

HONG KONG CASES

1985

Volume 1

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Butterworths Asia

Hong Kong • Singapore • Kuala Lumpur

The Butterworth Group of Companies

Singapore	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA 10 Anson Road #32-01 International Plaza, Singapore 0207
Hong Kong	BUTTERWORTHS ASIA (HONG KONG) 19/F Eight Commercial Tower 8 Sun Yip Street, Chai Wan, Hong Kong Tel: 29651400 Fax: 29760840
Malaysia	MALAYAN LAW JOURNAL SDN BHD Suite 1001/02 10th Floor Wisma Hamzah Kwong Hing No 1 Leboh Ampang 50100 Kuala Lumpur
Australia	BUTTERWORTHS Sydney, Melbourne, Brisbane, Adelaide, Perth, Canberra
Canada	BUTTERWORTHS CANADA LTD Toronto and Vancouver
Ireland	BUTTERWORTH (IRELAND) LTD Dublin
New Zealand	BUTTERWORTHS OF NEW ZEALAND LTD Wellington and Auckland
Puerto Rico	BUTTERWORTH OF PUERTO RICO, INC San Juan
UK	BUTTERWORTH & Co (PUBLISHERS) LTD London and Edinburgh
USA	BUTTERWORTH LEGAL PUBLISHERS Salem, New Hampshire and Carlsbad, California
Butterworths Asia is a division of Reed Elsevier (Singapore) Pte Ltd.	

© Butterworths Asia, 1995

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any material form or by any means, including photocopying and recording, or storing in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Such written permission must also be obtained before any part of this publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

ISSN 0218-7809

Typeset by Butterworths Asia and Corporate Press (HK) Ltd
Produced by Mandarin Offset Ltd
Printed and bound in Hong Kong

General Editor

Gerard McCoy, Barrister

Associate Editors

Grenville Cross QC

Peter Garland QC

Ruy Barretto, Barrister

Michael Ozorio, Barrister

Mohan Bharwaney, Barrister

Susan Kwan, Barrister

Malcolm Merry, Barrister

Aarif Barma, Barrister

Andrew Cheung, Barrister

Peter Ng, Barrister

Joseph Fok, Barrister

Anderson Chow, Barrister

Teresa Cheng, Barrister

David Fitzpatrick, Barrister

Patrick WS Cheung, Barrister

Andrew Byrnes, Hong Kong University

Johannes Chan, Hong Kong University

Reporters in this volume

Charles P Chiu, Barrister

Danny Choi, Barrister

TC Chong, Barrister

Lindy Course, Barrister

Michael T Darwyne, Barrister

Victor T Gidwani, Barrister

Godfrey Lam, Barrister

Julia Lau, Barrister

Rebecca MK Lee, Barrister

Raymond Leung, Barrister

PY Lo, Barrister

Herman LH Poon, Barrister

Alison Mary Thompson, Barrister

Jennifer Tsang, Barrister

Raymond Tsui Wai Nam, Barrister

Dominic Yeung, Barrister

Hareed Zafrullah, City University

Anthony P Kinnear

Angela Ho

Butterworths Asia

Managing Editor: Anthony P Kinnear

Deputy Managing Editor: Zarinah Marican

Legal Editor: Angela Ho

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The publishers are grateful to and acknowledge the significant contribution and support of the Hong Kong Superior Court Judgments Database project, directed by the four members of the Faculty of Law, whose names are mentioned below. The judgments database project (1989–1994) was funded primarily by the University of Hong Kong's Conference and Research Grants Committee with assistance from the Department of Professional Legal Education, at the Faculty of Law. The Faculty members responsible for the project are (in alphabetical order) Andrew Byrnes, Lecturer, Department of Law; Rick Glofcheski, Lecturer, Department of Law; Gary N Heilbronn, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education; and Sarah Nield, Senior Lecturer, Department of Professional Legal Education (until 1992). The project administrator is James Garritty, Research Officer, Faculty of Law.

