LABOR RELATIONS LAW

Cases and Materials

EIGHTH EDITION

Leroy S. Merrifield Theodore J. St. Antoine Charles B. Craver



Labor Relations Law

CASES AND MATERIALS

Eighth Edition

LEROY S. MERRIFIELD

Lobingier Professor Emeritus of Jurisprudence and Comparative Law The George Washington University

THEODORE J. St. ANTOINE

Degan Professor of Law University of Michigan

CHARLES B. CRAVER

Professor of Law The George Washington University

THE MICHIE COMPANY

Law Publishers

Charlottesville, Virginia

COPYRIGHT © 1953, 1960, 1968, 1971, 1974, 1979 BY THE BOBBS-MERRILL COMPANY, INC. COPYRIGHT © 1984, 1989 BY THE MICHIE COMPANY

Library of Congress Catalog Card No. 89-60150 ISBN 0-87473-429-0

Printed in the United States of America All rights reserved.

Preface to the Eighth Edition

The last couple of decades have seen an explosive growth in the law governing the workplace. Even the name of the subject is often changed from labor relations law to labor and employment law in order to reflect the new emphasis on the direct governmental regulation of employer-employee relations, as distinct from union-management relations. The question fairly arises whether the "basic" labor course in law school should attempt to cover the recent legal developments concerning job safety, employee benefit plans, wrongful discharge, and the like, in addition to the traditional Taft-Hartley materials.

We believe there is a genuine need for a new course on the individual employment relationship. But we also believe that there is a grave risk of superficiality and lack of focus in trying to do too much in a single three- or four-hour offering. Furthermore, we think that those two almost unique American institutions — the labor union and the collective bargaining process as they have evolved in this country — deserve study in a setting where they occupy the center of the stage.

Like its predecessors, therefore, the eighth edition of this casebook is designed for an intensive examination of the union-management relationship throughout its major phases. Kind words from many readers, both faculty members and students, indicate that the structure of recent editions is conducive to that purpose. Generally we follow the chronology of organizing, bargaining, and contract enforcement, with brief looks along the way at employment discrimination and internal union affairs.

As in the past, we have tried to respond generously to the most significant current developments in the field while simultaneously providing a set of materials that will be truly manageable in the usual three- or four-hour course. For this revision, we shall continue our practice of publishing an annual softbound supplement so that the book will be up-to-date at the beginning of each school year.

With esteem and affection, we dedicate this eighth edition to Russell A. Smith, Professor Emeritus of Law at the University of Michigan and our founding editor. Russ was one of the real pioneers in labor law when he single-handedly produced his 1,000-page first edition in 1950. He also impressed an order on the work which has withstood the test of time. Indeed, one junior co-editor must wryly acknowledge that some of the latest changes have marked a return to Russ's early organization. Thus, union security has been removed from internal union affairs and combined again with hiring hall problems. And after many years we have concluded that Russ was right in viewing American National Insurance as more of a bridge to Borg-Warner and scope of bargaining than as an introduction to "good faith" negotiations.

This quiet, humane man never lacked for worldly honors and positions — president of the National Academy of Arbitrators, associate dean of the Michigan Law School, and chair of innumerable federal and state boards, panels, and commissions. But it is as a person that we most revere him. His warmth and generosity are unbounded. It might well be embarrassing to other casebook

vi PREFACE

editors, if we disclosed the royalty arrangements Russ insisted upon when he added co-editors to one of the country's best-selling casebooks. And to spend an evening with him, over long, slow drinks, savoring his old stories and his fresh ideas, is to be transported into a charmed circle of good fellowship and much learning worn lightly. We salute you, Russ, and hope this dedication will serve as a small token of gratitude for all you have given us, generations of law students, and the whole realm of labor law and labor arbitration.

We must finally express our appreciation to Roy Esnard, Gregg A. Gilman, and Nancy J. Johnson whose capable and conscientious research assistance contributed substantially to this revision.

