

# HONG KONG CASES

**1992**

**Volume 1**

*General Editor*

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

*Butterworths Asia*

*Singapore • Kuala Lumpur • Hong Kong*

### **The Butterworth Group of Companies**

Singapore	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01 International Plaza, Singapore 0207
Hong Kong	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA (HONG KONG) 19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 9651400 Fax: 9760840
Malaysia	MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur
Australia	BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra
Canada	BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver
Ireland	BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin
New Zealand	BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland
Puerto Rico	BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan
UK	BUTTERWORTH & CO (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh
USA	BUTTERWORTH LEGAL PUBLISHERS Salem, New Hampshire and Carlsbad, California

Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed International (Singapore) Pte Ltd.

© Butterworths Asia, 1994

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

ISBN 0-409-99709-9

Typeset by Butterworths Asia and Superskill Graphics  
Produced by Mandarin Offset Ltd  
Printed and bound in Hong Kong

## *General Editor*

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

## *Associate Editors*

Grenville Cross QC

Ruy Barretto, Barrister

Michael Ozorio, Barrister

Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister

Susan Kwan, Barrister

Peter Garland, Barrister

Malcolm Merry, Barrister

Aarif Barma, Barrister

Andrew Cheung, Barrister

Peter Ng, Barrister

Joseph Fok, Barrister

Anderson Chow, Barrister

Teresa Cheng, Barrister

David Fitzpatrick, Barrister

Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister

Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University

Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

## *Reporters in this volume*

Danny Choi, Barrister

George F Chu, Barrister

Simon CK Chui, Barrister

Anne-Marie Gordon, Barrister

Paul Harris, Barrister

MJ Kenny, Barrister

Gary Kwan, Barrister

Christopher Lam, Barrister

Godfrey Lam, Barrister

Osmond Lam, Barrister

Raymond Lau Wai Man, Barrister

Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister

Raymond Leung, Barrister

PY Lo, Barrister

Lawrence Ng, Barrister

Raymond Tsui Wai Nam, Barrister

Daniel Wan, Barrister

Anthony P Kinnear

## **Butterworths Asia**

Managing Editor: Anthony P Kinnear

Deputy Managing Editor: Zarinah Marican

Publisher: David Catterall

# TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

List of abbreviations used in this volume (excluding reports):

A	High Court Action
ACJ	Acting Chief Justice
A-G	Attorney General
AR	Application for Review
App	Appendix
art	article
Aust	Australia
CA	Court of Appeal
CA	Civil Appeal Number in references to unreported cases (eg CA 2/92)
CJ	Chief Justice
Cap	Chapter (as in Chapter Number of an Ordinance)
Crim App	Criminal Appeal
Comm L	Commercial List
Con L	Construction List
ch	chapter (as in chapter number of a book)
cl(l)	clause(s)
DC	District Court
DCA	District Court Action
DJ	District Judge
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
EC	European Communities
ECC	Economic Compensation Case
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities
EEC	European Economic Communities
Ed	Edition
Ex Ch	Court of Exchequer Chamber
exh	exhibit
HC	High Court
HL	House of Lords
HMSO	Her Majesty's Stationery Office
J(J)	Justice(s)
J(J)A	Justice(s) of Appeal
LTA	Labour Tribunal Appeal
LC	Lord Chancellor
MA	Magistracy Appeal
MCA	Magistracy Criminal Appeal
MP	Miscellaneous Proceedings
MR	Master of the Rolls
n	note
NSW	New South Wales
O	Order (of the Rules of the Supreme Court)
PC	Privy Council
PCA	Privy Council Appeal
PRC	People's Republic of China

## Abbreviations

---

Pt	Part
para	paragraph
RSC	Rules of the Supreme Court
r(r)	rule(s)
reg	regulation
s	section
sub-s	subsection
Sch	Schedule
TMR	Trade Marks Registry
UN	United Nations
USDC	United States District Court
Uncitral	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
VP(P)	Vice-President(s)
WCC	Workers' Compensation Case

