

2011年 北京大学

美术学博士生国际学术论坛

论文集

丁宁 李凇 主编

陕西师范大学出版总社

20132

2011年 北京大学

美学博士生国际学术论坛

论文集



丁宁 李淞 主编

陕西师范大学出版总社有限公司

图书代号 ZH12N1088

图书在版编目(CIP)数据

2011年北京大学美术学博士生国际学术论坛论文集/  
丁宁, 李凇主编.——西安: 陕西师范大学出版总社有限  
公司, 2012.9

ISBN 978-7-5613-6550-2

I. ①2… II. ①丁… ②李… III. ①美术学—国际学  
术会议—文集 IV. ①J0-53

中国版本图书馆CIP数据核字(2012)第211763号

## 2011年北京大学美术学博士生国际学术论坛论文集

---

主 编 / 丁 宁 李 凇

责任编辑 / 田 丹 王 颖

封面设计 / 田 丹

出版发行 / 陕西师范大学出版总社有限公司

西安市长安南路199号 ( 邮政编码 710062 )

网 址 / <http://www.snupg.com>

印 刷 / 西安永琛快速印务有限责任公司

开 本 / 787mm × 1092mm 1/16

印 张 / 26.5

字 数 / 548千

版 次 / 2012年10月第1版

印 次 / 2012年10月第1次印刷

书 号 / ISBN 978-7-5613-6550-2

定 价 / 68.00元

---

读者购书、书店添货或发现印刷装订问题, 请与本社营销部联系、调换。

电话: (029) 85307864 85251046 ( 传真 )

# 目 录

## 一 中国美术史

图像和身份：四川东汉崖墓的案例研究 .....	(2)
陈轩（英国牛津大学）	
唐代关中十二生肖像研究 .....	(10)
焦琳（中央美术学院）	
吐蕃统治敦煌时期瑞像图中的于阗因素——以 231 窟、237 窟为中心院） .....	(26)
陈粟裕（中央美术学院）	
宋墓启门图初步探讨 .....	(43)
丁雨（北京大学）	
马远“三教图”的上下文 .....	(62)
褚国娟（北京大学）	
“孔子行教像”的图像来源与样式 .....	(74)
孔德平（中国艺术研究院）	
从隐逸神仙到全真祖师：吕洞宾图像的变化 .....	(85)
刘科（中央美术学院）	
《瀛山图》考辨 .....	(96)
张荣国（华东师范大学）	
明代中晚期江南地区《桃源图》题材绘画解读 .....	(118)
赵琰哲（中央美术学院）	

透过水陆仪轨看明代水陆画的“三教合流”现象 .....	(141)
-----------------------------	-------

熊雯（西安美术学院）

以杜为喻——王时敏《杜陵诗意图册》的一种解读 .....	(157)
------------------------------	-------

陈冠男（香港中文大学）

德藏《西厢记》卷首图考：莺莺像及其所佩玉环 .....	(171)
-----------------------------	-------

陈研（中国美术学院）

伞事三题——兼论伞盖之别 .....	(194)
--------------------	-------

展梦夏（清华大学）

明清玉圭研究 .....	(206)
--------------	-------

张丹丹（香港中文大学）

明清两卷《西湖十景》版画的比较 .....	(224)
-----------------------	-------

段晓林（华盛顿大学）

石涛=后印象派？——现代主义影响下二十世纪初中国绘画的演进 .....	(250)
-------------------------------------	-------

朱岩飞（俄亥俄州立大学）

政治意识形态对户县农民画的图像建构 .....	(270)
-------------------------	-------

王圣华（中国艺术研究院）

## 二 世界美术史

美国自然体验和十九世纪风景画 .....	(284)
----------------------	-------

孟宪平（北京大学）

四季更迭，晨昏交替——论四季图像与朝暮景致在十九世纪德国绘画中呈现方式的转变 与意义 .....	(301)
---	-------

顾素琿（台湾师范大学）

从世俗到神圣：狩野山雪《长恨歌》绘卷中杨贵妃形象研究 ..... (323)  
苏文惠（芝加哥大学）

Vajra'sṛṅkhalā 女神——波鸿 “Situation Kunst für Max Imdahl” 亚洲艺术陈列室收藏中一件个人化仪礼对象的身份确认 ..... (354)  
安德烈·比尔维什（德国柏林亚洲艺术博物馆、柏林洪堡大学）