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

List of abbreviations used in this volume (excluding reports):

A	High Court Action
ACJ	Acting Chief Justice
A-G	Attorney General
AR	Application for Review
Adm	Admiralty Action
App	Appendix
art	article
Aust	Australia
CA	Court of Appeal
CA	Civil Appeal Number in references to unreported cases (eg CA 2/92)
CC	High Court Criminal Case
CJ	Chief Justice
Cap	Chapter (as in Chapter Number of an Ordinance)
Crim App	Criminal Appeal
Comm L	Commercial List
Con L	Construction List
ch	chapter (as in chapter number of a book)
cl(l)	clause(s)
DC	District Court
DCA	District Court Action
DJ	District Court Divorce Jurisdiction
DJ	District Judge
DPP	Director of Public Prosecutions
EC	European Communities
ECC	Economic Compensation Case
ECHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities
EEC	European Economic Communities
Ed	Edition
Ex Ch	Court of Exchequer Chamber
exh	exhibit
fn	footnote
HC	High Court
HL	House of Lords
J(J)	Justice(s)
J(J)A	Justice(s) of Appeal
LT(A)	Labour Tribunal (Appeal)
LC	Lord Chancellor
Ld T(A)	Lands Tribunal (Appeal)
MA	Magistracy Appeal
MP	Miscellaneous Proceedings
MR	Master of the Rolls
n	note
NSW	New South Wales
O	Order (of the Rules of the Supreme Court)
PC	Privy Council

Abbreviations

PRC	People's Republic of China
PCA	Privy Council Appeal
Pt	Part
para(s)	paragraph(s)
RSC	Rules of the Supreme Court
r(r)	rule(s)
reg(s)	regulation(s)
s(s)	section(s)
sub-s(s)	subsection(s)
Sch	Schedule
UN	United Nations
Uncitral	United Nations Commission on International Trade Law
VP(P)	Vice-President(s)
WCC	Workers' Compensation Case

List of abbreviations of law reports:

AC	Law Reports, Appeal Cases (HL and PC); since 1890
Ad & E	Adolphus & Ellis, 12 volumes; 1834–1840
AIR	All Indian Reporter
All ER	All England Law Reports; since 1936
All ER Rep	All England Law Reports Reprint
ALR	Australian Law Reports
App Cas	Law Reports, Appeal Cases, House of Lords, 15 volumes; 1875–1890
Beav	Beavan's Reports, Rolls Court, 36 volumes; 1838–1866
C & K	Carrington & Kirwan, 3 volumes; 1843–1853
CCC	Cox's Criminal Cases, 31 volumes; 1843–1941
Ch	Law Reports, Chancery Division; since 1890
Ch D	Law Reports, Chancery Division, 45 volumes; 1875–1890
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports; since 1903
Cr App R	Criminal Appeal Reports (HL and CA(UK)); since 1908
Crim LR	Criminal Law Review; since 1954
EG	Estates Gazette; since 1858
FSR	Fleet Street Patent Law Reports, since 1963
HKC	Hong Kong Cases
HKDCLR	Hong Kong District Court Law Reports
HKLR	Hong Kong Law Reports
HL Cas	House of Lords Cases, 11 volumes; 1847–1866
IR	Irish Reports; since 1838
IRLR	Industrial Relations Law Reports; since 1972
KB	King's Bench
LJ	Law Journal Reports, New Series, 118 volumes; 1831–1949
LR A & E	Admiralty and Ecclesiastical cases, 4 volumes; 1865–

Hong Kong Cases

	1875
LR Eq	Equity cases, 20 volumes; 1866–1875
LR Ex	Exchequer Cases; 10 volumes; 1865–1875
LR QB	Queen’s Bench; 10 volumes; 1865–1875
Lloyd LR	Lloyd’s List Law Reports; 1919–1950
Lloyd’s Rep	Lloyd’s List Law Reports; since 1951
M & W	Meeson & Welsby, 16 volumes; 1836–1847
Manson	Manson; 1894–1914
MLJ	Malayan Law Journal
NI	Northern Ireland Law Reports; since 1925
NSWLR	New South Wales Law Reports; since 1971
NYS	New York State Reports
NZLR	New Zealand Law Reports; since 1883
QB	Law Reports, Queen’s Bench Division; 1891–1900, and since 1952
QB	Queen’s Bench Reports (Adolphus and Ellis, New Series), 18 volumes; 1841–1852
QBD	Law Reports, Queen’s Bench Division; 1875–1890
RTR	Road Traffic Reports; since 1970
SASR	South Australian State Reports; since 1921
SC (HL)	Sessions Cases (House of Lords)
TLR	The Times Law Reports, 71 volumes; 1884–1950
	The Times Law Reports; since 1951
WIR	West Indian Reports ; since 1959
WLR	Weekly Law Reports; since 1953
WN	Weekly Notes (Reports); 1866–1952
WN(NSW)	Weekly Notes, New South Wales; since 1884
WR	Weekly Reporter; 1853–1906

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

The mode of citation of cases reported in this volume of *Hong Kong Cases* is [1985] 1 HKC (page).

