

HONG KONG CASES

1983

Volume 1

General Editor
Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Butterworths Asia
Hong Kong • Singapore • Kuala Lumpur

The Butterworth Group of Companies

Singapore	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01 International Plaza, Singapore 079903
Hong Kong	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA (HONG KONG) 19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 29651400 Fax: 29760840
Malaysia	MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur
Australia	BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra
Canada	BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver
Ireland	BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin
New Zealand	BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland
Puerto Rico	BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan
UK	BUTTERWORTH & Co (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh
USA	BUTTERWORTH LEGAL PUBLISHERS Salem, New Hampshire and Carlsbad, California

©

Butterworths Asia*
1995

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

*Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed Elsevier (Singapore) Pte Ltd.

ISSN 0218-7809

Typeset by Butterworths Asia, Superskill Graphics
and Corporate Press
Produced by Mandarin Offset Ltd
Printed and bound in Hong Kong

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Associate Editors

Grenville Cross QC

Ruy Barretto, Barrister

Michael Ozorio, Barrister

Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister

Susan Kwan, Barrister

Peter Garland, Barrister

Malcolm Merry, Barrister

Aarif Barma, Barrister

Andrew Cheung, Barrister

Peter Ng, Barrister

Joseph Fok, Barrister

Anderson Chow, Barrister

Teresa Cheng, Barrister

David Fitzpatrick, Barrister

Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister

Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University

Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

Reporters in this volume

Christina Choi Fung Yee, Solicitor

Danny Choi, Barrister

TC Chong, Barrister

Charles P Chiu, Barrister

Simon CK Chui, Barrister

Lindy Course, Barrister

Victor T Gidwani, Barrister

Christopher Lam, Barrister

Godfrey Lam, Barrister

Osmond Lam, Barrister

Julia Lau, Barrister

Cindy Lee, Barrister

Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister

Walter Lee, Solicitor

Raymond Leung, Barrister

PY Lo, Barrister

Herman LH Poon, Barrister

James Rice, Barrister

KW Tang, Barrister

Jennifer Tsang, Barrister

Alison Thompson, Barrister

Raymond Tsui Wai Nam, Barrister

Butterworths Asia

Managing Editor: Anthony P Kinnear (Hong Kong)

Deputy Managing Editor: Zarinah Marican

Editors: Noorunnisa Ibrahim Kutty, Teoh Swee Leng, Bala Shanmugam,
Sharon Kaur

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The publishers are grateful to and acknowledge the significant contribution and support of the Hong Kong Superior Court Judgments Database project, directed by the four members of the Faculty of Law, whose names are mentioned below. The judgments database project (1989–1994) was funded primarily by the University of Hong Kong's Conference and Research Grants Committee with assistance from the Department of Professional Legal Education, at the Faculty of Law. The Faculty members responsible for the project are (in alphabetical order) Andrew Byrnes, Lecturer, Department of Law; Rick Glofcheski, Lecturer, Department of Law; Gary N Heilbronn, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education; and Sarah Nield, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education (until 1992). The project administrator is James Garritty, Research Officer, Faculty of Law.

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

List of abbreviations used in this volume (excluding reports):

A	High Court Action
ACJ	Acting Chief Justice
A-G	Attorney General
AR	Application for Review
Adm	Admiralty Action
App	Appendix
art	article
Aust	Australia
CA	Court of Appeal
CA	Civil Appeal Number in references to unreported cases (eg CA 2/92)
CC	High Court Criminal Case
CJ	Chief Justice
Cap	Chapter (as in Chapter Number of an Ordinance)
Crim App	Criminal Appeal
Comm L	Commercial List
Con L	Construction List
ch	chapter (as in chapter number of a book)
cl(l)	clause(s)
DC	District Court
DCA	District Court Action
DJ	District Judge
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
EC	European Communities
ECC	Economic Compensation Case
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities
EEC	European Economic Communities
Ed	Edition
Ex Ch	Court of Exchequer Chamber
exh	exhibit
fn	footnote
HC	High Court
HL	House of Lords
HMSO	Her Majesty's Stationery Office
J(J)	Justice(s)
J(J)A	Justice(s) of Appeal
LT(A)	Labour Tribunal (Appeal)
LC	Lord Chancellor
Ld T(A)	Lands Tribunal (Appeal)
MA	Magistracy Appeal
MCA	Magistracy Criminal Appeal
MP	Miscellaneous Proceedings
MR	Master of the Rolls
n	note
NSW	New South Wales