跨学科的人文科学需要特殊的思考：如何为跨文化研究搭建适合的框架？ ..... (363)  
荷莲（海德堡大学）

保罗·西涅克与新印象主义 ..... (371)  
禾苗（北京大学）

三 美术史理论

作为影子的图像——贝尔廷《图像人类学》中的一个主题 ..... (380)  
邹建林（北京大学）

米歇尔《视觉转向》之后的艺术史 ..... (388)  
拉兹罗·迦托尼（匈牙利罗兰大学）

社会艺术史形成中的早期研究范式 ..... (407)  
刘向娟（上海大学）



# CONTENTS

## | Chinese Art History

Xuan Chen (University of Oxford) .....	( 2 )
Picture and Identity: A Case Study of Eastern Han Cliff Tombs in Sichuan	
Jiao Lin ( China Central Academy Of Fine Arts ) .....	( 10 )
Research on Chinese Zodiac Images of Tang Dynasty in Guanzhong Area	
Chen Suyu ( China Central Academy Of Fine Arts ).....	( 26 )
Khotan Elements of the Representations of Famous Images in Dunhuang of Tibet Period: Focus on Cave 231 and 237	
Ding Yu ( Peking University ) .....	( 43 )
A Brief Discussion of the Theme of “Opening Gate” in the Tombs’ Frescos of Song Dynasty	
Chu Guanjuan ( Peking University ) .....	( 62 )
The Context on Ma Yuan’s Painting of Three Religions	
Kong Deping ( Chinese National Academy of Arts ).....	( 74 )
The Image Source and Patterns of Confucius Xingjiao Portrait	
Liu Ke ( China Central Academy Of Fine Arts ) .....	( 85 )
From Immortal Hermit to the Patriarch of Quanzhen: Changes of Lü Dongbin’s Images	
Zhang Rongguo ( East China Normal University ) .....	( 96 )
Textual Research on the “Sea and Mountain Picture”	

Zhao Yanzhe ( China Central Academy Of Fine Arts ) .....	( 118 )
The Painting Productions for the Subject Matter of the Peach Blossom Spring in Jiangnan during Medium-term and Terminal-term of the Ming Dynasty	
Xiong Wen ( Xi' an Academy Of Fine Arts ) .....	( 141 )
Study of the Three-Religion Concourse Phenomena Embodied in Paintings for Water-and-Land Services in Ming Dynasty Through the Ways that Water-and-Land Ritual Procedure Described	
Phil Kwun Nam Chan ( The Chinese University of Hong Kong ) .....	( 157 )
Du Fu' s Poem as An Analogy: An Interpretation of Wang Shimin' s Album on Du Fu' s Poems	
Chen Yan ( China Academy of Art ) .....	( 171 )
The History of the Portraits of Cui Ying-ying in Woodcuts	
Zhan Mengxia ( Tsinghua University ) .....	( 194 )
Three Issues about Umbrella——Also on the Differences between Umbrella and Canopy	
Zhang Dandan ( The Chinese University of HongKong ) .....	( 206 )
The Jade Gui in Ming and Qing Dynasty	
Duan Xiaolin ( University of Washington ) .....	( 224 )
A Comparative Study of Two Series of Printed Ten Scenes of West Lake	
Zhu Yanfei ( Ohio State University ) .....	( 250 )
Shitao=Post-Impressionist School ( ? ): Artistic and Intellectual Products of Modernism in Early Twentieth Century China	
Wang Sheng-hua ( Chinese National Academy of Arts ) .....	( 270 )
The Image Which Constructed by Political Ideology in Huxian peasant painting	

