

HONG KONG CASES

1994

Volume 2

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Butterworths Asia

Hong Kong • Singapore • Kuala Lumpur

The Butterworth Group of Companies

Singapore	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01 International Plaza, Singapore 0207
Hong Kong	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA (HONG KONG) 19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 9651400 Fax: 9760840
Malaysia	MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur
Australia	BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra
Canada	BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver
Ireland	BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin
New Zealand	BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland
Puerto Rico	BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan
UK	BUTTERWORTH & CO (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh
USA	BUTTERWORTH LEGAL PUBLISHERS Salem, New Hampshire and Carlsbad, California
Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed International (Singapore) Pte Ltd.	

© Butterworths Asia, 1995

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

ISBN 0-409-99754-4

Typeset by Butterworths Asia and Superskill Graphics
Produced by Mandarin Offset Ltd
Printed and bound in Hong Kong

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Associate Editors

Grenville Cross QC
Ruy Barretto, Barrister
Michael Ozorio, Barrister
Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister
Susan Kwan, Barrister
Peter Garland, Barrister
Malcolm Merry, Barrister
Aarif Barma, Barrister
Andrew Cheung, Barrister
Peter Ng, Barrister
Joseph Fok, Barrister
Anderson Chow, Barrister
Teresa Cheng, Barrister
David Fitzpatrick, Barrister
Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister
Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University
Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

Reporters in this volume

Danny Choi, Barrister
George F Chu, Barrister
Victor T Gidwani, Barrister
Paul Harris, Barrister
Gary Kwan, Barrister
Raymond Lau Wai Man, Barrister
Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister
PY Lo, Barrister
Judith O'Hare, City University
Herman LH Poon, Barrister
Raymond Tsui Wai Nam, Barrister
Anthony P Kinnear

Butterworths Asia

Managing Editor: Anthony P Kinnear
Deputy Managing Editor: Zarinah Marican

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The publishers are grateful to and acknowledge the significant contribution and support of the Hong Kong Superior Court Judgments Database project, directed by the four members of the Faculty of Law, whose names are mentioned below. The judgments database project (1989–1994) was funded primarily by the University of Hong Kong's Conference and Research Grants Committee with assistance from the Department of Professional Legal Education, at the Faculty of Law. The Faculty members responsible for the project are (in alphabetical order) Andrew Byrnes, Lecturer, Department of Law; Rick Glofcheski, Lecturer, Department of Law; Gary N Heilbronn, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education; and Sarah Nield, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education (until 1992). The project administrator is James Garritty, Research Officer, Faculty of Law.

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

List of abbreviations used in this volume (excluding reports):

A	High Court Action
ACJ	Acting Chief Justice
A-G	Attorney General
AR	Application for Review
Adm	Admiralty Action
App	Appendix
art	article
Aust	Australia
CA	Court of Appeal
CA	Civil Appeal Number in references to unreported cases (eg CA 2/92)
CC	High Court Criminal Case
CJ	Chief Justice
Cap	Chapter (as in Chapter Number of an Ordinance)
Crim App	Criminal Appeal
Comm L	Commercial List
Con L	Construction List
ch	chapter (as in chapter number of a book)
cl(l)	clause(s)
DC	District Court
DCA	District Court Action
DJ	District Judge
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
EC	European Communities
ECC	Economic Compensation Case
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities
EEC	European Economic Communities
Ed	Edition
Ex Ch	Court of Exchequer Chamber
exh	exhibit
fn	footnote
HC	High Court
HL	House of Lords
HMSO	Her Majesty's Stationery Office
J(J)	Justice(s)
J(J)A	Justice(s) of Appeal
LT(A)	Labour Tribunal (Appeal)
LC	Lord Chancellor
Ld T(A)	Lands Tribunal (Appeal)
MA	Magistracy Appeal
MCA	Magistracy Criminal Appeal
MP	Miscellaneous Proceedings
MR	Master of the Rolls
n	note
NSW	New South Wales
O	Order (of the Rules of the Supreme Court)