Hong Kong Cases

O	Order (of the Rules of the Supreme Court)
PC	Privy Council
PRC	People's Republic of China
PCA	Privy Council Appeal
Pt	Part
para	paragraph
RSC	Rules of the Supreme Court
r(r)	rule(s)
reg	regulation
s	section
sub-s	subsection
Sch	Schedule
UN	United Nations
Uncitral	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
VP(P)	Vice-President(s)
WCC	Workers' Compensation Case

List of abbreviations of law reports:

AC	Law Reports, Appeal Cases (HL and PC); since 1890
All ER	All England Law Reports; since 1936
App Cas	Law Reports, Appeal Cases, House of Lords, 15 vols; 1875–1890
B & S	Best and Smith' Reports, Queen's Bench, 10 vols; 1861–1870
BWCC	Butterworths' Workmen's Compensation Cases; 1907–1949
Beav	Beavan's Reports, Rolls Court, 36 vols; 1838–1866
C & P	Carrington and Payne's Reports, Nisi Prius; 9 vols; 1823–1841
CB	Common Bench Reports, 18 vols; 1845–1856
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports; since 1903
Ch	Law Reports, Chancery Division; since 1890
Ch App	Law Reports, Chancery Appeals, 10 vols; 1865–1875
Ch D	Law Reports, Chancery Division, 45 vols; 1875–1890
Cox CC	EW Cox's Criminal Law Cases; 1843–1945
Cr App R	Criminal Appeal Reports (HL and CA(UK)); since 1908
Crim LR	Criminal Law Review; since 1954
De GJ & Sm	De Gex, Jones and Smith's Reports, Chancery, 4 vols; 1862–1865
ER	English Reports, 178 volumes; 1220–1865
Fam	Family Division; 1972–(current)
Fam Law	Family Law
HKDCLR	Hong Kong District Court Law Reports
HKLJ	Hong Kong Law Journal
HKLR	Hong Kong Law Reports

Abbreviations

HKTC	Hong Kong Tax Cases
IR	Irish Reports; since 1892
Irish LTR	Irish Law Times Reports; 1867–
JP	Justice of the Peace
KB	Law Reports, King's Bench Division, 53 vols, 1901–1952
LGR	Local Government Reports; 1902–(current)
LJCP	Law Journal, Common Pleas; 1831–1875
LJKB	Law Journal, King's Bench; 1831–1946
LJQB	Law Journal, Queen's Bench; 1831–1846
LRCP	Law Reports, Common Pleas, 10 vols; 1865–1875
LT	Law Times Reports, 177 vols, 1859–1947
Lloyd LR	Lloyd's List Law Reports; 1919–1950
Lloyd's Rep	Lloyd's List Law Reports; since 1951
Mac & G	Macnaghten and Gordon's Reports, Chancery, 3 vols; 1849–1852
Mod	Modern Reports, 12 vols; 1669–1755
NY	New York Court of Appeals Reports; 1847–
O'M & H	O'Malley and Hardcastle's Election Cases; 1869–1934
P	Law Reports, Probate, Divorce and Admiralty Division; 1891–1971
QB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1891–1900, and since 1952
QBD	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1875–1890
RTR	Road Traffic Reports; 1970–(current)
SLT	Scot's Law Times; 1893–(current)
Sol Jo	Solicitor's Journal; since 1856
Stra	Strange's Reports, 2 vols; 1716–1747
TLR	The Times Law Reports, 71 volumes; 1884–1950
	The Times Law Reports; since 1951
TR	Taxation Reports
Taunt	Taunton's Reports, Common Pleas, 8 vols; 1807–1819
VLR	Victorian Law Reports, vols 11–29; 1885–1904
Ves Jun	Vesey Jun's Reports, Chancery, 19 vols; 1789–1817
WLR	Weekly Law Reports; since 1953
WR	Weekly Reporter, 54 vols; 1852–1906

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

The mode of citation of cases reported in this volume of *Hong Kong Cases* is [1983] 1 HKC (page).