## II World Art Studies

Meng Xianping ( Peking University ) .....	( 284 )
---	---------



Picturing Wilderness: American Natural Experience and the 19th Century Landscape Painting	
Su-Hun GU ( National Taiwan Normal University ) .....	( 301 )
The Transition of the Images of the Seasons and of the Times of Day in the German Painting of the 19th Century	
Stephanie Su ( University of Chicago ) .....	( 323 )
From Secular to Sacred: The Image of Yang Guifei in Kano Sansetsu's Chōgonka Scrolls	
André Bierwisch ( Humboldt-University zu Berlin ) .....	( 354 )
The Goddess Vajraskhala - Identification of a Personified Ritual Object in the Asian Room of the Bochum Collection 'Situation Kunst für Max Imdahl'	
Beatrice Hoeller ( Ruprecht-Karls-Universitaet Heidelberg ) .....	( 363 )
Intercultural Humanities Require Specific Considerations: What Makes an Appropriate Framework for Intercultural Studies?	
He Miao ( Peking University ) .....	( 371 )
Paul Signac and Neo-Impressionism	

### III Art Theories

Zou Jianlin ( Peking University ) .....	( 380 )
Image as Shadow : Remarks on a Motif in Hans Belting's <i>Bild-Anthropologie</i>	
László Gárdonyi ( Eötvös Loránd Science University ) .....	( 388 )
Art History After Mitchell's Pictorial Turn	
Liu Xiangjuan ( Shanghai University ) .....	( 407 )
The Early Research Method in the Formation of Social History of Art	

# 一、中国美术史



## **Picture and Identity: A Case Study of Eastern Han Cliff Tombs in Sichuan**

University of Oxford, Xuan Chen

**Abstract:** The cliff tomb was one of the dominant tomb types in Eastern Han (AD 25-220) in Sichuan. According to the published cliff tombs by far, cliff tombs first appeared in Sichuan in the Wang Mang period (AD 8-25) and remained developing mainly in Sichuan. It is notable that since the Kingdom of Shu, which used to rule many areas of Sichuan, had been conquered by the Kingdom of Qin, the burial type in Sichuan followed the development of burial type in the eastern provinces in China, from the vertical shaft tomb, which was prevalent until late Western Han (206 BC- AD 8), to the horizontal brick or stone tomb except the cliff tomb. It seems that the cliff tombs appeared in Sichuan as a local invention.

The paper studies how cliff tombs in Sichuan related to the burial types in the eastern provinces in China through discussing the picture of the bird and the fish, which appeared frequently in the decorations of the cliff tombs with many diversifications while appeared only occasionally in the tomb decorations in the eastern provinces. The paper argues that the development and the spread of the picture of the bird and the fish is crucial to study how the residents in Eastern Han Sichuan built cliff tombs influenced by the pictorial stone and brick tombs popular in the eastern provinces while establishing their own local identity through incorporating their local tastes and beliefs.

Identity is a notion instrumental to understand the diversifications of the picture of the bird and the fish and its popularity in the cliff tombs in Eastern Han Sichuan. The use of the notion of identity is based on Richard Jenkins's work on social identity. Through interpreting the picture of the fish and the bird, the paper argues that the cliff tomb was a cultural product related to the local residents who were trying to build their identity through developing regional features of their tombs. When the local residents of Sichuan built their identities, they took consideration of both how they were defined by the mainstream culture in the eastern provinces and how they understood their own identity.

The stone carving of a bird holding a fish in the mouth is a popular decorating element

in the tomb decoration, especially in the decoration of the pictorial stone coffin in Sichuan in Eastern Han (AD 25-220) (Fig. 1 and 2). Such stone carvings can be found frequently on the wall-paintings in the cliff tombs in Sichuan and on the surface of the stone coffins which were placed in the cliff tombs or the brick tombs in Sichuan in Eastern Han. In contrast, in contemporary central and eastern China, such stone carvings can only be found occasionally on some of the wall decorations in some stone tombs. However, the stone carvings of a bird holding a fish in the mouth can be found frequently in some earlier stone shaft tombs dated from the early Western Han to the early Eastern Han in central and eastern China, especially in southwestern Shandong (Map 1). Though there were regional variations in the stone carvings of a bird holding a fish in the mouth throughout the period from the early Western Han to the late Eastern Han, the stone carvings of the bird and the fish seem to be an important element in the tomb decoration in Han China. This paper will consider this phenomenon together with the development of burial types in Han China, especially the development of the cliff tombs in Sichuan in Eastern Han.

