

'TED BY JOHN D. HEY

# **Current Issues in** Microeconomics Follo

Edited by John D. Hey

Professor of Economics and Statistics University of York



6218561

Selection and editorial matter © John D. Hey 1989 Individual chapters © John Broome, Melvyn Coles and James M. Malcomson, John D. Hey, Graham Loomes, Bruce Lyons and Yanis Varoufakis, Mark J. Machina, Paul Madden, Ray Rees, Robert A. Solo, Ian Walker 1989

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright Act 1956 (as amended), or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 33–4 Alfred Place, London WC1E 7DP.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

First published 1989

Published by
MACMILLAN EDUCATION LTD
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 2XS
and London
Companies and representatives
throughout the world

Typeset by Latimer Trend & Company Ltd, Plymouth

Printed in the People's Republic of China

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Current issues in microeconomics.—(Current issues in economics: v. 1)

1. Microeconomics
I. Hey, John D. (John Denis), 1944—
II. Spring

II. Series 338.5

ISBN 0-333-45472-3 (hardcover)

ISBN 0-333-45473-1 (paperback)

12/840.

### CURRENT ISSUES IN ECONOMICS

### General Editor: David Greenaway

- Vol. 1 Current Issues in Microeconomics Edited by John D. Hey, University of York
- Vol. 2 Current Issues in Macroeconomics

  Edited by David Greenaway, University of Nottingham
- Vol. 3 Current Issues in Labour Economics Edited by David Sapsford, University of East Anglia, and Zafiris Tzannatos, University of Buckingham
- Vol. 4 Current Issues in International Monetary Economics
  Edited by David T. Llewellyn and Chris Milner, Loughborough
  University

#### Forthcoming

- Vol. 5 Current Issues in Public Sector Economics
- Vol. 6 Current Issues in Development Economics
- Vol. 7 Current Issues in Industrial Economics
- Vol. 8 Current Issues in Monetary Economics
- Vol. 9 Current Issues in Welfare Economics

### Series Standing Order

If you would like to receive future titles in this series as they are published, you can make use of our standing order facility. To place a standing order please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address and the name of the series. Please state with which title you wish to begin your standing order. (If you live outside the United Kingdom we may not have the rights for your area, in which case we will forward your order to the publisher concerned.)

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire, RG21 2XS, England.

## Series Editor's Preface

The Current Issues series has slightly unusual origins. Current Issues in International Trade, which Macmillan published in 1987 and which turned out to be the pilot for the series was in fact 'conceived' in the Horton Hospital, Banbury, and 'delivered' (in the sense of completed) in the Hilton International in Nicosia! The reader may be struck by the thought that a more worthwhile and enjoyable production process would start and finish the other way around. I agree! Be that as it may, that is how the series started.

As I said in the Preface to Current Issues in International Trade the reason for its creation was the difficulty of finding suitable references on 'frontier' subjects for undergraduate students. Many of the issues which excite professional economists and which dominate the journal literature take quite a time to percolate down into texts, hence the need for a volume of Current Issues. The reception which Current Issues in International Trade received persuaded me that it may be worth doing something similar for the other subject areas we teach. Macmillan agreed with my judgement, hence the series. Thus each volume in this series is intended to take readers to the 'frontier' of the particular subject area. Each volume contains ten essays, nine of which deal with specific current issues, and one which provides a general overview, setting the relevant current issues in the context of other recent developments.

As series editor the main challenge I faced was finding suitable editors for each of the volumes – the best people are generally the busiest! I believe, however, that I have been fortunate in having such an impressive and experienced team of editors with the necessary skills and reputation to persuade first-class authors to participate. I would like to thank all of them for their cooperation and assistance in the development of the series. Like me, all of them

will, I am sure, hope that this series provides a useful service to undergraduate and postgraduate students as well as faculty.

Microeconomics is the point of embarkation for almost all students of economics. Being at the core of the discipline, it is also an area to which most of us return from time to time, whatever our specialism. In this volume John Hey has selected nine issues which have been at the centre of recent developments in economics, issues which include: choice under uncertainty; microeconometrics; experimental economics; game theory; macroeconomics, and a number of others besides. He has persuaded a group of distinguished authors from the United Kingdom and North America to contribute. The result is a volume which should prove to be challenging, stimulating, and rewarding (in that order).

As well as being a first-rate economist, John Hey has considerable editorial skills. The combination of the two has resulted in what I think is a very fine volume. He himself provides a skilful overview of the chapters in his introductory chapter and it is unnecessary for me to comment on the detail of the chapters. I hope readers find the essays as interesting and rewarding as I have.

University of Nottingham

DAVID GREENAWAY

### **Notes on the Contributors**

John Broome is Reader in Economics, University of Bristol.

Melvyn Coles is Assistant Professor of Economics, Princeton University.

