



NUCLEAR STRATEGY, ARMS CONTROL, AND THE FUTURE

edited by

P. Edward Haley,

David M. Keithly,

and Jack Merritt

WESTVIEW PRESS

Nuclear Strategy, Arms Control, and the Future

**edited by P. Edward Haley,
David M. Keithly, and Jack Merritt**

WESTVIEW PRESS / BOULDER AND LONDON



All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher.

Copyright © 1985 by Westview Press, Inc.

Published in 1985 in the United States of America by Westview Press, Inc., 5500 Central Avenue, Boulder, Colorado 80301; Frederick A. Praeger, Publisher

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Main entry under title:

Nuclear strategy, arms control, and the future.

Bibliography: p.

1. Nuclear warfare—Addresses, essays, lectures.
2. Nuclear disarmament—Addresses, essays, lectures.
3. Military policy—Addresses, essays, lectures.

I. Haley, P. Edward. II. Keithly, David M.

III. Merritt, Jack.

U263.N765 1985 358'.39 85-8903

ISBN 0-8133-0169-6

ISBN 0-8133-0170-X (pbk.)

Printed and bound in the United States of America

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2

Nuclear Strategy, Arms Control, and the Future

Also of Interest

†*Toward Nuclear Disarmament and Global Security: A Search for Alternatives*, edited by Burns H. Weston with the assistance of Thomas A. Hawbaker and Christopher R. Rossi

†*International Security Yearbook 1984/85*, edited by Barry M. Blechman and Edward N. Luttwak

†*The Soviet Union and Strategic Arms*, Robbin F. Laird and Dale R. Herspring

†*The Defense of the West: Strategic and European Security Issues Reappraised*, edited by Robert Kennedy and John M. Weinstein

†*Defense Facts of Life: The Plans/Reality Mismatch*, Franklin C. Spinney

†*Thinking About National Security: Defense and Foreign Policy in a Dangerous World*, Harold Brown

†*Technology, Strategy, and Arms Control*, edited by Wolfram F. Hanrieder

The MX Decision: A New Direction in U.S. Weapons Procurement Policy?
Lauren H. Holland and Robert A. Hoover

Soviet Nuclear Weapons Policy: A Research Guide, William C. Green

Nuclear Past, Nuclear Present: Hiroshima, Nagasaki, and Contemporary Strategy, Ian Clark

A Strategy for Terminating a Nuclear War, Clark C. Abt

Nuclear Non-Proliferation, Robert L. Beckman

Atoms for Peace, edited by Joseph F. Pilat, Robert E. Pendley, and Charles K. Ebinger

NATO—The Next Generation, edited by Robert E. Hunter

Alternative Military Strategies for the Future, edited by Keith A. Dunn and William O. Staudenmaier

The Environmental Effects of Nuclear War, edited by Julius London and Gilbert F. White

†Available in hardcover and paperback.

About the Book and Editors

Balanced and comprehensive in approach, this text assembles classic statements on nuclear strategy and arms control made by Soviet and U.S. policymakers, military thinkers, and opinion leaders during the last forty years. Major Soviet statements, rarely appearing in translation, reflect the disagreement over whether "victory" or "parity" is the goal of Soviet nuclear strategy and forces. Taken as a whole, the selections record the concerns and hopes of government leaders who bear responsibility for protecting their nation's security in the nuclear age.

The general introduction is structured and written in a straightforward, succinct fashion that helps the student master the seemingly inchoate mass of ideas surrounding the arms race. The development of Soviet and U.S. policies and postures since the Cold War is recounted. The ramifications of such concepts as counterforce strategy, massive retaliation, assured destruction, deterrence, stability, and the strategic defense initiative are logically and thoroughly explained so that students with no background can easily grasp the discussions that follow. The introduction also explores the intricacies of arms control negotiations, as well as the pitfalls that have been and will be encountered by the superpowers. With their analysis of the arms race, the editors bridge the gap between antinuclear activists and those who are legally charged with the defense of their country.

