

# THE ANATOMY OF JUDGEMENT

AN INVESTIGATION INTO THE  
PROCESSES OF PERCEPTION  
AND REASONING

M.L.J. Abercrombie



PARIS  
IN THE  
THE SPRING



BIRD  
IN THE  
THE HAND



ONCE  
IN A  
A LIFETIME

# THE ANATOMY OF JUDGEMENT

AN INVESTIGATION INTO THE PROCESSES  
OF PERCEPTION AND REASONING

*M. L. Johnson Abercrombie*

*'an association in which the free development of each  
is the condition of the free development of all'*

**FA<sup>B</sup>**

Free Association Books / London / 1989

Published in Great Britain in 1989 by  
Free Association Books  
26 Freegrove Road  
London N7 9RQ

First published 1960

Copyright © M. L. Johnson Abercrombie 1960

*British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data*  
Abercrombie, M. L. J. (Minnie Louise Johnson), 1909-1984

The anatomy of judgement.

1. Judgement

I. Title

153.4'6

ISBN 1-85343-106-0

Printed and bound in Great Britain by  
Bookcraft, Midsomer Norton, Avon

## *Publisher's Foreword*

Because it is so lucid and clear, this book needs little introduction except for the purpose of emphasizing its current relevance. It is an utterly accessible, empirically-based introduction to the unconscious dimensions of perception and judgement. In particular, the author shows with great eloquence just how complicated and subject to context are the supposedly most unequivocal facts – those of science.

The relevance to the present is that there is an important coming together of ideas from psychoanalysis and philosophy, so that a psychoanalytic theory of knowledge is in sight, though not yet in sharp focus. We have in the work of M. L. Johnson Abercrombie a synthesis of ideas and research from group analysis, the psychology of perception and the philosophy of science. Abercrombie applies them to the learning process of applied scientists, namely medical students. Using group analytic methods derived from S. H. Foulkes, she then shows how group explorations can shed light on the processes by which we come to have experiences which we believe to be unequivocal.

I suggest that this book is an essential introduction to a psychoanalytic epistemology of everyday life and of science. I read it when it was first published in 1960; its insights have remained with me, and its relevance to the present strikes me as considerable.

Robert M. Young  
*Spring 1989*

## Acknowledgments

I am indebted to M. Abercrombie, B. C. Brookes, H. F. Brookes, Jean MacGibbon, L. E. R. Picken, and J. Z. Young for criticizing one or other drafts of this book, and to Maureen T. Blazey and Pauline Gregory for invaluable secretarial assistance. Many flaws have been removed as a result of their labour and their interest has sustained me.

For making possible the work that this book reports, I am deeply grateful to Professor J. Z. Young, to the Rockefeller Foundation, and to preclinical students at University College, London, in whose company I spent many delightful and profitable hours.

The work was strongly influenced by that of S. H. Foulkes on group analytic psychotherapy, and by that of the late Adelbert Ames, Jr., and others who have researched on the projective nature of perception. I wish to record my gratitude to them and to the many others who have contributed to the work, knowingly or unknowingly, either by personal contact or by their writings.

Finally, acknowledgements are due to the following for permission to reproduce illustrations. *The American Journal of Psychology* (Fig. 1). American Psychological Assn. (Fig. 6). *Centre d'Etudes et Documentation Préhistoriques* (Plates II A and III A, from *Four Hundred Years of Cave Art*, by H. Breuil). Harper and Brothers (Fig. 8). *Horizons de France* (Plates II B and III B, from *Le Monde des Mammifères*, by F. Bourlière). Dr. F. P. Kilpatrick (Fig. 9 and Plate VI). Kunsthistorisches Museum (Plate I). The Prehistoric Society (Fig. 7). The Readers' Digest Association Ltd. and *This Week* (Fig. 3, from the British Edition, Nov., 1954). *Verlag Hans Huber* (Plate IV, from *Psychodiagnosics*, by H. Rorschach.)