John D. Hey is Professor of Economics and Statistics, University of York.

Graham Loomes is Senior Lecturer in Economics, University of York.

Bruce Lyons is Lecturer in Economics, University of East Anglia.

Mark J. Machina is Associate Professor of Economics, University of California, San Diego.

Paul Madden is Senior Lecturer in Econometrics and Social Statistics, University of Manchester.

James M. Malcomson is Professor of Economics, University of Southampton.

Ray Rees is Professor of Economics, University of Guelph.

**Robert A. Solo** is Professor of Economics, Michigan State University.

Yanis Varoufakis is Lecturer in Economics, University of East Anglia.

Ian Walker is Professor of Economics, Keele University.



## **Contents**

	LIST OF FIGURES	vii
	LIST OF TABLES	ix
	SERIES EDITOR'S PREFACE	X
	NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS	xii
1	INTRODUCTION: RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN MICROECONOMICS John D. Hey	1
2	CHOICE UNDER UNCERTAINTY: PROBLEMS SOLVED AND UNSOLVED Mark J. Machina	12
3	UNCERTAINTY, INFORMATION AND INSURANCE Ray Rees	47
4	GAME THEORY, OLIGOPOLY AND BARGAINING Bruce Lyons and Yanis Varoufakis	79
5	CONTRACT THEORY AND INCENTIVE COMPATIBILITY Melvyn Coles and James M. Malcomson	127
6	EXPERIMENTAL ECONOMICS Graham Loomes	152

7	GENERAL EQUILIBRIUM AND DISEQUILIBRIUM AND THE MICROECONOMIC FOUNDATIONS OF MACROECONOMICS Paul Madden	179
8	MICROECONOMIC MODELLING AND MICRO- ECONOMIC POLICY ANALYSIS  Ian Walker	209
9	WHAT'S THE GOOD OF EQUALITY?  John Broome	236
10	INSTITUTIONAL ECONOMICS	
	Robert A. Solo	263
	END-NOTES ZAGRABILATION CATOM	277
	REFERENCES	289
	AUTHOR INDEX	310
	SUBJECT INDEX	314

# **List of Figures**

2.1	Concave utility function of a risk averter	15
2.2	Convex utility function of a risk lover	16
2.3	Expected utility indifference curves in the triangle	
	diagram	18
2.4	Relatively steep indifference curves of a risk averter	19
2.5	Relatively flat indifference curves of a risk lover	20
2.6	Expected utility indifference curves and the Allais	
	paradox	23
2.7	Indifference curves which 'fan out' and the Allais paradox	24
2.8	Indifference curves which fan out and the common	
	ratio effect	26
2.9	Indifference curves which fan out and the common	
	ratio effect for negative pay-offs	27
2.10	'Recovered' utility functions for mixture	
	probabilities $\frac{1}{4}$ , $\frac{1}{2}$ , and $\frac{3}{4}$	28
2.11	Fanning out indifference curves which generate the	
	responses of Figure 2.6a	29
2.12	'Indifference curves' for the expected regret model	35
2.13	Risk aversion of every local expected utility	
	approximation is equivalent to global risk aversion	36
2.14	Duplex gambles with identical underlying	
	distributions	38
3.1	Fair insurance	50
3.2	Insurance in general	54
3.3	Social risk, exchange and insurance	57
3.4	No social risk implies full insurance	59
3.5	Full information equilibrium	63
3.6	Pooled insurance	66

3.7	Separating equilibrium	68
3.8	The moral hazard problem	71
3.9	Solution to the moral hazard problem	73
3.10	Optimal partial coverage	75
3.11	Optimal partial coverage may or may not exist	76
4.1	Prisoners' dilemma	82
4.2	Best replies and Nash equilibrium	85
4.3	Cournot-Nash equilibrium	86
4.4	Entry game in normal form	88
4.5	Entry game in extensive form	89
4.6	Pre-commitment in the entry game	91
4.7	Bertrand-Nash duopoly with identical firms	92
4.8	Bertrand competition with entry and fixed costs	93
4.9	Capacity-constrained price competition with	73
	$0 > k > \pm 0$	95
4.10	Discontinuous best-reply curves	96
4.11	Stick and carrot	101
4.12	Multiple Nash equilibria in the one-shot (stage)	
	game	103
4.13	Nash equilibrium in the division game	110
4.14	Duration of costly bargaining	119
4.15	Pay-off matrix	120
4.16	Duration of bargaining	123
7.1		184
7.2		185
7.3		191
7.4		195
7.5		201
7.6		206
3.1	Labour supply and commodity demands under	
	two-stage budgeting	212
3.2	Rationed and unrationed cost functions	216
3.3	Pre- and post-reform constraints	223
3.4	Distributional effects of proportional income tax	225
3.5	Tax reduction by income decile	232
3.6	EG and tax reductions by equivalent income decile	234