	Page		Page
A		Bulistock Ltd v	
A & A Continental		Yu Lam Ying [CA]	217
Commodities Ltd v Mak		Bylamson & Associates	
Chi Sing [CA]	94	(Enterprises) Ltd, Re [HC]	510
Anglo Starlite Insurance Co		C	
Ltd; Ng Chiu Wo v [DC]	574	Caine Tai Investment Co Ltd	
Artemis, The [CA]	46	& Ors v Ayala International	
Attlee Investments Ltd v		Finance Ltd & Republic	
Lee Chuen t/a Lee Chuen		National Bank of New York [CA]	163
Furniture Co [CA]	186	Carnelley & Anor; R v [CA]	376
Attorney General v		Carrian Holdings Ltd, Re [HC]	491
Cheng Chun Tim [CA]	328	Castle Insurance Co Ltd	
Attorney General v		& Ors v Hong Kong Islands	
Cheng Yick Chi & Ors [PC]	14	Shipping Co Ltd [PC]	32
Attorney General v		Chan Lok Yu; R v [CA]	235
Firebird Ltd [PC]	1	Chan Mui; R v [HC]	554
Attorney General v		Chan Wai Man; R v [CA]	383
Hon Lit Hom [CA]	156	Chan Wing Kin & Anor v	
Attorney General v		Fonnie Co Ltd & Anor [HC]	400
Lam Kok Hung [HC]	625	Chan Wing Sze v	
Attorney General v		Chau Kin Hung [HC]	518
Mightystream Ltd [PC]	8	Chan Yau Hang & Anor;	
Attorney General v		R v [CA]	107
Ng Yuen Shiu [PC]	23	Chau Kin Hung;	
Attorney General v		Chan Wing Sze v [HC]	518
Yung Tak Kee [CA]	331	Chau Ming Cheong; R v [CA]	68
Attorney General;		Chau Tat Ling; R v [CA]	214
Beaux Estates Ltd v [HC]	317	Cheng Chi Keung; R v [CA]	371
Attorney General;		Cheng Chun Tim;	
Cheng Kam Hung v [HC]	302	Attorney General v [CA]	328
Attorney General;		Cheng Kam Hung v	
Cho Hsun Co Ltd v [HC]	620	Attorney General [HC]	302
Attorney General;		Cheng Yick Chi & Ors;	
Ma Kit Ching Veronica v [DC]	470	Attorney General v [PC]	14
Ayala International Finance		Cheung Chun Fuk; R v [CA]	122
Ltd & Republic National		Cheung So Yin Kee;	
Bank of New York; Caine		Yung Kee Co v [HC]	386
Tai Investment Co Ltd		Cho Hsun Co Ltd v	
& Ors v [CA]	163	Attorney General [HC]	620
B		Choi Chung Hing & Ors;	
Beaux Estates Ltd v		R v [HC]	458
Attorney General [HC]	317		