Intended for use as a basic text in courses on national security, arms control, and peace studies, this collection of primary sources encourages students to reassess their own perceptions of the arms race. Each chapter contains its own extensive introduction, and each part has a selected bibliography that can be used for further study. The glossary at the end of the text provides a comprehensive dictionary of arms control and disarmament terms. The historic nature of the selections makes this book a valuable resource for scholars, researchers, and libraries as well.

P. Edward Haley is director of the Keck Center for International Strategic Studies and chairman of the International Relations Committee, Claremont McKenna College. He has worked on the staffs of members of the U.S. Senate and House of Representatives and was an international affairs fellow of the Council on Foreign Relations. *David M. Keithly* is administrative assistant, the Keck Center for International Strategic Studies. He holds a doctorate in Government from Claremont Graduate School. *Jack Merritt* is professor emeritus of physics, Claremont McKenna College. Prior to coming to Claremont, he served as an administrative officer at the U.S. Atomic Energy Commission and the National Science Policy Organization of the Bureau of Budget.

—to—
Laura and Catherine,
Wayne and Wes,
future students

Preface

The purpose of this book is to make readily available to a wide audience interested in nuclear questions a group of “classic” statements on nuclear strategy and arms control. Our working definition of “classic” is: everything changed because the statement was made, or the statement embodied the beliefs of many people in and out of government.

Wherever possible, statements by civilian and military leaders have been used. It is they who, on our behalf, daily grapple with and bear the moral weight of decisions about nuclear war and arms control. As the book reveals, they are conscious of the great responsibilities they carry and have brought a seriousness and dedication to their work that sometimes are lost in the heat of controversy about the subject of their labors.

The opinions of academics and other analysts play a vital part in the development and correction of the views and actions of Western policymakers. A number of classic academic statements are included in the book. More will be found in the sources included in the bibliography at the end of each chapter.

A large place has been reserved in the book for statements by Soviet political and military leaders. Too often nuclear questions are discussed and the most far-reaching conclusions reached as if the entire issue were an internal U.S., or at most, Western concern and the Soviet government had no firm and consequential views on the subject. Not only is this not the case, but from the beginning of our nuclear era Soviet leaders have approached nuclear strategy in ways fundamentally different from those followed by U.S. leaders. That the Soviet approach is so different makes it all the more important to consider what Soviet leaders have thought and written about nuclear war and arms control, rather than to work from secondary sources.

The idea for the book came from a class—Nuclear Weapons and Arms Control—started three years ago and still being taught by P. Edward Haley, a political scientist, and Jack Merritt, a physicist, with the assistance of David M. Keithly. The three of us soon discovered the interest of our students in these kinds of statements and the useful role they could play

in stimulating discussion and understanding. We also quickly realized how difficult and time-consuming it was to assemble them all and make them available. Taken together these two observations made clear that we had a book.

But that was not all. As our editing chores progressed, it became clear to us that the book might serve an even more important purpose outside the classroom. An alarming misunderstanding has developed between the general public, including members of the antinuclear movement, and the civilians and soldiers who bear official and personal responsibility for national defense. The public, particularly those actively concerned with nuclear weapons, tend to relegate nuclear policymakers to one or another demeaning category: foolish, criminal, or insane. In response, the policymakers sometimes view the activists as ignorant busybodies meddling with vital and dangerous matters that they do not understand.

If both groups keep this view of each other, political and military paralysis is the likely result. There is common ground: Both groups desperately wish to avoid nuclear war. Yet how many nuclear activists know or would believe that Secretary of Defense Robert McNamara is convinced that he persuaded Presidents Kennedy and Johnson in the early 1960s never to initiate nuclear war? On the other side, how many policymakers will accept that nuclear strategy is not a priestly calling, that although complex, its intricacies can be grasped by bright and determined lay people—and their ranks include Nobel laureates—who in turn might have something of value to contribute to U.S. and allied strategy? It thus became clear that our second major purpose was to provide a book that could bridge the gap in outlook and understanding between activists and officials, between—in Freeman Dyson's words—warriors and victims.