The Han dynasty (206 BC-AD 220) was a time when burial types experienced a gradual change from vertical pit tombs to horizontal house-resembling tombs. ①The vertical pit tombs were usually in the form of wooden-panel boxes placed in the pits which were dug into the ground. Usually there were burial mounds on top of the vertical pits. The horizontal house-resembling tombs were usually built on the surface of the ground or lower ground in bricks or stones resembling houses. There were usually burial mounds on top of the horizontal tombs. The change took place in the early Western Han in the areas around Luoyang in Henan in central China and gradually expanded to the other areas in China later. In the Eastern Han, the horizontal house-resembling tombs became the most prevalent burial type in China.

The burial types discussed together with the stone carvings of the bird and the fish in this paper include the cliff tomb, the stone tomb and the stone shaft tomb. The stone shaft tomb is a kind of vertical pit tomb (Fig. 3). It mainly distributed in southwestern Shandong and northern Jiangsu over the period from the early Western Han to the early Eastern Han. Some scholars regard it as the early stage of the development of the stone tomb in eastern China. ②Like the vertical pit tomb in the form of a wooden-panel box, the stone shaft tomb is made of stone panels which form a stone shaft in the pit for containing the body and the

---

①For the development of the burial types in Han China see Huang 2003.

②See Yan and Liu 1995.

burial goods. Some stone shaft tombs have stone carvings of various figures and patterns, for example, the bird and the fish, on their stone panels, usually on the inward sides, while sometimes on the outward sides.

The stone tomb and the cliff tomb are horizontal house-resembling tombs. They are the burial types reflecting regional variations in the later stage of the development of horizontal house-resembling tombs. It can be briefly summarized that the cliff tomb and the stone or brick tomb were two dominant burial types in Eastern Han China. While the stone or brick tombs spread in most of the areas of Eastern Han China, the cliff tombs spread mainly in the Sichuan area. Such distribution of the burial types in Eastern Han China leads to the question on the origin of the cliff tombs in Sichuan, which I will discuss later in relation to the development of the stone carvings of the bird and the fish.

The stone tombs discussed in this paper mainly distributed in Shandong and northern Jiangsu over the period from early to late Eastern Han. The stone tombs were usually built half underground by pieces of stone squared into proper shapes to resemble houses (Fig. 4). Many of the stone tombs have stone carvings of figures, patterns and narrative scenes depicting historical stories on their walls in the chambers and other architectural elements such as the door posts and the door panels. It has been suggested that the Han stone carvings appeared in the stone shaft tomb first and then flourished in the middle and the late Eastern Han in stone tombs. ①

The cliff tombs discussed in this paper distributed mainly in the Sichuan Basin, along the Min River, Fu River, Tuo River, Jialing River and the Yangzi River. The cliff tombs were usually cut horizontally into the sandstone cliffs along the rivers (Fig. 5). They usually contain a long tomb passage, a doorway, an entry chamber, some middle chambers and side chambers and a back chamber (Fig. 6 and 7). Many cliff tombs have architectural elements resembling those of houses carved on the living rock, such as the pillar and the brackets, the ceiling, the door post and the wooden-framed wall. Like the stone tombs in Shandong, many cliff tombs have stone carvings of figures and pattern on their walls and other architectural elements in the chambers. However, the stone carvings in the cliff tombs are often less both in quality and in number compared to the stone carvings in the stone tombs in Shandong. In addition, very few narrative scenes of historical stories have been found in the cliff tombs in Sichuan. Most of the stone carvings in the cliff tombs are separate figures or patterns distributing randomly in the chambers of the

---

①See Yan and Liu 1995.

tombs. In contrast, many of the stone carvings of figures in the stone tombs in Shandong are arranged according to planned schemes to form narrative scenes or to follow certain regulations in the burial ritual. To some extent, the cliff tombs exhibit more dedication in building architectural elements resembling houses than the stone tombs. On the other hand, the stone tombs exhibit more achievement in the designing and making stone carvings of high quality.

