BRICKEY

... CORPORATE AND WHITE COLLAR CRIVE Ceases and Materials

Fourth Edition



Corporate and White Collar Crime

Cases and Materials

Fourth Edition

Kathleen F. Brickey

James Carr Professor of Criminal Jurisprudence Washington University



© 2006 Kathleen F. Brickey

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission to make copies of any part of this publication should be mailed to:

Aspen Publishers Attn: Permissions Department 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor New York, NY 10011-5201

Printed in the United States of America.

1234567890

ISBN 0-7355-5616-4

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Brickey, Kathleen F.

Corporate and white collar crime: cases and materials / Kathleen F. Brickey. — 4th ed.

p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 0-7355-5616-4

- 1. White collar crimes United States Cases. 2. Commercial crimes United States Cases.
- 3. Corporation law United States Criminal provisions Cases. I. Title.

KF9350.A7B75 2006 345.73'0268—dc22

Preface

Despite its familiar ring, the term "white collar crime" is dauntingly difficult to define. Edwin Sutherland, who first coined the term in 1939, developed a construct that relied on the social status of the offender and the circumstances surrounding the crime as the relevant points of reference. As the concept evolved over the years, the focus shifted away from the offender to the nature of the offense, the locus of the wrong, or the means used to commit it. Nevertheless, decades of academic debate have neither resolved the threshold definitional issue nor provided a coherent organizing principle.

Notwithstanding the vagaries of defining the subject, white collar crime has become a growth industry in the wake of Enron and is fast becoming an established part of the law school curriculum.

This book endeavors to provide a theoretical and policy framework for considering the respective roles of institutional and individual responsibility and for systematically examining the principal federal statutes prosecutors rely on to prosecute corporate and white collar crime. In addition to relying on reported cases as vehicles for discussion, the book uses problems, case studies, and other similar materials to illustrate the context within which the issues are framed. The fourth edition nonetheless maintains a strong focus on substantive criminal law. And because statutes are the organizing principle of the course, the book is designed to be used with the companion statutory supplement.

While the similarities between this edition and its predecessors are greater than the differences, recent developments have dictated some changes in emphasis and coverage. Most notably, the Supreme Court's decision in *United States v. Booker*, which invalidated the Federal Sentencing Guidelines' reliance on mandatory sentencing ranges, necessitated some major restructuring of the materials in Chapter 14, Sanctions. In addition to other major case updates, highlights of additions to the fourth edition include case studies and related materials derived from the recent prosecutions of Arthur Andersen, Martha Stewart, Enron CEO Ken Lay, and WorldCom CEO Bernie Ebbers, among others.

As was true of the earlier editions, for the sake of brevity and clarity I have omitted some footnotes and citations and eliminated most parallel citations without indication.

xxviii Preface

Footnotes that were retained are renumbered consecutively throughout each chapter. Explanatory footnotes that I added to cases and other quoted material are identified by the legend "— Ed." And unless otherwise specified, citations to the United States Code that I have supplied are citations to the current Code.

Kathleen F. Brickey

February 2006

Acknowledgments

I have benefitted greatly from the feedback I received from students and colleagues on the first three editions of the book, and I want to acknowledge my gratitude to them all.

Another special word of thanks goes to my faculty assistant, Beverly Owens, for her exceptional organizational and technical assistance. I could not have produced the new edition without her help.

I am also indebted to the following authors, organizations, and copyright holders for permission to reprint excerpts from their works:

American Law Institute, Model Penal Code, Sections 1.04(5); 2.02(2)(c); 2.07(1), (2), (4)(c), (5) and Restatement (Second) of Torts § 538. Copyright © 2001 by the American Law Institute. Reproduced with permission. All rights reserved.

Kathleen F. Brickey, Criminal Mischief, The Federalization of American Criminal Law, 46 Hastings L.J. 1135, 1156 n.133 (1995). Copyright © 1995 by Kathleen F. Brickey.

Kathleen F. Brickey, Enron's Legacy, 8 Buff. Crim. L. Rev. 221, 235-237 (2004). Copyright © 2004 by Kathleen F. Brickey.