Washington, D. C. Ann Arbor, Michigan April 1989 Leroy S. Merrifield Theodore J. St. Antoine Charles B. Craver

Summary Table of Contents

n. C	Page
Preface Table of Contents	
PART ONE: HISTORICAL BACKGROUND AND INTRODUCTION	
Foreword]
PART TWO: ORGANIZATION AND REPRESENTATION OF EMPLOYEES	
Seminar on Free Speech and Preelection Conduct, in Southwestern Legal Foundation, Labor Law Developments, Proceedings of the Eleventh Annual Institute on Labor Law 239-46 (1965)	63 64
Unfair Labor Practices Section II. Representation Questions	$\frac{64}{205}$
PART THREE: UNION COLLECTIVE ACTION	
Selig Perlman, A Theory of the Labor Movement 238-42 (1928)	260 261 268 291 338 421 428 431
PART FOUR: COLLECTIVE BARGAINING	
Albert Rees, The Economics of Trade Unions 74, 89-90, 186-87 (2d ed. 1977) Note	
Freeman & Medoff, The Two Faces of Unionism, in The Public Interest 69, 76, 78-82, 85, 86 (Fall 1979)	492 494
Section II. The Impact of the Antitrust Laws	601 643
	751

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART FIVE: INTERNAL UNION AFFAIRS

i	Page
A.J. Muste, Factional Fights in Trade Unions, in American Labor Dynamics 332-33 (J. Hardman ed. 1928)	829
(1959)	
Section I. The Legal Status of Unions	
Section II. The Civil Liberties of Members	882
Section IV. Unions and the Public	915
	
Table of CasesIndex	

Table of Contents

	Page
Preface Summary Table of Contents	vi
PART ONE: HISTORICAL BACKGROUND AND INTRODUCTION	
Foreword	1
Section I. Historical Background	1
A. The Pre-Civil War Period]
1. Early Development of Labor Unions	1
2. The "Criminal Conspiracy" Doctrine	9
Philadelphia Cordwainers' Case [Commonwealth v. Pullis] B. The Post-Civil War Era	2
1. The Growth of National Unions and Labor Unrest	ϵ
2. Judicial Reaction and the Labor Injunction	11
Vegelahn v. Guntner	11
3. Early Legislative Reaction	20
a. Railway Labor Legislation	21
b. The Clayton Act	23
4. Labor Unions from 1900 to 1932	23
5. The Norris-La Guardia Act	24
C. The Period Since 1933	26
1. The Initial New Deal Labor Policies	26
2. The National Labor Relations Act (Wagner Act), 1935	27
NLRB v. Jones & Laughlin Steel Corp.	28
3. Union Growth Under the Wagner Act: The CIO and Industrial Unions	31
4. Labor Standards and Social Security Legislation	33
5. The World War II Period	34
6. The Labor-Management Relations Act (Taft-Hartley Act),	0.1
1947	35
7. Labor Unions from 1947 to 1959: The AFL-CIO Merger	36
8. The Labor-Management Reporting and Disclosure Act	
(Landrum-Griffin Act), 1959	38
9. Labor Developments Since 1959	39
a. Equal Employment Opportunity Laws	39
b. Job Safety Laws	40
c. Public Employee Unionism	41
d. Economic Controls	41 41
f. Organized Labor in the 1970's and 1980's	42
g. Organized Labor in the 1970's and 1980's	42
Section II. Introductory Materials	43
A. Coverage of the National Labor Relations Act	43
1. Scope of the Concept "Affecting Commerce"	43
2. NLRB Exercise of Its Jurisdiction	44