### List of abbreviations of law reports:

AC	Law Reports, Appeal Cases (HL and PC); since 1890
ACLC	Australian Company Law Cases; since 1982
All ER	All England Law Reports; since 1936
App Cas	Law Reports, Appeal Cases, House of Lords, 15 volumes; 1875–1890
BCC	British Company Law Cases; since 1983
BCLC	Butterworths Company Law Cases; since 1978
BLR	Business Law Review
BWCC	Butterworths' Workmen's Compensation Cases, 41 volumes; 1913–1937
Beav	Beavan's Reports, Rolls Court, 36 volumes, 1838–1866
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports; since 1903
CM & R	Crompton, Meeson and Roscoe's Reports, Exchequer, 2 volumes; 1834–1835
CPD	Law Reports, Common Pleas Division; 5 volumes; 1875–1880
Ch	Law Reports, Chancery Division; since 1890
Ch App	Law Reports, Chancery Appeals, 10 volumes; 1865–1875
Ch D	Law Reports, Chancery Division, 45 volumes; 1875–1890
Com LR	Commercial Law Reports
Cox CC	EW Cox's Criminal Law Cases, 31 volumes; 1843–1941
Cr App R	Criminal Appeal Reports (HL and CA(UK)); since 1908
Cr App R (S)	Criminal Appeal Reports (Sentencing); since 1979
Crim LR	Criminal Law Review; since 1954
DCLR	District Court Law Reports

# Hong Kong Cases

---

DLR	Dominion Law Reports
De G & Sm	De Gex and Smale's Reports, Chancery, 4 volumes; 1857–1859
De GM & G	De Gex, Macnaghten and Gordon's Reports, Chancery, 8 volumes; 1851–1857
ER	English Reports, 178 volumes; 1220–1865
FLR	Family Law Reports
FSR	Fleet Street Reports; since 1975
Fam	Law Reports, Family Division; since 1972
HKCLR	Hong Kong Criminal Law Reports
HKLR	Hong Kong Law Reports
HKLJ	Hong Kong Law Journal
HL Cas	Clark's Reports, House of Lords, 11 volumes; 1847–1866
HLR	Housing Law Reports
ICR	Industrial Cases Reports; since 1975
KB	Law Reports, King's Bench Division, 53 volumes; 1901–1952
LR Eq	Law Reports, Equity Cases, 20 volumes; 1865–1875
LR Exch	Law Reports, Exchequer, 10 volumes; 1865–1875
LRCP	Law Reports, Common Pleas, 10 volumes; 1865–1875
LRHL	Law Reports, English and Irish Peerage Claims, House of Lords, 7 volumes; 1866–1875
LRQB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench, 10 volumes; 1865–1875
LT	Law Times Reports, 177 volumes; 1859–1947
Lloyd LR	Lloyd's List Law Reports; 1919–1950
Lloyd's Rep	Lloyd's List Law Reports; since 1951
NI	Northern Ireland Law Reports; since 1925
NZLR	New Zealand Law Reports; since 1883
P	Law Reports, Probate, Divorce and Admiralty Division; 1891–1971
QB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1891–1900, and since 1952
QBD	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1875–1890
RPC	Reports of Patent Cases; since 1884
RTR	Road Traffic Reports; since 1970
SJ	Solicitors Journal
SLT	Scots Law Times; since 1893
SR (NSW)	New South Wales, state Reports, since 1901
TLR	The Times Law Reports, 71 volumes; 1884–1950
TLR	The Times Law Reports; since 1951
US	United States Reports
WLR	Weekly Law Reports; since 1953
WN	Law Reports, Weekly Notes, 87 volumes; 1866–1952
WCC	Workmen's Compensation Cases (Minton–Senhouse), 9 volumes; 1898–1907

## TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

The mode of citation of cases reported in this volume of *Hong Kong Cases* is [1992] 1 HKC (page).

