

Modern Economic Analysis

D H GOWIAN

Modern Economic Analysis

Edited by

D.H. GOWLAND

Lecturer in Economics at the University of York

BUTTERWORTHS

LONDON – BOSTON

Sydney – Wellington – Durban – Toronto

United Kingdom London	Butterworth & Co (Publishers) Ltd 88 Kingsway, WC2B 6AB
Australia Sydney	Butterworths Pty Ltd 586 Pacific Highway, Chatswood, NSW 2067 Also at Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide and Perth
Canada Toronto	Butterworth & Co (Canada) Ltd 2265 Midland Avenue, Scarborough, Ontario, M1P 4S1
New Zealand Wellington	Butterworths of New Zealand Ltd T & W Young Building, 77-85 Customhouse Quay, 1, CPO Box 472
South Africa Durban	Butterworth & Co (South Africa) (Pty) Ltd 152-154 Gale Street
USA Boston	Butterworth (Publishers) Inc 10 Tower Office Park, Woburn, Massachusetts 01801

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the Publishers. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

This book is sold subject to the Standard Conditions of Sale of Net Books and may not be re-sold in the UK below the net price given by the Publishers in their current price list.

First published 1979

© Butterworth & Co (Publishers) Ltd, 1979

ISBN 0 408 10632 8

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Modern economic analysis.

1. Economics

I. Gowland, D.H.

330 HB171 78-41281

ISBN 0-408-10632-8

Typeset by Scribe Design, Gillingham, Kent

Printed in Great Britain by Billing & Sons Ltd, Guildford & London

Preface

Keynes once defined economics as a 'technique of thinking'. If the authors of this book are not all Keynesians in any other sense, we would all like to think that we are heirs to Keynes in this respect. In our view economics must be a problem-orientated subject, or else it is nothing at all. The art of an economist is to analyse problems by the use of a toolkit of basically simple devices. The power of elementary economics is greatly underestimated by students of the subject, in part because their teachers lack the confidence to expound the full power of the subject. The authors of this book have had a wide and varied experience in government, ranging from 10 Downing Street to the DHSS via the Treasury and the Bank of England. Others have worked as consultants for the European Commission, for City firms and for a wide range of other public and private bodies. It may surprise our readers to learn that this has left us basically very optimistic about our subject.

Criticism of economists is very common. Two hundred years ago Charles James Fox said that economics 'was the most useless of all sciences'. Almost two hundred years later James Callaghan, one of his successors as Chancellor of the Exchequer, said that if you get five economists together you have six opinions. There are many other similar witticisms about the profession so it is perhaps important to point out how and why economists disagree. Normally disagreement arises from one of two closely related sources. Economists make different assumptions which are then fed into the same model and produce dramatically different results. The New Cambridge School, outlined in Appendix D to Chapter 2, is a very good example of what can be done with the elementary Keynesian national income model. The Keynesian—monetarist controversy is another example of how different assumptions fed into the same model can produce radically

different policy conclusions. Like many disputes the monetarist-Keynesian one can also be thought of as purely a dispute about empirical magnitudes. Whichever assumptions, monetarist or Keynesian, are the more valid it would normally be agreed they are dependent upon observation and estimation of real world phenomena. Thus one may say that the monetarist viewpoint consists of a special assumption about the interest elasticity of the demand-for-money and the substitutability of money for real assets. Alternatively one may say that the monetarist position is dependent upon the empirical estimation of these magnitudes.

It is perhaps important to stress how crucial the four basic concepts of economics are. They are all concerned with the analysis of choice. Under various titles this has always been accepted as the underlying rationale of economics, sometimes loosely described as the allocation of scarce resources to unlimited wants, at other times precisely described as a study of constrained maximization. The four basic concepts are opportunity cost, efficiency, marginality, and time preference. Opportunity cost is normally dealt with in the first chapter of an economics textbook and thereafter forgotten. This is very unfortunate since the concept has enormous power in the analysis of real world economic problems. The whole of cost-benefit analysis is built upon this. For example, it probably sounds like an exercise from 1984 to say that policy-makers must value life. Yet modern society is based upon decisions that involve a choice between life on the one hand and material goods or time on the other. The decision to use motor cars as a means of transport is an obvious example of this. The motor car costs 12,000 lives per annum, yet there is no political lobby demanding that it should be banned. It is even regarded as politically impossible to control drunken driving adequately despite the fact that this probably costs 4,000 lives per annum. Whether the advantages of speed and convenience and the pleasures of drink are worth 12,000 and 4,000 lives respectively is a decision which can only be analysed in terms of opportunity cost. There are many examples where choices are between seemingly intangible and immeasurable things like time, life and so on, on the one hand, and material goods on the other. By seeking to make these implicit choices explicit and by making them subject to public scrutiny the economist hopes to render decision-making consistent. It is absurd, from one point of view, to refuse to spend £50,000 on saving a life in one context, for example by building a footbridge near a school, and to spend twenty times this in another context, for example to minimize rail casualties. This search for consistency need not imply any overall view as to the value of life, but merely a view that as many lives as possible should be saved for any given expenditure. The economist normally seeks an efficient outcome to any problem.