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
Chong Chui Yuk Ching v Chong Pui Cheong [DC]	544	Hong Yiu Fat; R v [CA]	117
Chong Pui Cheong; Chong Chui Yuk Ching v [DC]	544	Horton & Anor; Horton v [HC]	341
Choy Sau Kam & Anor; Commissioner of Inland Revenue v [CA]	101	Horton v Horton & Anor [HC]	341
Commissioner of Inland Revenue v Choy Sau Kam & Anor [CA]	101	I	
Cotteen Investments Ltd; First Hong Kong Credit Ltd v [CA]	222	Ip Tin Yan; R v [CA]	594
E		K	
Edward Wong Finance Co Ltd v Lam Foo Hing Jewellery Factory Ltd & Ors [HC]	607	Kala Sakhrani Mohan v Ontrade International Ltd & Anor [CA]	81
F		Kam Man Fai; R v [HC]	614
Firebird Ltd; Attorney General v [PC]	1	Kwong Choi Hing; R v [CA]	239
First Hong Kong Credit Ltd v Cotteen Investments Ltd [CA]	222	Kwong Yeung & Anor; R v [HC]	585
Fong Yuk Choi & Ors; R v [CA]	208	L	
Fonnie Co Ltd & Anor; Chan Wing Kin & Anor v [HC]	400	Lai Hang; Ng Shui Hing v [CA]	158
Fuk Lai Ling v Poon Shu Wan [CA]	126	Lam Foo Hing Jewellery Factory Ltd & Ors; Edward Wong Finance Co Ltd v [HC]	607
Fung Chi Ming & Ors; R v [CA]	219	Lam Kok Hung; Attorney General v [HC]	625
G		Lam Mee Kam & Ors; Poon Kai Tin v [CA]	200
Gohind Mohan & Anor; McElney & Ors v [CA]	243	Lam Ming Kwong & Ors; R v [CA]	139
Griesheim, The [HC]	251	Law Chi Keung & Ors; R v [CA]	296
H		Law Man; R v [CA]	190
Heng Hock Shan & Ors; Heng Kwai Shan v [HC]	335	Le Tranh Dieh; R v [HC]	447
Heng Kwai Shan v Heng Hock Shan & Ors [HC]	335	Lee Chan Lo Kai; Lee Wing Tat v [HC]	522
Ho Chi Kwong; R v [HC]	456	Lee Chuen t/a Lee Chuen Furniture Co; Attlee Investments Ltd v [CA]	186
Hon Lit Hom; Attorney General v [CA]	156	Lee Tin Sung; R v [HC]	611
Hong Kong Islands Shipping Co Ltd; Castle Insurance Co Ltd & Ors v [PC]	32	Lee Wing Tat v Lee Chan Lo Kai [HC]	522
		Lee Yip Tang & Anor; Lee Yu Ying v [HC]	434
		Lee Yu Ying v Lee Yip Tang & Anor [HC]	434
		Leung Ngan; Ng Chai Wan & Anor v [CA]	150
		Li Hung Lit; Li Kao Feng Ning Judy v [CA]	111

Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Li Kao Feng Ning Judy v Li Hung Lit [CA]	111	Poon Shu Wan; Fuk Lai Ling v [CA]	126
Liu Wing Cheung Wilfred; Lo Chi Wai Arthur v [HC]	416	Power Tankers Inc Ltd; The Sansinena Co Ltd v [HC]	274
Lo Chi Wai Arthur v Liu Wing Cheung Wilfred ... [HC]	416	Producers Finance & Investment Ltd v Tse Yee Wan & Anor [HC]	426
M		R	
Ma Hung Kim; Wong Chi Hoi v [CA]	196	R v Carnelley & Anor [CA]	376
Ma Kit Ching Veronica v Attorney General [DC]	470	R v Chan Lok Yu [CA]	235
Mak Chi Sing; A & A Continental Commodities Ltd v [CA]	94	R v Chan Mui [HC]	554
Mak Tat Kue & Ors; R v [HC]	549	R v Chan Wai Man [CA]	383
McElney & Ors v Gohind Mohan & Anor [CA]	243	R v Chan Yau Hang & Anor .. [CA]	107
Mightystream Ltd; Attorney General v [PC]	8	R v Chau Ming Cheong [CA]	68
N		R v Chau Tat Ling [CA]	214
Ng Chai Wan & Anor v Leung Ngan [CA]	150	R v Cheng Chi Keung [CA]	371
Ng Chiu Wo v Anglo Starlite Insurance Co Ltd [DC]	574	R v Cheung Chun Fuk [CA]	122
Ng Kwok Hing v Tiah Toh Ming [DC]	324	R v Choi Chung Hing & Ors .. [HC]	458
Ng Shui Hing v Lai Hang [CA]	158	R v Fong Yuk Choi & Ors [CA]	208
Ng Tam Yue; R v [HC]	496	R v Fung Chi Ming & Ors [CA]	219
Ng Wai Chung, Re [HC]	535	R v Ho Chi Kwong [HC]	456
Ng Yiu Kai; R v [HC]	179	R v Hong Yiu Fat [CA]	117
Ng Yuen Shiu; Attorney General v [PC]	23	R v Ip Tin Yan [CA]	594
O		R v Kam Man Fai [HC]	614
Ontrade International Ltd & Anor; Kala Sakhrani Mohan v [CA]	81	R v Kwong Choi Hing [CA]	239
P		R v Kwong Yeung & Anor [HC]	585
Pfeifer; Po Wai Ching & Anor v [CA]	204	R v Lam Ming Kwong & Ors. [CA]	139
Po Wai Ching & Anor v Pfeifer [CA]	204	R v Law Chi Keung & Ors [CA]	296
Poon Kai Tin v Lam Mee Kam & Ors [CA]	200	R v Law Man [CA]	190
		R v Le Thanh Dieh [HC]	447
		R v Lee Tin Sung [HC]	611
		R v Mak Tat Kue & Ors [HC]	549
		R v Ng Tam Yue [HC]	496
		R v Ng Yiu Kai [HC]	179
		R v Szeto Wah [HC]	412
		R v Tam Kam Shing [HC]	592
		R v Taylor [CA]	311
		R v Tong Choy Yuen [HC]	409
		R v Tsang Yat Lui [CA]	88
		R v Wellform Construction Co Ltd [HC]	530