	Page		Page
A			
Acada Developments Co Ltd v EpcO Industrie-Ausruestungen GMBH	[CA] 465	Chan Cheuk Hing; Attorney General & Anor v	[CA] 499
Aik San Realty Ltd; The Bank of Tokyo Ltd v	[HC] 380	Chan Chun Chung; R v	[HC] 158
American International Assurance Co Ltd; Hang Seng Goldsmith Co (a firm) v	[HC] 146	Chan Kam Sam; R v	[CA] 396
Atari International (HK) Ltd & Anor; United Technology Products Co Ltd v	[HC] 33	Chan Tung Hoi; R v	[CA] 544
Athenian Zoe, The (No 1)	[HC] 362	Chan Wai Man (formerly t/a Shanghai Night Club) v Kong Wing Fung & Ors	[HC] 411
Athenian Zoe, The (No 2)	[HC] 367	Chan Yam Fai & Anor; R v ...	[HC] 108
Attorney General & Anor v Chan Cheuk Hing	[CA] 499	Chan Yam Yick; R v	[CA] 291
Attorney General v B Paterson- Todd Esq.	[HC] 416	Chang Din Hung & Anor; Ho Chung Yen, executor of the estate of Madam Wong Yuet Wan, deceased v	[DC] 628
Attorney General v Chiu Kwok Chun Stephen	[CA] 199	Chau Kau v Sanfield Building Contractors Ltd	[CA] 419
Attorney General v Fung Chung Ping & Anor	[CA] 429	Cheng Ah Hung Bernard v Chintung Commodities Ltd ..	[CA] 318
Attorney General v Helena Restaurant (1981) Ltd	[HC] 491	Cheng Ah Hung Bernard; Chintung Commodities Ltd v	[HC] 313
Attorney General v Ho Chun Chau	[CA] 40	Cheng Pak Hoi; R v	[HC] 472
Attorney General v Lam Yick Kwan & Ors	[HC] 208	Cheng Sung Hin; R v	[HC] 331
Attorney General v Tam Kin Hung	[CA] 606	Cheung Donald Quintin v Wang Teh Huei & Ors	[HC] 403
Attorney General v Yung Yuk	[HC] 521	Cheung Yiu Man; R v	[HC] 482
Attorney General; Chung Lai Yung Anna v	[CA] 559	Chintung Commodities Ltd v Cheng Ah Hung Bernard	[HC] 313
Axona International Credit and Commerce Ltd (in liq) v PT Susukan Agung & Ors	[HC] 452	Chintung Commodities Ltd; Cheng Ah Hung Bernard v ..	[CA] 318
B		Chiu Kwok Chun Stephen; Attorney General v	[CA] 199
B Paterson-Todd Esq; Attorney General v	[HC] 416	Chow Kum Wing; Lam Wing Ching & Ors v	[CA] 189
Bank of Tokyo Ltd, The v Aik San Realty Ltd	[HC] 380	Chu Mei Kam; Maidstone Investment Ltd v	[DC] 475
C		Chung Lai Yung Anna v Attorney General	[CA] 559
CC Orient, The	[HC] 115	Chung Shi Shun; R v	[CA] 50
		Cic-Union Europeenne Inter- national Et Cie v Wing Sun & Co (a firm) & Anor	[HC] 568
		Comr of Inland Revenue; Wong Wing Bui (t/a Tai Yip Glass Co) v	[HC] 433