	Page		Page
<b>A</b>			
ACL Electronics (HK) Ltd v Bulmer Ltd & Anor .....	[CA] 133	Chau Woon & Anor; Fu Kwong Woon v .....	[DC] 562
Akira Sugiyama v Kosei Securities Co (Asia) Ltd .....	[HC] 261	Chen Hsiao Mei Oung Lilian v Chen Shih Ta Michael .....	[CA] 40
Ample Treasure Ltd v Eight Gain Investments Ltd .....	[HC] 457	Chen Shih Ta Michael; Chen Hsiao Mei Oung Lilian v .....	[CA] 40
Attorney General v Ko Sai Man & Ors .....	[CA] 33	Cheung Moon Chee (Administrator of the Estate of Ngan Sau, deceased) v Commissioner of Police & Anor .....	[HC] 271
Attorney General v Lam Sau Ki .....	[CA] 92	Cheung Tin Ming; Kwangtung Provincial Bank v .....	[HC] 344
Attorney General v Lau Ching Yau & Anor .....	[CA] 66	China State Construction Engineering Corp Guangdong Branch v Madiford Ltd .....	[HC] 320
Attorney General v Ng Kam Chuen & Anor .....	[CA] 51	Chinakong Manufactory Ltd v Uniden Hong Kong .....	[HC] 481
Attorney General v Wellcome Foundation Ltd .....	[CA] 158	Choy Bing Wing v Ng Yat Chi .....	[HC] 508
Attorney General; Wellcome Foundation Ltd v .....	[HC] 171	Chu Chi Wing & Anor; Lee Siu Man v .....	[HC] 266
Au Wing Cheung v Roserick Ltd .....	[CA] 149	Chu Chin Yiau v Ray On Construction Co Ltd .....	[HC] 246
Auto-Treasure Ltd t/a Albert Jewelry Creation v Noble Diamond Ltd t/a Noble Jewellery & Anor .....	[CA] 117	Chuen Wah Trading Co; Star Ferry Co Ltd v .....	[HC] 415
<b>B</b>		Co-Horse Ltd v Siu Mun Yee .....	[HC] 595
Bank of Credit and Commerce Hong Kong Ltd, Re .....	[HC] 282	Commissioner of Police & Anor; Cheung Moon Chee (Administrator of the Estate of Ngan Sau, deceased) v .....	[HC] 271
Bulmer Ltd & Anor; ACL Electronics (HK) Ltd v .....	[CA] 133	Comtrad Industries Ltd & Ors v RJP International Ltd .....	[HC] 519
Burmah Castrol Chemicals Ltd & Anor v Wong Fu & Co Ltd .....	[HC] 287	Crownhall Investments Ltd (in liquidation) & Anor, Re .....	[CA] 137
<b>C</b>		<b>D</b>	
Cabot Plastics Hong Kong Ltd; R v .....	[HC] 465	Dr Koo Chih Ling Linda & Anor v Dr Lam Tai Hing .....	[HC] 193
Chan Kai & Ors v The Queen .....	[PC] 1		
Chan Kwai Ngor v Leung Fat Hang t/a Fu Dor Restaurant .....	[HC] 408		
Chan Sing Chuk & Ors; Innovisions Ltd v .....	[HC] 348		

# Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Dr Lam Tai Hing; Dr Koo Chih Ling Linda & Anor v .. [HC]	193	Kenven Transportation Ltd; Katran Shipping Co Ltd v .... [HC]	538
<b>E</b>		King Light Industrial Ltd & Anor; Lo Wai Keung v .... [HC]	389
Eight Gain Investments Ltd; Ample Treasure Ltd v ..... [HC]	457	Ko Sai Man & Ors; Attorney General v ..... [CA]	33
<b>F</b>		Kong Chung Ching & Anor v Lam King Ho & Anor (Administrators of the Estate of So Ping Yim, deceased) ... [CA]	104
FM International Ltd; Shenzhen Nan Da Industrial and Trade United Co Ltd v .. [HC]	328	Kosei Securities Co (Asia) Ltd; Akira Sugiyama v ..... [HC]	261
FSR; FWC v ..... [HC]	490	Kwangtung Provincial Bank v Cheung Tin Ming ..... [HC]	344
FWC v FSR ..... [HC]	490	<b>L</b>	
Fok Por v Sum Shuk Ching .... [DC]	581	Lam King Ho & Anor (Administrators of the Estate of So Ping Yim, deceased); Kong Chung Ching & Anor v ..... [CA]	104
Fu Kwong Woon v Chau Woon & Anor ..... [DC]	562	Lam Put v Tai Yieh Construction and Engineering Co Ltd ..... [HC]	291
<b>G</b>		Lam Sau Ki; Attorney General v ..... [CA]	92
Galco International Toys NV; Kader Industrial Co Ltd v .... [CA]	36	Lam Yin Yung; R v ..... [CA]	98
Golden Palace Ballroom v Wai Luen Investment Co Ltd ..... [HC]	241	Lau Chin & Anor v Ng Yau Chi & Ors ..... [CA]	58
<b>H</b>		Lau Ching Yau & Anor; Attorney General v ..... [CA]	66
Hong Kong and Yaumati Ferry Co Ltd; Wong Hing Faat v ..... [HC]	497	Lee Chai Cheong & Anor v Prudential Enterprise Ltd ..... [CA]	15
Hong Nin Security Co Ltd v Tsang Ming & Ors ..... [HC]	338	Lee Siu Man v Chu Chi Wing & Anor ..... [HC]	266
<b>I</b>		Leung Fat Hang t/a Fu Dor Restaurant; Chan Kwai Ngor v ..... [HC]	408
Icos Vibro Ltd v SFK Construction Management Ltd & Anor ..... [HC]	296	Levi Strauss & Co v Maruichi Holdings (HK) Ltd & Ors ..... [HC]	419
Ideal Consolidators Ltd v Maeda Corp & Anor ..... [HC]	528	Lin Shun Hung Stephen; Mingson Industries Ltd v .... [DC]	588
Innovisions Ltd v Chan Sing Chuk & Ors ..... [HC]	348	Lo Shu Keung & Ors; R v ..... [CA]	71
International United Shipping Agency Ltd; Yu Sang v ..... [DC]	542	Lo Wai Keung v King Light Industrial Ltd & Anor ..... [HC]	389
<b>K</b>			
Kader Industrial Co Ltd v Galco International Toys NV ..... [CA]	36		
Kai Hui Wai & Anor; R v ..... [CA]	122		
Katran Shipping Co Ltd v Kenven Transportation Ltd .. [HC]	538		



Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
Lui Cho Hung Boris t/a Boris Lui & Co v Yuen Kong Ling Cana & Anor..... [HC]	523	<b>Q</b> Queen, The; Chan Kai & Ors v ..... [PC]	1
<b>M</b>		<b>R</b>	
Madiford Ltd; China State Construction Engineering Corp Guangdong Branch v ..... [HC]	320	R v Cabot Plastics Hong Kong Ltd ..... [HC]	465
Maeda Corp & Anor; Ideal Consolidators Ltd v ..... [HC]	528	R v Kai Hui Wai & Anor ..... [CA]	122
Man Shing Electrical Manufactory Ltd; Ming Kee Manufactory Ltd v ..... [HC]	442	R v Lam Yin Yung ..... [CA]	98
Maruichi Holdings (HK) Ltd & Ors; Levi Strauss & Co v ..... [HC]	419	R v Lo Shu Keung & Ors ..... [CA]	71
Ming Kee Manufactory Ltd v Man Shing Electrical Manufactory Ltd ..... [HC]	442	R v Tse Kwok Fu ..... [CA]	142
Mingson Industries Ltd v Lin Shun Hung Stephen ..... [DC]	588	R v Tsoi Sai Pui & Ors ..... [HC]	468
<b>N</b>		R v Wong Kam Wah & Anor ..... [CA]	28
Ng Kam Chuen & Anor; Attorney General v ..... [CA]	51	R v Yeung Hing Yu ..... [CA]	128
Ng Yat Chi; Choy Bing Wing v ..... [HC]	508	R v Yeung Ka Wah ..... [CA]	84
Ng Yau Chi & Ors; Lau Chin & Anor v ..... [CA]	58	R v Yeung Kam Fat ..... [CA]	62
Noble Diamond Ltd t/a Noble Jewellery & Anor; Auto-Treasure Ltd t/a Albert Jewelry Creation v .... [CA]	117	RJP International Ltd; Comtrad Industries Ltd & Ors v ..... [HC]	519
<b>O</b>		Ray On Construction Co Ltd; Chu Chin Yiau v ..... [HC]	246
Official Receiver; Tae Kim Chang & Anor v ..... [HC]	403	Roseric Ltd; Au Wing Cheung v ..... [CA]	149
<b>P</b>		<b>S</b>	
PH Shek Ltd & Anor; Prudential Mall Ltd v ..... [PC]	7	SFK Construction Management Ltd & Anor; Icos Vibro Ltd v ..... [HC]	296
Pak Yuk May t/a Mei House v Tsang Yuk Sim ..... [HC]	381	Sea Empire, The ..... [HC]	357
Prudential Enterprise Ltd; Lee Chai Cheong & Anor v ..... [CA]	15	Shenzhen Nan Da Industrial and Trade United Co Ltd v FM International Ltd ..... [HC]	328
Prudential Mall Ltd v PH Shek Ltd & Anor ..... [PC]	7	Silver Source Development Ltd v Time Century Ltd ..... [HC]	366
		Siu Mun Yee; Co-Horse Ltd v ..... [HC]	595
		Star Ferry Co Ltd v Chuen Wah Trading Co ..... [HC]	415
		Sum Shuk Ching; Fok Por v ... [DC]	581
		Swire Pacific Ltd; Wong Chick v ..... [DC]	571
		<b>T</b>	
		Tae Kim Chang & Anor v Official Receiver ..... [HC]	403

# Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Tai Yieh Construction and Engineering Co Ltd; Lam Put v ..... [HC]	291	Wellcome Foundation Ltd; Attorney General v ..... [CA]	158
Time Century Ltd; Silver Source Development Ltd v ..... [HC]	366	Wong Chick v Swire Pacific Ltd ..... [DC]	571
Tsang Ming & Ors; Hong Nin Security Co Ltd v ..... [HC]	338	Wong Fu & Co Ltd; Burmah Castrol Chemicals Ltd & Anor v ..... [HC]	287
Tsang Yuk Sim; Pak Yuk May t/a Mei House v ..... [HC]	381	Wong Hing Faat v Hong Kong and Yaumati Ferry Co Ltd ..... [HC]	497
Tse Kwok Fu; R v ..... [CA]	142	Wong Kam Wah & Anor; R v ..... [CA]	28
Tsoi Kay & Anor v Wu John Baptist ..... [HC]	475	Wu John Baptist; Tsoi Kay & Anor v ..... [HC]	475
Tsoi Sai Pui & Ors; R v ..... [HC]	468		
		<b>Y</b>	
<b>U</b>		Yeung Hing Yu; R v ..... [CA]	128
Uniden Hong Kong; Chinakong Manufactory Ltd v ..... [HC]	481	Yeung Ka Wah; R v ..... [CA]	84
United Strength Ltd, Re ..... [HC]	386	Yeung Kam Fat; R v ..... [CA]	62
		Yu Sang v International United Shipping Agency Ltd ..... [DC]	542
<b>W</b>		Yuen Kong Ling Cana & Anor; Lui Cho Hung Boris t/a Boris Lui & Co v ..... [HC]	523
Wai Luen Investment Co Ltd; Golden Palace Ballroom v ... [HC]	241	Yun Jip Auto Services Ltd, Re [HC]	234
Wellcome Foundation Ltd v Attorney General ..... [HC]	171		

# SUBJECT INDEX

## ARBITRATION

### Enforcement

Dispute as to whether parties agreed on Beijing arbitration or Hong Kong arbitration – Whether award a ‘Convention award’ – Whether procedure irregular – Role of enforcing court – Need to refer to sources on convention – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 44

*Shenzhen Nan Da Industrial and Trade United Co Ltd v FM International Ltd*  
HC 328

### Mareva injunction

Jurisdiction of court – Agreement that disputes be settled by application of British maritime law – Whether Mareva injunction considered an interim measure of protection – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) Fifth Schedule art 9 – Uncitral Model Law

*Katran Shipping Co Ltd v Kenven Transportation Ltd* HC 538

### Stay of proceedings

Scope of arbitration clause – Whether UNCITRAL Model Law applies – Effect of Arbitration (Amendment No 2) Ordinance 1989 s 26 – Forum non conveniens – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 6A – Arbitration (Amendment No 2) Ordinance 1989 s 26

*China State Construction Engineering Corp Guangdong Branch v Madiford Ltd*

HC 320

Summary judgment – Deduction for late completion – Whether penalty clause – Claim for interest of sums unlawfully withheld – Striking out application – Application for dismissal from proceedings – Unconditional leave to defend – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 6 – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14, O 15 & O 18

*Icos Vibro Ltd v SFK Construction Management Ltd & Anor* HC 296

## BANKING AND FINANCE

### Exchange contracts

Whether unenforceable – Whether contrary to Bretton Woods Agreements – Whether deposits with company exchange contracts contrary to Thai law – Meaning of ‘exchange contract’ – Onus of proof on person alleging unenforceability – Bretton Woods Agreements Order in Council 1946 art VIII s 2(b)

*Tae Kim Chang & Anor v Official Receiver* HC 403

## CIVIL PROCEDURE

### Appeal

Appeal against variation of restraint order – Restraint order varied to allow company in liquidation to exercise rights of set off – Whether leave to appeal against variation of order required under s 186 of Companies Ordinance – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 186 – Drug Trafficking (Recovery of Proceeds) Ordinance (Cap 405) ss 10, 11, 12 & 13

