action

Attorney General v Tin Shui Wai Development Ltd & Ors HC 360

Legal professional privilege – Report on accident produced by adjusters
commissioned by insurers of third defendant – Whether report privileged – Test
of dominant purpose for preparing report – Whether privilege defeated because
report was commissioned by insurers rather than third defendant – Document
once privileged always privileged

Tam Yuk Kwan v Chu Cheuk Tao & Ors HC 231

Ex parte summons

Application by owner of land for declaration as to title – Non-existence of
actual dispute – Whether application an abuse of court process

Re Kwun Tong Island Lot No 386 HC 411

Interim payment into court

Stay of execution – Whether there were special circumstances which rendered
a stay expedient – Background and circumstances surrounding the case – Whether
corporate veil should be lifted – Rules of the Supreme Court O 47 r 1

Dao Heng Bank Ltd v Bis Consultants Ltd CA 87

Interrogatories

Refusal to answer – General practice – Fear of self-incrimination – Whether refusal justified – Whether appellant must make objection on oath

Tan Soon Gin George v Petroliaam Nasional Berhad & Ors CA 125

Payment into court

Arbitration – Two or more matters in dispute – Specifying amount paid in respect of each matter in dispute – Apportionment a matter for court's discretion – Some part of claim paid prior to arbitration – Whether court had jurisdiction to order that apportionment of moneys paid prior to arbitration be specified – Rules of the Supreme Court O 73 r 11(1) & 11(5)

Hanson Jay & Associates Ltd v Attorney General CA 74

Pleadings

Striking out statement of claim – Abuse of process of court – Rules of the Supreme Court O 18 r 19

Brilliant Star Investment Ltd v NZI International Acceptances Ltd & Ors HC 375

Stay of proceedings

Summons striking out indorsement on the writ and striking out two of the plaintiffs for want of authority – Whether constitutes 'a step in the proceedings' – Whether amounts to an 'affirmation of the correctness' of the proceedings – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 6A(1)

China Trade Omni Development Centre Ltd & Ors v Ramada International Inc & Anor HC 417

Summary judgment

Action for freight – Defendant cannot set up counterclaim in respect of cargo

Emery Air freight Corp v Equus Tricots Ltd HC 541

Any triable issue – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14 r 3(1)

Crocodile Garments Ltd v The Prudential Enterprise Ltd HC 474

Application for leave to defend – Onus on defendant to show triable issue – Whether large number of direct conflict of facts in competing affirmations amounts to triable issue

Luk Shau Chun v Kwong Hon Wah HC 593

Delay – Application after summons for directions and discovery – Whether delay fatal to application – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14

Morison, Son & Jones (Hong Kong) Ltd v Yiu Wing Construction Co Ltd CA 11

Dishonoured cheque – Whether a defence of quantified partial failure of consideration tenable – How such defence may be established – Whether a defence shut out if it arises after cause of action accrues

Suen Ho Sun v Kamenar International Ltd CA 135

Winding up

Institution of proceedings – Role of Registrar General, Official Receiver and Attorney General – Registrar General (Establishment) Ordinance (Cap 100) ss 2, 3 & 4

First Bangkok City Finance Ltd & Anor v Coro Tejapaibui & Ors HC 453

Writ

Amendment of name of party on writ – Genuine mistake – Delay – Limitation period had expired – Fresh writ with correct plaintiff in respect of same subject matter issued before expiry of limitation period – Whether defendant would be prejudiced by amendment – Whether just to allow amendment – Rules of the Supreme Court O 20 r 5(3)

Kutex International Ltd v Shui Hing Investment Co Ltd & Anor CA 192

COMPANIES AND CORPORATIONS

Authority

Ostensible authority – Whether person who signed contracts did so on behalf of company – Test

R v Molesworth Ltd HC 607

Liquidation

Refusal of liquidator to refund deposit – Circumstances which justify court's interference with a liquidator's decision to act – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 200(5)

Eagle Queen Co Ltd & Anor v First Bangkok City Finance Ltd CA 59

Official Receiver

Whether winding up proceedings lawfully commenced by Official Receiver – Proceedings brought by Registrar General – Duties of Official Receiver as liquidator appointed by the court – Carrying out of official acts – Registrar General (Establishment) Ordinance (Cap 100) ss 2(3), 3 & 4 – Legal Officers Ordinance (Cap 87) ss 3 & 4

First Bangkok City Finance Ltd & Anor v Coro Tejapaibui & Ors HC 453

Takeovers

Offers to minority shareholders after takeover – Whether compliance with Hong Kong Code on Takeovers and Mergers – Necessity for comparable price offer for different classes of shares – Hong Kong Code on Takeovers and Mergers General Principle 3 & r 33

Amoy Properties Ltd v Committee on Takeovers and Mergers and Commissioner for Securities CA 1

Winding up

Respondent a former shareholder of the company – Whether respondent can be a party to proceedings under s 168A of the Companies Ordinance – Whether s 168A wide enough to allow respondent to be a party – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 168A

Lou Thiam Siong v Hwa Aun Co (Hong Kong) Ltd & Ors HC 443