Hong Kong Cases

PC	Privy Council
PRC	People's Republic of China
PCA	Privy Council Appeal
Pt	Part
para	paragraph
RSC	Rules of the Supreme Court
r(r)	rule(s)
reg	regulation
s	section
sub-s	subsection
Sch	Schedule
UN	United Nations
Uncitral	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
VP(P)	Vice-President(s)
WCC	Workers' Compensation Case

List of abbreviations of law reports:

AC	Law Reports, Appeal Cases (HL and PC); since 1890
ALJR	Australian Journal Law Reports
All ER	All England Law Reports; since 1936
ALR	Australian Law Reports
App Cas	Law Reports, Appeal Cases, House of Lords, 15 volumes; 1875–1890
Asia BLR	Asia Business Law Review
BCC	British Company Law Cases; since 1983
BCLC	Butterworths Company Law Cases; since 1978
BLR	Business Law Review
BWCC	Butterworths' Workmen's Compensation Cases, 41 volumes; 1913–1937
Ch	Law Reports, Chancery Division; since 1890
Ch App	Law Reports, Chancery Appeals, 10 volumes; 1865–1875
Ch D	Law Reports, Chancery Division, 45 volumes; 1875–1890
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports; since 1903
CR	Criminal Reports, Canada; since 1945
Cr App R	Criminal Appeal Reports (HL and CA(UK)); since 1908
Cr App R (S)	Criminal Appeal Reports (Sentencing); since 1979
Crim LR	Criminal Law Review; since 1954
DLR	Dominion Law Reports
De GF & J	De Gex, Fisher and Jones's Reports, Chancery, 4 volumes, 1859–1862
De J & S	De Gex, Jones and Smith's Reports, Chancery, 4 volumes; 1862–1865
Dods	Dodson's Reports, Admiralty, 2 volumes, 1811–1822

Abbreviations

E & B	Ellis & Blackburn's Reports, Queen's Bench, 8 volumes; 1852–1858
EGLR	Estate Gazette Law Reports; since 1985
ER	English Reports, 178 volumes; 1220–1865
Ex D	Law Reports, Exchequer Division, 5 volumes, 1875–1880
F 2d	Federal Reporter, Second Series (USA), 1924– (current)
HKCLR	Hong Kong Criminal Law Reports
HKDCLR	Hong Kong District Court Law Reports
HKLR	Hong Kong Law Reports
HKLTR	Hong Kong Lands Tribunal Law Reports
HKPLR	Hong Kong Public Law Reports
ICR	Industrial Cases Reports; since 1975
IR	Irish Reports; since 1893
LGR	Local Government Reports; since 1902
LJ Ch	Law Journal, Chancery, 1831–1875
LR A & E	Law Reports, Admiralty and Ecclesiastical Cases, 4 volumes; 1865–1875
LR HL	Law Reports, English and Irish Peerage Claims, House of Lords, 7 volumes; 1866–1875
LR PC	Law Reports, Privy Council, 6 volumes; 1865–1875
LR QB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench, 10 volumes; 1865–1875
Lloyd LR	Lloyd's List Law Reports; 1919–1950
Lloyd's Rep	Lloyd's List Law Reports; since 1951
MLJ	Malayan Law Journal
My & K	Mylne and Keen's Reports, Chancery, 3 volumes, 1832–1835
NSWLR	New South Wales Law Reports; since 1971
NW (2d)	North Western Reporter, Second Series (USA); since 1941
NZLR	New Zealand Law Reports; since 1883
P	Law Reports, Probate, Divorce and Admiralty Division; 1891–1971
P (2d)	Pacific Reporter, Second Series (USA); since 1931
P & CR	Planning (Property) and Compensation Reports; since 1950
PD	Law Reports, Probate, Divorce and Admiralty Division; 1875–1890
QB	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1891–1900, and since 1952
QB	Queen's Bench Reports (Adolphus and Ellis, New Series), 18 volumes; 1841–1852
QBD	Law Reports, Queen's Bench Division; 1875–1890
Qd R	Queensland Law Reports; 1958–1972
	Queensland Reports; since 1972
RTR	Road Traffic Reports; since 1970
SA	South African Law Reports; since 1947
SC (J)	Court of Justiciary Cases (Scotland); since 1906

