

ENVIRONMENTAL AND NATURAL RESOURCE ECONOMICS

FIFTH EDITION

Tom Tietenberg Colby College



An imprint of Addison Wesley Longman, Inc.

To Florence M. and Harry H. Tietenberg, who provided me with a healthy environment conducive to development.

Senior Editor: Andrea Shaw

Development Editor: Greta Brogna Editorial Assistant: Debra Lally

Senior Production Supervisor: Juliet Silveri

Marketing Manager: Amy Cronin Marketing Coordinator: Jen Thalmann

Project Coordination, Text design, and Electronic Page Makeup: Electronic Publishing

Services Inc., N.Y.C. Cover Design: Regina Hagen

Manufacturing Coordinator: Tim McDonald

Copyright © 2000 by Addison Wesley Longman, Inc.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher. Printed in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Tietenberg, Thomas H.

Environmental and Natural Resource Economics/Tom Tietenberg.— 5th ed.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-321-03128-8

1. Environmental economics. 2. Environmental policy. 3. Natural resources—Governmental policy. 4. Raw materials—Government policy.

1. Title.

HC79.E5T525 2000

99-18397

333.7—dc21

CIP

When I wrote the first edition of *Environmental and Natural Resource Economics* in 1981, environmental and natural resource economics was a well-developed, but underutilized, field. Its impact on environmental policy could most generously be described as "emerging." That is no longer the case. Economics has become an indispensable part of the education of anyone dealing with environmental policy. As *Our Common Future* put it in 1987, "Economics and ecology bind us in ever-tightening networks. . . . Economics and ecology must be completely integrated in decision-making and law-making processes."

Signs of maturation abound. A number of journals are now devoted either exclusively or mostly to the topics covered in this book. One, *Ecological Economics*, is a journal dedicated to bringing economists and ecologists closer together in a common search for appropriate solutions for environmental challenges. Interested readers can also find advanced work in the field in *Land Economics*, *Journal of Environmental Economics and Management*, *Environmental and Resource Economics*, *Resource and Energy Economics*, and *Natural Resources Journal*, among others.

New resources for student research projects have been made available in response to the growing popularity of the field. Original research on topics related to international environmental and natural resource issues was formerly very difficult for students because of the paucity of data. A number of good sources now exist, including *World Resources* (Washington, DC: Oxford University Press, published annually), which has an extensive data appendix, and *OECD Environmental Data* (Paris: Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, published periodically).

Three Internet sources will be mentioned because they are so closely related to the focus of environmental and natural resource economics. Two discussion lists that involve material covered by this book are RES-ECON and ECOL-ECON. The former is a more academically inclined list focusing on problems related to natural resource management, whereas the latter is a more wide-ranging discussion list dealing with sustainable development.

Services on the Internet are changing so rapidly that some of this information may become obsolete. One way to keep up to date on the various web options is to visit my web site at http://www.colby.edu/personal/thtieten/. That site has links to other sites, including the site sponsored by the Association of Environmental and Resource Economists, which has information on graduate programs in this field.

Environmental and Natural Resource Economics attempts to bring those who are beginning the study of environmental and natural resource economics close to the frontiers of knowledge. Although it is designed to be accessible to students who have completed only a two-semester introductory course in economics or a one-semester

¹The World Commission on Environment and Development, *Our Common Future* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987): 27, 37.

introductory microeconomics course, it has been successfully used in several institutions in lower-level and upper-level undergraduate courses as well as lower-level graduate courses.

Intertemporal optimization is handled within a discrete-time, mathematical programming framework, and all mathematics other than simple algebra are relegated to appendixes. Graphs and numerical examples are used to provide an intuitive understanding of the principles suggested by the math and the reasons for their validity. In the fifth edition I have tried to retain the strengths that seem particularly valued by users, while expanding the number of applications of economic principles, clarifying some of the more difficult arguments, and updating the material to include the very latest developments around the world.

The structure and topical coverage of this book facilitate its use in a variety of contexts. For a survey course in environmental and natural resource economics, all chapters are appropriate, though many of us have found that the book contains somewhat more material than can be covered adequately in a quarter or even a semester. This surplus of material provides some flexibility for the instructor to choose those topics that best fit his or her course design. A one-term course in natural resource economics could be based on Chapters 1 to 14 and 22 to 24. A brief introduction to environmental economics could be added by including Chapter 15. A single-term course in environmental economics could be structured around Chapters 1 to 5 and 15 to 21. Chapter 7 could be added if a brief introduction to natural economics seems desirable.