Kathleen F. Brickey, Mostly Martha, 44 Washburn L.J. 517, 548-551 (2005). Copyright © 2005 by Kathleen F. Brickey.

Kathleen F. Brickey, Rethinking Corporate Liability Under the Model Penal Code, 19 Rutgers L.J. 593, 625-626, 629-632 (1988). Reprinted with permission of the Rutgers Law Journal. Copyright 1988 by Rutgers School of Law-Camden.

Francis T. Cullen, William J. Maakestad & Gary Cavender, Corporate Crime Under Attack, 351-353 (1987). Copyright © 1987 by the Anderson Publishing Co. All Rights Reserved. Reprinted by permission.

Sanford H. Kadish, Some Observations on the Use of Criminal Sanctions in Enforcing Economic Regulations, 30 U. Chi. L. Rev. 423, 430-432 (1963). Reprinted by permission.

United States Attorney's Office, Southern District of New York, Insider Trading Prosecutions in the Southern District of New York.

Summary of Contents

Cont	tents	Xi	
Contents Preface Acknowledgments 1. Corporate Criminal Liability 2. Personal Liability in an Organizational Setting 3. Conspiracy 4. Mail Fraud 5. Securities Fraud 6. False Statements 7. Perjury and False Declarations 8. Obstruction of Justice 9. Bribery of Public Officials 10. RICO 11. Tax Fraud 12. Currency Reporting Crimes and Money Laundering 13. Environmental Crimes 14. Sanctions		- XXV	
4 <i>ckn</i>	nowledgments	xxix	
1.	Corporate Criminal Liability	1	
2.	Personal Liability in an Organizational Setting	41	
3.		59	
4.	Mail Fraud	91	
5.	Securities Fraud	155	
6.	False Statements	213	
7.		213 257	
8.		307	
9.			
l 0.	·	375	
		425	
		507	
		547	
		603	
· ~ ·	Sanctions	661	
able	e of Cases	743	
able	e of Statutes	749	
ndex	¢	751	

Contents

Preface Acknowledgments		
1		·
	Corporate Criminal Liability	1
I. :	Introduction	1
	New York Central & Hudson River	
	Railroad v. United States	1
	Notes and Questions	3
	Francis T. Cullen, William J. Maakestad, and	
	Gary Cavender, Corporate Crime Under	
	Attack	3
	Notes and Questions	5
	U.S. Department of Justice Guidance,	
	Federal Prosecution of Corporations	5
	Notes and Questions	8
	Kathleen F. Brickey, Enron's Legacy	8
	Notes and Questions	11
	United States v. C. R. Bard, Inc.	12
	Notes and Questions	17
II.	The Respondeat Superior Rule	18
	A. Criminal Acts	18
	Commonwealth v. Beneficial Finance Co.	18
	Notes and Questions	21

xii		Contents
	People v. Lessoff & Berger	22
	Notes and Questions	24
	United States v. Hilton Hotels Corp.	24

Notes and Questions

B. Criminal Intent

United States v. Bank of New England, N.A.

Notes and Questions

26

27

Notes and Questions

III. The Model Penal Code Rule
Section 2.07 Liability of Corporations,
Unincorporated Associations and Persons Acting

Unincorporated Associations and Persons Acting, or Under a Duty to Act, in Their Behalf 32

State v. Chapman Dodge Center, Inc. 34

Notes and Questions 36

State v. Christy Pontiac-GMC, Inc. 37

Notes and Questions 39

Note on Corporate Structure 39

Kathleen F. Brickey, Rethinking Corporate

Liability Under the Model Penal

Code

39

	Personal Liability in an	-
	Organizational Setting	41
I.	Introduction	41
II.	Direct Participants	41
	United States v. Wise	41
	Notes and Questions	43
	Sanford H. Kadish, Some Observations on	
	the Use of Criminal Sanctions in	
	Enforcing Economic Regulations	43
	Notes and Questions	44
	Note on Accomplice Liability	44
	Problem 2-1	44
III.	Responsible Corporate Officers	45
	United States v. Park	46
	Notes and Questions	52
	Problem 2-2	53
	Problem 2-3	53
	Problem 2-4	53
	United States v. Jorgensen	54
	Notes and Questions	57
	Note on Fines and Indemnification	57
	Notes and Questions	58

