

Democracy

Liberty

&

Property

DEMOCRACY, LIBERTY, AND PROPERTY

Readings in the American Political Tradition

Edited, with Introductions, by

FRANCIS W. COKER

*Alfred Cowles Professor of Government,
Yale University*

NEW YORK • *The Macmillan Company* • 1947

COPYRIGHT, 1942,
By THE MACMILLAN COMPANY

All rights reserved—no part of this book may be reproduced in any form without permission in writing from the publisher, except by a reviewer who wishes to quote brief passages in connection with a review written for inclusion in magazine or newspaper.

— PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA —

Published May, 1942

Reprinted March, 1947

PREFACE

FREE speculation upon the nature and purpose of government has been an element of the American tradition from the days of the first settlements. Our writers have stood predominantly for government by consent, freedom in regard to belief and expression, and free economic enterprise. This is not to say that we have all been of one mind in these matters. The principles themselves have been challenged from time to time; and we have engaged in continual debate upon their quantitative and qualitative implications. What should be the form and extent of popular participation in government? What rightful limits are to be set upon the power of government over personal liberties or property rights? How may we determine the pace of political change, or preserve that responsiveness to emerging public demands which is the essence of democracy? These and kindred questions have provided the dynamic which has made our political speculation the vital thing it has always been.

The purpose of this collection is to indicate the main lines of our political tradition by means of representative excerpts from a variety of sources,—essays and addresses, public documents, revolutionary pronouncements, formal treatises; and the attempt has been made to indicate typical attitudes on both sides of the fundamental questions at issue.

The editor is greatly indebted for advice and criticism given by colleagues in Yale University: Professors C. H. Driver, A. W. Griswold, and H. C. Mansfield; Mrs. Margaret Lippiatt Van Houten, research assistant in government; Mr. Paul F. Boller, Foote-Sheldon Clark fellow in History, the Arts, and Letters; Mr. Maurice J. Klain, Cowles fellow in government; and Miss Frances Astrachan, graduate student in government.

F. W. C.

NEW HAVEN, CONN.
April, 1942

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

THE author gratefully acknowledges the kindness of publishers in giving permission to reprint selections in this volume as follows:

D. APPLETON-CENTURY COMPANY for the selections from *The Complete Works of Abraham Lincoln* (c. 1894, 1905).

THE JOHN DAY COMPANY for the selection from Franklin D. Roosevelt, *Looking Forward* (1933).

DOUBLEDAY, DORAN AND COMPANY, INC. for the selection from Woodrow Wilson, *The New Freedom* (c. 1913, 1933).

HARPER & BROTHERS for the selections from Horace Greeley, *Hints Towards Reform* (1850); and from The Rt. Rev. Msgr. John A. Ryan, *A Better Economic Order* (1935).

THE PRESIDENT AND FELLOWS OF HARVARD COLLEGE for the selection from Thomas Nixon Carver, *Essays in Social Justice* (1915).

HENRY HOLT AND COMPANY, INC. for the selection from Frederick Jackson Turner, *The Frontier in American History* (1920).

HOUGHTON MIFFLIN COMPANY for the selections from Herbert Agar and Allen Tate, eds., *Who Owns America?* (1936); from *Emerson's Complete Works* (1883); and from *The Writings of Henry David Thoreau* (c. 1906).

MITCHELL KENNERLEY for the selection from Walt Whitman, *Complete Prose Works* (1914).

ALFRED A. KNOFF, INC. for the selections from Charles A. Beard, *The Economic Basis of Politics* (1922, 1934); from James Fenimore Cooper, *The American Democrat* (reprint, 1931); and from H. L. Mencken, *Notes on Democracy* (1926).

FOLA LA FOLLETTE for the selection from Robert M. La Follette, *La Follette's Autobiography* (1913).

THE LATE RT. REV. WILLIAM LAWRENCE for his article, "The Relation of Wealth to Morals" in *The World's Work*, Vol. I (1900-01).

J. B. LIPPINCOTT COMPANY for the selection from H. C. Carey, *Principles of Social Science* (ed. 1871).

LITTLE, BROWN & COMPANY for the selections from *The Works of John Adams* (1850-56); from *The Works of Fisher Ames* (1854); from

Theodore Parker, *Additional Speeches* (1855); and from *The Works of Daniel Webster* (1851).