NEW TO THIS EDITION

The fifth edition continues the trend started in the last edition toward a more international focus. Additional attention has been paid to environmental problems and policies in Eastern and Western Europe, China, and the developing nations than was the case in previous editions. Economic valuation of the environment is now addressed with two chapters, rather than one. While the first deals with the concepts that lie behind economic valuation, the second focuses on measurement concepts. Both chapters contain several practical illustrations.

The introductory material on sustainable development now appears in a separate chapter; new mathematical appendices have been added for the fisheries and forestry chapters; and a new glossary of terms defines and explains over 200 terms.

New boxed examples highlight special topics, including: (1) Does Reducing Pollution Make Economic Sense? (2) Choosing Between Preservation and Development in Australia; (3) Valuing Damage from Groundwater Contamination Using Averting Expenditures, (4) Valuing Diesel Odor Reduction by Contingent Ranking; (5) The Value of Wildlife Viewing; (6) Income-Generating Activities as Fertility Control: Bangladesh; (7) Implementing the "Take-Back" Principle; (8) Trust Funds for Habitat Preservation; (9) Free-Access Harvesting of the Minke Whale; (10) Local Approaches to Wildlife Protection: Zimbabwe; (11) Environmental Taxation in China; (12) The Sulfur Allowance Program; 913) Why and How Do Environmentalists Buy Pollution? (14) Tradeable Permits for Ozone-Depleting Chemicals; (15) Car Sharing: Better Use of Automotive Capital; (16) Getting the Lead Out: The

Lead Phaseout Program; (17) Counterproductive Policy Design; (18) Jobs Versus the Environment: What is the Evidence; (19) Resource Depletion and Economic Sustainability: Malaysia; (20) Controlling Land use Development with TDRs; and (21) Reputational Strategies for Pollution Control in Indonesia.

New topics covered include:

- electricity deregulation
- Web sites of interest
- The relative costs of risk reduction options
- Environmental Kuznets curves
- Averting expenditures
- Contingent ranking
- Disclosure strategies
- Kyoto Protocol and emissions trading of greenhouse gases

Some complete new data and artwork have been added.

This edition retains a strong policy orientation. Though a great deal of theory and empirical evidence is discussed, their inclusion is motivated by the desire to increase understanding of intriguing policy problems, and these aspects are discussed in the context of those problems. This explicit integration of research and policy within each chapter avoids the problem frequently encountered in applied economics textbooks—that is, in such texts the theory developed in earlier chapters is often only loosely connected to the rest of the book. The many insights gleaned from other disciplines have an important role to play in overcoming the typical textbooks' tendency to accept the material uncritically at a superficial level; instead, this text highlights those characteristics that make the economics approach unique.

This is an economics book, but it goes beyond economics. Insights from the natural and physical sciences, literature and political science, as well as other disciplines, are scattered liberally throughout the text. In some cases these references raise unresolved issues that economic analysis can help resolve, while in others they affect the structure of the economic analysis or provide a contrasting point of view. They have an important role to play in overcoming the tendency to accept the material uncritically at a superficial level by highlighting those characteristics that make the economics approach unique.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Perhaps the most rewarding part of writing this book has been that it has put me in touch with so many thoughtful people I had not previously met. I very much appreciate the faculty and students who pointed out areas of particular strength or areas where coverage could be expanded in this edition. The support this book has received from faculty and students has been gratifying and energizing. One can begin to understand the magnitude of my debt to my colleagues by glancing at the several hundred names in the lists of references contained in the name index. Because their research contributions make this an exciting field, full of insights worthy of being shared, my task was easier and a lot more fun than it might otherwise have been.