NLRB, A Guide to Basic Law and Procedures Under the	Page
National Labor Relations Act 41-43 (1987)	
Note	
3. Exclusions from Coverage	
a. Independent Contractors	
House Committee on Education and Labor, H.R. Rep	
No. 245 on H.R. 3020, 80th Cong., 1st Sess. 18	
(1947)	47
b. Supervisory Employees	48
c. Other Exclusions	50
4. State Labor Relations Act	
B. Organization and Procedure of the National Labor Relations	
Board	
C. The Perceived Need for Reform of the National Labor Relations	
Act	57
The Failure of Labor Law — A Betrayal of American Workers,	
Report of Subcommittee on Labor-Management Relations,	
House Committee on Education and Labor, 98th Cong., 2d	
Sess. (Oct. 1984)	57
Note on NERD Procedure	61
PART Two: Organization and Representation of Employees	
Seminar on Free Speech and Preelection Conduct, in Southwestern Le-	
gal Foundation, Labor Law Developments, Proceedings of the Elev-	
enth Annual Institute on Labor Law 239-46 (1965)	63
Bernard Karsh, Diary of a Strike 47, 117, 119-20 (1958)	64
Section I. The Right of Self-Organization; Protection Against Employer	0.
Unfair Labor Practices	64
A. Employer Interference, Restraint, or Coercion	65
1. Limiting Organizational Activities on Employer's Premises	66
NLRB v. Babcock & Wilcox Co.	66
Notes	69
NLRB v. United Steelworkers [Nutone, Inc.]	72
Notes	74
2. Antiunion Speeches and Publications	74
Notes	77
NLRB v. Gissel Packing Co	78
Notes	82
May Department Stores Co	83
Notes	87
3. Interrogation	88
Blue Flash Express, Inc	88
Notes	93
4. Economic Coercion and Inducement	95
NLRB v. Exchange Parts Co	95
Notes	97
5. Violence, Intimidation, Espionage, and Surveillance	98
6. Employer Responsibility for Antiunion Conduct of Subordi-	
nates and Others	99
B. Employer Domination or Support	101

Notes	
Employer Discrimination	•
1. General Considerations; Problems of Proof	
Problems	
Notes	
2. Discrimination to Encourage Union Membership	
a. Hiring Halls and Other Practices	٧.
Notes	
Carpenters Local 60 v. NLRB	
Notes	•
b. Union Security Under Federal Legislation	•
NLRB v. General Motors Corp.	
Notes	•
c. State "Right-to-Work" Legislation	•
Retail Clerks, Local 1625 v. Schermerhorn	•
Notes	
Retail Clerks Local 1625 v. Schermerhorn	
Notes	
3. Protected Concerted Activities and Employer Response	
NLRB v. City Disposal Systems	
Notes	
NLRB v. Weingarten, Inc.	•
Notes	
Elk Lumber Co.	
Notes	
Mastro Plactics Corp. v. NLRB	
Notes	•
NLRB v. Mackay Radio & Telegraph Co	
Notes	
Trans World Airlines, Inc. v. Independent Federation o	ľ
Flight Attendants	
Notes	•
NLRB v. Truck Drivers, Local 449, International Brother hood of Teamsters [Buffalo Linen Case]	-
NLRB v. Brown	
Note	
American Ship Building Co. v. NLRB	
Notes	
Proof of Motive in Cases Involving Violations of §§ 8(a)(3) and (1))
Notes	
Textile Workers Union v. Darlington Mfg. Co., NLRB v.	
Darlington Mfg. Co.	
Notes	
5. Remedial Problems	
Clear Pine Mouldings, Inc.	

	Page
Notes	200
Phelps Dodge Corp. v. NLRB	201
Notes	
Section II. Representation Questions	
A. Establishing Representative Status Through NLRB Elections	205
Foreword	
NLRB, Twenty-sixth Annual Report 3, 4 (1961)	205
NLRB, Forty-sixth Annual Report 31 (1981)	206
1. Bars to Conducting an Election	
NLRB, Thirty-seventh Annual Report 50-52 (1972)	206
Notes	207
2. Defining the Appropriate Unit	209
NLRB, Thirteenth Annual Report 35-36 (1948)	209
Notes	
a. Craft and Industrial Units	211
Globe Machine & Stamping Co	211
Notes	
Mallinckrodt Chemical Works	
Notes	219
b. Multiple Plant Units	
NLRB, Seventeenth Annual Report 68-69 (1952)	
Notes	
c. Multiple Employer Units	
NLRB, Twenty-third Annual Report 36-37 (1958)	
Charles D. Bonanno Linen Serv. v. NLRB	223
Notes	
3. The Conduct of Representation Elections	
NLRB, Thirty-first Annual Report 59, 61-65 (1966)	225
Notes	226
NLRB, Thirty-first Annual Report 66-68 (1966)	
Notes	229
4. Court Review of Representation Proceedings	
Leedom v. Kyne	
Notes	238
B. Establishing Representative Status Through Unfair Labor Practice	
Proceedings	239
NLRB v. Gissel Packing Co.	
Notes	
Linden Lumber Div., Summer & Co. v. NLRB	
Note	
11000	-00
PART THREE: UNION COLLECTIVE ACTION	
TART THREE. UNION COLLECTIVE MCTION	
Selig Perlman, A Theory of the Labor Movement 238-42 (1928)	259
Neil W. Chamberlain, The Philosophy of American Management Toward	
Labor, in Labor in a Changing America 181-82 (W. Haber ed. 1966)	260
Lloyd G. Reynolds, Stanley H. Masters & Coletta H. Moser, Labor Eco-	
nomics and Labor Relations 495, 497, 512 (9th ed. 1986)	260
Section I. Introduction	261
A. Collective Action at Common Law	261
B. Anti-Injunction Statutes	262
Marine Cooks & Stewards v. Panama S.S. Co.	