MACMILLAN COMPANY for the selections from *The Writings of John Quincy Adams* (1913-17); from *The Writings of Benjamin Franklin* (1905-07); and from Norman Thomas, *After the New Deal, What?* (1936).

MASSACHUSETTS HISTORICAL SOCIETY for the selection from *The Winthrop Papers* (1931).

G. P. PUTNAM'S SONS for the selections from *The Writings of Samuel Adams* (1904-08); *The Works of Alexander Hamilton* (1904); *The Writings of Thomas Jefferson* (1892-99); and *The Writings of Thomas Paine* (1894-96).

REYNAL & HITCHCOCK, INC. for the selection from Henry A. Wallace, *New Frontiers* (1934).

ROOSEVELT MEMORIAL ASSOCIATION, INC. for the selection from *The Works of Theodore Roosevelt* (1923-26).

ROBERT SCHALKENBACH FOUNDATION for the selection from Henry George, *Progress and Poverty* (reprint, 1940).

CHARLES SCRIBNER'S SONS for the selections from E. G. Conklin, *The Direction of Human Evolution* (rev. ed., 1934); from Charles Horton Cooley, *Social Organization* (1909); from Edwin Lawrence Godkin, *Problems of Modern Democracy* (3rd. ed., 1907); from Herbert Hoover, *The Challenge to Liberty* (1934); and from Thorstein Veblen, *The Theory of Business Enterprise* (1904).

THE VIKING PRESS, INC. for the selection from Thorstein Veblen, *The Theory of the Leisure Class* (1899).

YALE UNIVERSITY PRESS for the selections from Carl L. Becker, *Modern Democracy* (1941); from *Records of the Federal Convention*, ed. by Max Farrand (rev. ed., 1937); and from *Essays of William Graham Sumner*, ed. by A. G. Keller and M. R. Davie (1934).

CONTENTS

	PAGE
PREFACE	v
INTRODUCTION: ORIGINS OF THE AMERICAN POLITICAL TRADITION	1
I. DEMOCRACY VERSUS ARISTOCRACY	
1. JOHN WINTHROP (1588-1649)	15
From <i>A Modell of Christian Charity</i> (1630)	17
2. JOHN COTTON (1584-1652)	21
From <i>Copy of a Letter from Mr. Cotton to Lord Say and Seal in the Year 1636</i>	23
3. THE "FUNDAMENTAL AGREEMENT" OF NEW HAVEN (1639) .	26
4. JOHN WISE (1652-1725)	33
From <i>A Vindication of the Government of New-England Churches</i> (1717)	34
5. THOMAS PAINE (1737-1809)	45
From <i>Common Sense</i> (1776)	47
6. THE DECLARATION OF INDEPENDENCE (1776)	59
7. THE CONVENTION OF 1787	65
Debates on Representation and the Suffrage	66
8. JAMES MADISON (1751-1836)	79
<i>The Federalist</i> , No. 10 (1787)	80
9. BENJAMIN FRANKLIN (1706-90)	88
From <i>Queries and Remarks Respecting Alterations in the Constitution of Pennsylvania</i> (1789)	89
10. JOEL BARLOW (1754-1812)	92
From <i>Advice to the Privileged Orders in the Several States of Europe</i> (1792)	93
11. THOMAS JEFFERSON (1743-1826)	99
From <i>Notes on the State of Virginia</i> (1782)	101
From <i>Inaugural Address</i> (1801)	109
From a <i>Letter to John Adams</i> (1813)	111