Valuable assistance was received during various stages of the writing from the following:

Maurice Ballabon Baruch College

A. Paul Baroutsis Slippery Rock University of Pennsylvania

Peter Berck University of California, Berkely

Fikret Berkes Brock University

Trond Björndal Norwegian School of Economics and

Business Administration

Sidney M. Blumner California State Polytechnic University, Pomona

Vic Brajer California State University, Fullerton

Richard Bryant University of Missouri, Rolla

Richard V. Butler Trinity University
Duane Chapman Cornell University

Charles J. Chicchetti University of Wisconsin, Madison

Jon Conrad Cornell University

William Corcoran University of Nebraska, Omaha Gregory B. Christiansen California State University, Hayward

Maureen L. Cropper
John H. Cumberland
Herman E. Daly
Diane P. Dupont
Randall K. Filer
University of Maryland
University of Maryland
University of Guelph
Brandeis University

Ann Fisher Pennsylvania State University
Anthony C. Fisher University of California, Berkeley

Marvin Frankel University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign

A. Myrick Freeman III Bowdoin College

James Gale Michigan Technological University
Haynes Goddard University Of Cincinnati

Nicholas Gotsch Institute of Agricultural Economics (Zurich)

Doug Greer San Jose State University
Ronald Griffin Texas A & M University

A. R. Gutowsky California State University, Sacramento

W. Eric Gustafson
Jon D. Harford
Gloria E. Helfand
University of California, Davis
Cleveland State University
University of California, Davis

Ann Helwege Tufts University

John J. Hovis University of Maryland Craig Infanger University of Kentucky

James R. Kahn State University of New York, Binghamton

John O. S. Kennedy LaTrobe University
Thomas Kinnaman Bucknell University

Richard F. Kosobud University of Illinois, Chicago

Dwight Lee University of Georgia
Joseph N. Lekakis University of Crete
Ingemar Leksell University of Göteberg

Randolph M. Lyon Executive Office of the President (U.S.)

Giadomenico Majone Harvard University
David Martin Davidson College

Nicholas Mercuro University of New Orleans
David E. Merrifield Western Washington University

Frederic C. Menz
Michael J. Mueller
Clarkson University
Thomas C. Noser
University of Alabama
Lloyd Orr
Indiana University
Peter J. Parks
Rutgers University

Raymond Prince University of Colorado, Boulder

H. David Robison La Salle University

J. Barkley Rosser, Jr. James Madison University
Milton Russell University of Tennessee
Frederic O. Sargent University of Vermont

Salah El Serafy World Bank

W. Douglas Shaw University of Nevada

James S. Shortle Pennsylvania State University

Leah J. Smith Swarthmore College
V. Kerry Smith Duke University
Rob Stavins Harvard University
Joe B. Stevens Oregon State University
Gert t. Svendsen The Aarhus School of Business
Kenneth N. Townsend Hampden-Sydney College

Wallace E. Tyner Purdue University
Myles Wallace Clemson University
Patrick Welle Bemidji State University

Anthony Yezer The George Washington University

In preparing this edition, I am especially indebted to the following reviewers for their detailed, helpful suggestions:

Peter Berck University of California, Berkeley

Richard V. Butler
A. Myrick Freeman III
Thomas C. Kinnaman

Trinity University
Bowdoin College
Bucknell University

David W. Martin Davidson College

Their support and willingness to share ideas on how the manuscript could be improved are much appreciated.

Assisting with the fifth edition have been my research assistants Will Chamberlain and Megan Dingler. Working with such fine young men and women has made it all the more obvious to me why teaching is the world's most satisfying profession.

Finally, I should like to express publicly my deep appreciation to my wife Gretchen, my daughter Heidi, and my son Eric for their love and support.