Hong Kong Cases

SJ	Solicitor's Journal; since 1856
SLT	Scots Law Times; since 1893
SR (NSW)	New South Wales, state Reports, since 1901
State Tr	State Trials, 34 volumes; 1163–1820
TLR	The Times Law Reports, 71 volumes; 1884–1950
	The Times Law Reports; since 1951
US	United States Reports
VR	Victorian Reports; 1870–1872 and since 1957
WLR	Weekly Law Reports; since 1953

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

The mode of citation of cases reported in this volume of *Hong Kong Cases* is [1994] 2 HKC (page).

Page		Page	
A		B	
Abundance Assets Ltd; Allson Classic Hotel (HK) Ltd v [CA]	154	Bank of America National Trust and Savings Association & Ors; Zanda Investment Ltd v [HC]	409
Active Keen Industries Ltd v Fok Chi Keong [CA]	67	Bank of Credit and Commerce Hong Kong Ltd (in liquidation); Tam Wing Chuen & Anor v [CA]	106
Ahola Josephine Ann v LA Gear Inc & Anor [HC]	640	Bank of Credit and Commerce Hong Kong Ltd (in liquidation); Young Hong Yui William & Ors v [HC]	89
Aktieselskabet Dansk Skibsfinsiering v Wheelock Marden & Co Ltd & Ors [CA]	264	Baroness Dunn & Anor v Li Kwok Po David & Ors [HC]	597
Alacrity, The [HC]	659	Bouygues SA & Ors; Red Sea Insurance Co Ltd v [PC]	35
Allson Classic Hotel (HK) Ltd v Abundance Assets Ltd [CA]	154		
Anwide Co Ltd v Attorney General [CA]	114	C	
Anwide Co Ltd v Attorney General [HC]	118	Caledonian Techmore (Building) Ltd (Hanison Construction Co Ltd, third party); Gay Constructions Pty Ltd & Anor v [HC]	562
Arnhold & Co Ltd v Yieldworth Engineers & Suppliers Ltd [CA]	391	Chan Ching Ho; Attorney General v [CA]	457
Attorney General v Chan Ching Ho [CA]	457	Chan Wai; R v [CA]	204
Attorney General v Dil Bahadur Gurung [CA]	476	Chan Yiu Tong; R v [HC]	539
Attorney General v Wong Nai Yuen [HC]	665	Cheng Kwan Sang; R v [CA]	461
Attorney General v Wong Yuk Ming & Anor [HC]	720	Cheung Sau Chu Rosanna v Li Kwok Keung & Ors [HC]	592
Attorney General v Wu See Sin [HC]	637	Cheung Shu Wai; R v [CA]	174
Attorney General; Anwide Co Ltd v [CA]	114	Chian Ker Chi Paul v Super Zone Investment Ltd & Anor [HC]	679
Attorney General; Anwide Co Ltd v [HC]	118	China Ocean Shipping Co v Mitrans Maritime Panama SA [HC]	614
Attorney General & Anor; Crossing Electronic (Chemicals) Ltd v [HC]	601	China Pride Investment Ltd v Silverpole Ltd [CA]	341
Attorney General & Anor; Heland Investment Ltd v [HC]	550	China Pride Investment Ltd; Silverpole Ltd v [HC]	52
Attorney General & Anor; Hong Kong Racing Pigeon Association Ltd v [HC]	610	Chinascreen Ltd, Re [HC]	643
		Ching Kwok Wing; R v [CA]	715