	PAGE
12. JOHN ADAMS (1735-1826)	117
From a Letter to James Sullivan (1776)	118
From <i>A Defence of the Constitutions of Government of the United States of America</i> (1787-88)	121
From a Letter to Thomas Brand-Hollis (1790)	132
From a Letter to Samuel Adams (1790)	134
From a Letter to John Taylor (1814)	137
From a Letter to Thomas Jefferson (1813)	141
13. JOHN MARSHALL (1755-1835)	143
From Opinion of the Court in <i>Marbury v. Madison</i> (1803)	145
14. FROM THOMAS JEFFERSON'S Comments on the Federal Judiciary in Letters (1807-21) and his <i>Autobiography</i>	158
15. FISHER AMES (1758-1808)	165
From <i>The Dangers of American Liberty</i> (1805)	165
16. JOHN TAYLOR (1753-1824)	173
From <i>Inquiry into the Principles and Policy of the Government of the United States</i> (1814)	174
17. DANIEL WEBSTER (1782-1852)	180
From Speech on "Apportionment of the Senate"; in the Massachusetts State Constitutional Convention of 1820-21	182
18. JAMES KENT (1763-1847)	190
Speech on the Elective Franchise (1821)	191
19. FROM THE MEMORIAL OF THE NON-FREEHOLDERS OF THE CITY OF RICHMOND (1829)	198
20. JOHN C. CALHOUN (1782-1850)	208
From <i>A Disquisition on Government</i> (1848-50)	209
21. WALT WHITMAN (1819-92)	212
From <i>Democratic Vistas</i> (1870)	213
22. E. L. GODKIN (1831-1902)	221
From <i>The Real Problems of Democracy</i> (1896)	222
23. FREDERICK JACKSON TURNER (1861-1932)	234
From "Contributions of the West to American Democracy" (1903)	234
24. H. L. MENCKEN (1880-)	253
From <i>Notes on Democracy</i> (1926)	253

	PAGE
25. E. G. CONKLIN (1863-)	268
From <i>Evolution and Democracy</i> (1922)	268

II. POLITICAL AUTHORITY AND CIVIL LIBERTIES

1. JOHN WINTHROP (1588-1649)	287
From "A Defence of an Order of Court Made in the Year 1637"	287
From "Comments on a Popular Petition" (1639)	290
From his "Little Speech" to the General Court (1645)	292
2. NATHANIEL WARD (c. 1578-1652)	295
From <i>The Simple Cofler of Aggawam in America</i> (1647)	296
3. ROGER WILLIAMS (1603-82)	301
From <i>The Bloody Tenent of Persecution</i> (1644)	303
"Letter to the Town of Providence" (1655)	305
4. JOHN CALLENDER (1706-48)	307
From <i>An Historical Discourse on . . . Rhode-Island</i> (1739)	307
5. SAMUEL ADAMS (1722-1803)	314
"The Rights of the Colonists" (1772)	316
6. DANIEL LEONARD (1740-1829)	322
From "Massachusettsis" Letters (1774-75)	323
7. JEFFERSON'S FIGHT FOR RELIGIOUS FREEDOM	329
From <i>Notes on the State of Virginia</i> (1782)	329
<i>An Act for Establishing Religious Freedom</i> (1786)	334
8. ELBRIDGE GERRY (1744-1814)	336
From <i>Observations on the New Constitution</i> (1788)	337
9. ALEXANDER HAMILTON (1757-1804)	343
A Letter on the "Whiskey Rebellion" (1794)	346
From a Letter on the Independent Judiciary (1802)	350
10. FISHER AMES ON THE DANGERS OF POPULAR LIBERTIES	354
From a Letter to the <i>Independent Chronicle</i> (1786)	355
From <i>The Dangers of American Liberty</i> (1805)	359
11. JOHN QUINCY ADAMS (1767-1848)	365
From "Letters of Publicola" (1791)	366
12. From a Letter from JOHN ADAMS to John Taylor (1814)	371

	PAGE
13. JOHN C. CALHOUN (1782-1850)	374
From <i>A Disquisition on Government</i> (1848-50)	374
14. HENRY DAVID THOREAU (1817-62)	385
From <i>Civil Disobedience</i> (1849)	386
15. DANIEL WEBSTER (1782-1852)	396
From Speech in the Senate on "The Constitution and the Union" (1850)	397
16. WILLIAM H. SEWARD (1801-72)	401
From a Speech in the United States Senate (1850)	402
17. THEODORE PARKER (1810-60)	404
From "The Law of God and the Statutes of Men" (1854)	405
18. ABRAHAM LINCOLN ON SLAVERY	410
A Letter to H. L. Pierce and Others (1859)	412
19. CIVIL LIBERTIES IN WARTIME	414
The Civil War	414
From Letters of Lincoln (1863-64)	416
The World War (1914-17)	423
Majority and Minority Opinions in <i>Abrams v. United States</i> (1919)	425
20. RECENT JUDICIAL INTERPRETATION OF CONSTITUTIONAL GUAR- ANTEES OF CIVIL LIBERTY	435
Majority and Minority Opinions in <i>Gitlow v. New York</i> (1925)	436
Opinion of the Court in <i>De Jonge v. Oregon</i> (1937)	443