Tom Tietenberg Prospect Harbor, Maine

CONTENTS

PREFACE XXI

CHAPTER ONE VISIONS OF THE FUTURE 1

INTRODUCTION 1

The Self-Extinction Premise 1
The Use of Models 3
Thinking about the Future 3

Example 1.1 The Dangers of Prognostication 4

THE BASIC PESSIMIST MODEL 4

Conclusions of Pessimist Model 5 The Nature of the Model 6

THE BASIC OPTIMIST MODEL 8

Conclusions of the Optimist Model 8
The Nature of the Model 8

THE ROAD AHEAD 10

The Issues 10 An Overview of the Book 11

SUMMARY 13

Further Reading 14
Additional Readings 14
Discussion Questions 15

CHAPTER TWO VALUING THE ENVIRONMENT: CONCEPTS 16

INTRODUCTION 16

THE HUMAN ENVIRONMENT RELATIONSHIP 17

The Environment as an Asset 17 The Economic Approach 19

NORMATIVE CRITERIA FOR DECISION-MAKING 19

Evaluating Predefined Options 19
Example 2.1 Nature Knows Best 21

FINDING THE OPTIMAL OUTCOME 26

Static Efficiency 27 Dynamic Efficiency 28

APPLYING THE CONCEPTS 28

Pollution Control 28

Example 2.2 Does Reducing Pollution Make Economic Sense? 29

Preservation versus Development 30

SUMMARY 30

Example 2.3 Choosing Between Preservation and Development in Australia 31

Further Reading 32

Additional References 32

Discussion Question 32

Problem 32

APPENDIX 33

The Simple Mathematics of Dynamic Efficiency 33

CHAPTER THREE VALUING THE ENVIRONMENT: METHODS 34

INTRODUCTION 34

VALUING BENEFITS 35

Types of Values 37

Example 3.1 Valuing the Northern Spotted Owl 38

Classifying Valuation Methods 38

Valuing Human Life 42

Example 3.2 Valuing Damage From Groundwater Contamination Using Averting Expenditures 43

Example 3.3 Valuing Diesel Odor Reduction by Contingent Ranking 44

Issues in Benefit Estimation 44

Primary versus Secondary Effects 44

Example 3.4 The Value of Wildlife Viewing 45

Tangible versus Intangible Benefits 47

Approaches to Cost Estimation 47

The Survey Approach 48

The Engineering Approach 48

The Combined Approach 48

The Treatment of Risk 48

Choosing the Discount Rate 51

A Critical Appraisal 51

Example 3.5 The Importance of the Discount Rate 52

COST-EFFECTIVENESS ANALYSIS 54

IMPACT ANALYSIS 55

Example 3.6 NO₂ Control in Chicago: An Example of Cost-Effectiveness Analysis 56

SUMMARY 57

Further Reading 58

Additional References 59 Discussion Questions 60 Problems 60
FOUR PROPERTY RIGHTS, EXTERNALITIES, AND ENVIRONMENTAL PROBLEMS 61
INTRODUCTION 61 PROPERTY RIGHTS 62 Property Rights and Efficient Market Allocations 62 Efficient Property Right Structures 62 Example 4.1 Pollution in Centrally Planned Economies 63
EXTERNALITIES AS A SOURCE OF MARKET FAILURE 65 The Concept Introduced 65 Types of Externalities 68
IMPROPERLY DESIGNED PROPERTY RIGHTS SYSTEMS 69 Other Property Rights Regimes 69 Public Goods 71
IMPERFECT MARKET STRUCTURES 73 Example 4.2 Public Goods Privately Provided: The Nature Conservancy 74
DIVERGENCE OF SOCIAL AND PRIVATE DISCOUNT RATES 74
GOVERNMENT FAILURE 76 Example 4.3 Religion as the Source of Environmental Problems 77
THE PURSUIT OF EFFICIENCY 78 Private Resolution through Negotiation 78 The Courts: Property Rules and Liability Rules 79
LEGISLATIVE AND EXECUTIVE REGULATION 81

AN EFFICIENT ROLE FOR GOVERNMENT 82

SUMMARY 82

CHAPTER

Further Reading 83 Additional References 83 Discussion Questions 84 Problems 84

CHAPTER FIVE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT: DEFINING THE CONCEPT 86

INTRODUCTION 86 A TWO-PERIOD MODEL 87 **DEFINING INTERTEMPORAL FAIRNESS** 91

ARE EFFICIENT ALLOCATIONS FAIR? 92		
APPLYING THE SUSTAINABILITY CRITERION	93	
IMPLICATIONS FOR ENVIRONMENTAL POLI	CY 9	95

SUMMARY 95

Further Reading 97
Additional References 97
Discussion Questions 98
Problems 98

APPENDIX 98

The Mathematics of the Two-Period Model 98

CHAPTER SIX THE POPULATION PROBLEM 100

INTRODUCTION 100

HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE 101

World Population Growth 101
Population Growth in the United States 102

EFFECTS OF POPULATION GROWTH ON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT 104