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
Chou Hung & Ors; Golden Bay Investment Ltd & Anor v [CA]	197	G	
Chow Ching Fuk; R v [CA]	278	Gay Constructions Pty Ltd & Anor v Caledonian Techmore (Building) Ltd [HC]	562
Chow Wing Kun & Anor; Law Chou Shing & Anor v .. [HC]	531	Golden Bay Investment Ltd & Anor v Chou Hung & Ors [CA]	197
Chung Sau Wah (a bankrupt) & Ors (Fuk Lan Ip Christine, third party); Wong Lai Ha v [HC]	646	Goldroyce Garment Ltd; H Smal Ltd v [HC]	526
Commissioner of Police; Shun Tak Holdings Ltd v [HC]	363	Grand Hyatt Hong Kong Co Ltd & Anor; Dixon v [HC]	489
Comtowell Ltd; Skink Ltd (in liquidation) v [CA]	286	H	
Cosmos-Pavis International Ltd & Ors; Prime Aim International Ltd v [HC]	545	H Smal Ltd v Goldroyce Garment Ltd [HC]	526
Crossing Electronic (Chemicals) Ltd v Attorney General & Anor [HC]	601	Heland Investment Ltd v Attorney General & Anor [HC]	550
D		Ho Anna (agent for Ho Mook Charles); Tsui Wing Chung v [Ld T]	629
Dawson Enterprises Ltd v Talisteam Ltd [HC]	327	Ho Che Chung; R v [CA]	148
Dental Council of Hong Kong; Secretary of Dental Council of Hong Kong v [HC]	570	Ho Shui Wah; R v [HC]	437
Dil Bahadur Gurung; Attorney General v [CA]	476	Ho Thi Diem, Re [HC]	708
Director of Immigration; Ho Thi Diem v [HC]	708	Ho Tung Shing & Ors; R v [CA]	404
Dixon v Grand Hyatt Hong Kong Co Ltd & Anor [HC]	489	Hong Kong Racing Pigeon Association Ltd v Attorney General & Anor [HC]	610
F		Hui Wai Man; R v [CA]	441
Ferrari SpA & Anor; Kwan Shiu Cheong Charles v [CA]	179	I	
First Bangkok City Finance Ltd (in liquidation), Re [HC]	735	Incorporated Owners of Wing Ming Industrial Centre & Anor; Wing Ming Garment Factory Ltd v [CA]	748
Fok Chi Keong; Active Keen Industries Ltd v [CA]	67	Intertrans Far East Ltd, Re [HC]	704
Fong Chi Leung; World Wide Stationery Manufacturing Co Ltd v [CA]	449	Italian Motors (Sales & Service) Ltd v Vaswani [CA]	767
Fu Mei Ling Mary (Adminstratrix of the Estate of Fu Tong, deceased) & Anor; Yeung Kong & Anor v [CA]	1	Italian Motors (Sales & Service) Ltd; Vaswani v [HC]	753
		J	
		Jansen; Matheson PFC Ltd v .. [CA]	250
		K	
		Kao, Lee & Yip (a firm) v Koo Hoi Yan Donald [CA]	228

Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Koo Hoi Yan Donald; Kao, Lee & Yip (a firm) v	[CA] 228	Metrobilt Enterprise Ltd & Anor; Tseng Yueh Lee Irene v	[HC] 684
Kwan Shiu Cheong Charles v Ferrari SpA & Anor	[CA] 179	Mitrans Maritime Panama SA; China Ocean Shipping Co v	[HC] 614
Kwan Wing Cheong; R v	[CA] 485		
Kwong Heong Mean; Pacol Aurelia v	[HC] 470		
		N	
L		Ng Kam Chuen; R v	[CA] 238
LA Gear Inc & Anor; Ahola Josephine Ann v	[HC] 640	Ng Wing Ming; R v	[CA] 464
Lai Hon Man; R v	[CA] 210		
Lai Kam Hon v Wong Lun Hing	[HC] 320	O	
Lai Moon Hung & Anor v Lam Island Development Co Ltd	[CA] 11	Olivesburg Ltd v Volstead Travel Service Co Ltd	[CA] 507
Lam Island Development Co Ltd; Lai Moon Hung & Anor v	[CA] 11		
Lau Kwong Kun; Law Chee Sing v	[Ld T] 624	P	
Law Chee Sing v Lau Kwong Kun	[Ld T] 624	Pacol Aurelia v Kwong Heong Mean	[HC] 470
Law Chou Shing & Anor v Chow Wing Kun & Anor ..	[HC] 531	Paul Y Construction Co Ltd; Ryoden Engineering Co Ltd & Anor v	[HC] 578
Law Kin Man, Re	[HC] 118	Prime Aim International Ltd v Cosmos-Pavis International Ltd & Ors	[HC] 545
Lee Kenny & Anor v Wong Kwok Yan	[CA] 309		
Leung Kam Tong & Ors; R v	[CA] 383	R	
Leung Kwong Cheung; Re	[HC] 502	R v Chan Wai	[CA] 204
Leung Tze Chun; R v	[CA] 191	R v Chan Yiu Tong	[HC] 539
Li Kwok Keung & Ors; Cheung Sau Chu Rosanna v	[HC] 592	R v Cheng Kwan Sang	[CA] 461
Li Kwok Po David & Ors; Baronness Dunn & Anor v ...	[HC] 597	R v Cheung Shu Wai	[CA] 174
Li Yuen Chu; R v	[HC] 621	R v Cheung Shu Wai	[CA] 174
		R v Ching Kwok Wing	[CA] 715
M		R v Chow Ching Fuk	[CA] 278
Matheson PFC Ltd v Jansen ...	[CA] 250	R v Ho Che Chung	[CA] 148
Maule, The	[HC] 671	R v Ho Shui Wah	[HC] 437
		R v Ho Tung Shing & Ors	[CA] 404
		R v Hui Wai Man	[CA] 441
		R v Kwan Wing Cheong	[CA] 485
		R v Lai Hon Man	[CA] 210
		R v Leung Kam Tong & Ors ..	[CA] 383
		R v Leung Tze Chun	[CA] 191
		R v Li Yuen Chu	[HC] 621
		R v Ng Kam Chuen	[CA] 238
		R v Ng Wing Ming	[CA] 464