The warm response of Fred Praeger and Miriam Gilbert to the book shortened the time to publication. However, it is obvious that a book of this kind is never really finished. The worldwide concern with its subject matter and the technological, political, and military factors driving the arms race continue to produce major changes in every area covered and in many we were obliged to omit or cover only in the bibliography. We realize that we have made a beginning only, and we cordially invite our readers to send us their comments and recommendations regarding additional or alternate "classics."

We thank Laura Anderson, Libby Barstow, Joan Edgar, Anita Elsbee, Alice Levine, Gwendolyn Lohman, Ruth Palmer, and the students in Political Science 138 for their assistance in the preparation of this book.

P. Edward Haley
David M. Keithly
Jack Merritt

Nuclear Strategy, Arms Control, and the Future

Credits

The selections in this book are taken from the following sources. Permissions to reprint are gratefully acknowledged.

The discussion of nuclear weapons in Europe in the editors' introduction ("The Fundamentals of Nuclear Strategy and Arms Control") is based on a paper by P. Edward Haley, "Nuclear Weapons, Democratic Statesmanship, and the Security of Europe." It was prepared for presentation at a conference in honor of the fortieth anniversary of VE-Day that was sponsored by the Washington Institute for Values in Public Policy, Washington, D.C., May 7-9, 1985.

1. Reprinted from *Foreign Relations of the United States: 1948*, 1 (pt. 2), pp. 624-628. NSC-30 was dated September 10, 1948.
2. Records of the Joint Chiefs of Staff on deposit in the Modern Military Records Branch, National Archives, Washington, D.C. JCS 1952/1 was dated December 21, 1948.
3. Reprinted from *Foreign Relations of the United States: 1950*, 1, pp. 237-292. NSC-68 was dated April 14, 1950.
4. Records of the Organizational Research and Policy Division of the Office of the Chief of Naval Operations (Op-23), Naval Historical Center, Washington, D.C. The selection was dated May 11, 1949.
5. Reprinted from *Foreign Relations of the United States: 1950*, 1, Department of State Atomic Energy Files, January 20, 1950, Memorandum by the Counselor (Kennan).
6. Reprinted from *Department of State Bulletin*, March 29, 1954, vol. 30, pp. 459-464.
7. Excerpted from Henry A. Kissinger, *Nuclear Weapons and Foreign Policy* (New York: Council on Foreign Relations, 1975), by permission of the Council on Foreign Relations, Inc. A Council on Foreign Relations book, published by Westview Press, 1984.
8. Reprinted from *Public Papers of the Presidents of the United States*, John F. Kennedy, 1961, document no. 99.