*Re Bank of Credit and Commerce Hong Kong Ltd* HC 282

Lower court exercising discretionary powers – Appeal against costs – Whether decision open to appeal to Court of Appeal – Principles on which leave to appeal may be granted

*Chen Hsiao Mei Oung Lilian v Chen Shih Ta Michael* CA 40

### Costs

Common fund basis – Whether manner in which defence was conducted an affront to court – Whether circumstances warranted costs on a common fund basis – Rules of the Supreme Court O 64 r 28(2), (4) & (4A)

*Dr Koo Chih Ling Linda & Anor v Dr Lam Tai Hing* HC 193

Interim payment – Payment into court – Defects in notice of payment – Rules of the Supreme Court O 22 r 1, O 29 r 16 & O 62 r 5

*Prudential Mall Ltd v PH Shek Ltd & Anor* PC 7

Taxation – Doctor's fee for attendance at court taxed down – Power of District Court judge to review decision of assistant registrar of Supreme Court acting as registrar of District Court – Insufficient evidence before court to determine issue – Appointment of two assessors and order for further hearing of review – Rules of the Supreme Court (Cap 4) O 62 r 35(3) – Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) s 53

*Lam Put v Tai Yieh Construction and Engineering Co Ltd* HC 291

Wardship proceedings – Costs follow the event – Appeal relating only to costs – Appeal out of time – Whether leave is necessary

*Chen Hsiao Mei Oung Lilian v Chen Shih Ta Michael* CA 40

### Cross-appeal

Appeal from a Master to judge-in-chambers – Whether defendant required to serve formal cross-appeal – Notice required as a matter of good practice – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14

*Chinakong Manufactory Ltd v Uniden Hong Kong* HC 481

### Discovery

*Norwich Pharmacal* order – Administrative inconvenience

*Wellcome Foundation Ltd v Attorney General* HC 171

*Norwich Pharmacal* order – Discovery against the Commissioner of Customs and Excise – Grounds on which *Norwich Pharmacal* order can be made

*Attorney General v Wellcome Foundation Ltd* CA 158

*Norwich Pharmacal* order – Patent and trademark infringement – Whether case made out – Patent Act 1977 s 60(1) – Trade Marks Ordinance (Cap 43) s 27(3)

*Wellcome Foundation Ltd v Attorney General* HC 171

Production of list of documents – Distinction between listing and production of documents – Documents 'in a person's power' – Meaning of 'power' –

Affidavit in verification – Rules of the Supreme Court O 24 rr 7 & 13  
*Innovisions Ltd v Chan Sing Chuk & Ors* HC 348

Time wasting  
*Tsoi Kay & Anor v Wu John Baptist* HC 475

### **District Court judge**

Rank – Whether District Court judge can review decision of registrar of District Court – Whether District Court judge of lower grade than registrar – District Court Ordinance (Cap 336) s 53  
*Lam Put v Tai Yieh Construction and Engineering Co Ltd* HC 291

### **General stay pending appeal**

Judgment by consent for certain sums claimed – Summary judgment for further sums claimed – Unconditional and conditional leave to defend on remaining claims – Stay of execution of judgment pending appeal – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14 r 3(2), O 58 r 1(4) & O 59 r 13(1)  
*Kader Industrial Co Ltd v Galco International Toys NV* CA 36

### **Injunction**

Ex parte application – Standard of material disclosure – Stay of order pending inter parte application  
*Comtrad Industries Ltd & Ors v RJP International Ltd* HC 519

### **Joinder of party**

Amendment of statement of claim – Whether mere allegation of a defendant's own allegation sufficient for plaintiffs to join another defendant  
*Lui Cho Hung Boris t/a Boris Lui & Co v Yuen Kong Ling Cana & Anor* HC 523

### **Pleadings**

Amendment – Leave to amend defence – Personal injury claim – Inclusion of limitation of liability defence – Whether sufficient material facts pleaded to establish elements of defence – Whether prejudice would be caused to plaintiff by allowing amended defence – Substantial lapse of time between accident and raising of defence – Merchant Shipping Act 1894 [UK] s 503  
*Wong Hing Faat v Hong Kong and Yau-mati Ferry Co Ltd* HC 497

Amendments – Whether proposed amendments to statements of claim constitute new causes of action – Rules of the Supreme Court O 20 r 5(5)  
*Attorney General v Ng Kam Chuen & Anor* CA 51