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
R v Sung Kwok Man & Anor	[CA] 161	Taliteam Ltd; Dawson Enterprises Ltd v	[HC] 327
R v Tai Yiu Wah	[CA] 59	Tam Chun Fai; R v	[CA] 397
R v Tam Chun Fai	[CA] 397	Tam Wing Chuen & Anor v Bank of Credit and Commerce Hong Kong Ltd (in liquidation)	[CA] 106
R v To Kwan Hang & Anor ...	[CA] 293	Tang Kin Kwok & Ors; Tang Shu Tin & Ors v	[HC] 727
R v Tong Yiu Lun	[HC] 605	Tang Shu Tin & Ors v Tang Kin Kwok & Ors	[HC] 727
R v Tran Dinh Thanh & Anor	[CA] 260	The Price Co; United Links International Ltd v	[HC] 617
R v Wong Shuk Har	[HC] 517	To Kwan Hang & Anor; R v ..	[CA] 293
R v Yan Kwok Kwong	[CA] 245	Tong Yiu Lun; R v	[HC] 605
R v Yau Chi Keung	[CA] 64	Tran Dinh Thanh & Anor; R v	[CA] 260
R v Yeung Lee Transportation & Engineering Ltd	[HC] 556	Tseng Yueh Lee Irene v Metrobilt Enterprise Ltd & Anor	[HC] 684
Red Sea Insurance Co Ltd v Bouygues SA & Ors	[PC] 35	Tsui Wing Chung v Ho Anna (agent for Ho Mook Charles)	[Ld T] 629
Ryoden Engineering Co Ltd & Anor v Paul Y Construction Co Ltd	[HC] 578		
S		U	
Secretary of Dental Council of Hong Kong v Dental Council of Hong Kong	[HC] 570	United Links International Ltd v The Price Co	[HC] 617
Shun Tak Holdings Ltd v Commissioner of Police	[HC] 363	V	
Silverpole Ltd v China Pride Investment Ltd	[HC] 52	Vaswani v Italian Motors Sales & Service) Ltd	[HC] 753
Silverpole Ltd; China Pride Investment Ltd v	[CA] 341	Vaswani; Italian Motors Sales & Service) Ltd v	[CA] 767
Skink Ltd (in liquidation) v Comtowell Ltd	[CA] 286	Volstead Travel Service Co Ltd; Olivesburg Ltd v	[CA] 507
Star Verve Co Ltd; Sunic Consultants Ltd v	[Ld T] 693	W	
Sung Kwok Man & Anor; R v	[CA] 161	Wah Kwong Construction Material; Wong Man Yip v ..	[CA] 214
Sunic Consultants Ltd v Star Verve Co Ltd	[Ld T] 693	Wharf Properties Ltd; Swordland Ltd v	[CA] 223
Super Zone Investment Ltd & Anor; Chian Ker Chi Paul v	[HC] 679	Wheelock Marden & Co Ltd & Ors; Aktieselskabet Dansk Skibsfinansiering v	[CA] 264
Swordland Ltd v Wharf Properties Ltd	[CA] 223	Wing Ming Garment Factory Ltd v Incorporated	
T			
Tai Yiu Wah; R v	[CA] 59		

Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Owners of Wing Ming Industrial Centre & Anor [CA]	748	Y	
Wong Kwok Yan; Lee Kenny & Anor v [CA]	309	Yan Kwok Kwong; R v [CA]	245
Wong Lai Ha v Chung Sau Wah (a bankrupt) & Ors (Fuk Lan Ip Christine, third party) [HC]	646	Yau Chi Keung; R v [CA]	64
Wong Lun Hing; Lai Kam Hon v [HC]	320	Yeung Kong & Anor v Fu Mei Ling Mary (Adminstratrix of the Estate of Fu Tong, deceased) & Anor [CA]	1
Wong Man Yip v Wah Kwong Construction Material [CA]	214	Yeung Lee Transportation & Engineering Ltd; R v [HC]	556
Wong Nai Yuen; Attorney General v [HC]	665	Yieldworth Engineers & Suppliers Ltd; Arnhold & Co Ltd v [CA]	391
Wong Shuk Har; R v [HC]	517	Young Hong Yui William & Ors v Bank of Credit and Commerce Hong Kong Ltd (in liquidation) [HC]	89
Wong Yuk Ming & Anor; Attorney General v [HC]	720	Z	
World Wide Stationery Manufacturing Co Ltd v Fong Chi Leung [CA]	449	Zanda Investment Ltd v Bank of America National Trust and Savings Association & Ors [HC]	409
Wu See Sin; Attorney General v [HC]	637		

SUBJECT INDEX

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Judicial review

Application out of time – Whether delay due to applicant withholding application pending outcome of test case – Principles on which delay pending outcome of test case acceptable – Rules of the Supreme Court O 53 r 4 – Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) s 21K

Re Ho Thi Diem HC 708

Decision of Building Authority – Rejection of re-submitted plans which contravened Outline Zoning Plan – Whether re-submission of virtually identical plans a fresh application – Consideration of matter as at time of first submission – Buildings Ordinance (Cap 123) ss 15, 16(1)(d) & (g)