	Page
Notes	265
C. Labor Relations Acts and Other Statutes	
Section II. Constitutional Protection	
International Brotherhood of Teamsters, Local 695, A.F.L. v. Vogt,	
Inc.	
Notes	
Hudgens v. NLRB	
Notes	
Section III. Picketing	291
A. Regulation of Coercive Methods in Picketing	291
Vegelahn v. Guntner	291
Notes	291
Milk Wagon Drivers, Local 753 v. Meadowmoor Dairies, Inc	292
Notes	293
Teamsters, Local 901 (Lock Joint Pipe & Co.)	294
Notes	
B. Union Fines and Discipline as Coercion	298
NLRB v. Allis-Chalmers Mfg. Co	298
Notes	305
NLRB v. Boeing Co	
Notes	
Pattern Makers' League of North America v. NLRB	308
Notes	320
C. Organizational and Recognition Picketing	321
NLRB v. Driver, Chauffeurs, Helpers, Local 639 [Curtis Bros.,	
Inc.]	321
Note	323
International Hod Carriers Local 840 (Blinne Construction Co.)	324
Smitley, d/b/a Crown Cafeteria v. NLRB	332
Notes	335
Houston Building & Construction Trades Council (Claude Ever-	000
ett Construction Co.)	336
Notes	338
Section IV. Secondary Pressure	338
Notes	339
Analysis of §§ 8(b)(4)(A) and (B) Prior to 1959 Amendments § 8(b)(4)	341
Analysis of §§ $8(b)(4)(A)$ and (B) as Amended in 1959 § $8(b)(4)$	342
A. Primary-Secondary Distinction	343
NLRB v. International Rice Milling Co.	
Notes	
B. Common Situs Problems	346
Sailors' Union of the Pacific and Moore Dry Dock Co.	346
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	349
Notes NLRB v. Denver Building & Construction Trades Council	350
Note	355
	9==
cal 761, AFL-CIO v. NLRB [General Electric Co.]	355
Notes	361
Building & Construction Trades Council of New Orleans	260
(Markwell & Hartz, Inc.)	362
Notes	370

	Page
C. The Ally Doctrine	371
NLRB v. Business Machine & Office Appliance Mechanics Con-	
ference Board, IUE, Local 459 [Royal Typewriter Co.]	371
Notes	374
D. Consumer Picketing	376
NLRB v. Retail Clerks, Local 1001 [Safeco Title Insurance Co.]	376
Notes	384
E. Threats and Coercion of Secondary Employers	385
	385
NLRB v. Servette, Inc.	386
Notes	200
Edward J. DeBartolo Corp. v. Florida Gulf Coast Building Trades	205
Council	387
Notes	393
F. Hot Cargo Agreements	394
United Brotherhood of Carpenters & Joiners, Local 1976 v.	
NLRB [Sand Door]	394
Notes	397
Truck Drivers, Local 413 v. NRLB	399
Notes	405
	405
NLRB v. International Longshoremen's Ass'n	
Notes	416
G. Damages for Unlawful Secondary Activity	418
United Mine Workers, District 28 v. Patton	418
Notes	419
Section V. Jurisdictional Disputes	421
NLRB, Thirty-seventh Annual Report 121 (1972)	421
NLRB v. Radio & Television Broadcast Engineers, Local 1212 [CBS]	421
Notes	427
Section VI. "Featherbedding"	
American Newspaper Publishers Ass'n v. NLRB	428
	430
NLRB v. Gamble Enterprises	
Notes	430
Section VII. Emergency Disputes	431
A. Introduction	431
B. National Emergency Strikes Under the LMRA	432
Kleiler, A Legislative History of the National Emergency Provi-	
sions, in Emergency Disputes and National Policy 91, 106-08	
(I. Bernstein, H. Enarson & R. Fleming eds. 1955)	432
Notes	433
C. Emergency Railroad and Airline Disputes	
D. State Emergency Dispute Legislation	435
D. State Effective Amazonachas and Proposals	435
E. Alternative Approaches and Proposals	433
Williams, Settlement of Labor Disputes in Industries Affected	405
with a National Interest, 49 A.B.A. J. 862, 867-68 (1963)	435
Notes	438
Section VIII. Federal Preemption	439
San Diego Building Trades Council v. Garmon	440
Notes	442
Amalgamated Ass'n of Street, Electric Railway & Motor Coach Em-	
ployees of America v. Lockridge	444
Notes	451

