

# American Short Fiction: Readings & Criticism

Edited by James K. Bowen  
and Richard VanDerBeets



# *Short Fiction*

*( Readings  
and Criticism )*

Edited by

JAMES K. BOWEN

RICHARD VAN DER BEETS

Copyright © 1970 by The Bobbs-Merrill Company, Inc.  
Printed in the United States of America  
Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 74-115055  
ISBN-0-672-60648-8 (pbk)

Sixth Printing—1978

"Death in the Woods" by Sherwood Anderson, reprinted by permission of Harold Ober Associates, Inc. Copyright © 1926 by the American Mercury, Inc. Renewed 1953 by Eleanor Copenhaver Anderson.

"Paper Pills" by Sherwood Anderson, from *Winesburg, Ohio*, by Sherwood Anderson. Copyright 1919 by B. W. Huebsch, Inc., 1947 by Eleanor Copenhaver Anderson. Reprinted by permission of The Viking Press, Inc.

"The Long Way Out" by F. Scott Fitzgerald. Copyright 1937 Esquire-Coronet, Inc.; renewal copyright © 1965 Francis Scott Fitzgerald Lanahan. Reprinted with the permission of Charles Scribner's Sons from *The Stories of F. Scott Fitzgerald*.

"A Rose for Emily" by William Faulkner. Copyright 1930 and renewed 1958 by William Faulkner. Reprinted from *The Collected Stories of William Faulkner* by William Faulkner, by permission of Random House, Inc.

"Shingles for the Lord" by William Faulkner. Copyright 1943 by William Faulkner. Reprinted from *The Collected Stories of William Faulkner* by William Faulkner, by permission of Random House, Inc.

"The Killers" by Ernest Hemingway. Copyright 1927 Charles Scribner's Sons; renewal copyright 1955. Reprinted with the permission of Charles Scribner's Sons from *Men Without Women* by Ernest Hemingway.

"Ways and Means" by Langston Hughes from *Simple Speaks His Mind*, published by Simon & Schuster. Reprinted by permission of Harold Ober Associates Incorporated. Copyright 1943, 1944, 1945, 1946, 1947, 1948, 1949, 1950 by Langston Hughes.

"On the Road" by Langston Hughes from *Laughing to Keep From Crying*, published by Henry Holt. Reprinted by permission of Harold Ober Associates Incorporated. Copyright © 1952 by Langston Hughes.

"The Real Thing" and "The Real Right Thing" by Henry James, reprinted from *The New York Edition of Henry James*, Charles Scribner's Sons.

"The Magic Barrel" and "The Prison" by Bernard Malamud, reprinted with the permission of Farrar, Straus & Giroux, Inc., from *The Magic Barrel* by Bernard Malamud. Copyright © 1950, 1954, 1958 by Bernard Malamud.

"A Good Man is Hard to Find" and "A Late Encounter With the Enemy" by Flannery O'Connor from *A Good Man is Hard to Find*. Copyright 1953 by Flannery O'Connor. Reprinted by permission of Harcourt, Brace & World, Inc.

"Flowering Judas" and "Rope" by Katherine Anne Porter from *Flowering Judas and Other Stories*. Copyright 1930, 1958 by Katherine Anne Porter. Reprinted by permission of Harcourt, Brace & World, Inc.

"The Notorious Jumping Frog of Calaveras County" and "A True Story" by Mark Twain from *Sketches New and Old* by Mark Twain. Reprinted by permission of Harper & Row, Publishers.

"A & P" by John Updike. Copyright © 1962 by John Updike. Reprinted from *Pigeon Feathers and Other Stories* by John Updike, by permission of Alfred A. Knopf, Inc. Originally appeared in *The New Yorker*.

"Lifeguard" by John Updike. Copyright © 1961 by John Updike. Reprinted from *Pigeon Feathers and Other Stories* by John Updike, by permission of Alfred A. Knopf, Inc. Originally appeared in *The New Yorker*.

## Foreword

Short stories are not American in invention, nor is analysis of them singularly a native art; but, like the English sparrow, the short story has found sturdy nurture among us, increasing in number, and sometimes in excellence, beyond what it had ever been before. Its length often fits exactly to our mood, or to our requirement that something be succinctly said. In the hand of a master, it becomes consummately an art, suggesting more than it seems at first to reveal.

As an art form, the short story has attracted critics almost beyond number, who probe to analyze or explain, and much of their criticism provides a kind of useful calisthenics, both graceful and rewarding. Indeed, so much has been written about our better stories, that the criticism concerning any one of them might in itself fill a volume. For that reason alone, the compilers of the

present critical anthology are to be congratulated, having supplied so much in the form of abstracts of many penetrating critical interpretations, providing thereby breadth and diversity of informed opinion not to be found in other collections.