Contents			xiii
3			

	٠	

	Conspiracy	59
I.	Introduction	59
II.	The Plurality Requirement	60
	United States v. Stevens	61
	Notes and Questions	63
	United States v. Hughes Aircraft Co.	64
	Notes and Questions	66
III.	Knowing Participation	66
	United States v. Furkin	67
	Notes and Questions	70
	United States v. Misle Bus & Equipment Co.	70
	Notes and Questions	71
	Note on Scope of Conspiracy	71
IV.	The Object Offense	72
	United States v. Arch Trading Co.	73
	Notes and Questions	75
	United States v. Licciardi	76
	Notes and Questions	83
V.	Withdrawal and Termination	83
	United States v. Steele	83
	Notes and Questions	87
	Problem 3-1	87
	United States v. Jimenez Recio	88
	Notes and Questions	90

4			
		Mail Fraud	91
I.	Introduction		91
II.	Schemes to Defraud		92
	A. Intent to Defraud		92
	United States v. Hawkey		92
	Notes and Questions		94
	Note on Fraud and False Pretenses		94
	Problem 4-1		95
	Note on Materiality		95
	Lustiger v. United States		96
	Notes and Questions		98
	Problem 4-2		98
	B. Protected Interests		99
	United States v. George		99
	Notes and Ouestions		103

	Carpenter v. United States	103
	Notes and Questions	106
	Cleveland v. United States	106
	Notes and Questions	112
	Pasquantino v. United States	112
	Notes and Questions	117
	United States v. Czubinski	118
	Notes and Questions	124
	United States v. DeVegter	125
***	Notes and Questions	129
III.	Use of the Mails	129
	Schmuck v. United States	130
	Notes and Questions	134
	United States v. Sampson	134
	Notes and Questions	136
13.7	Note on Proof of Mailing	136
IV.	Mail and Wire Fraud Affecting a Financial Institution	137
	United States v. Bouyea	137
X 7	Notes and Questions	139
V.	Statutes Prohibiting Specific Frauds	139
	A. Bank Fraud	139
	United States v. Doke	140
	Notes and Questions	143
	United States v. Reaume	143
	Notes and Questions	145
	B. Computer Fraud	146
	United States v. Middleton	146
	Notes and Questions	152
	United States v. Czubinski	152
	Notes and Questions	154
5		
_	Securities Fraud	155
I.	Introduction	155
II.	Willfulness	156
	United States v. Weiner	157
	Notes and Questions	162
III.	The "No Knowledge" Proviso	163
	United States v. Lilley	164
	Notes and Questions	167
IV.	Insider Trading	168
	A. The Evolving Doctrinal Rules	169
	1. Classical Theory	169
	Chiarella v. United States	169
	Notes and Questions	174

Contents

xiv

Cont	ents			xv
		2.	Misappropriation Theory	174
			United States v. O'Hagan	174
			Notes and Questions	179
		3.	Tipper/Tippee Theory	179
			Dirks v. Securities and Exchange Commission	179
			Notes and Questions	183
			Problem 5-1	184
			United States v. Chestman	184
			Notes and Questions	189
			Note on Rule 10b5-2	190
			Notes and Questions	190
		4.	Knowing Possession	191
			United States v. Teicher	191
			Notes and Questions	194
			Note on Rule 10b5-1	194
			Notes and Questions	196
			Problem 5-2	196
		5.	Materiality	196
			Problem 5-3	197
	В.	Th	e Human Dimension of the Wall Street Insider	198
		Tra	iding Scandal	
		1.	Wall Street's Army of Insiders	198
		2.	Insider Trading Prosecutions in the Southern	
			District of New York	198
V.	Mi	srepr	esentation and Concealment	209
			Case Study: United States v. Stewart	209
			Notes and Questions	210
VI.	Sec	curiti	es Fraud Prosecutions Under the Sarbanes-Oxley Act	211
			Notes and Questions	212
6				
			False Statements	213
Ī.	Inte	oduc	tion	212
II.		isdict		213
			United States v. Rodgers	214
			United States v. Wright	214
			Notes and Questions	217
			United States v. Steiner Plastics	219
			Manufacturing Co.	210
			Notes and Questions	219
III.	Der	artm	ent or Agency	220
	~-01		United States v. McNeil	221
			Notes and Questions	221
			Total and Questions	224