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
D		Ho Chung Yen, executor of the estate of Madam Wong Yuet Wan, deceased v Chang Din Hung & Anor [DC]	628
Dickson Watch & Jewellery Co Ltd v Mow Tai Insurance & Reinsurance Co Ltd [HC]	505	Ho Kwai Yeung; R v [HC]	180
E		Ho Wei Yiu & Anor; Ho Yiu Chuen Fong v [CA]	334
Epco Industrie-Ausruestungen GMBH; Acada Developments Co Ltd v [CA]	465	Ho Yiu Chuen Fong v Ho Wei Yiu & Anor [CA]	334
Euro Treasure Ltd; Kao, Lee & Yip v [CA]	46	Hor Wai Ming & Anor; R v ... [CA]	30
F		Hung Hing Tong; R v [HC]	172
Fabrique Ebel Societe Anonyme v MBO Far East (HK) Ltd [HC]	166	Hwang Yiou Kwa Victor & Anor v Morgan Guaranty Trust Co of New York [CA]	294
Format Ltd v Urban Council .. [HC]	609	I	
Fung Chung Ping & Anor; Attorney General v [CA]	429	Ip Siu Man; R v [CA]	122
Fung Sik Chung; R v [HC]	194	J	
G		Jaguar Shipping Corp Ltd; Uni- Ocean Lines Private Ltd v ... [HC]	25
Glory Garment Factory, Re [CA]	154	Jardine Engineering Corp Ltd v Wharf Properties Ltd [CA]	135
GTE Directories (HK) Ltd v Mo Yung Kwok Wah (t/a Sun Hing Co) [DC]	485	K	
Guangdong Water Conservancy and Hydro Power Engineering Development Co Ltd v The Ming An Insurance Co (Hong Kong) Ltd [HC]	177	Kam Tin Po; R v [CA]	281
H		Kao, Lee & Yip v Euro Treasure Ltd [CA]	46
Hang Lung Bank Ltd v World- Wide Properties Corp Ltd [HC]	444	Kit Wing Wo; R v [HC]	204
Hang Seng Goldsmith Co (a firm) v American International Assurance Co Ltd [HC]	146	Kong Wing Fung & Ors; Chan Wai Man (formerly t/a Shanghai Night Club) v [HC]	411
Helena Restaurant (1981) Ltd; Attorney General v [HC]	491	Kowloon Motor Bus Co (1933) Ltd & Anor v Wu Kam Wing [CA]	539
Hemandas, Re, ex p Bank of Credit and Commerce (Hong Kong) Ltd [HC]	387	Kwangtung Provincial Bank v Tang Chik Leung [CA]	93
Ho Chi Fai & Ors; R v [HC]	242	Kwok Chi Leung; R v [CA]	603
Ho Chun Chau; Attorney General v [CA]	40	L	
		Lai Foon Yung v Tin Sum Valley Public Primary School [HC]	372
		Lam Ching Yee & Anor v Lam Man Kwong & Anor [HC]	56
		Lam Hing Nam & Ors; R v ... [CA]	376

Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Lam Kin Yiu & Ors; R v [HC]	232	Ming An Insurance Co (Hong Kong) Ltd, The; Guangdong Water Conservancy and Hydro Power Engineering Development Co Ltd v [HC]	177
Lam Man Kwong & Anor; Lam Ching Yee & Anor v [HC]	56	Mo Yung Kwok Wah (t/a Sun Hing Co); GTE Directories (HK) Ltd v [DC]	485
Lam Po & Anor; Tang Siu Kit (an infant) v [HC]	391	Morgan Guaranty Trust Co of New York; Hwang Yiou Kwa Victor & Anor v [CA]	294
Lam Shing Chow; R v [HC]	162	Mow Tai Insurance & Reinsurance Co Ltd; Dickson Watch & Jewellery Co Ltd v [HC]	505
Lam Siu Hung; R v [HC]	359	N	
Lam Wing Ching & Ors v Chow Kum Wing [CA]	189	Ng Cho Shing, Re, ex p The Far East Bank Ltd [HC]	309
Lam Yick Kwan & Ors; Attorney General v [HC]	208	Ng Chung Sang; R v [HC]	311
Lee Yi Choi; R v [CA]	578	Ng Yee May; Sin Hua Trust, Savings & Commercial Bank Ltd v [CA]	1
Leung Kim Hung; R v [HC]	84	P	
Leung Mun Lam; R v [CA]	535	Peter Leung Construction Co Ltd v Tai Poon Co Ltd ... [CA]	285
Li Kin Wai & Anor; R v [HC]	249	Poon Wah Sang & Ors; R v ... [HC]	556
Like Soon Co Ltd v Tsai Kui Kan & Ors [HC]	619	Provident Centre Development Ltd; Woomera Co Ltd & Anor v [CA]	257
Lo Brothers Ltd v Mak Kwan Ting [CA]	427	PT Susukan Agung & Ors; Axona International Credit and Commerce Ltd (in liq) v [HC]	452
Lo Hon Yiu Henry; R v [HC]	183	R	
Lo Ka Chun v Lo To & Anor. [CA]	527	R v Chan Chun Chung [HC]	158
Lo To & Anor; Lo Ka Chun v [CA]	527	R v Chan Kam Sam [CA]	396
Lo Yau Wai; R v [CA]	150	R v Chan Tung Hoi [CA]	544
Lo Yung Kan; R v [CA]	302	R v Chan Yam Fai & Anor [HC]	108
Lui Po Keung v Tam Kwok Hung [HC]	224	R v Chan Yam Yick [CA]	291
M		R v Cheng Pak Hoi [HC]	472
Ma Shing & Anor; R v [CA]	561	R v Cheng Sung Hin [HC]	331
Maidstone Investment Ltd v Chu Mei Kam [DC]	475	R v Cheung Yiu Man [HC]	482
Mak Kwan Ting; Lo Brothers Ltd v [CA]	427	R v Chung Shi Shun [CA]	50
Man Lim Ping; R v [CA]	61	R v Fung Sik Chung [HC]	194
MBO Far East (HK) Ltd; Fabrique Ebel Societe Anonyme v [HC]	166	R v Ho Chi Fai & Ors [HC]	242
Miller v Miller [HC]	595		
Millie's Shoes Factory Ltd & Ors (in liq) (No 1), Re [HC]	548		
Millie's Shoes Factory Ltd & Ors (in liq) & Ors (No 2), Re [HC]	552		