Heland Investment Ltd v Attorney General & Anor HC 550

Disciplinary proceedings – Dental Council of Hong Kong – Restrictions of practice – Whether of lesser severity than other penalties in s 18(1) of the Dentists Registration Ordinance – Whether conditions vague, unsatisfactory or incapable of enforcement – Dentists Registration Ordinance (Cap 156) s 18(1)

Secretary of Dental Council of Hong Kong v Dental Council of Hong Kong HC 570

Disciplinary proceedings – Locus standi of Secretary to the Dental Council of Hong Kong – Secretary's role a conduit between public and respondent

Secretary of Dental Council of Hong Kong v Dental Council of Hong Kong HC 570

Dispute as to liability for driving offence – Magistrate's refusal to hear defence – Whether application for judicial review justified – Whether remedy of appeal more appropriate

Re Leung Kwong Cheung HC 502

Practice – Uncontested proceedings – Filing of notice of motion – English practice directions followed in absence of Hong Kong practice direction

Crossing Electronic (Chemicals) Ltd v Attorney General & Anor HC 601

Procedural error – Delay in applying for judicial review – Whether procedural errors an excuse for inaction – Procedural errors to be questioned promptly – Rules of the Supreme Court O 53 r 4 – Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) s 21K

Re Ho Thi Diem HC 708

Test case – Whether applicant's case had common issues with test case – Criteria to apply in determining if a case was a test case

Re Ho Thi Diem HC 708

Validity of search warrant – Legal professional privilege

Shun Tak Holdings Ltd v Commissioner of Police HC 363

ANIMALS

Poultry

- Racing pigeon – Whether racing pigeon ‘poultry’ – Waste Disposal Ordinance (Cap 354) ss 2 & 15
Hong Kong Racing Pigeon Association Ltd v Attorney General & Anor
HC 610

ARBITRATION

Application for leave to appeal

- Application of sliding scale test – Where question of law a one-off case – Little likelihood of leave to appeal being granted unless case plainly or obviously wrong – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 23(3)
Arnhold & Co Ltd v Yieldworth Engineers & Suppliers Ltd CA 391

Appointment of arbitrator

- Whether there was an arbitration agreement under art 7 of the Model Law
H Smal Ltd v Goldroyce Garment Ltd HC 526

Failure to appoint arbitrator

- Costs – Indemnity basis
China Ocean Shipping Co v Mitrans Maritime Panama SA HC 614

Stay of proceedings

- Whether art 7(2) of the Uncitral Model Law complied with – Whether record of agreement has to refer specifically to an arbitration clause – Relevant considerations
Gay Constructions Pty Ltd & Anor v Caledonian Techmore (Building) Ltd (Hanison Construction Co Ltd, third party) HC 562

BANKING AND FINANCE

Negligence

- Unauthorized cheques accepted by banks – Claim in wrongful conversion – Whether banks negligent – Standard of care required – Causation – Contributory negligence by payee – Bills of Exchange Ordinance (Cap 19) s 86(1) & (3) – Law Amendment and Reform Consolidation Ordinance (Cap 23) s 21
Zanda Investment Ltd v Bank of America National Trust and Savings Association HC 409

BILLS OF EXCHANGE AND OTHER NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENTS

Claim upon dishonoured bill

- Bill drawn by plaintiff upon defendant payable at American bank to bank in Hong Kong – Bill accepted by defendant – Bill delivered by plaintiff to Hong Kong bank – Bill dishonoured – Whether plaintiff holder of bill and entitled to sue upon it
United Links International Ltd v The Price Co HC 617

Protection of bankers

Unauthorized cheques accepted by banks – Whether banks negligent – Standard of care required – Causation – Whether unauthorized indorsement an ‘irregularity’ – Safest method of crossing cheques – Bills of Exchange Ordinance (Cap 19) s 86(1) & (3)

Zanda Investment Ltd v Bank of America National Trust and Savings Association HC 409

BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION

Building Authority

Decision-making process – Incorrect application of principles – Duty to give reasons for rejection of plans