9. Reprinted from *Department of State Bulletin*, July 9, 1962, vol. 47, pp. 66-69.
10. Reprinted from *Department of State Bulletin*, October 9, 1967, vol. 57, pp. 443-449.
11. Reprinted from *Authorization for Military Procurement, Research, and Development*, 1969, Hearings Before the Committee on Armed Services, United States Senate, S3293.
12. Press Conference of U.S. Secretary of Defense, January 10, 1974, at the National Press Club, Washington, D.C.
13. Statement Before the Senate Foreign Relations Committee on "Nuclear War Strategy, PD-59," September 16, 1980.
14. Reprinted from Desmond Ball, "Can Nuclear War Be Controlled?" Adelphi Paper no. 169 (London: International Institute for Strategic Studies, 1981).
15. Reprinted from Colin S. Gray, "Nuclear Strategy: The Case for a Theory of Victory," *International Security* 4 (Summer 1979):63-87. By permission of The MIT Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts. Copyright 1980 by the President and Fellows of Harvard College and of the Massachusetts Institute of Technology.
16. Reprinted by permission from Jeffrey Richelson, "PD-59, NSDD-13, and the Reagan Strategic Modernization Program," *Journal of Strategic Studies* 6, no. 2 (June 1983):125-146, published by Frank Cass & Co. Ltd., 11 Gainsborough Road, London E11, England. Copyright Frank Cass & Co. Ltd.
17. Excerpted from Marshal V. D. Sokolovsky, "The Nature of Modern War," *Soviet Military Strategy*, Moscow, 1962, by permission of the Rand Corporation. Copyright 1963 the Rand Corporation.
18. Reprinted from Colonel A. A. Sidorenko, *The Offensive*, Moscow, 1970. Published under the auspices of the U.S. Air Force, 1970.
19. Reprinted from Col. General N. A. Lomov, *The Revolution in Military Affairs*, Moscow, 1973. Published under the auspices of the U.S. Air Force, 1973.
20. Excerpted from Marshal N. V. Ogarkov, "Military Strategy," *Soviet Military Encyclopedia*, vol. 7 (Moscow: Voenizdat, 1979), pp. 555-565, in Leon Gouré and Michael J. Deane, "The Soviet Strategic View," *Strategic Review* 8, no. 3 (Summer 1980):92-95, by permission of *Strategic Review*, 1980. Copyright *Strategic Review*, 1980.
21. Excerpted from Major General S. K. Il'in, *Morale Factors in Modern Wars* (Moscow: Voenizdat, 1979), in Leon Gouré and Michael J. Deane, "The Soviet Strategic View," *Strategic Review* 8, no. 3 (Summer 1980):95-96, by permission of *Strategic Review*, 1980. Copyright *Strategic Review*, 1980.
22. Reprinted from Fritz W. Ermath, "Contrasts in American and Soviet Strategic Thought," *International Security* 3 (Fall 1978):138-155, by permission of The MIT Press, Cambridge, Massachusetts. Copyright 1979 by the President and Fellows of Harvard College and of the Massachusetts Institute of Technology.
23. Reprinted from *The Current Digest of the Soviet Press* 29, no. 3 (February

- 16, 1977). Translation copyright 1977 by *The Current Digest of the Soviet Press*, published weekly at the Ohio State University; reprinted by permission.
24. Reprinted from *Foreign Broadcast Information Service*, Soviet Union, vol. 3, no. 3, October 21, 1981 (Washington, D.C.: Foreign Broadcast Information Service, 1981), p. A1.
 25. Excerpted from "A Garthoff-Pipes Debate on Soviet Strategic Doctrine," *Strategic Review* 10 (Fall 1982):36-63, by permission of *Strategic Review*, 1982. Copyright *Strategic Review*, 1982.
 26. Reprinted from *Survival*, January-February 1978 (London: International Institute for Strategic Studies, 1978).
 27. Remarks Before the National Press Club, Washington, D.C., *Weekly Compilation of Presidential Documents*, November 23, 1981, pp. 1273-1278.
 28. Reprinted from *The Current Digest of the Soviet Press* 35, no. 17 (May 25, 1983). Translation copyright 1983 by *The Current Digest of the Soviet Press*, published weekly at the Ohio State University; reprinted by permission.
 29. Excerpted from Pierre Lellouche, "France and the Euromissiles: The Limits of Immunity," *Foreign Affairs* 62 (Winter 1983/84):318-334, by permission of *Foreign Affairs*, Winter 1983/84. Copyright 1983 by the Council on Foreign Relations, Inc.
 30. Excerpted from "Summary of Defense of Japan" (September 1984), Foreign Press Center, Japan, with permission of the Embassy of Japan. Copyright Foreign Press Center, Japan, 1984.
 31. Reprinted from *Public Papers of the Presidents of the United States*, John F. Kennedy, 1963, document no. 232.
 32. Reprinted from John Newhouse, *Cold Dawn: The Story of SALT* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1973), pp. 267-272, by permission of Russell & Volkening, Inc., as agents for the author. Copyright John Newhouse.
 33. Excerpted from Harold Brown, *Thinking About National Security* (Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press, 1983), pp. 82-84, 184-185, with permission from Westview Press. Copyright Westview Press, 1983.
 34. Excerpted from Richard Perle, "Echoes of the 1930s," *Strategic Review* 7 (Winter 1979):11-15, by permission of *Strategic Review*, 1979. Copyright *Strategic Review*, 1979.
 35. Reprinted from Edward N. Luttwak, "Why Arms Control Has Failed," *Commentary* 65 (January 1978):19-28, by permission; all rights reserved.
 36. Reprinted from *Department of State Bulletin*, July 29, 1974, vol. 71, pp. 205-215.
 37. Reprinted from U.S. Department of State, *Current Policy*, no. 72A, Senate Testimony, July 9-11, 1979.
 38. Reprinted from U.S. Department of State, *Current Policy*, no. 72A, Senate Testimony, July 9-11, 1979.
 39. Reprinted from *Congressional Record*—Senate, August 11, 1972, and August 14, 1972.