However the 'efficiency expert' is very unpopular. By using the word 'efficiency' the economist incurs a share of the insults thrown at this expert. In fact the concept of efficiency is used in a very special sense by economists. It has two basic meanings. The first is that it is impossible to get more output of one good from given inputs without sacrificing the output of some other good. In an economy there are an infinite range of goods or combinations of output which satisfy this condition. Nevertheless, there is an even larger number which do not; if one can literally have something for nothing it seems foolish to sacrifice this opportunity. This does not mean that all economists believe that people should work harder, because in this case inputs are changed. Furthermore, it does not mean that they prefer mass-produced beakers or deplore the production of real ale; hand-thrown pottery and real ale are different products from mass-produced ones so to sacrifice these involves sacrificing one good in favour of another. The concept of efficiency says nothing about these, however in many contexts it is a very powerful tool of analysis, as we hope to make clear in Chapters 9, 10, 11 and 12. The other basic meaning of efficiency is that one cannot maintain the present level of output with less input. Strictly, one cannot reduce the input of any one factor of production without increasing the inputs of another. This again may seem trivially obvious, yet it is a very powerful tool of analysis.

The concept of efficiency is often defined in terms of marginal conditions. The word marginal is at the heart of any economic analysis. It is surprising how often economists contribute to public decision-making merely because of their ingrained habit of thinking in terms of marginal rather than average. For example it is obviously true that if all expenditure by the water industry were stopped there would be grave consequences for health. In particular it is likely that there would be a large-scale cholera epidemic. On the other hand this does not mean that all the present expenditure on water can be justified in terms of health. In fact it is probably true that one could reduce this expenditure by 10% or 20% with no cost in terms of health. Certainly if a small fraction of the saving were devoted to expenditure on the National Health Service then the overall gain in terms of the health of the community would be very large. The origins of this example can perhaps be seen by glancing at Alan Williams' biography.

The fourth basic concept is time preference. In fact this is really simply a special case of opportunity cost. In a community which is growing richer the postponement of expenditure is normally highly desirable. This may again seem trivially obvious yet many decisions are made on a basis that contravenes this — many people are happy in their public capacity to spend unjustifiably large sums now to avoid the expenditure of smaller ones in the future.

These four concepts run throughout this book together with many other simple economic tools. For example the chapter on 'Money and Banking' emphasizes how the application of simple supply and demand analysis enables one to solve many of the apparent mysteries of the subject. In fact the book frequently restates familiar topics so as to bring out problems with which the experienced are unfamiliar or have only seen treated superficially elsewhere. The section 5.1 on the quantity theory of money is a good example of this. Thus, we believe that the book will be of value to nearly all students and practitioners of economics, almost irrespective of their present level and experience. The book originated in a series of one-week courses for teachers of economics organized at the University of York.

Contributors

David Gowland is a lecturer in Economics at the University of York and is also Director of In-Service Training. He worked in the Economic section of the Bank of England from 1971–73. He was founder co-author of the Rothschild Intercontinental Bank Monthly Review in 1974. Between 1975 and 1979 he worked as a consultant on domestic and international monetary and financial policy to the 10 Downing Street Policy Unit. He has written various articles on aspects of monetary economics and securities markets and is the author of a recent book *Monetary Policy and Credit Control: the UK Experience*.

Mark Austin is a lecturer in Economics at the University of York. He is currently engaged in research into the influence of company financial behaviour on investment.

Gavyn Davies was a policy adviser in the 10 Downing Street Policy Unit, 1974–79. He previously did research in labour economics at Oxford.