Notes
Teamsters Local 24 v. Oliver
Note
Metropolitan Life Ins. Co. v. Massachusetts
Sears, Roebuck & Co. v. San Diego County District Council of Carpen
ters
Notes
Belknap, Inc. v. Hale
Notes
Lingle v. Norge Division of Magic Chef, Inc.
Notes
PART FOUR: COLLECTIVE BARGAINING
rt Rees, The Economics of Trade Unions 74, 89-90, 186-87 (2d ed
1977)
man & Medoff, The Two Faces of Unionism, in The Public Interes
69, 76, 78-82, 85, 86 (Fall 1979)
on I. The Duty to Bargain Collectively
A. Exclusive Representation and Majority Rule
J.I. Case Co. v. NLRB
Notes Emporium Capwell Co. v. Western Addition Community Organi-
zationzation capweii Co. v. western Addition Community Organi-
Note
B. The Nature of the Duty to Bargain
1. Good Faith
Labor Study Group, The Public Interest in National Labor
Policy 82 (Committee for Economic Development 1961)
General Electric Co.
Note
NLRB v. General Electric Co.
Notes
Note
NLRB v. Insurance Agents' Int'l Union
General Electric Co. v. NLRB
Notes
Charles D. Bonanno Linen Serv. v. NLRB
Notes
2. Bargaining Remedies
H.K. Porter Co. v. NLRB
Notes
Ex-Cell-O Corp
Notes
NLRB v. Katz
Notes

	rage
Detroit & Toledo Shore Line R.R. v. United Transportation	
Union	546
4. Supplying Information	
NLRB v. Truitt Manufacturing Co.	547
NLRB v. Acme Industrial Co.	549
Notes	549
C. The Subject Matter of Collective Bargaining	552
Neil Chamberlain, The Union Challenge to Management Control	
8-9 (1948)	552
S. Slichter, J. Healy & E. Livernash, The Impact of Collective	
Bargaining on Management 958 (1960)	552
NLRB v. Wooster Division of Borg-Warner Corp	553
Notes	556
Allied Chemical & Alkali Workers Local 1 v. Pittsburgh Plate	
Glass Co.	558
Notes	564
Fibreboard Paper Products Corp. v. NLRB	564
Notes	571
First National Maintenance Corp. v. NLRB	572
Notes	581
Otis Elevator Co. (United Technologies)	581
Notes D. The Duration of the Duty to Bargain	
1. The Effect of a Change in the Status of Union or Employer	583
Brooks v. NLRB	583
Notes	583 586
Stone Rubber Co.	587
Notes	587
American Seating Co.	
	591
Garment Workers Local 57 v. NRLB (Garwin Corp.)	591
Notes	592
	592
The Jacobs Manufacturing Co.	599
	598
NLRB v. Lion Oil Co.	600
• •	
Section II. The Impact of the Antitrust Laws	601
Loewe v. Lawlor ["Danbury Hatters"]	601
Note	601
	602
Apex Hosiery Co. v. Leader	603
	604
	607
Allen Bradley Co. v. International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers,	
Local 3	608
Notes	611
	612
Note	620
Amalgamated Meat Cutters & Butcher Workmen, Local 189 v. Jewel	
Tea Co	620