40. United States Statutes at Large, 92d Cong., 2d sess. (1972), vol. 86.
41. Excerpted from Paul H. Nitze, "Assuring Strategic Stability in an Era of Détente," *Foreign Affairs* 54 (January 1976):207-232, by permission of *Foreign Affairs*, January 1976. Copyright 1976 by the Council on Foreign Relations, Inc.
42. Reprinted from *Origins* 13 (May 19, 1983). Excerpts from "The Challenge of Peace: God's Promise and Our Response," copyright © 1983 by the United States Catholic Conference. All rights reserved. A complete copy of the pastoral letter may be ordered from the Office of Publishing and Promotions Services, U.S.C.C., 1312 Massachusetts Ave. N.W., Washington, D.C., 20005.
43. Reprinted from Albert Wohlstetter, "Bishops, Statesmen, and Other Strategists on the Bombing of Innocents," *Commentary* 75 (June 1983):15-35, by permission; all rights reserved.
44. Reprinted from *Gagner la Paix*, Déclaration de l'Assemblée plénière de l'épiscopat français (November 1983), by permission of the Conference of French Catholic Bishops. A complete copy of the text, which was translated by the French Bishops Conference, may be obtained from the General Secretary of the Conference, 106, rue du Bac, 75341 Paris Cedex 07, France.
45. Reprinted from *New York Times*, April 15, 1983. Copyright © 1983 by the New York Times Company. Reprinted by permission.
46. Reprinted with permission from Andrei Sakharov, "The Danger of Thermonuclear War," *Foreign Affairs* 61 (Summer 1983):1001-1016. Copyright Andrei Sakharov, 1983.
47. Report of the President's Commission on Strategic Forces (the Scowcroft Commission), April 1983.
48. Address to the Nation, *Weekly Compilation of Presidential Documents*, March 28, 1983, pp. 442-448.
49. Reprinted from Sidney D. Drell and Wolfgang K. H. Panofsky, "The Case Against Strategic Defense: Technical and Strategic Realities," *Issues in Science and Technology* 1 (Fall 1984):45-65. Excerpted by permission from *Issues in Science and Technology* 1, no. 1 (Fall 1984):45-65. Copyright © 1984 National Academy of Sciences.
50. Reprinted from *The Current Digest of the Soviet Press* 33, no. 8 (March 25, 1981). Translation copyright 1981 by *The Current Digest of the Soviet Press*, published weekly at the Ohio State University; reprinted by permission.
51. Reprinted from McGeorge Bundy, George F. Kennan, Robert S. McNamara, and Gerard Smith, "Nuclear Weapons and the Atlantic Alliance," *Foreign Affairs* 60 (Summer 1982):754-768. Condensed and reprinted by permission of *Foreign Affairs*, Spring 1982. Copyright 1982 by the Council on Foreign Relations, Inc.
52. Excerpted from Karl Kaiser, Georg Leber, Alois Mertes, and Franz-Josef Schulze, "Nuclear Weapons and the Preservation of Peace," *Foreign Affairs* 60 (Summer 1982):1157-1170, by permission of *Foreign Affairs*,