Alan Maynard is a senior lecturer in Economics at the University of York. He has worked for the EEC Commission, the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), the Royal Commission on the Distribution of Income and Wealth, and the Royal Commission on the National Health Service. He is the author of numerous articles on economic aspects of social policy and of the book *Health Care in the European Community*.

Michael G. Webb is a senior research fellow at the Institute of Social and Economic Research at the University of York. He was previously a lecturer at Leicester University, and is also a lecturer on project

appraisal with the U.N. Asian Development Institute. He is the author of numerous articles on various aspects of economics as well as several books including *Pricing Policies for Public Enterprises*, *The Economics of Nationalised Industries* and *The Economics of Energy*.

Alan Williams is a professor in the Department of Economics at the University of York. He is author of several books and numerous articles on public expenditure appraisal. His most recent book is *The Principles of Practical Cost-Benefit Analysis*. Between 1966 and 1968 he was seconded to HM Treasury as a consultant on programme budgeting and cost-benefit analysis, and also served on various working parties concerned with the application of these techniques in local government. He has been a member of the Yorkshire Water Authority and of the Royal Commission on the National Health Service and is currently directing further empirical research on the economics of health and welfare services.

Contents

1 Money and Banking D.H. Gowland	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Monetary Policy : A Conceptual Framework	2
1.3 Techniques of Monetary Control	5
1.4 The 'Old Approach'	7
1.5 The Lessons of the 'Old Approach'	8
1.6 The 'New Approach' : Competition and Credit Control	10
1.7 Was the 'New Approach' so Simple?	12
1.8 The Role of Special Deposits and Reserve Ratios	13
1.9 The Overnight Inter-Bank Market	15
1.10 The History of the 'New Approach'	16
1.11 What went Wrong?	17
1.11.1 The Merry-go-Round and the CD Tax Loophole	17
1.12 The Authorities' Choice : the 'New "New Approach"'	18
1.13 The Gilt-Edged Market	20
1.14 The 'New "New Approach" ' in Action	21
1.15 Money Supply Targets	24
1.16 The IMF and After	25
Appendix 1A: Money Creation	26
Appendix 1B: Definitions of the Money Supply	27
Appendix 1C: The Overseas Impact on the Money Supply	28
Appendix 1D: The Creation of Reserve Assets	31
 2 International Monetary Economics D.H. Gowland	 39
2.1 Fixed and Floating Exchange Rates	39
2.2 Some Paradoxes	39

2.3	Discipline	40
2.3.1	Some Warnings	41
2.4	Certainty	42
2.5	Destabilizing Speculation	43
2.6	Floating Rates and Inflation	45
2.7	Exchange Rates and the Balance of Payments	45
2.7.1	The Elasticities Approach	46
2.7.1.1	'Elasticity Pessimism'	47
2.7.2	The New Theories	47
2.7.2.1	The Absorption Approach	48
2.7.2.2	The Monetary Theory of the Balance of Payments	48
2.7.2.3	The New Cambridge School	49
2.7.2.4	The New Theories : Common Features	49
2.7.3	The 'J' Curve and the Treasury Model	49
2.8	Government Policy and the Foreign Exchange Market	51
Appendix 2A:	Arbitrage in Foreign Exchange Markets and the Interest Parity Theory	52
Appendix 2B:	An Analysis of Exchange Rate Regimes	54
Appendix 2C:	Speculation and Intervention	55
Appendix 2D:	The New Cambridge School	57

3	The Eurocurrency Market D.H. Gowland	65
3.1	What is Eurocurrency?	65
3.2	The Available Statistics	66
3.3	Changing Patterns of Eurocurrency Markets	66
3.4	A Digression : Petrodollars	67
3.5	The Maturity Structure of the Market	67
3.6	Safety of the Market and Official Control	67
3.7	A Digression Upon the Ethics of Eurocurrency Markets	68
3.8	The History of the Market	69
3.8.1	1927-57	69
3.8.2	Expansion 1958-64	69
3.8.3	US Monetary Policy 1965-69	70
3.8.4	The Era of LDCs 1970-73	71
3.8.5	The Era of Consolidation 1974-	71
3.9	The Impact of the Eurocurrency Market	72
3.9.1	Eurocurrency Markets and Domestic Monetary Policy	72
3.9.2	Eurocurrency Markets and World Inflation	73
3.9.3	Vehicle of Anglo-Saxon Imperialism?	73
3.9.4	Exchange Rate Stability	74