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
R v Wong Kuen & Ors [HC]	439	W	
R v Wong Tak Lam & Ors [CA]	168	Wellform Construction	
R v Wong Tak Leung [CA]	143	Co Ltd; R v [HC]	530
R v Wong Wah Chiu & Ors ... [CA]	131	Wong Che Wai Raymond v	
R v Wong Yu Choi [HC]	578	Wong Chung Yee Fung	
R v Yeung Shun Lik [HC]	583	Helen & Anor [HC]	556
S		Wong Chi Hoi v	
Sansinena Co Ltd, The v		Ma Hung Kim [CA]	196
Power Tankers Inc Ltd [HC]	274	Wong Chor Wan v	
Stikeman, Elliott (a firm) v		Yuen Yau & Anor [CA]	192
Wong Ming Yuen & Anor ... [HC]	355	Wong Chung Yee Fung Helen	
Szeto Wah; R v [HC]	412	& Anor; Wong Che Wai	
T		Raymond v [HC]	556
Taiship Co Ltd;		Wong Kuen & Ors; R v [HC]	439
Wong Kwai Ngor (personal		Wong Kwai Ngor (personal	
representative of the estate of		representative of the estate	
Hui Fook Hoi, deceased) v ... [DC]	601	of Hui Fook Hoi, deceased) v	
Tam Kam Shing; R v [HC]	592	Taiship Co Ltd [DC]	601
Taylor; R v [CA]	311	Wong Ming Yuen & Anor;	
Tiah Toh Ming;		Stikeman, Elliott (a firm) v .. [HC]	355
Ng Kwok Hing v [DC]	324	Wong Tak Lam & Ors; R v [CA]	168
Tong Choy Yuen; R v [HC]	409	Wong Tak Leung; R v [CA]	143
Tong Ling Shipping and		Wong Wah Chiu & Ors; R v .. [CA]	131
Enterprises Co Ltd;		Wong Yu Choi; R v [HC]	578
Tsang Lin v [DC]	449	Y	
Tsang Lin v Tong Ling		Yeung Shun Lik; R v [HC]	583
Shipping and Enterprises		Yu Lam Ying;	
Co Ltd [DC]	449	Bulistock Ltd v [CA]	217
Tsang Yat Lui; R v [CA]	88	Yuen Yau & Anor;	
Tse Yee Wan & Anor;		Wong Chor Wan v [CA]	192
Producers Finance &		Yung Kee Co v	
Investment Ltd v [HC]	426	Cheung So Yin Kee [HC]	386
		Yung Tak Kee;	
		Attorney General v [CA]	331