*To*  
MY MOTHER,  
MY HUSBAND, &  
MY SON

# Contents

*Publisher's Foreword*

*Acknowledgements*

1	Introduction: The Anatomy of Judgement	13
---	----------------------------------------	----

## **Part One**

*The relation between the inside and outside worlds*

2	Seeing Pictures	23
3	Learning to See	40
4	Human Relations in Getting Information	55

## **Part Two**

*Explorations in thinking*

5	The Nature of Free Group Discussion	67
6	Seeing and Thinking	83
7	Using Words	93
8	Classifying	110
9	Evaluating Evidence	119
10	The Effects of the Discussion Course	125
11	On Suffering Change	130

	<i>Argument</i>	142
--	-----------------	-----

	<i>Appendix</i>	143
--	-----------------	-----

	<i>Bibliography</i>	145
--	---------------------	-----

	<i>Index</i>	151
--	--------------	-----

## *List of Plates*

I	Peasant Wedding (Breughel)	<i>Facing Page</i>	34
II	Cave paintings and live animals:		36
	(a) Bison, Altamira		
	(b) Wildebeest, N. Rhodesia		
III	Cave paintings and live animals:		37
	(a) Swimming stags, Altamira		
	(b) Migrating reindeer, Lapland		
IV	A typical Rorschach inkblot		42
V	A radiograph as a subject of interpretation		42
VI	The distorted room (Kilpatrick)		43
VII	Radiograph of hands		86

## *Line Diagrams*

FIG.

1	The Hidden Man ( <i>after</i> Porter)	<i>Page</i>	24
2	The relation between object, observer and information received		26
3	The Three Triangles ( <i>after</i> Brooks)		28
4	The Three Men ( <i>after</i> Metzger)		31
5	The Two Shapes		32
6	Ambiguous figures		33
7	Cave paintings and dead animals		37
8	The Distorted Room ( <i>after</i> Kelley)		43
9	The Three Chairs ( <i>after</i> Kilpatrick)		45
10	The Müller-Lyer illusion		53
11	Lines of communication in (a) a lecture, (b) tutorial discussion and (c) group discussion		68
12	The Hidden Man revealed		144



THE ANATOMY  
OF JUDGEMENT



# THE ANATOMY OF JUDGEMENT

AN INVESTIGATION INTO THE PROCESSES  
OF PERCEPTION AND REASONING

*M. L. Johnson Abercrombie*

*'an association in which the free development of each  
is the condition of the free development of all'*

**FA<sup>B</sup>**

Free Association Books / London / 1989

Published in Great Britain in 1989 by  
Free Association Books  
26 Freegrove Road  
London N7 9RQ

First published 1960

Copyright © M. L. Johnson Abercrombie 1960

*British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data*  
Abercrombie, M. L. J. (Minnie Louise Johnson), 1909-1984  
The anatomy of judgement.

1. Judgement

I. Title

153.4'6

ISBN 1-85343-106-0

Printed and bound in Great Britain by  
Bookcraft, Midsomer Norton, Avon

# Contents

*Publisher's Foreword*

*Acknowledgements*

1	Introduction: The Anatomy of Judgement	13
---	----------------------------------------	----

## **Part One**

*The relation between the inside and outside worlds*

2	Seeing Pictures	23
3	Learning to See	40
4	Human Relations in Getting Information	55

## **Part Two**

*Explorations in thinking*

5	The Nature of Free Group Discussion	67
6	Seeing and Thinking	83
7	Using Words	93
8	Classifying	110
9	Evaluating Evidence	119
10	The Effects of the Discussion Course	125
11	On Suffering Change	130
	<i>Argument</i>	142
	<i>Appendix</i>	143
	<i>Bibliography</i>	145
	<i>Index</i>	151