	Page
Notes	
American Federation of Musicians v. Carroll	
Note	631
Connell Construction Co. v. Plumbers Local 100	
Notes	641
Section III. The Enforcement of the Collective Agreement	
Archibald Cox, Law and the National Labor Policy 85 (1960)	
A. The Legal Status of the Collective Agreement	
Note	
B. The Enforcement of the Collective Agreement Through the Griev-	
ance Procedure and Arbitration	
Labor Study Group, The Public Interest in National Labor Policy	
32 (Committee for Economic Development 1961)	
1. The Grievance Procedure	
2. Voluntary Arbitration	
3. Arbitration Under the Railway Labor Act	
Note C. Judicial Enforcement of the Collective Agreement	$651 \\ 652$
1. The Enforcement of Voluntary Arbitration Agreements	652
a. At Common Law	652
b. State Arbitration Statutes	
c. Section 301 of the Labor Management Relations Act	
Textile Workers Union v. Lincoln Mills	654
Notes	
Retail Clerks, Locals 128 & 633 v. Lion Dry Goods, Inc.	
Notes	659
United Steelworkers v. Warrior & Gulf Navigation Co	660
United Steelworkers v. American Mfg. Co	666
Notes	666
AT & T Technologies v. CWA	667
Notes	
Nolde Bros. v. Bakery & Confectionery Workers Local	
358	668
Notes	669
United Steelworkers v. Enterprise Wheel & Car Corp	669
Notes	670
Paperworkers v. Misco, Inc	671
Notes	677
2. The Enforcement of Strike Bans and the Effect of Norris-La	
Guardia	678
Felix Frankfurter & Nathan Greene, The Labor Injunction	
36-37, 200-01 (1930)	678
Teamsters, Chauffeurs, Warehousemen & Helpers, Local	
174 v. Lucas Flour Co	679
Note	682
Boys Markets, Inc. v. Retail Clerks Local 770	682
Notes	689
Buffalo Forge Co. v. United Steelworkers	690
Notes	697
Complete Auto Transit, Inc. v. Reis	698
Notes	699

	Page
D. Contract Rights and Statutory Rights — Overlapping Law and	701
Forums	$\begin{array}{c} 701 \\ 701 \end{array}$
Notes	705
Milwaukee Spring Div. of Illinois Coil Spring Co	706
Notes	712
NLRB v. Bildisco & Bildisco	$\begin{array}{c} 713 \\ 714 \end{array}$
Notes	$\frac{714}{715}$
Notes	722
Carey v. Westinghouse Electric Corp	724
Notes	725
Smith v. Evening News Ass'n	726
Notes	$\frac{726}{727}$
Notes	727
E. Successor Employers' Contractual and Bargaining Obligations	729
John Wiley & Sons, Inc. v. Livingston	729
Notes	729
NLRB v. Burns International Security Services, Inc.	730
Howard Johnson Co. v. Hotel & Restaurant Employees Detroit Local Joint Board	737
Notes	737
Fall River Dyeing & Finishing Corp. v. NLRB	739
Notes	750
Section IV. Fair Representation and Individual Contract Rights	751
Clyde W. Summers, Individual Rights in Collective Agreements and Arbitration, 37 N.Y.U. L. Rev. 362, 393 (1962)	751
Archibald Cox, The Duty of Fair Representation, 2 Vill. L. Rev. 151,	731
167 (1957)	751
A. Judicial Enforcement of Fair Representation	752
Steele v. Louisville & Nashville R.R.	752
Notes	755 755
Vaca v. Sipes	764
Hines v. Anchor Motor Freight, Inc.	767
Notes	771
Clayton v. United Automobile Workers	772
Notes	772
Glover v. St. Louis-San Francisco Ry.	772
Notes B. Unfair Representation as an Unfair Labor Practice	773 773
Miranda Fuel Co.	773
Notes	774
Section V. Equal Employment Opportunity	776
Christopher Jencks et al., Inequality: A Reassessment of the Effect of	770
Family and Schooling in America 190-91 (1972, 1973)	776
letin No. 4, 1982)	777
Laura N. Gasaway, Comparable Worth: A Post-Gunther Overview, 69	
Georgetown Law Journal 1123, 1125-26 (1981)	777