SUBJECT INDEX

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Judicial review

Certiorari – Orders by magistrate for surrender and further detention of travel document under Prevention of Bribery Ordinance – Whether hearings could be ex parte – Whether in breach of natural justice – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) s 17A(1) & (6)

Re Ng Wai Chung [HC] 535

Certiorari – Removal of illegal immigrants – Whether illegal immigrant had ‘legitimate expectation’ of being accorded a fair hearing – Whether removal order made without prior hearing valid

Attorney General v Ng Yuen Shiu [PC] 23

Public administration disputes

Resolution by courts – Applicable law – Whether court to consider the law as it was at time dispute arose or at time of hearing – Application for registration and licensing of public light buses – Change in law divesting officer of certain powers – Whether officer could be ordered to consider application based on previous law

Cheng Kam Hung v Attorney General [HC] 302

BILLS OF EXCHANGE AND OTHER NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENTS

Cheque

Cheque dishonoured at presentment – Whether notice of dishonour necessary after cheque dishonoured – Whether drawee bank had obligation to pay drawer or acceptor where drawer had insufficient funds – Waiver of notice of dishonour – Bills of Exchange Ordinance (Cap 19) s 50(2)(b)

Edward Wong Finance Co Ltd v Lam Foo Hing Jewellery Factory Ltd & Ors [HC] 607

BRIBERY AND CORRUPTION

Ambit of offence

Candidate for Urban Council election being interviewed by news reporter – Offering money to reporter and asking for assistance in every possible way – Corrupt and Illegal Practices Ordinance (Cap 288) s 5

R v Ng Tam Yue [HC] 496

Further detention of travel documents

Application to magistrate by Commissioner – Whether ‘may’ in s 17A(6) afforded discretion to magistrate to refuse order or to order detention of documents for less than the three months allowed in provision – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) s 17A(6)

Re Ng Wai Chung [HC] 535

Ex parte application to magistrate by Commissioner – Whether in breach of natural justice – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) s 17A(6)
Re Ng Wai Chung [HC] 535

Solicitating an advantage

Sentencing – Whether immediate custodial sentence should be imposed – Whether guilty plea and possibility of dismissal exceptional circumstances – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) s 4
Attorney General v Yung Tak Kee [CA] 331

Whether presumption in s 25 of the Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) applied – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) s 25
R v Ng Yiu Kai [HC] 179

Surrender of travel documents

Ex parte application to magistrate by Commissioner – Whether in breach of natural justice – Prevention of Bribery Ordinance (Cap 201) s 17A(1)
Re Ng Wai Chung [HC] 535

BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION

Building Authority

Statutory duty to consider plans within 60 days – Amendment to Regulations after submission of plans – Whether plans to be considered as of date of submission or at time of consideration – Whether developer had an accrued right to have plans approved – Buildings Ordinance (Cap 123) s 15 – Building (Planning) Regulations reg 2(1)
Attorney General v Firebird Ltd [PC] 1

Site

Classification of site – Amendment to regulations classifying types of site – Whether amendments could affect classification of site for which building plans had already been submitted – Buildings Ordinance (Cap 123) s 15 – Building (Planning) Regulations reg 2(1)
Attorney General v Firebird Ltd [PC] 1

Classification of site – Meaning of ‘street’ – Building (Planning) Regulations
Beaux Estates Ltd v Attorney General [HC] 317

Meaning of ‘site’ – Calculation of area of site – Unbuilt on land in front of proposed site dedicated to pedestrian flow – Whether such land should be included as part of the site – Building (Planning) Regulations reg 23(2)
Attorney General v Cheng Yick Chi & Ors [PC] 14

Construction site

Duty of contractor to erect barriers – Whether fall or dislodgement of earthwork likely to strike workman from height greater than 4ft – Whether activities constituted ‘earthworking operation’ – Construction Sites (Safety) Regulations reg 39(1)
R v Kwong Yeung & Anor [HC] 585