The presentation of a large range of viewpoints, economically packaged, is sufficient reason for congratulation, and gratitude; but other reasons for intelligent use of abstracts come to mind: when deftly done, they are creations in themselves, exemplars for student imitation; they cut through difficulties of time and space, allowing a generously wide sampling of approaches and attitudes; they make plain what is sometimes excessively difficult to comprehend because of specialized language. Critics can often become so involved in what they are saying that they seem to be talking among themselves, addressing what they have to say to other critics, and in terms that are not immediately understood by ordinary readers. To have reduced, translated, and made clear in summary the substance of each critical essay is in itself a boon to the ordinary reader. By the time he has completed reading and studying in this collection, the reader should be prepared to discuss literature intelligently with other ordinary readers or with professional critics, whose ranks he may in some sense be thought to have joined. Precision is gained, along with insight and vocabulary, and these three are cornerstones of a liberal education—indeed, of any education at all.

For education is finally a leading-out, not just a filling-in—that is, learning is a good and necessary thing, but not the goal. To learn traditional critical vocabulary and critical methods is a first step, and one that this collection generously encourages. But then, to apply these terms and these methods, led by the ideas rather than just by the words of other commentators, is to discover that literature can be many-splendored, capable of supporting varied and various approaches. With the tools in hand, the reader may then shape his own critical interpretations, testing, revising, or expanding what others—even his teachers—have said before. He will discover that literature, when it is excellent, is indestructible: no picking at it, no analysis, no close reading nor discussion can harm it in the least.

But to study literature is in a large sense to learn to talk about literature. To read it, simply for enjoyment, is the good thing, and enjoyment that becomes insight is perhaps the greatest gift literature has to offer. Inevitably, however, the intelligently inquiring reader will want to talk with someone about what he has read, to be able to explain what it is that he likes and why he likes it, or why someone else would receive refreshment from reading it. This is sometimes a difficult undertaking, because the words to express what one wants to say are not easily come on; it is because of this that the presentation of traditional critical vocabulary and method in the variety of examples that abstracts make possible is so wel-

come an innovation. The abstracts provide not only theoretical, but practical, examples of how literature has been discussed: these things have been said, these insights set forth, these ideas expressed; what now is there for me to say? The answer is that there is a great deal to say, for short stories such as those presented in this collection are multiple-faceted, and their chronological arrangement allows for judgment, not only on each story itself, but on the development of new ways of saying or suggesting things over the more than one hundred years represented by the stories chosen for study.

Having heard what critics have said about one story, the reader is then on his own in discovering what there is to be said about a second (or, with some adventuring, a third, or a fourth, or a fifth) story by the same author. Users of this anthology are to be envied for the opportunities that it presents for intelligently controlled, independent judgment. They will not need to be reminded that the literature is primary, and the talk about it only a means of discovering what richness it can disclose.

*Lewis Leary*

## Acknowledgments

In every instance, those authors of original articles still living and able to be located were asked either to prepare or approve abstracts of their articles. Grateful acknowledgment is made to the following authors who personally prepared abstracts of their own articles especially for this collection: Howard W. Bahr, Sam Bluefarb, Edgar M. Branch, Oliver Evans, Marvin Felheim, Richard E. Fisher, M. E. Grenander, Wilfred L. Guerin, Marvin Klotz, Jon S. Lawry, Earle Labor, Simon O. Lesser, Hugh N. Maclean, Mordecai Marcus, Terence Martin, Charles A. Owen, Jr., Clell T. Peterson, Marc L. Ratner, Richard H. Rupp, John Russell, Alfred S. Shivers, Eric Solomon, Edward Stone, Richard VanDerBeets, J. A. Ward, and Norris W. Yates. Acknowledgment is also due the following members of the editorial and research staff of *American Literature Abstracts* who contributed inde-

pendently-prepared abstracts: Carol McMillen Benson, Warren B. Benson, Dan Ducker, James L. Green, and Jackson E. Parham.