III. GOVERNMENT AND PROPERTY RIGHTS

INTRODUCTION	455
1. THOMAS JEFFERSON (1743-1826)	458
From <i>Notes on the State of Virginia</i> (1782)	458
From a Letter to Rev. James Madison (1785)	459
From a Letter to Benjamin Austin (1816)	461
2. JOHN ADAMS (1735-1826)	464
From <i>A Defence of the Constitutions of Government of the United States of America</i> (1787-88)	464
From a Letter to Henry Marchant (1789)	464
From <i>Discourses on Davila</i> (1789-90)	465
From a Letter to John Taylor (1814)	466

	PAGE
3. ALEXANDER HAMILTON (1757-1804)	468
From <i>Report on Manufactures</i> (1791)	468
4. FLETCHER v. PECK (1810)	487
From the <i>Opinion of the Court</i>	488
5. JOHN TAYLOR (1753-1824)	492
From <i>Inquiry into the Principles and Policy of the Govern-</i> <i>ment of the United States</i> (1814)	492
From <i>Construction Construed, and Constitutions Vindi-</i> <i>cated</i> (1820)	494
From <i>Tyranny Unmasked</i> (1822)	497
6. DANIEL WEBSTER (1782-1852)	504
From "First Settlement of New England" (1820)	504
7. JAMES FENIMORE COOPER (1789-1851)	510
"On Property" (1838)	511
8. HORACE GREELEY (1811-72)	516
From "The Emancipation of Labor" (1846)	517
9. GEORGE FITZHUGH (1806-81)	531
From <i>Sociology for the South</i> (1854)	531
10. HENRY C. CAREY (1793-1879)	542
From <i>Principles of Social Science</i> (1858-59)	543
11. ABRAHAM LINCOLN (1809-65)	553
From a Campaign Speech in New Haven (1860)	553
From Annual Message to Congress (1861)	554
12. HENRY GEORGE (1839-97)	556
From <i>Progress and Poverty</i> (1879)	558
13. GROVER CLEVELAND (1837-1908)	571
From Fourth Annual Message (1888)	572
14. WILLIAM GRAHAM SUMNER (1840-1910)	578
"The Challenge of Facts" (1880's)	579
15. THE RT. REV. WILLIAM LAWRENCE (1850-1941)	606
"The Relation of Wealth to Morals" (1901)	606
16. CHARLES HORTON COOLEY (1864-1929)	619
From <i>Social Organization</i> (1909)	619
17. THOMAS NIXON CARVER (1865-)	632
From "Economic Competition" (1915)	632

	PAGE
18. THORSTEIN VEBLEN (1857-1929)	648
From <i>The Theory of the Leisure Class</i> (1899)	649
From <i>The Theory of Business Enterprise</i> (1904)	658
19. CHARLES A. BEARD (1874-)	668
From <i>The Economic Basis of Politics</i> (1922, 1934)	668
20. THEODORE ROOSEVELT (1858-1919)	677
From "The New Nationalism" (1910)	679
21. ROBERT M. LA FOLLETTE (1855-1925)	690
From "Address . . . Dealing with . . . Trusts, Consoli- dated Railroads and . . . Banking Interests . . ." (1912)	692
22. WOODROW WILSON (1856-1924)	707
From <i>The New Freedom</i> (1913)	709
23. FRANKLIN D. ROOSEVELT (1882-)	720
From <i>Looking Forward</i> (1933)	720
24. HENRY A. WALLACE (1888-)	731
From <i>New Frontiers</i> (1934)	731
25. HERBERT HOOVER (1874-)	739
"We May Sum Up" (1934)	739
26. THE RT. REV. JOHN A. RYAN (1869-)	749
From "A New Economic Order" (1935)	749
27. NORMAN THOMAS (1884-)	758
From <i>After the New Deal, What?</i> (1936)	758
28. RESTORING PRIVATE PROPERTY	773
From Herbert Agar and Allen Tate, <i>Who Owns America?</i> (1936)	774
29. PROPERTY RIGHTS AND DUE PROCESS OF LAW	785
From Majority and Minority Opinions in <i>West Coast Hotel</i> <i>v. Parrish</i> (1937)	786