United States v. Pickett

Notes and Questions

224

xvi		Contents
IV.	False Statements	227
	A. False Promises	227
	United States v. Shah	227
	Notes and Questions	231
	B. "Exculpatory No's"	231
	Brogan v. United States	231
	Notes and Questions	236
	C. Materiality	236
	Problem 6-1	236
V.	Culpable Mental State	237
	United States v. Yermian	237
	United States v. Green	241
	Notes and Questions	243
VI.	Multiple Punishment	243
	United States v. Ramos	243
	Notes and Questions	245
VII.	Related Theories of Liability	245
	A. Procurement Fraud	245
	United States v. Brooks	245
	Notes and Questions	249
	United States v. Sain	249
	Notes and Questions	250
	B. False Claims	251
	United States v. Maher	251
	Notes and Questions	254
	C. Certification of Corporate Financial Reports	254
	Notes and Questions	255
7		
	Perjury and False Declarations	257
I.	Introduction	- · · ·
II.	Making Material False Statements	257
11.	D	257
	Notes and Questions	257
	Problem 7-1	261
	United States v. Walser	261
		262
III.	Notes and Questions The Two-Witness Rule	266
111.	United States v. Davis	266
	Notes and Questions	267
	Note on Inconsistent Declarations	270
	Problem 7-2	270
IV.	The Recantation Defense	270
1 7.	United States v. Sherman	271
	onieu siaies v. snerman	271

Notes and Questions

Conte	nts		xvii
		Note on Competent Tribunals and Ancillary	
		Proceedings	280
V.	Immunized Testi	E	281
		United States v. Apfelbaum	281
		Notes and Questions	285
VI.	Perjury by Gove	ernment Witnesses	286
	3 3 3	Case Study: United States v. Stewart	286
		United States v. Stewart (Opinion of the Court)	286
		United States v. Stewart (Indictment)	287
		United States v. Stewart (Opinion of the Court)	295
		Notes and Questions	298
		Verdict Form: United States v. Stewart	299
		TABLE 7-1: Jury Findings Against Martha Stewart	302
		TABLE 7-2: Jury Findings Against Peter Bacanovic	304
8			
		Obstruction of Justice	307
I.	Introduction		307
II.	Pending Judicial	Proceedings	307
		United States v. Simmons	309
		Notes and Questions	312
		United States v. Lundwall	313
		Notes and Questions	317
III.	Endeavoring to l	Influence or Impede	318
		United States v. Collis	318