Courtesy acknowledgment is made to those journals represented by articles abstracted in this collection: *Accent*, *Alaska Review*, *America*, *American Book Collector*, *American Imago*, *American Literature*, *American Prefaces*, *American Quarterly*, *Bookman*, *CEA Critic*, *CLA Journal*, *College English*, *Critique: Studies in Modern Fiction*, *Exercise Exchange*, *Explicator*, *Forum*, *Journal of American Folklore*, *Kenyon Review*, *Massachusetts Review*, *Midcontinent American Studies Journal*, *Midwest Quarterly*, *Modern Fiction Studies*, *Modern Language Notes*, *Modern Philology*, *Moderna språk*, *Nineteenth-Century Fiction*, *Die Neueren Sprachen*, *New England Quarterly*, *Phylon*, *PMLA*, *Partisan Review*, *Queen's Quarterly*, *Research Studies*, *Sewanee Review*, *Southern Quarterly*, *Southwest Review*, *Studies in Short Fiction*, *University Review*, *Western Humanities Review*, and *Yale Review*; and to *Twayne Publishers*. Complete bibliographic source-citation and formal acknowledgment, where requested, accompany each abstract in the text proper.

The editors thank the staff of the University of the Pacific Library for its courtesy and aid in the gathering and duplicating of materials.

J. K. B.

R. VDB.



## Introduction

This book attempts to provide a useful common ground for encountering the best of American short fiction and the criticism that it generates. To enable an unusually broad representation of both, a technique new to collections of this kind is introduced: the abstract. The value of the abstract as a critical tool to aid the study of literature is now generally acknowledged; the existence of such periodicals as *Abstracts of English Studies*, *Abstracts of Folklore Studies*, and *American Literature Abstracts* testifies to the widespread use of abstracts within the scholarly community. The transition from scholarly to textbook use of abstracts is a natural and inevitable one, and this critical anthology is the first of its kind to apply the technique of abstracts as critical apparatus directly to the classroom.

Each of the seventeen stories in Part One is accom-

panied by four abstracts of critical articles bearing on interpretation, analysis, or judgment of that story. Abstracts—concise, readable, non-evaluative summaries of approximately four hundred words—can be presented in sufficient number as to afford a breadth and diversity of opinion not otherwise possible; abstracts render the substance of critical articles, intended for an audience of mature scholars, into readable and meaningful terms for the student; and, of course, abstracts serve as detailed and reliable bibliographic guides in determining the relevance and value of original materials for further study and research. From the wealth of materials available, the abstracts here presented were chosen to reflect as wide a range of criticism and critical approaches as possible; the many excellent articles not selected for abstract were excluded not out of ignorance or bias but rather because those included better fit the particular demands of this collection.

Part Two is organized on a principle of matching arrangement whereby less familiar, less frequently anthologized, and less critically attended stories by the same authors represented in Part One are offered (with the exception of Hemingway, for which the Fitzgerald story is substituted) for comparison and independent analysis without critical apparatus.

The abstracts can be profitably employed in a number of ways, and the variety of uses to which the materials lend themselves can only be suggested here. For example—and using as an illustration Poe's "Ligeia" and its accompanying abstracts—study, discussion, or writing might involve the following: 1. develop the general observations in each or any of the four abstracts accompanying "Ligeia" by providing specific details from the story that substantiate them; 2. in the light of the Basler, Gargano, and Morrison approaches to the story, evaluate Lauber's "A Plea for Literalism"; 3. to what extent may the central thesis of the Gargano abstract be applied to Poe's other story, "William Wilson"? 4. of the four approaches to the story reflected in the abstracts, defend a choice of the most cogent. Topics may also be broadened beyond a particular story and set of abstracts by considering, for example, 1. the psychological interpretation of fiction as it is demonstrated in abstracts relating to "Rip Van Winkle," "Ligeia," "My Kinsman, Major Molineux," "Bartleby," "Flowering Judas," and others; 2. or by undertaking a discussion of the use of the supernatural in "Ligeia," "William Wilson," "Drowne's Wooden Image," "Rip Van Winkle," and others; 3. or by tracing elements of the Gothic in "Ligeia," "William Wilson," "The Boarded Window," and "A Rose for Emily." Similar investigations, aided by the critical focus of appropriate abstracts, can be made into such areas as mythic/archetypal, sociocultural, and historical approaches to fiction. Further, chronological arrangement of stories provides an overview for considering the development of American short fiction as genre. Many and varied ways to use the

stories, abstracts, and matching stories will present themselves to users of this anthology.

As these suggestions for study and writing indicate, the abstracts here collected present critical terminology and methods not in theory but as they are practically applied: the demonstrable applications of a variety of approaches and systems. Acquaintance with these critical principles and practices can greatly enhance the appreciation of literature, for *criticism* is a term that can be said to relate to the description, analysis, or judgment of literature; and the *critic*, one who performs such analysis and exercises such judgment on the value and quality of literary works. The critic may employ any of a number of varying theories of art.