Statement of claim – Title of action – Practice of including words in the title of the action indicating that a company was in liquidation – Whether failure to do so warrants striking out of statement of claim  
*Akira Sugiyama v Kosei Securities Co (Asia) Ltd* HC 261

**Specific discovery**

Copyright action – Practice of Hong Kong courts – Separate hearings for liability and damages – Whether discovery available before liability proved where facts are not in dispute – Documents relevant only for quantum of damages – Rules of the Supreme Court O 24 r 8

*Auto-Treasure Ltd t/a Albert Jewelry Creation v Noble Diamond Ltd t/a Noble Jewellery & Anor* CA 117

**Stay of execution of writs of fieri facias**

Whether O 47 of the Rules of the Supreme Court limited to stays of execution of writs of fieri facias – Court's authority to make order to forgive debt – Rules of the Supreme Court O 47

*Kwangtung Provincial Bank v Cheung Tin Ming* HC 344

**Striking-out**

Non-compliance with order relating to discovery – Whether cross-examination of deponents to be permitted – Rules of the Supreme Court O 24 r 16

*Tsoi Kay & Anor v Wu John Baptist* HC 475

**Summary action for possession**

Proprietary estoppel – Whether assurance equivocal – Whether substantial issue to be tried – Rules of the Supreme Court O 113

*Star Ferry Co Ltd v Chuen Wah Trading Co* HC 415

**Summary judgment**

No affidavit evidence filed by defendant – Whether defendant should be given leave to defend – Affidavit required except in unusual cases – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14

*Chinakong Manufactory Ltd v Uniden Hong Kong* HC 481

Possession of land – Leave to defend – Expenditure of money by tenant on premises on basis of alleged oral agreement raised bona fide defence

*Golden Palace Ballroom v Wai Luen Investment Co Ltd* HC 241

Trade mark infringement – Whether application suitable for infringement cases

*Burmah Castrol Chemicals Ltd & Anor v Wong Fu & Co Ltd* HC 287

**COMPANIES AND CORPORATIONS**

**Dividends**

Claim by executors for dividends declared on shares in a private company held by deceased at time of death – Executors not registered as members of company – Whether company entitled to retain dividends – Whether valid resolution to justify retention

*Lee Chai Cheong & Anor v Prudential Enterprise Ltd* CA 15

## **Liquidation**

Powers of liquidator – Voluntary winding up – Whether liquidator has power to continue legal action commenced by a company without sanction before it was put in voluntary liquidation – ‘Bring an action’ – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) ss 199, 231, 249 & 251 – Rules of the Supreme Court O 6 r 3

*Akira Sugiyama v Kosei Securities Co (Asia) Ltd* HC 261

## **Winding up**

Company assets – Jurisdiction of court to give direction under s 211 – Classes of person to whom section applies – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 211

*Re Crownhall Investments Ltd (in liquidation) & Anor* CA 137

Company in liquidation obtained variation of restraint order allowing it to exercise rights of set off – Appeal against variation of restraint order – Whether leave to appeal required under s 186 of Companies Ordinance – Role of provisional liquidator – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 186 – Drug Trafficking (Recovery of Proceeds) Ordinance (Cap 405) ss 10, 11, 12 & 13

*Re Bank of Credit and Commerce Hong Kong Ltd* HC 282

Consent order that petitioners sell shares to opposing contributories – Shares found to have nil value – Whether shares could be ‘sold’ and ‘purchased’ where nil value – Ordinary commercial terms

*Re Yun Jip Auto Services Ltd* HC 234

Costs of winding up – Petition for winding up on just and equitable grounds disputed by shareholders – Whether order could be made for payment of legal costs out of company’s funds – Whether such payments would be in ordinary course of company’s business – Company’s money not to be expended on shareholder disputes – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) ss 168A, 177(1)(f) & 182

*Re CG & L Investment Ltd and Wyatt Estates Ltd* CA 78

Insolvency – Whether inference of insolvency can be made where there is no dispute that debt is owed – Company’s counterclaim alleged to exceed judgment debt – Whether just and equitable to make winding up order

*Re United Strength Ltd* HC 386

Proof of debts – Deposits with company in liquidation – Whether exchange contracts – Whether contrary to Bretton Woods Agreements and unenforceable – Whether contrary to Thai law – Meaning of ‘exchange contract’ – Onus of proof on Official Receiver to show contracts contrary to Thai law – Bretton Woods Agreements Order in Council 1946 art VIII s 2(b)