IV. THE PROBLEM OF CHANGE

1. From the DISCUSSION ON THE LAST DAY OF THE CONVENTION OF 1787	803
2. A Letter of THOMAS JEFFERSON to James Madison (1789)	808
3. From ALEXANDER HAMILTON, <i>The Federalist</i> , No. 85 (1788)	814

CONTENTS

xv

	PAGE
4. MRS. MERCY OTIS WARREN (1728-1814)	820
From <i>History of . . . the American Revolution</i> (1805) .	821
5. RALPH WALDO EMERSON (1803-82)	827
From "The Conservative" (1841)	828
6. CARL L. BECKER (1873-)	843
From <i>Modern Democracy</i> (1941)	843
APPENDIX: CONSTITUTION OF THE UNITED STATES	859
INDEX	875

INTRODUCTION

ORIGINS OF THE AMERICAN POLITICAL TRADITION

I

FEW of the original European settlers of America were inspired by any intention of experimenting with novel ideas of government, liberty, or property. What Governor Bradford said of the founders of Plymouth was probably true as well of most of the other seventeenth-century immigrants. They came, he declared, "not out of any newfangledness, or other such like giddie humor, by which men are oftentimes transported to their great hurt & danger, but for sundrie weightie & solid reasons." Among those solid reasons, certain preoccupations with religion were conspicuous. Bradford's history of Plymouth, other contemporary narratives, and the early colonial charters all put the conversion of the Indians high among the purposes of the colonizing endeavor. Yet most of those who came over for religious reasons were more concerned with fortifying their own beliefs and keeping their fellow-settlers on the narrow path than with saving the souls of the natives. For the majority of these early settlers came from the religious minorities of their home countries, where they were denied the freedom to preach and practise their particular tenets. The move to America offered them the opportunity to worship, preach, and teach according to their own unorthodox convictions.

On the other hand, more worldly aims were predominant in the minds of most of the promoters and financial sponsors of the settlements; and solid economic reasons moved many of the migrants themselves. England had manifestly been lagging behind Portugal and Spain in the century-old race to build a colonial empire. Now, however, the circumstances seemed propitious for renewed efforts. An enterprising temper was spreading; and concerted efforts, both public and private, were being made to induce in Englishmen a realization of the rich resources of the New World, in materials and

markets for England's manufacturers and traders, supplies for her navy, and new opportunities for finding employment and getting rich. Captain John Smith, hardy explorer and soldier of fortune, reveals the realism of this expanding mood in his *Description of New England*, written in 1616. After discanting on the sublime joy of "discovering things unknowne," "erecting Townes, peopling Countries," and converting "the poore Salvadges," he added that he was "not so simple to thinke, that ever any other motive than wealth will ever erect there a Commonweale, or draw companie from their ease and humours at home." No less significant is a Puritan minister's pamphlet of the same decade wherein we find that a chapter entitled "New England is a fit Country for the Seating of an English Colony for the Propagation of Religion" is devoted mainly to descriptions of the fish, fowl, venison, furs, wines, and (particularly) the "Planks, Masts, Oares, Pitch, Tarre and Iron, and hereafter (by the aptnesse of the Soyle for Hempe) if the Colonie increase, Sailes and Cordage."

Much of this publicity describing the resources of the New World was put forth to promote imperial aims or to serve the interests of investors who had no thought of migrating to such remote regions themselves. Yet America did offer prospects of a better livelihood for ordinary craftsmen, laborers and others who were willing to endure the hazards of actual settlement; and such men were numerous. Inflation, war, and changes in fiscal policy had seriously upset certain industries during the preceding generation. And although at the time of the first settlements England was apparently emerging from this depression, many farmers, traders, and professional men were still finding it difficult to maintain their accustomed standards of living, or believed they were not sharing sufficiently in the recovery. Unemployment was still widespread; towns and parishes were overwhelmed by the task of taking care of beggars and vagabonds; and the belief was growing that England was overpopulated. "We are a great people," said a pamphleteer in 1609, "and the lande is too narrow for us."