Hong Kong Cases

	Page		Page
R v Ho Kwai Yeung [HC]	180	Sino-British (HK) Ltd; Taxation & Financial Services Ltd & Anor v [DC]	227
R v Hor Wai Ming & Anor [CA]	30	Sizto Yuk Hing; R v [HC]	138
R v Hung Hing Tong [HC]	172	Sun Hung Kai Credit Ltd v Szeto Yuk Mei & Ors [DC]	345
R v Ip Siu Man [CA]	122	Syed Ahmad Noh; R v [HC]	424
R v Kam Tin Po [CA]	281	Szeto Yuk Mei & Ors; Sun Hung Kai Credit Ltd v [DC]	345
R v Kit Wing Wo [HC]	204		
R v Kwok Chi Leung [CA]	603	T	
R v Lam Hing Nam & Ors [CA]	376	Tai Poon Co Ltd; Peter Leung Construction Co Ltd v [CA]	285
R v Lam Kin Yiu & Ors [HC]	232	Tam Kin Hung; Attorney General v [CA]	606
R v Lam Shing Chow [HC]	162	Tam Kwok Hung; Lui Po Keung v [HC]	224
R v Lam Siu Hung [HC]	359	Tang Chik Leung; Kwangtung Provincial Bank v [CA]	93
R v Lee Yi Choi [CA]	578	Tang Siu Kit (an infant) v Lam Po & Anor [HC]	391
R v Leung Kim Hung [HC]	84	Taxation & Financial Services Ltd & Anor v Sino-British (HK) Ltd [DC]	227
R v Leung Mun Lam [CA]	535	Thiam Joc (HK) Ltd & Ors v Sanday Investment Ltd [CA]	298
R v Li Kin Wai & Anor [HC]	249	Tin Sum Valley Public Primary School; Lai Foon Yung v [HC]	372
R v Lo Hon Yiu Henry [HC]	183	To Kin Wah & Anor v Shui Hing Co Ltd [HC]	239
R v Lo Yau Wai [CA]	150	Tsai Kui Kan & Ors; Like Soon Co Ltd v [HC]	619
R v Lo Yung Kan [CA]	302	Tsang Koon Ah; R v [HC]	5
R v Ma Shing & Anor [CA]	561	Tse Hung Lit & Anor; R v [CA]	216
R v Man Lim Ping [CA]	61	Tung Koon Ming; R v [HC]	4
R v Ng Chung Sang [HC]	311		
R v Poon Wah Sang & Ors [HC]	556	U	
R v Sizto Yuk Hing [HC]	138	Uni-Ocean Lines Private Ltd v Jaguar Shipping Corp Ltd . [HC]	25
R v Syed Ahmad Noh [HC]	424	United Technology Prodcuts Co Ltd v Atari International (HK) Ltd & Anor [HC]	33
R v Tsang Koon Ah [HC]	5	Urban Council; Format Ltd v . [HC]	609
R v Tse Hung Lit & Anor [CA]	216		
R v Tung Koon Ming [HC]	4	W	
R v Wong Chi Yung & Ors [CA]	436	Wang Teh Huei & Ors; Cheung Donald Quinton v ... [HC]	403
R v Wong Chung Ming [CA]	625		
R v Yeu Chui Fook [HC]	462		
R v Zee Kim Hung [CA]	615		
S			
Sanday Investment Ltd; Thiam Joc (HK) Ltd & Ors v [CA]	298		
Sanfield Building Contractors Ltd; Chau Kau v [CA]	419		
Shui Hing Co Ltd; To Kin Wah & Anor v [HC]	239		
Sin Hua Trust, Savings & Commercial Bank Ltd v Ng Yee May [CA]	1		