Literary and critical historians generally divide criticism, especially contemporary criticism, into *types*, of which the most pertinent to the purposes of this anthology are historical, formalistic, sociocultural, psychological, and mythic.\*

*Historical criticism* holds as its basic principle that no work of literature can be critically regarded as if it were complete in itself; that is, each work must be examined in its entire context, in the whole range of available information related to it: the author's life and career, his literary sources and the influences of other writers, the age or culture in which the work was written, and the place of the work in a literary tradition, convention, or genre. *Formalistic criticism* (formalism or the "new criticism"), on the other hand, maintains that every work of literature contains within itself all that is necessary for complete understanding and appreciation and must be regarded without reference to extra-literary values or information outside the particular work. Formalistic criticism, consequently, relies heavily upon close textual analysis (*explication de texte*) for interpretation and judgment. Believing that the nature of the literary work itself must not be confused with its origins or effects, the formalistic critic indicts historical criticism with both the "intentional fallacy"—the error of judging the meaning of a literary work by the author's expressed or presumed intention in writing it—and the "affective fallacy"—the error of judging a literary work in terms of its results, particularly its emotional effect. *Sociocultural criticism* is related in some basic ways to the historical, but the central concern of the sociocultural critic involves both the literary work's social, economic, and political significances and its moral and cultural significances. The sociocultural critic holds the view that every work of literature reflects the interplay of a variety of social and cultural factors, that the form and technique of a work of literature are no more important than its ideas, and that enduring literary works are in the deepest sense

\* Sheldon Norman Grebstein, *Perspectives in Contemporary Criticism* (New York, 1968).

moral, for they are involved with, and evaluate responses to, life. *Psychological criticism*, of all critical approaches, relies most upon a science or a scientific discipline—psychoanalysis/depth psychology and the development of Freudian thought and principles. The psychological critic studies a literary work as a projection of the personality of its author, demonstrates the relationship between that personality and subject matter, style, and character; or he delineates literary symbolism in terms of the Freudian view of the primacy of sex as a motivating factor in human behavior and the symbolic content of most human acts. *Mythic*, or “*archetypal*,” *criticism* draws its materials from a variety of areas of knowledge—cultural anthropology, psychology, history, and philosophy among others. The purpose of the mythic critic is to demonstrate the relationship between ritual, myth, dream, and literature and to uncover the archetypal patterns in a literary work. The mythic critic views literature as the recurrent manifestation of archetypes: characters, images, symbols, scenes, and plots. The term *archetype* derives from Carl Jung, a disciple of Freud, and is used to describe a primordial image, shaped by the repeated experience of our ancestors, which is a part of the collective unconscious of the race of man. Great works of literature, in this view, gather their materials from the collective unconscious and combine individual experience with racial-archetypal experience.

These types of criticism are not mutually exclusive and this brief discussion of them only indicative of the variety of methods employed by critics in approaching a work of literature. Basic approaches are reflected in the abstracts accompanying the stories collected here, and the student is encouraged to make use of them first for their particular insights and illuminations, for their aid in developing and refining his own critical faculties, and, ultimately, as touchstones for deeper individual appreciation of the fiction itself.

James K. Bowen  
Richard VanDerBeets

# *Contents*

*Introduction, xix*

## PART ONE

### *Readings and Abstracts of Criticism*

WASHINGTON IRVING

*Rip Van Winkle*

3

ABSTRACTS: *Fallen from Time: The Mythic Rip Van Winkle*, 18 *"Rip Van Winkle": A Psychoanalytic Note on the Story and Its Author*, 19 *Rip, Ichabod, and the American Imagination*, 21 *Paul Bunyan and Rip Van Winkle*, 22

EDGAR ALLAN POE

*Ligeia*

24

ABSTRACTS: *The Interpretation of "Ligeia"*, 37 Poe's "Ligeia": An Analysis, 38 Poe's "Ligeia": Dream and Destruction, 39 "Ligeia": A Plea for Literalism, 40

NATHANIEL HAWTHORNE

*My Kinsman, Major Molineux*

42

ABSTRACTS: "My Kinsman, Major Molineux": An Interpretation, 58 Hawthorne's "My Kinsman, Major Molineux": History as Moral Adventure, 60 The Image of the Father: A Reading of "My Kinsman, Major Molineux" and "I Want to Know Why", 61 Allegory and "My Kinsman, Major Molineux", 62

HERMAN MELVILLE

*Bartleby the Scrivener*

64

ABSTRACTS: Melville's *Parable of the Wall*, 94 Melville's *Bartleby* as a Psychological Double, 95 Melville's "Bartleby" and the Absurd, 96 Meaning and Structure in "Bartleby", 97