# List of Tables

3.1	Individual versus social risk	56
6.1	Demand and supply schedules	163
8.1	Behavioural and welfare analysis by household	
	type is been admitted as a part more transfer and the	224
8.2	Atkinson equivalent income inequality indices	
	before and after reform	225
8.3	Estimated elasticities	227
8.4	Behavioural responses to harmonisation	230
8.5	Sources of tax revenue	231
8.6	Reductions in indirect taxes paid	233
8.7	Atkinson equivalent income inequality indices	
	before and after harmonisation	234
8.8	Social welfare change	235
9.1	States of nature or people	
9.2	Income distributions	

# 1 Introduction: Recent Developments in Microeconomics

JOHN D. HEY

This Series of books is aimed at students of economics and nonspecialist economists interested in learning about recent developments in economics. Usually, such recent developments first see the light of day in one of the academic journals, and take some time to filter through to the general economist. This process often takes several years. At the same time, however, the developments are assimilated - often in an informal (and sometimes mistaken) fashion by the leading economists, and are implicit in various pedagogical activities carried out within the profession. This puts the non-specialist at a considerable disadvantage. Unfortunately, there is usually no easy way for the non-specialist to make him-/or her-self aware of these recent developments, given that they are typically communicated in specialist language in high-level journals, from one highbrow economist to another. Often, advanced mathematics is used, and much - in the way of prior knowledge - is taken for granted in the exposition. Nevertheless, knowledge of such recent developments is of great importance: the greater the degree of dissemination of such developments, the more likely it is that those elements which are of practical importance for economics will eventually be put to use.

It is the purpose of this series of books – and of this book in particular – to help to close this information gap: to enable non-specialists to become acquainted with recent developments in the

subject; to communicate in non-specialist language to non-specialists. We hope that this series will be of immense value to students as well as economists in all walks of life who like to keep up with what is happening at the frontier.

This particular book is concerned with recent developments in microeconomics. I would contend that such developments lie at the very heart of economics - certainly given the way that economics is currently practised by the majority of the profession. It is increasingly recognised that all areas of economics rely on a central core of microtheory. This is true even in macroeconomics, where it is now widely agreed - in sharp contradistinction to the situation of twenty years ago - that theory must have a firm micro base. (This is not to imply that I agree with this: it is simply a comment on the situation as it exists at present.) So developments in microeconomics have possible implications well outside the narrow confines of micro itself. Conversely, developments in microeconomics - as we will see in the course of this book - have often been motivated by inadequacies in other areas of economics. This is particularly true of the ongoing macroeconomic quest to provide a satisfying theoretical explanation of various allegedly disequilibrium phenomena such as unemployment and inflation. We will find echoes of this particularly in Chapter 7 (which discusses the microfoundations of macroeconomics) but also in Chapters 4 and 5.

The recent history of microtheory can distinguish three broad phases (within the now-dominant mathematical neoclassical paradigm): first, the theory of the maximising agent (or agents) in a certain world; second – based on the triumphant rise of the Neumann-Morgenstern (now normally referred to as SEU – subjective expected utility) theory of behaviour under uncertainty—the theory of the maximising agent (or agents) in a (Neumann-Morgenstern) uncertain world; third, and most recently, the behaviour of agents in one we might call a post-SEU (post-Neumann-Morgenstern) world. It is with these latter two phases that this book is mainly concerned. (As will be or will become apparent, different parts of the subject are at different phases in their development: some are still absorbing the implications of the [SEU] theory of the rational agent in an uncertain world; others have moved on from there – for one reason or another.)

Much of this book is concerned with the treatment and effect of uncertainty – though there are deeper (methodological) issues to

which I shall come in a minute. The SEU theory of rational behaviour under uncertainty (of which I hope most readers are aware) fits in most satisfyingly with mainstream neoclassical economics in that it provides a logical (and rather elegant) description of how rational people ought to behave in an uncertain world. The application of this theory to economic problems has led to many satisfying predictions, which have, in many instances, been borne out by the facts. A number of illuminating examples can be found in Chapters 3 and 5. There is now a veritable cottage industry applying SEU theory across the whole range of economics. Although these are 'recent developments' in one sense, we do not include much discussion of such developments in this volume - for the simple reason that they do not describe 'current issues' at the frontier; in R&D terminology, recent applications of SEU theory are developments while the current issues discussed in this volume are research.

While SEU theory has proved a godsend in many areas of economics, there are other areas in which it has either proved 'unusable' and yet other areas in which it has proved empirically unsound. Accordingly, in these areas the literature has moved on, with current issues being concerned with alternatives to, or

generalisations of, SEU theory.