Heland Investment Ltd v Attorney General & Anor HC 550

Building contract

Right of sub-contractor to payment under architect’s certificate – Whether sub-contractor’s right to deduct liquidated damages subject to issuance of architect’s certificate – Whether contract had effect of excluding defendant’s common law right of set-off

Ryoden Engineering Co Ltd & Anor v Paul Y Construction Co Ltd HC 578

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Appeal to Privy Council

Whether there was an adverse decision to appeal from

Red Sea Insurance Co Ltd v Bouygues SA & Ors PC 35

Dismissal of action

Adverse effect of action on defendant – Whether prejudice suffered by defendant increased by delay

Cheung Sau Chu Rosanna v Li Kwok Keung & Ors HC 592

Inordinate and inexcusable delay – Risk of witnesses being unable to recollect events – Existence of real risk of delay preventing fair trial of issues

Cheung Sau Chu Rosanna v Li Kwok Keung & Ors HC 592

Inordinate and inexcusable delay – Whether plaintiff’s divorce proceedings and on-going police investigation amounted to excuse for delay in prosecution

Cheung Sau Chu Rosanna v Li Kwok Keung & Ors HC 592

Foreign corporation

Service of claim out of jurisdiction – Burden on plaintiff to show foreign corporation has place of business in Hong Kong

Ahola Josephine Ann v LA Gear Inc & Anor HC 640

Service out of jurisdiction – Leave must be obtained – Service of claim on foreign corporation not validly effected if leave of court not obtained – No submission to jurisdiction

Ahola Josephine Ann v LA Gear Inc & Anor HC 640

Interim stay of proceedings

Concurrent proceedings in Hawaii – Whether parallel proceedings – Transfer of business – Preservation of rights by issue of ‘proceedings’ – Transfer of Businesses (Protection of Creditors) Ordinance (Cap 49) s 4(5)
Allson Classic Hotel (HK) Ltd v Abundance Assets Ltd CA 154

Interlocutory applications

Application for interim stay of proceedings pending hearing of substantive application – Exercise of discretion of judge hearing application – Paramount principle – Whether order for service of points of claim before hearing of substantive application appropriate
Allson Classic Hotel (HK) Ltd v Abundance Assets Ltd CA 154

Interlocutory proceedings

Plaintiffs’ application for summary judgment – Defendants’ application for striking out – Plaintiffs entitled to summary judgment where defendants’ defence is misconceived or unsustainable – Defendants not entitled to refer dispute to arbitration if they had no arguable defence to plaintiffs’ O 14 application – Rules of the Supreme Court O 14
Ryoden Engineering Co Ltd & Anor v Paul Y Construction Co Ltd HC 578

Interrogatories

Effect of amendments to O 26 r 1 of the Rules of the Supreme Court – Whether interrogator needs to be certain that costs will be saved before serving interrogatories without consent of court – Rules of the Supreme Court O 26 r 1
Baronness Dunn & Anor v Li Kwok Po David & Ors HC 597

Judgments and orders

Time from which order effective – Committal proceedings – Leave to issue committal proceedings granted – Motion for committal filed before order drawn up and entered – Whether filing of motion valid – Rules of the Supreme Court O 42 r 3(1)
Re Chinascreen Ltd HC 643

Partnership

Use of firm name in actions – Firm does not exist as an entity separate from its partners – Order 81 does not alter substantive law – Rules of the Supreme Court O 81
Kao, Lee & Yip (a firm) v Koo Hoi Yan Donald & Ors CA 228

Pleadings

Allegations of fraud – Requirement of particularity
Aktieselskabet Dansk Skibsfinansiering v Wheelock Marden & Co Ltd & Ors CA 264

Amendment – Prejudice to party – Burden of proof – Rules of the Supreme Court O 20 r 5
Kwan Shiu Cheong Charles v Ferrari SpA & Anor CA 179