## *List of Plates*

I Peasant Wedding (Breughel)	<i>Facing Page</i> 34
II Cave paintings and live animals:	36
(a) Bison, Altamira	
(b) Wildebeest, N. Rhodesia	
III Cave paintings and live animals:	37
(a) Swimming stags, Altamira	
(b) Migrating reindeer, Lapland	
IV A typical Rorschach inkblot	42
V A radiograph as a subject of interpretation	42
VI The distorted room (Kilpatrick)	43
VII Radiograph of hands	86

## *Line Diagrams*

FIG.		
1	The Hidden Man ( <i>after</i> Porter)	<i>Page</i> 24
2	The relation between object, observer and information received	26
3	The Three Triangles ( <i>after</i> Brooks)	28
4	The Three Men ( <i>after</i> Metzger)	31
5	The Two Shapes	32
6	Ambiguous figures	33
7	Cave paintings and dead animals	37
8	The Distorted Room ( <i>after</i> Kelley)	43
9	The Three Chairs ( <i>after</i> Kilpatrick)	45
10	The Müller-Lyer illusion	53
11	Lines of communication in (a) a lecture, (b) tutorial discussion and (c) group discussion	68
12	The Hidden Man revealed	144

## *Publisher's Foreword*

Because it is so lucid and clear, this book needs little introduction except for the purpose of emphasizing its current relevance. It is an utterly accessible, empirically-based introduction to the unconscious dimensions of perception and judgement. In particular, the author shows with great eloquence just how complicated and subject to context are the supposedly most unequivocal facts – those of science.

The relevance to the present is that there is an important coming together of ideas from psychoanalysis and philosophy, so that a psychoanalytic theory of knowledge is in sight, though not yet in sharp focus. We have in the work of M. L. Johnson Abercrombie a synthesis of ideas and research from group analysis, the psychology of perception and the philosophy of science. Abercrombie applies them to the learning process of applied scientists, namely medical students. Using group analytic methods derived from S. H. Foulkes, she then shows how group explorations can shed light on the processes by which we come to have experiences which we believe to be unequivocal.

I suggest that this book is an essential introduction to a psychoanalytic epistemology of everyday life and of science. I read it when it was first published in 1960; its insights have remained with me, and its relevance to the present strikes me as considerable.

Robert M. Young  
*Spring 1989*





## Acknowledgments

I am indebted to M. Abercrombie, B. C. Brookes, H. F. Brookes, Jean MacGibbon, L. E. R. Picken, and J. Z. Young for criticizing one or other drafts of this book, and to Maureen T. Blazey and Pauline Gregory for invaluable secretarial assistance. Many flaws have been removed as a result of their labour and their interest has sustained me.

For making possible the work that this book reports, I am deeply grateful to Professor J. Z. Young, to the Rockefeller Foundation, and to preclinical students at University College, London, in whose company I spent many delightful and profitable hours.

The work was strongly influenced by that of S. H. Foulkes on group analytic psychotherapy, and by that of the late Adelbert Ames, Jr., and others who have researched on the projective nature of perception. I wish to record my gratitude to them and to the many others who have contributed to the work, knowingly or unknowingly, either by personal contact or by their writings.

Finally, acknowledgements are due to the following for permission to reproduce illustrations. *The American Journal of Psychology* (Fig. 1). American Psychological Assn. (Fig. 6). *Centre d'Etudes et Documentation Préhistoriques* (Plates II A and III A, from *Four Hundred Years of Cave Art*, by H. Breuil). Harper and Brothers (Fig. 8). *Horizons de France* (Plates II B and III B, from *Le Monde des Mammifères*, by F. Bourlière). Dr. F. P. Kilpatrick (Fig. 9 and Plate VI). Kunsthistorisches Museum (Plate I). The Prehistoric Society (Fig. 7). The Readers' Digest Association Ltd. and *This Week* (Fig. 3, from the British Edition, Nov., 1954). *Verlag Hans Huber* (Plate IV, from *Psychodiagnosics*, by H. Rorschach.)