Few colonial leaders looked upon these diverse religious and economic motives as incompatible. Indeed they were inclined to regard them as interdependent. Even the strongest conviction and the most resolute courage needed a vigorous body and some assurance of a secure place in society. Thus, said Bradford of the Pil-

grims, life was so hard in the country to which they had first gone, in their flight from religious trouble at home, that some of them preferred imprisonment in England "rather than this libertie in Holland with these afflictions"; and the leaders concluded that "an easier place of living . . . would draw many, and take away these discouragements." Their pastor, John Robinson, said that many now writing and preaching against the Pilgrim doctrine would adopt it "if they were in a place where they might have libertie and live comfortably." The Puritans were even more explicit in acknowledging the connection between spiritual strength and economic well-being. They frankly accepted what Rev. John Cotton called "a combination of virtues, strangely mixed." "We know that nothing sorts better with piety than competency," said Rev. John White, another Puritan divine.

The settlers came over during a period of unusually active discussion of civic affairs. Yet they were not utopians and the writers among them had drawn up no clear schemes for defining the location of public authority or the scope of private rights. Although the dissenting sects had arisen as adherents of a new, liberal, idea in religion—of spiritual regeneration through man's own inner experience—most of them clung to the belief that ordinary mortals needed instruction, guidance, perhaps even coercion, by their enlightened and duly designated leaders. The Puritans, who were the most intellectual and articulate of the seventeenth-century settlers, had no exalted opinion of human nature. For the most part they believed in the moral right and practical necessity of authority and rank, in both church and state. Men, according to the Puritan creed, were not by nature either reasonable or good and they were certainly not born equal. As for the financial promoters of the settlements, they were men of wealth, accustomed to the enjoyment of social and political privileges. It was therefore in accord with their convictions and generally in their interest to have familiar social distinctions recognized in the colonies. Among the actual settlers, it is true, there were very few men of aristocratic origins. Yet the resources of the new continent created new occasions for inequality as well as for equality. When the colonists set up their own governments, they merely followed tradition in requiring property and religious qualifications for voting and the holding of office; and the conflicts between privileged and unprivileged groups formed

the substance of political controversy throughout the colonial period.

There were difficulties in the way of a government of laws rather than of men in the colonies. Lawyers were rare among the early settlers. Early charters and codes repeated the traditional prescriptions to govern according to the law or to proceed only according to the "due course of law" in punishing criminals and adjudicating civil disputes; and colonial magistrates generally followed the traditional procedure of English courts. Both magistrates and law-makers, however, had confused and vacillating ideas as to what (if any) system of laws limited their discretion. Sometimes they proclaimed the Bible to be the supreme law, binding on civil authority as well as the church. Sometimes they acted on the assumption that the substantive rules of common law must prevail in America as in England. Sometimes they appealed to rules of "natural law"—universally binding principles of reason and justice, understood by all normally reasonable men—as the final arbiter. Occasionally, legislators in enacting statutes and magistrates in deciding questions at issue in criminal and civil litigation claimed a right to act according to their own ideas of civic justice and expediency.

Very few of the colonial leaders desired to make America a home for religious freedom. Most of the colonies gave a privileged position to a particular religion and officially concerned themselves with the religious and moral behavior of their inhabitants. Thus the Puritans, although they opposed certain doctrines and rituals of the Church of England, were yet not opposed to the principle of religious uniformity, a uniformity sustained if need be by the force of the civil authority itself. They came to America in order to worship and teach as they pleased, but not to provide such freedom for others. The Fundamental Orders of Connecticut authorized the civil authorities to see that "the peace, ordinances, and rules of Christ be observed in every Church according to His Word," and the "blue" laws of that colony are famous. Civil authorities in Massachusetts dealt harshly with persons who advocated unorthodox beliefs, in however orderly a manner. This religious authoritarianism was not confined to the Puritan colonies. Most of the colonies maintained churches supported by public taxation; and many of them compelled church attendance and narrowly restricted Sabbath-day activities. The first Virginia charter, for example, prescribed that the