Table of Cases Reported

	Page		Page
Wharf Properties Ltd; Jardine Engineering Corp Ltd v [CA]	135	Woomera Co Ltd & Anor v Provident Centre Development Ltd [CA]	257
Whitehall Finance Ltd v Win and Fair Securities Co Ltd ... [CA]	68	World-Wide Properties Corp Ltd; Hang Lung Bank Ltd v . [HC]	444
Win and Fair Securities Co Ltd; Whitehall Finance Ltd v [CA]	68	Wu Kam Wing; Kowloon Motor Bus Co (1933) Ltd & Anor v [CA]	539
Wing Sun & Co (a firm) & Anor ; Cic-Union Europeenne International Et Cie v [HC]	568	Y	
Wong Chi Yung & Ors; R v ... [CA]	436	Yeu Chui Fook; R v [HC]	462
Wong Chung Ming; R v [CA]	625	Yung Yuk; Attorney General v [HC]	521
Wong Wing Biu (t/a Tai Yip Glass Co) v Comr of Inland Revenue [HC]	433	Z	
		Zee Kim Hung; R v [CA]	615

SUBJECT INDEX

AGENCY

Power of attorney

Execution – Illiterate grantor – Two witnesses only required where grantor physically unable to sign – Powers of Attorney Ordinance (Cap 31) s 2(2)
R v Tsang Koon Ah [HC] 5

ARBITRATION

Application for stay of action

Alleged admission made after expiry of contractual limitation period – Whether time bar avoided – Whether waiver or estoppel – Whether prejudice established – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 6A
Uni-Ocean Lines Private Ltd v Jaguar Shipping Corp Ltd [HC] 25

Arbitration clause

Stay of action – Whether there was dispute between the parties at the time writ was issued – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 6
Peter Leung Construction Co Ltd v Tai Poon Co Ltd [CA] 285

Scott v Avery clause

Whether clause was a condition precedent – Whether court had discretion to stay proceedings – Arbitration Ordinance (Cap 341) s 6
Guangdong Water Conservancy and Hydro Power Engineering Development Co Ltd v The Ming An Insurance (Hong Kong) Ltd [HC] 177

BANKING AND FINANCE

Deposit taking company

Deposit taking company ceased to be creditworthy – Whether a breach of contract – Whether failure of consideration
Axona International Credit and Commerce Ltd (in liq) v PT Susukan Agung & Ors [HC] 452

Loans made in excess of statutory limit – Whether loans recoverable – Calculation of reserves – Effect of mortgage of property on calculation – Whether general loan agreement a contract of loan – Deposit-taking Companies Ordinance (Cap 328) ss 22, 24
Whitehall Finance Ltd v Win and Fair Securities Co Ltd [CA] 68

Futures contract

Contract notes – Failure to comply with statutory requirements – Whether a prima facie defence of illegality – Commodities Trading Ordinance (Cap 250) s 45A
Chintung Commodities Ltd v Cheng Ah Hung Bernard [HC] 313

Whether illegal – Whether illegal secondary markets – Effect of deficient contract notes – Whether dealer unregistered – Whether inference that dealer remained accredited – Commodity Exchanges (Prohibition) Ordinance (Cap 82) ss 3, 4 – Commodities Trading Ordinance (Cap 250) ss 26, 45A
Cheng Ah Hung Bernard v Chintung Commodities Ltd [CA] 318

BANKRUPTCY

Petition for receiving order

· Amendment out of time – Incorrect dates – Whether defect one of substance or one of form