EFFECTS OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT ON POPULATION GROWTH 110

THE ECONOMIC APPROACH TO POPULATION CONTROL 113

Example 6.1 The Value of an Averted Birth 114

Example 6.2 Fertility Decline in Korea: A Case Study 118

Example 6.3 Income-Generating Activities as Fertility Control: Bangladesh 120

SUMMARY 121

Further Reading 122
Additional References 122
Discussion Questions 123
Problems 124

CHAPTER SEVEN THE ALLOCATION OF DEPLETABLE AND RENEWABLE RESOURCES: AN OVERVIEW 125

INTRODUCTION 125

A RESOURCE TAXONOMY 126

Example 7.1 The Pitfalls in Misusing Reserve Data 129

EFFICIENT INTERTEMPORAL ALLOCATIONS 131

The Two-Period Model Revisited 131

The N-Period Constant-Cost Case 132
Transition to a Renewable Substitute 132
Increasing Marginal Extraction Cost 136
Exploration and Technological Progress 137

MARKET ALLOCATIONS 138

Appropriate Property Right Structures 138

Example 7.2 Technological Progress in the Iron Ore Industry 139

Environmental Costs 140

SUMMARY 142

Further Reading 143 Additional References 143 Problems 143

APPENDIX 144

Extensions of the Basic Depletable Resource Model
The N-Period, Constant-Cost, No-Substitute Case
144
Constant Marginal Cost with an Abundant Renewable
Substitute
145
Increasing Marginal Cost Case
147
Including Environmental Cost
148

CHAPTER EIGHT DEPLETABLE, NONRECYCLABLE ENERGY RESOURCES: OIL, GAS, COAL, AND URANIUM 149

INTRODUCTION 149

NATURAL GAS: PRICE CONTROLS 150

Example 8.1 Price Controls and Substitution Bias 154

OIL: THE CARTEL PROBLEM 156

Price Elasticity of Demand 157

Example 8.2 Optimal OPEC Pricing 158

Example 8.3 Are Soft Energy Paths Doomed? 159

Income Elasticity of Demand 159

Non-OPEC Suppliers 160

Compatibility of Member Interests 161

OIL: NATIONAL SECURITY PROBLEM 162

TRANSITION FUELS: ENVIRONMENTAL PROBLEMS 166

ELECTRICITY 170

THE LONG RUN 173

SUMMARY 175

Further Reading 176
Additional References 176
Discussion Questions 177
Problems 178

CHAPTER NINE RECYCLABLE RESOURCES: MINERALS, PAPER, GLASS, ETC. 179

INTRODUCTION 179

AN EFFICIENT ALLOCATION OF RECYCLABLE RESOURCES 180

Extraction and Disposal Cost 181

Example 9.1 Population Density and Recycling:

The Japanese Experience 181

Example 9.2 New Markets for Trash: Tires 182

Recycling: A Closer Look 182

Recycling and Virgin Ore Depletion 183

THE STRATEGIC-MATERIAL PROBLEM REVISITED 184

General Principles 184

Example 9.3 Lead Recycling 184

Government Response 185

Cobalt: A Case Study 186

Substitution and Vulnerability 186

WASTE DISPOSAL AND POLLUTION DAMAGE 188

Disposal Cost and Efficiency 188

The Disposal Decision 188

Disposal Costs and the Scrap Market 190

Public Policies 190

Pollution Damage 195

Example 9.4 Implementing the "Take-Back" Principle 196

TAX TREATMENT OF MINERALS 197

PRODUCT DURABILITY 199

Functional Obsolescence 200

Fashion Obsolescence 200

Durability Obsolescence 200

SUMMARY 203

Further Reading 203

Additional References 204

Discussion Questions 205

Problems 205

CHAPTER TEN REPLENISHABLE BUT DEPLETABLE RESOURCES: WATER 207

INTRODUCTION 207

THE POTENTIAL FOR WATER SCARCITY 208

THE EFFICIENT ALLOCATION OF SCARCE WATER 210

Surface Water 210

Groundwater 212

THE CURRENT ALLOCATION SYSTEM 213

Riparian and Prior Appropriation Doctrines 213
Sources of Inefficiency 214
Restrictions on Transfers 215
Federal Reclamation Projects 216
Water Pricing 217
Common Property Problems 217