*Tae Kim Chang & Anor v Official Receiver* HC 403

## **CRIMINAL LAW AND PROCEDURE**

### **Bribery**

Accepting an advantage – Test to be applied to determine whether a gift was corrupt – Public servant provided information which was not confidential and

could be obtained by any member of the public who could show good cause –  
Whether such act corrupt – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) s 4(2)  
*Attorney General v Lam Sau Ki* CA 92

**Cautioned statement**

Admissibility – Whether judge may reconsider admissibility of cautioned  
statement which was earlier admitted without objection – Duty of judge sitting  
without a jury when considering the admissibility of a statement  
*R v Lam Yin Yung* CA 98

**Confession**

Voluntariness – Whether appellate court will entertain objection of oppression  
where point not taken at trial  
*R v Tsoi Sai Pui & Ors* CA 468

**Jury**

Discharge of jury – Judge's discretion – Misapprehension of jury as to  
standard of proof remedied by redirection  
*R v Yeung Hing Yu* CA 128

**Juvenile offender**

Jurisdiction of magistrates' court – Joinder of juvenile offender on the same  
information but not the same charge – Discretion of magistrate to assume  
jurisdiction over juvenile offender so joined – 'In the course of' – Juvenile  
Offenders Ordinance (Cap 226) s 3C  
*R v Tsoi Sai Pui & Ors* CA 468

**Membership of triad society**

Sufficiency of evidence – Evidence as to practices of the triad society –  
Societies Ordinance (Cap 151) s 39  
*R v Tsoi Sai Pui & Ors* CA 468

**Sentencing**

Extreme youth of defendants – Sentence of 4½ years' imprisonment –  
Whether appropriate – Juvenile Offenders Ordinance (Cap 226) s 3F(1)  
*R v Wong Kam Wah & Anor* CA 28

Totality principle – Incest – Multiple counts – Multiple victims – Aggravating  
factors  
*R v Yeung Kam Fat* CA 62

Wounding with intent – English decisions on sentencing generally irrelevant  
– Need for sentence to reflect deterrence – Discount for enhanced sentence on  
review  
*Attorney General v Lau Ching Yau & Anor* CA 66

**Triad offences**

Liability of office-bearers and managers of society – Whether prior consent  
in writing of Attorney General required for a charge under s 26(1) of Societies



Ordinance where offence was not one under Societies Ordinance – Meaning of ‘Charged with an offence under this Ordinance’ – Societies Ordinance (Cap 151) ss 26(1) & 35 – Theft Ordinance (Cap 210) s 23(1)

*Chan Kai & Ors v The Queen* PC 1

### **Trial**

Jury – Prejudicial evidence of unsentenced accomplices allowed at trial – Failure of trial judge to give appropriate direction to jury

*R v Kai Hui Wai & Anor* CA 122

Justice must manifestly be seen to be done – Judge descending into the arena of dispute – Judge asking leading questions and forming opinion prematurely and arbitrarily before defendants gave evidence

*R v Lo Shu Keung & Ors* CA 71

Standard of proof – Direction of trial judge

*R v Yeung Ka Wah* CA 84

### **Unrepresented defendant**

Duties of trial judge – Extent of duty to protect interests of unrepresented defendant – Whether judge’s duty to act as defendant’s counsel – Whether under duty to suggest to accused the names of witnesses he might call – Whether bail conditions inhibited defence

*R v Tse Kwok Fu* CA 142

## **CROWN PROCEEDINGS**

### **Recovery of drug proceeds**

Restraint order – External confiscation order – Whether a warrant issued by a designated country falls within the ambit of an external confiscation order – Drug Trafficking (Recovery of Proceeds) Ordinance (Cap 405) ss 7, 8, 9, 10 & 28 – Drug Trafficking (Recovery of Proceeds) (Designated Countries and Territories) Order 1991

*Attorney General v Ko Sai Man & Ors* CA 33

## **DEEDS AND OTHER INSTRUMENTS**

### **Power of attorney**

Construction – Obvious mistake – Whether power effective

*Co-Horse Ltd v Siu Mun Yee* HC 595

## **EMPLOYMENT**

### **Duty of employee**

Implied warranty to exercise reasonable skills – Negligence in failing to exercise reasonable care in the service of the employer – Extent of such implied warranty

*Mingson Industries Ltd v Lin Shun Hung Stephen* DC 588