MARK TWAIN

*The Notorious Jumping Frog of  
Calaveras County*

99

ABSTRACTS: *The Art and Satire of Twain's "Jumping Frog" Story*, 105 The "Jumping Frog" as a Comedian's First Virtue, 106 Mark Twain's Use of California Folklore in His *Jumping Frog Story*, 108 "My Voice is Still for Setchell": A Background Study of "Jim Smiley and His *Jumping Frog*", 109

HENRY JAMES

*The Real Thing*

111

ABSTRACTS: Henry James: "The Real Thing": An Attempt at Interpretation, 132 "The Real Thing", 133 Henry James and "The Real Thing", 134 James's "The Real Thing": Three Levels of Meaning, 135

STEPHEN CRANE

*The Blue Hotel*

137

ABSTRACTS: The Two Worlds of "The Blue Hotel", 161 Pity and Fear in "The Blue Hotel", 162 Character as Structure: Ironic Parallel and Transformation in "The Blue Hotel", 164 Stephen Crane: Tragedian or Comedian: "The Blue Hotel", 165

JACK LONDON

*To Build a Fire*

166

ABSTRACTS: The Theme of Jack London's "To Build a Fire", 180 London's Code of the Northland, 181 The Romantic in Jack London: Far Away Frozen Wilderness, 182 The Symbolic Wilderness: James Fenimore Cooper and Jack London, 183

AMBROSE BIERCE

*An Occurrence at Owl Creek Bridge*

185

ABSTRACTS: Ambrose Bierce: An Appraisal, 193 The Bitterness of Battle: Ambrose Bierce's War Fiction, 194 Bierce's Turn of the Screw: Tales of Ironical Terror, 195 Ambrose Bierce and Realism, 197

SHERWOOD ANDERSON

*Death in the Woods*

199

ABSTRACTS: *The Man, the Boy, and the Myth: Sherwood Anderson's "Death in the Woods"*, 210 "*Death in the Woods*" and the Artist's Self in Sherwood Anderson, 211 Some Artistic Dimensions of Sherwood Anderson's "*Death in the Woods*", 212 "*Death in the Woods*": Sherwood Anderson's "*Cold Pastoral*", 213

ERNEST HEMINGWAY

*The Killers*

215

ABSTRACTS: *Hemingway and His Heroes*, 224 *Time and the Contagion of Flight* in "*The Killers*", 225 The Protagonist of Hemingway's "*The Killers*", 226 Some Questions About Hemingway's "*The Killers*", 227

WILLIAM FAULKNER

*A Rose for Emily*

229

ABSTRACTS: *Faulkner's "A Rose for Emily": The Corpse*, 237 *Faulkner's "A Rose for Emily": The Theme*, 239 The Chronology of "*A Rose for Emily*", 240 William Faulkner's Style, 241

KATHERINE ANNE PORTER

*Flowering Judas*

243

ABSTRACTS: *Laura and the Unlit Lamp*, 254 Katherine Anne Porter: Symbol and Theme in "*Flowering Judas*", 255 Loss of Innocence in "*Flowering Judas*", 256 Katherine Anne Porter: Psychology as Art, 257



LANGSTON HUGHES

*Ways and Means*

259

ABSTRACTS: *Jesse B. Semple: Negro American*, 264 *Recreation and Reflection: "Simple Speaks His Mind"*, 265 *A Word About Simple*, 266 *Love, Life, and Negro Soul*, 267

FLANNERY O'CONNOR

*A Good Man Is Hard to Find*

269

ABSTRACTS: *Advertisements for Grace: Flannery O'Connor's "A Good Man Is Hard to Find"*, 283 *The Functional Gothic in Flannery O'Connor*, 284 *The Grotesque in Flannery O'Connor*, 285 *The Moment of Grace in the Fiction of Flannery O'Connor*, 286

BERNARD MALAMUD

*The Magic Barrel*

288

ABSTRACTS: *Style and Humanity in Malamud's Fiction*, 303 *Bernard Malamud's Comic Vision and the Theme of Identity*, 304 *Bernard Malamud and the Jewish Literary Tradition*, 306 *The New Nihilism and the Novel*, 307

JOHN UPDIKE

A & P

308

ABSTRACTS: *John Updike's Fiction*, 314 *John Updike: Style in Search of a Center*, 315 *The Doubt and Faith of John Updike*, 316 *John Updike: Theme and Form in the Garden of Epiphanies*, 318

Contents xv