Multi-storey building

Management fees – Whether included in rent for purpose of distress for rent – Recovery of management fees in distress for rent to be authorized by owners incorporated – Multi-Storey Buildings (Owners Incorporation) Ordinance (Cap 344) ss 23 & 24

Ng Kwok Hing v Tiah Toh Ming [DC] 324

Street

Meaning – Whether width of street diminished by temporary structures on both sides – Whether temporary structures changed structural characteristics of space – Buildings Ordinance (Cap 123) s 2 – Buildings (Planning) Regulations regs 16(4) & 23(2)

Cho Hsun Co Ltd v Attorney General [HC] 620

Road-bridge – Whether bridge connecting a site to the road a ‘street’ – Buildings Ordinance (Cap 123) s 2(1) – Building (Planning) Regulations reg 2(1) *Attorney General v Mightystream Ltd* [PC] 8

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Amendment

Addition of causes of action after expiry of limitation period – Whether O 20 r 5(5) empowering court to allow addition ultra vires – Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) s 54 – Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap 1) s 28(b) – Rules of the Supreme Court O 20 r 5(5)

McElney & Ors v Gohind Mohan & Anor [CA] 243

Consent order

Setting aside – Grounds for setting aside – Counsel’s lack of authority – Whether party seeking to set aside order need to prove that opposing party had notice of such limitation – Rules of the Supreme Court O 18 r 19

Ng Shui Hing v Lai Hang [CA] 158

Setting aside – Procedure after such order had been passed – Rules of the Supreme Court O 18 r 19

Ng Shui Hing v Lai Hang [CA] 158

Dismissal of action

Want of prosecution – Delay in issuance of writ – Whether ground for dismissal – Whether delay excusable – Rules of the Supreme Court O 25 r 1(4) *The Sansinena Co Ltd v Power Tankers Inc Ltd* [HC] 274

Want of prosecution – Inordinate and inexcusable delay – Whether substantial risk to fair trial – Whether substantial prejudice caused to defendant – Rules of the Supreme Court O 25 r 1(4)

The Sansinena Co Ltd v Power Tankers Inc Ltd [HC] 274

Imprisonment under O 49B

Application for discharge – Jurisdiction of court to consider lawfulness of original arrest and imprisonment – Whether temporary release of judgment debtor

could be ordered – Rules of the Supreme Court O 49B

Producers Finance & Investment Ltd v Tse Yee Wan & Anor [HC] 426

Lawfulness – Debtor arrested on bare authority of writ of execution – Whether necessary to obtain order of committal first – Rules of the Supreme Court O 49B

Producers Finance & Investment Ltd v Tse Yee Wan & Anor [HC] 426

Judgment debtor

Imprisonment – Application for discharge – Burden and standard of proof – Rules of the Supreme Court O 49 r 6(1)

Lee Yu Ying v Lee Yip Tang & Anor [HC] 434

Mandatory injunction

Relevant considerations in making order – Employee detained overseas in relation to suit against employer company – Whether employer under implied duty to give financial guarantee for his release – Parties' chances of succeeding at trial

A & A Continental Commodities Ltd v Mak Chi Sing [CA] 94

Pleadings

Striking out particulars of claim – Whether particulars disclosed cause of action

Ng Shui Hing v Lai Hang [CA] 158

Striking out statement of claim – Defendant was sued as guarantor in writ but as principal debtor in statement of claim – Discretion of judge to refuse amendment of writ – Statement of claim raising different cause of action from writ – Whether amendment would be just – Rules of the Supreme Court O 18 r 15(2) & O 20 r 5

Kala Sakhrani Mohan v Ontrade International Ltd & Anor [CA] 81

Stay of execution pending appeal

Relevant principles governing exercise of discretion – Whether appeal bona fide – Whether failure to grant stay would render appeal nugatory – Rules of the Supreme Court O 59 r 14

Caine Tai Investment Co Ltd & Ors v Ayala International Finance Ltd & Republic National Bank of New York [CA] 163

Summary judgment

Application taken out after affidavit in answer to O 86 summons already filed – Whether abuse of process – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14 & O 86