4 UK Financial Institutions: Have They Failed the Nation?	
D. H. Gowland	77
4.1 Introduction	77
4.2 The Indictment	78
4.2.1 The Level of UK Investment	78
4.2.2 A Non-Availability of Long-Term Funds	80
4.2.3 Cost of Capital	81
4.2.4 The Absence of an Industrial Bond Market	81
4.2.5 Low Loan Limits	82
4.2.6 An Overactive Secondary Market	83
4.2.7 The Absence of Industrial Banking	85
4.2.8 Bias Against Small Companies	86
4.2.9 Regional Discrimination	87
4.2.10 The Consequences of the Decline of the Private Investor	88
4.2.11 Excessive Overseas Investment	89
4.3 Some Recent Developments	89
Appendix 4A: The Available Data	90
 5 Monetarists and Keynesians D.H. Gowland	 95
5.1 Introduction	95
5.2 The Quantity Theory	96
5.2.1 Does Money Exist?	98
5.3 The IS/LM Model	98
5.4 The Tobin Model	104
5.4.1 Tobin's Transmission Mechanism	105
5.4.2 The Monetarist Transmission Mechanism	106
5.5 The Flow-of-Funds Model	107
5.6 Causality: Theory and Empirical Work	109
5.7 Some Conclusions	110
Appendix 5A: The American 'New Right'	110
Appendix 5B: Was Keynes a Keynesian?	112
Appendix 5C: Is Friedman a Keynesian?	113
 6 Unemployment Gavyn Davies	 119
6.1 Introduction	119
6.2 New Developments in Unemployment Theory	120
6.2.1 Classical and Keynesian Unemployment	120
6.2.2 Search Unemployment and the Natural Rate	126

xiv Contents

6.3. The Recent Behaviour of Unemployment in the UK	128
6.3.1 Hidden Unemployment	128
6.3.2 Hoarded Labour	129
6.3.3 Voluntary Unemployment	130
6.3.4 Demand Deficiency	131
6.4 Conclusion	133
7 Inflation Gavyn Davies	137
7.1 Introduction	137
7.2 The Revival of Monetarism	137
7.3 The Phillips Curve	138
7.4 Trade Unions and Incomes Policy	148
7.5 Inflation in an Open Economy	151
7.6 Conclusion	152
8 Investment Mark Austin	157
8.1 Introduction	157
8.2 The Theories	158
8.2.1 Keynes and the Marginal Efficiency of Capital	158
8.2.2 The Accelerator	160
8.2.3 Costs of Adjustment	161
8.2.4 Neo-classical	163
8.3 The Evidence	164
8.3.1 The Crucial Variables	164
8.3.2 The Lag Structure	165
8.3.3 The Influence of Government Policy	166
9 Cost-Benefit Analysis Alan Williams	169
9.1 Introduction	169
9.2 Efficient Private Sector Investment Appraisal	170
9.3 What Relevance has this for the Public Sector?	173
9.4 Three Exhibits	175
9.4.1 The London Underground Network	175
9.4.2 Nuclear vs Coal-Fired Power Stations	176
9.4.3 Trunk Road Improvements	177
9.5 Conclusions	180

10 Nationalized Industries Michael G. Webb	183
10.1 Introduction	183
10.2 Definition and Importance in the UK Economy	183
10.2.1 The Public Corporation Concept	184
10.2.2 Importance in the UK Economy	184
10.3 Objectives and Constraints	185
10.3.1 Economic Efficiency	186
10.3.2 Profitability	187
10.3.3 Equity	187
10.3.4 Macroeconomic Objectives	188
10.3.5 Objective Functions and Constraints	188
10.4 Pricing and Investment Guidelines	189
10.4.1 Measurement	190
10.4.2 Complications	192
10.4.3 Pricing Rules and the Profitability Objective	193
10.4.4 Peak Load Pricing	193
10.5 Government Control of the Nationalized Industries	194
 11 Energy Michael G. Webb	 197
11.1 Introduction	197
11.2 Energy Pricing	197
11.2.1 Measures of Marginal Costs	199
11.2.2 Peak Load Pricing	200
11.2.3 Practice	201
11.3 Depletion Policy	202
11.4 Energy and the Environment	206
 12 The Economics of Social Policy Alan Maynard	 209
12.1 Introduction	209
12.2 Alternative Concepts of Poverty	209
12.3 The Measurement and Definition of Poverty	210
12.4 The Causes of Poverty	213
12.4.1 The Causes of Poverty: An Institutional Perspective	213
12.4.2 The Causes of Poverty: Low Productivity	214
12.5 Alternative Poverty Policies	216