Re Ng Cho Shing, ex p The Far East Bank Ltd [HC] 309

Proof of act of bankruptcy

Affirmation filed pursuant to s 9(1) of Bankruptcy Ordinance – Whether such affirmation sufficient for the purpose of s 9(2) – Further evidence required in support at hearing of petition – Bankruptcy Ordinance (Cap 6) s 9(1), (2)

Re Glory Garment Factory [CA] 154

Receiving order

Defence of 15% provision – Burden of proof and evidence required in establishing the defence – Uncorroborated evidence of debtor unsatisfactory – Bankruptcy Ordinance (Cap 6) s 9(3)

Re Hemandas, ex p Bank of Credit and Commerce (Hong Kong) [HC] 387

BETTING, GAMBLING AND LOTTERIES

Bookmaking

Aiding and abetting in receiving bets – Assisting in bookmaking a separate offence – Whether liable to conviction under Gambling Ordinance (Cap 148) s 7(1)(a) – Gambling Ordinance (Cap 148) s 7(1)(a), (c)

R v Fung Sik Chung [HC] 194

Whether presumption in s 19 can be used in a s 7(1)(a) prosecution – Mere presence in premises insufficient – Prosecution failed to prove which offences under s 7(1)(a) or (c) the defendant had committed – Gambling Ordinance (Cap 148) ss 7(1)(a), (c), 19

R v Lam Kin Yiu & Ors [HC] 232

Gambling

Presumption of gambling – Whether defendant required to give evidence to rebut presumption – Gambling Ordinance (Cap 148) s 19

Attorney General v Lam Yick Kwan & Ors [HC] 208

Knowingly suffering premises to be used as a gambling establishment

Use of presumption in s 19 – Proof of knowledge – Gambling Ordinance (Cap 148) ss 15(1)(a), 19

R v Lam Kin Yiu & Ors [HC] 232

BILLS OF EXCHANGE AND OTHER NEGOTIABLE INSTRUMENTS

Consideration

Dishonoured cheque – Giving of receipts in return for cheque constituted valuable consideration – Whether consideration satisfied where a promisee suffers detriment at the promisor's request even though no benefit conferred on the promisor – Bills of Exchange Ordinance (Cap 19) s 27

Kao, Lee & Yip v Euro Treasure Ltd [CA] 46

Letter of Credit

Draft duly accepted – Bank had no knowledge of pledge under underlying contract – Whether pledgee could restrain bank from paying on the draft

Cic-Union Europeenne International Et Cie v Wing Sun & Co

(a firm) & Anor

[HC] 568

CIVIL PROCEDURE

Affidavit

Application to remove own solicitor's affidavit – Whether any justification for granting application

Axona International Credit and Commerce Ltd (in liq) v PT

Susukan Agung & Ors

[HC] 452

Appeal

Appeal against orders for unconditional leave to defend and stay of action – Whether there was a right of appeal under Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) s 14(3)(b)

Jardine Engineering Corp Ltd v Wharf Properties Ltd

[CA] 135

Charging orders on shares

Whether such orders should be discharged – Whether O 50 r 2 of Rules of Supreme Court ultra vires – Charging order a method of enforcing judgment creditor's right – Supreme Court Ordinance (Cap 4) s 54(1)(h), (i)

The Bank of Tokyo Ltd v Aik San Realty Ltd

[HC] 380

Committal

Imposition of condition for security for costs – Circumstances in which condition will be imposed – Whether ill-founded or oppressive – Rules of the Supreme Court O 52 r 2(7)

Fabrique Ebel Societe Anonyme v MBO Far East (HK) Ltd

[HC] 166

Non-compliance with rules – Leave not sought before commencing proceedings – Whether court could grant leave under O 2 r 1 – Test to be applied – Whether conduct of respondents constituted waiver – Rules of the Supreme Court O 2 r 1

Fabrique Ebel Societe Anonyme v MBO Far East (HK) Ltd

[HC] 166

Costs

Action transferred from High Court to District Court – Whether pre-transfer costs to be taxed on the High Court scale – District Court Ordinance (Cap 336) s 43(1)

Ho Chung Yen, executor of the estate of Madam Wong Yuet Wan, deceased v

Chang Din Hung & Anor

[DC] 628

Contractual entitlement to claim – Damages representing costs incurred on an indemnity basis – Whether permissible – 'Costs' and 'damages' distinguished – Principles to apply – Impermissible fetter on court's discretion to award costs