- Summer 1982. Copyright 1982 by the Council on Foreign Relations, Inc.
53. Eureka College Commencement Address, *Weekly Compilation of Presidential Documents*, May 9, 1982, pp. 599-604.
 54. Excerpted from Randall Forsberg, "A Bilateral Nuclear-Weapon Freeze," *Scientific American* 247 (November 1982):52-61, by permission of Randall Forsberg and *Scientific American*, 1982. Copyright © 1982 by Scientific American, Inc. All rights reserved.
 55. Excerpted from Alton Frye, "Strategic Build-Down: A Context for Restraint," *Foreign Affairs* 62 (Winter 1983/84):293-317, by permission of *Foreign Affairs*, Winter 1983/84. Copyright 1983 by the Council on Foreign Relations, Inc.
 56. Reprinted from Sverre Lodgaard, "Nordic Initiatives for a Nuclear Weapon-Free Zone in Europe," in *The Arms Race and Arms Control* (London: SIPRI, 1982), pp. 190-207. Originally published in *World Armaments and Disarmament*, SIPRI Yearbook 1982 (London: Taylor and Francis, 1982), chapter 4. Excerpted with permission from SIPRI. Copyright 1982 SIPRI.
 57. Reprinted from *News and Views from the U.S.S.R.* (Washington, D.C.: Soviet Embassy, Information Department, January 14, 1985).
 58. Reprinted from U.S. Department of State, *Current Policy*, no. 647, January 14, 1985.

Contents

<i>Credits</i>	xv
<i>Preface</i>	xxi

The Fundamentals of Nuclear Strategy and Arms Control	1
---	---

PART ONE THE DEVELOPMENT OF U.S. NUCLEAR STRATEGY

Chapter 1	
The Early Years: 1946–1953	37
1. U.S. Policy on Atomic Weapons (NSC-30), National Security Council	39
2. Evaluation of Current Strategic Air Offensive Plans (JCS 1952/1), Joint Chiefs of Staff	41
3. U.S. Objectives and Programs for National Security (NSC-68), National Security Council	43
4. Evaluation of Effect on Soviet War Effort Resulting from the Strategic Air Offensive, Lt. General H. R. Harmon	49
5. International Control of Atomic Energy George F. Kennan	52

Chapter 2
The Years of Plenty: 1954–197355

6. Foreign Policy for Security and Peace, *John Foster Dulles*58
7. Nuclear Weapons and Foreign Policy, *Henry A. Kissinger*62
8. Recommendations Relating to Our Defense Budget,
John F. Kennedy71
9. Defense Arrangements of the North Atlantic Community,
Robert S. McNamara75
10. The Dynamics of Nuclear Strategy, *Robert S. McNamara*77
11. Hearings on Military Posture Before the U.S. Congress,
Robert S. McNamara81

Chapter 3
The Effects of Vulnerability and Parity92

12. Flexible Strategic Options and Deterrence,
James R. Schlesinger94
13. Nuclear War Strategy, PD-59, *Harold Brown*101
14. Can Nuclear War Be Controlled? *Desmond Ball*107
15. Nuclear Strategy: The Case for a Theory of Victory,
Colin S. Gray113
16. PD-59, NSDD-13, and the Reagan Strategic Modernization
Program, *Jeffrey Richelson*120

Bibliography: Part One134

PART TWO
THE TWO FACES OF
SOVIET NUCLEAR STRATEGY

Chapter 4
Victory and Parity137

17. The Nature of Modern War, *Marshal V. D. Sokolovsky*138
18. The Nature of the Offensive Under Conditions Where
Nuclear Weapons Are Employed, *Colonel A. A. Sidorenko*146