13 The Control of Public Spending	D.H. Gowland	223
13.1	Introduction	223
13.2	The PESC System	224
13.2.1	The Defects of the PESC System	227
13.3	Cash Limits	229
13.4	Some Possible Reforms	230
13.4.1	Ministry of the Budget	230
13.4.2	High Employment Budget Deficit	230
Appendix 13A:	Comparisons of Public Spending	231
Appendix 13B:	The Treasury Medium-Term Assessment	234
14 New Microeconomics : The Economics of Public Choice		
	Alan Maynard	237
14.1	Introduction	237
14.2	Why does the State Exist?	237
14.3	The Economics of Politics	245
14.3.1	The Economics of Voting	245
14.3.2	The Economics of Political Behaviour	246
14.3.3	The Economics of Bureaucracy	248

1

Money and Banking

D.H. Gowland

1.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter is essentially a study of the conduct of monetary policy in the UK in recent years. The subject seems to fill most students with dread since it tends to be regarded as a rather esoteric and complex subject whereas it is in fact very simple¹. It is worth considering why the subject causes such response and in doing so to stress some of the basic problems and concepts which underlie the misunderstanding and the understanding of the subject.

It is difficult to approach the subject since it is swathed in the mystique of generations of central bankers and is often presented by both academic and journalistic commentators in a cocoon of unnecessary jargon². Thus even the proposition that demand curves slope downwards can sound like high mysticism³. More important, many people are bemused by the seeming *legerdemain* when millions of pounds are created out of thin air⁴. Provided the 'balance sheet identities' are satisfied then such transactions are possible, even if they sound like something out of 'Alice in Wonderland'. To develop this point, gross assets and liabilities can be magnified or contracted at will. The only constraint is that an equal quantity of assets and liabilities must be created. This leads to a crucial point in monetary analysis; when considering an asset one must always remember the liability which has been created.

Another fundamental problem in the analysis of a monetary system is that the government controls a very few simple instruments, e.g. MLR, open market operations, and seeks to influence various ultimate targets: the price level, output, unemployment, the balance of payments and so on. A long chain links instrument and target. Monetary economics tends to analyse the intermediate links in the chain. This causes much confusion since most of the problems in

monetary economics are about the appropriate point at which to analyse the process. In particular, there is much argument about what is a target and what is an indicator. Virtually every economist would agree that most definitions of the money supply (and many other financial aggregates) are closely linked to national income; at least in the absence of attempts to use them for policy purposes. The dispute is about whether the connection reflects an indicator or a target. To use a metaphor, everyone would agree that a thermometer reading is related to the heat of a room. But plunging a thermometer in a bucket of ice will not influence the temperature of a room. However, while a thermometer is an indicator but not a target, a thermostat is quite a good proximate target; adjusting (i.e. controlling) it will be a reasonable method of controlling the temperature of a room (provided the central heating system, the structure of the economy, is unaltered). Monetary economics is often like a debate about which is a thermostat and which a thermometer, but which ignores both the actual heat of the room and the central-heating boiler. This leads to the definition of both monetary policy and monetary economics. Monetary policy is the appropriate use of official instruments in order to influence financial flows with the aim of ensuring an optimal constellation of output, employment, inflation, balance of payments, etc. Monetary economics is thus essentially the study of proximate targets and indicators in an attempt to measure the effect of official instruments and the decisions of financial intermediaries on the ultimate targets.

1.2 MONETARY POLICY : A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

Economics as a subject only makes sense within an appropriate conceptual framework. It was argued above that one of the common mistakes of monetary analysis is to concentrate excessively on institutional detail rather than on the underlying conceptual problem. Thus, this section considers one such framework which is both the simplest and the one used by the UK authorities. It is in fact impossible to understand what the authorities have done, or tried to do, or may do, without an understanding of how they have analysed the situations they have faced.

Initially this model assumes a closed economy. One starts by defining the money supply:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Money} &= \text{bank deposits} \\ &+ \text{non-bank private sector holdings of currency} \end{aligned} \quad (1.1)$$

(This definition is basically the UK M_3). However, deposits are a bank's