GTE Directories (HK) Ltd v Mo Yung Kwok Wah

[DC] 485

High Court action settled – Damages recovered below limit of jurisdiction of District Court – Whether to be taxed on High Court or District Court scale – District Court Ordinance (Cap 336) s 43(2)

Lui Po Keung v Tam Kwok Hung [HC] 224

Meaning of ‘all costs to follow the event’ – Final outcome of case – Rules of the Supreme Court O 62 r 3(3)

Like Soon Co Ltd v Tsai Kui Kan & Ors [HC] 619

District Court

Application to strike out defence – Omnibus traverse – Whether general denial a sufficient defence – Whether application should be made pursuant to r 27(1)(b) or r 38A of District Court Civil Procedure (General) Rules

Kwangtung Provincial Bank v Tang Chik Leung [CA] 93

Mareva injunction

Application for leave to administer interrogatories – Whether interrogatories necessary to make Mareva injunction effective – Ancillary orders not to be used for purpose of policing Mareva injunction

United Technology Products Co Ltd v Atari International Ltd [HC] 33

Maritime Law

Warrant for arrest of sister ship – Application to set aside arrest – Failure to comply with O 75 r 5(8)(b) of the Rules of Supreme Court – Whether defect produced a void which could not be filled – Technical irregularity curable under O 2 r 1

The Athenian Zoe (No 1) [HC] 362

Pleadings

Striking out statement of claim – Whether a much amended statement of claim that still revealed no cause of action should be struck out as an abuse of the court’s process – Undue influence – Late allegation not permitted without good reason for delay

Lo Ka Chun v Lo To & Anor [CA] 527

Request for further and better particulars

Copyright action – Whether sufficient assertion of fact – Publication not identified – Identity of supplier of publications a matter of evidence to which plaintiff not entitled

Format Ltd v Urban Council [HC] 609

Summary judgment

Conditional leave to defend – Financial condition impossible for defendant to fulfil

Hwang YJ Victor v Morgan Guaranty Trust Co of New York [CA] 294

COMPANIES AND CORPORATIONS

Accounts

Failure to lay accounts at general meeting – Whether all reasonable steps

taken – Delegation of duty by director – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 122
R v Lo Hon Yiu Henry [HC] 183

Auditor's remuneration

Whether amount charged reasonable in the absence of agreement – Whether court bound by time-cost formula – Whether company estopped from raising issue of reasonableness of fee after directors signed tax return showing auditor's fees – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) s 131(8)

Taxation & Financial Services Ltd v Sino-British (HK) Ltd [DC] 227

Directors

Delegation of duties – Duties may be delegated to employees but not to professional advisors

R v Lo Hon Yiu Henry [HC] 183

Winding up

Provisional liquidator's fees – Allegation of fraud by Official Receiver not particularized – Companies Ordinance (Cap 32) ss 255, 276 – Companies (Winding-up) Rules r 6

Re Millie's Shoes Factory Ltd & Ors (in liq) (No 1) [HC] 548

Provisional liquidators' fees – Meaning of adequate remuneration – Whether fees should be assessed on time-cost basis or percentage of realisation – Fees to be assessed after full and proper investigation by Taxing Master

Re Millie's shoes factory Ltd & Ors (in liq) & Ors (No 2) [HC] 552

Winding-up petition

Dispute as to ownership of shares the subject of related proceedings – Whether petition should be struck out or stayed pending outcome of proceedings – Relevant considerations

Cheung Donald Quintin v Wang Teh Hui & Ors [HC] 403

CONFLICT OF LAWS

Contract

Assignment of debt by Macau bank to Hong Kong bank – Whether Macau law applied – Proper law of the contract – Closest and most real connection – Whether assignment of debt a 'banking activity'

Hang Lung Bank Ltd v World-Wide Properties Corp Ltd [HC] 444

CONTRACT

Breach

Rectification – Allegation of prior agreement between the parties with which the written instrument did not accord necessary

Thiam Joc (HK) Ltd & Ors v Sanday Investment Ltd [CA] 298

Consideration

Hire purchase agreement Consideration for guarantee – Agreement to deliver vehicle to hirer

Sun Hung Kai Credit Ltd v Szeto Yuk Mei & Ors [DC] 345