Chapter 2 is concerned with some of these issues. Written by Mark Machina, this chapter is concerned, first, with the evidence casting doubt on SEU theory, and second, with the various alternative theories that have been put forward over the past few years. This is a very vigorous area of current research. To give a simple example which motivates the material of that chapter, consider (one variant of) the famous Allais Paradox: let A denote getting \$3000 with certainty, and let B denote a gamble which gives you \$4000 with probability 0.8 and \$0 with probability 0.2. If you were given a choice between A and B here and now, which would you choose? Now, consider the choice between C and D defined as follows: with C you would get \$3000 with probability 0.25 and \$0 with probability 0.75; with D you would get \$4000 with probability 0.2 and \$0 with probability 0.8. If you were given a choice between C and D here and now, which would you choose? Now, the conventional wisdom (SEU theory) requires that if you chose A (B) in the first problem you should choose C(D) in the second. Did you in fact do this? (To see why the conventional wisdom says that you 4

'should' have this pattern of choice, consider the following: precede both A and B in the first problem by a piece of preliminary risk - in each case a 25 per cent chance of getting to the initial starting-point and a 75 per cent chance of simply getting \$0; does this change your choice? Now note that A preceded by the preliminary piece of risk is simply C, while B preceded by the preliminary risk is simply D.) In practice, it is frequently observed that many people make choices that go against this prediction/prescription of the conventional wisdom. Moreover, many of these people continue to hold to their 'irrational' choices even after the error of their ways is pointed out to them. This is but one example of many which provide evidence to suggest that many people have preferences, and hence behaviour, which is inconsistent with the conventional wisdom in economics. Mark Machina describes this evidence. explains in what ways it departs from that indicated by SEU theory, and discusses the implications. In essence, these are twofold: either the recommendation that we embark on a programme of education, so that 'irrational' people are taught the error of their ways; or the recommendation that economists produce some new theory to explain this apparently irrational behaviour. Naturally, this chapter is mainly concerned with this latter. Machina introduces us to a number of new theories - including Prospect theory, Regret theory, Disappointment theory and Machina's own generalised Subjective expected utility (SEU) theory ('SEU theory without the independence axiom').

In Chapter 3, we return to the conventional wisdom. Under the guidance of Ray Rees, we explore what SEU theory has to tell us about the impact of uncertainty on the behaviour of individuals and on the behaviour of markets. As might be anticipated, uncertainty not only affects behaviour but it also has adverse effects on individuals' welfare. Thus ways of evading or avoiding uncertainty are likely to prove of value (unless, of course, the evasion or avoidance is excessively costly). It is not surprising, therefore, that we see in the real world numerous instruments for avoiding risk: for example, various forms of futures markets; various price stabilisation schemes; various risk-sharing contracts; and so on. But, of course, the example par excellence is that of insurance. This is one of the main elements in Ray Rees's chapter. To begin with, Rees shows that a risk-averse agent would always choose to be fully insured if offered actuarially-fair insurance. A problem,

however, arises in a market situation if what is an 'actuarially-fair price' cannot be identified. This arises when the risk which the individual faces cannot be observed by the other side of the market. This is a classic example of what has now come to be termed the problem of asymmetrical information - when one side of any potential transaction has less information than the other side. Effectively, this means that (at least) one side of the market is uncertain about the nature of the good being traded. This problem frequently surfaces in economics - and resurfaces in later chapters of this book. When it arises, all sorts of problems can occur - at the worst trade may not take place ('the market ceases to exist'); at the best contracts are redefined in anticipation of the uncertainty (though this presupposes a critical amount of information available to market participants); in between, various suboptimal outcomes may result. This chapter discusses these issues - which are of crucial importance for the appropriate operation of economic policy.

Subjective expected utility theory is essentially aimed at the description of the behaviour of economic agents facing essentially exogenous uncertainty - uncertainty generated by Nature, rather than by the behaviour of other interested (possibly competing) agents. Crucially, in such 'games against nature', the nature of the uncertainty - although possibly modified by the agent's behaviour - is not essentially determined by it. In contrast, when there are other interested agents involved, the very essence of the uncertainty is affected (or perhaps can be affected) by the agents' behaviour. The most obvious example is that of duopoly. Consider the simple (mineral springs) model of duopoly used by Cournot in his classic study. In this each of the two duopolists must choose output in ignorance of the choice made by the other. So there is uncertainty uncertainty about what the rival will do. But this is a different form of uncertainty from that encountered in games against nature: there is no exogenous probability distribution over the rivals' choices. But there is something else. This is seen in starkest form when the two duopolists are identical in all respects. In this case each duopolist can observe that the rival is identical and, in particular, must share the same reasoning about the appropriate solution to the choice problem. Thus, one duopolist can decide what to do by assuming that his or her rival is going through exactly the same mental process. In this way, possibly, the uncer-