First Hong Kong Credit Ltd v Cotteen Investments Ltd [CA] 222

Difficult questions of law – Whether application for summary judgment appropriate – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14

First Hong Kong Credit Ltd v Cotteen Investments Ltd [CA] 222

Trial

Defendant absent from hearing – Defendant could not be traced – Whether notification of setting down of trial under O 34 r 8 given to defendant – Rules of the Supreme Court O 34 r 8

*Edward Wong Finance Co Ltd v Lam Foo Hing Jewellery
Factory Ltd & Ors*

[HC] 607

Writ

Application to set aside – Negligence claim against party outside jurisdiction – Whether service on agent within jurisdiction carrying out managerial services for company valid – Whether agent a proper or necessary party to action – Standard of proof – Rules of the Supreme Court O 11 r 1(1)(j)

The Artemis

[CA] 46

Application to set aside – Whether plaintiff bound by claims stated in affidavit – Whether plaintiff could also rely on claims indorsed in writ even if they were not mentioned in affidavit

The Artemis

[CA] 46

Concurrent service within and without jurisdiction – Validity – Whether company ‘ordinarily resident’ in Hong Kong – Test of residence – Whether having agent in Hong Kong meant company was carrying on business in Hong Kong – Rules of the Supreme Court O 11 r 1(1)(c)

The Artemis

[CA] 46

COMPANIES AND CORPORATIONS

Winding up

Creditor’s winding-up – Debt disputed on substantial grounds – Jurisdiction of companies court to resolve question of whether debt due

Re Bylamson & Associates (Enterprises) Ltd

[HC] 510

Commencement of execution by one creditor before petition was presented – Whether application for stay of execution should be allowed – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 181

Attlee Investments Ltd v Lee Chuen t/a Lee Chuen Furniture Co

[CA] 186

Distrain for rent – Application by landlord to possession of premises occupied by tenant in liquidation – Whether landlord entitled to distrain for rent due after presentation of winding up petition against tenant

Re Carrian Holdings Ltd

[HC] 491

CONFLICT OF LAWS

Family law

Divorce – Stay of Australian proceedings – Relative advantages and disadvantages to the parties – Principal place of residence and work of both parties in Hong Kong

Horton v Horton & Anor

[HC] 341

Foreign law

Conflicting foreign law – Court to resolve conflict by examining sources – English law applicable only if foreign law insufficient

The Griesheim [HC] 251

Proof of foreign law – Expert's evidence – Sources of foreign law – Matters to be considered in deciding whether sources sufficiently set out – Requirements to be fulfilled by expert in proving foreign law

The Griesheim [HC] 251

CONTRACT

Frustration

Whether doctrine of frustration applicable to leases – Timing of frustrating act considered – Frustrating act occurred at end of tenancy period – Tenant had benefit of contract

Yung Kee Co V Cheung So Yin Kee [HC] 386

COURTS AND JUDICIAL SYSTEM

District Court

Jurisdiction – Whether offence of false imprisonment punishable by life imprisonment within jurisdiction of court – Offences Against the Person Ordinance (Cap 212) s 42

R v Chan Yau Hang & Anor [CA] 107

High Court

Appeal against sentence – Whether High Court may hear appeal on merits where magistrate omitted to consider relevant report in sentencing appellant

R v Tam Kam Shing [HC] 592

Magistrates' court

Power of magistrate to convict defendant of attempt – Defendant charged originally with only substantive offence – Whether magistrate could convict defendant of attempt without first amending charge – Magistrates Ordinance (Cap 227) s 27 – Criminal Procedure Ordinance (Cap 221) s 51

R v Lee Tin Sung [HC] 611

CRIMINAL LAW AND PROCEDURE

Appeal

Conviction unsafe and unsatisfactory – Lurking doubt – Whether appellate court had substantial remaining doubt

R v Wong Wah Chiu & Ors [CA] 131

Misdirection in law – Applicability of proviso – Correct test – Whether judge would have inevitably convicted if there had been no misdirection

R v Wong Tak Lam & Ors [CA] 168