POTENTIAL REMEDIES 218

Example 10.1 Using Economic Principles to Conserve Water in California 219

Example 10.2 Protecting Instream Uses Through Acquiring Water Rights 220

SUMMARY 224

Example 10.3 Politics and the Pricing of Scarce Water 225
Further Reading 226
Additional References 226
Discussion Questions 227
Problems 228

CHAPTER ELEVEN REPRODUCIBLE PRIVATE-PROPERTY RESOURCES: AGRICULTURE 229

INTRODUCTION 229
GLOBAL SCARCITY 230

FORMULATING THE GLOBAL SCARCITY HYPOTHESIS 231

TESTING THE HYPOTHESIS 233

Outlook for the Future 234
Technological Progress 234
Allocation of Agricultural Land 235
Energy Costs 236
Environmental Costs 236

THE ROLE OF AGRICULTURAL POLICIES 238

A SUMMING UP 239

DISTRIBUTION OF FOOD RESOURCES 239

Defining the Problem 240
Domestic Production in LDCs 240
The Undervaluation Bias 242
Example 11.1 The Price Responsiveness of Supply: Thailand 243
Feeding the Poor 244
Example 11.2 Perverse Government Intervention: The Case
of Colombia 245

FEAST AND FAMINE CYCLES 246

SUMMARY 249

Further Reading 250
Additional References 251
Discussion Questions 252
Problems 253

CHAPTER TWELVE STORABLE, RENEWABLE RESOURCES: FORESTS 254

INTRODUCTION 254

DEFINING EFFICIENT MANAGEMENT 256

The Biological Dimension 256
The Economics of Forest Harvesting 257
Extending the Basic Model 261

SOURCES OF INEFFICIENCY 263

Global Inefficiencies 263
Biodiversity 263
Global Warming 263
Poverty and Debt 264
Perverse Incentives 265
Example 12.1 Externalities in Forest Management:
Waldsterben 267

IMPLEMENTING EFFICIENT MANAGEMENT 268

Debt-Nature Swaps 270
Extractive Reserves 271
Establishing Conservation Easements 271
Example 12.2 Success Stories in Conserving Tropical
Forests 272

SUMMARY 273

Example 12.3 The International Tropical Timber Agreement 273

Example 12.4 Trust Funds for Habitat Preservation 274

Further Reading 275

Additional References 276

Discussion Questions 277

Problems 277

APPENDIX 277

The Harvesting Decision: Forests 277

CHAPTER THIRTEEN RENEWABLE COMMON-PROPERTY RESOURCES: FISHERIES AND OTHER SPECIES 279

INTRODUCTION 279

EFFICIENT ALLOCATION 280

The Biological Dimension 280 Static Efficient Sustainable Yield 282 Dynamic Efficient Sustainable Yield 284

APPROPRIABILITY AND MARKET SOLUTIONS 286

Example 13.1 Property Rights and Fisheries: Oysters 289
Example 13.2 Free-Access Harvesting of the Minke Whale 290
Example 13.3 Harbor Gangs of Maine 291

PUBLIC POLICY TOWARD FISHERIES 292

Aquaculture 292
Raising the Real Cost of Fishing 293
Taxes 295
Individual Transferable Quotas (ITQs) 296
Example 13.4 Efficient Versus Market Exploitation
of Lobsters 297
The 200-Mile Limit 300
The Economics of Enforcement 301
Extension to Other Species 302

SUMMARY 302

Example 13.5 Local Approaches to Wildlife Protection:
Zimbabwe 303
Further Reading 304
Additional References 304
Discussion Questions 306
Problems 306

APPENDIX 307

The Harvesting Decision: Fisheries 307

CHAPTER FOURTEEN GENERALIZED RESOURCE SCARCITY 310

INTRODUCTION 310

FACTORS MITIGATING RESOURCE SCARCITY 311

Exploration and Discovery 311 Technological Progress 312 Substitution 312

DETECTING RESOURCE SCARCITY 313

Example 14.1 Resource Scarcity in Historical Perspective:
Timber 314
Criteria for an Ideal Scarcity Indicator 315
Applying the Criteria 315
The Physical Indicators 315
Resource Prices 316