321

321

325

325

326

330

330

334

335

336

337

337

338

338

338

342

342

342

347

Notes and Questions

United States v. Griffin

Notes and Questions

United States v. Aguilar

Notes and Questions

United States v. Cintolo

Notes and Questions

Note on Lawyer Liability

Notes and Questions

United States v. Lester

Notes and Questions

Notes and Questions

Arthur Andersen LLP v. United States

Problem 8-1

Problem 8-2

1. Section 1503: The Omnibus Clause

2. Section 1512: Corrupt Persuasion

IV. The Victim and Witness Protection Act

A. Noncoercive Witness Tampering

kviii		Content
	Note on Evidence Tampering and Document	
	Destruction	348
	Destruction or Alteration of Records in Federal	
	Investigation	349
	Notes and Questions	350
	Destruction of Corporate Audit Records	350
	Notes and Questions	35
	3. Section 1512: Misleading Conduct	351
	United States v. Gabriel	35.
	Notes and Questions	356
	4. Section 1512: Harassment	356
	United States v. Wilson	356
	Notes and Questions	358
	5. Tampering with Records or Otherwise Impeding an	
	Official Proceeding	358
	Notes and Questions	359
	B. Coercive Witness Tampering	359
	United States v. Willard	359
	Notes and Questions	360
	Note on Retaliation Against Witnesses and Informants	360
	Notes and Questions	361
V.	The Fifth Amendment Privilege	361
	A. The Act of Production Doctrine	361
	Notes and Questions	364
	B. The Enron Investigation	364
	Case Study: SEC v. Lay	364
	Memorandum of the Securities and	
	Exchange Commission in Support of Its	
	Application for Orders to Show Cause,	
	for an In Camera Review, and Requiring	
	Obedience to Subpoena	365
	Reply of the Securities and Exchange Commission	
	in Support of Its Application for Order	
	Requiring Obedience to Subpoena	370
	Stipulation and Order Requiring Production	
	of Records	373
9		
	Bribery of Public Officials	375
I.	Introduction	375
II.	Bribery of Public Officials	376
	A. Official Acts	376
	United States v. Parker	376

Conte	nts			xix
		Notes and Questions		378
		United States v. Arroyo		<i>378</i>
		Notes and Questions		381
	B. Motive and	Intent		381
		United States v. Sun-Diamond Growers of	f	
		California		381
		Notes and Questions		385
		United States v. Anderson		386
		Notes and Questions		388
	C. Thing of V	'alue		389
		United States v. Williams		389
		Problem 9-1		390
	D. Public Offi	cials		390
	 Appoir 	nted Officials		391
		Dixson v. United States		391
		Notes and Questions		395
	2. Elected	d Officials		395
		United States v. Brewster		395
		Notes and Questions		401
	E. Cooperatin	g Witnesses		401
		United States v. Ware		401
		Notes and Questions		405
III.	Federal Progran	n Bribery		406
		Salinas v. United States		406
		Notes and Questions		409
		United States v. DeLaurentis		409
		Notes and Questions		411
		Sabri v. United States		412
		Notes and Questions		415
		United States v. Copeland		416
		Notes and Questions		419
IV.	Extortion Under	Color of Official Right		419
		Evans v. United States		419
		Notes and Questions		424
10	•			
			RICO	425
I.	Introduction			425
II.	The Enterprise			425
		United States v. Turkette		426
		Notes and Questions		420
		Problem 10-1		429
		National Organization for Women v.		429
		Scheidler		430
				マンし

XX		Contents
	Notes and Questions	433
	Note on Interstate Commerce Requirement	433
III.	Pattern of Racketeering Activity	435
	A. The Pattern Requirement	435
	H.J., Inc. v. Northwestern Bell Telephone	436
	Notes and Questions	442
	B. State Predicate Crimes	443
	United States v. Garner	443
	Notes and Questions	447
	Problem 10-2	447
	Note on the Dual Sovereignty Doctrine	447
IV.	Relationship Between Person and Enterprise	448
	Reves v. Ernst & Young	448
	Notes and Questions	452
	Problem 10-3	452
	McCullough v. Suter	453
	Note on Relational Elements	454
V.	RICO Conspiracies	455
	Salinas v. United States	455
	Notes and Questions	457
VI.	Asset Forfeiture	458
	A. Forfeitable Interests	458
	United States v. Simmons	458
	Notes and Questions	462
	United States v. Rubin	463
	Notes and Questions	466
	B. Third-Party Interests	466
	United States v. BCCI Holdings	467
	Notes and Questions	471
	C. Attorneys' Fees	472
	Caplin & Drysdale v. United States	473
	Notes and Questions	476
	United States v. Moffitt, Zwerling & Kemler,	
	P.C.	476
	Notes and Questions D. Constitutional Limits	480
		482
		482
	Alexander v. United States 2. Alexander II	482
	3. Alexander III	484
		484
	United States v. Alexander (Alexander III)	485
VII.	Notes and Questions Civil Liability	486
V 11.	A. Injury to Business or Property	486
	Sedima, S.P.R.L. v. Imrex Co.	487
	Notes and Questions	487
	Libertad v. Welch	491
	Notes and Questions	491
	Tions and Questions	494