It is necessary to mention that compared to the cliff tombs, the stone carvings in Sichuan in Eastern appear more on pictorial stone coffins. Many of the stone carvings of the bird holding a fish in the mouth were also found on the pictorial stone coffins. Like the cliff tombs, the pictorial stone coffins also were carved from the local sandstone from the cliffs and distributed mainly in Sichuan in Eastern Han. It is notable that that the pictorial stone coffins were found not only in the cliff tombs but also in many stone or brick tombs in Sichuan. In addition, both the cliff tombs and the pictorial stone coffins appeared around the early Eastern Han while no evidence can show which one appeared earlier than the other. In this sense, it is not unreasonable to suggest that the pictorial stone coffins appeared earlier. It is possible that coffins made of sandstone quarried from the cliffs in Sichuan, a new material instead of traditional materials such as pottery and wood, were introduced into the stone or brick tombs in Sichuan first, and then people realized that through quarrying sandstone from the cliffs, the space formed in the cliff could be used as tombs. The cliff tomb, a new burial type appeared by chance when people quarrying sandstone from the cliffs to make stone coffins. I suggest that the pictorial stone coffins possibly developed based on the pictorial scheme of the stone shaft tombs. Then the cliff tombs developed based on the pictorial scheme of the pictorial stone coffins. In contrast, though the stone tombs in central and eastern China inherited many pictorial elements from the stone shaft tombs, the pictorial scheme experienced dramatic changes from separate pictorial elements to large narrative scenes.

The development of the stone carvings of the bird holding a fish in the mouth, to some extent, can support this suggestion and can be regard as an important clue to trace the development of various burial types from the Western Han to the Eastern Han. Appearing later than the stone shaft tombs, the pictorial stone coffins adopted similar pictorial scheme including pictorial element such as the bird and the fish (Fig. 8 and 9). Such similar pictorial scheme continued to develop in the decoration of the cliff tombs, in which the pictures of the bird and the fish continued to appear as an independent decorating element (Fig. 10). In contrast, in the stone tombs in eastern China, unlike the pictorial scheme arranged in



framed panels in the stone shaft tombs, the stone carvings exhibit large narrative scenes in which independent decoration element, such as the bird and the fish was incorporated into the narrative scene (Fig. 11). In the stone tombs, the picture of the bird and the fish was no longer an independent decorating element and could only be traced through observing the large narrative scenes in the tomb decoration.

The stone carvings of figures and patterns in the tomb first appeared in the stone shaft tombs in Shandong. Figures and patterns were arranged in frames on each side of the stone shaft built by stone panels. Though the size of the stone shaft is larger than that of the stone coffin and the stone carvings were usually on the inward sides of the stone shaft, the pictorial schemes on the surfaces of the stone coffins in Sichuan are similar to those on the stone panels of the stone shaft tombs in Shandong. Figures and patterns also appeared relatively independent and were arranged in frames which fit into the four sides of the stone coffin. For example, the picture of two birds holding a fish in their mouths was carved on the left section of the framed picture on the stone panel in a stone shaft in Zoucheng in Shandong (Fig. 8). Similarly, the picture of two birds with a fish in the middle was found on the framed picture on a pictorial stone coffin (Fig. 9). Stone coffins with such pictorial scheme including the picture of the bird and the fish have been found frequently in Sichuan, especially in the area around Yibin, in southern Sichuan, along the Yangzi River.

In the cliff tombs, the stone carvings of the bird and the fish also appeared as important independent pictorial elements. For example, there is a stone carving of a bird holding two fishes in its mouth on the wall of the doorway in the third chamber in the tomb M6 at Taliangzi in Zhongjiang in Sichuan (Fig. 10). In contrast, in the stone tombs in central and eastern China, the pictures of the bird and the fish rarely appear as independent image, but appear in large scenes containing numerous images. For example, the image of a bird eating a fish in a stone tomb dated to the late Eastern Han in Zoucheng in Shandong appears as a component part of the picture depicting a pavilion next to the water. In the picture, there is a group of people walking upstairs to the main pavilion while there are three other people fishing in the main pavilion. In the water under the pavilion there are swimming fishes. The image of a bird eating a fish is located among the group of fishes swimming in the water (Fig. 11).

The picture of the bird and the fish in the tomb is regarded to have multiple meanings. ①It might bless the tomb occupants to be wealthy in their afterlife. Meanwhile it

---

①For the studies of the multiple meanings of the picture of the bird and the fish see Luo 2005 and Niu 2010.



might function in guiding the tomb occupants through the path to the heaven. Furthermore, the picture of the bird eating fish might have the implication of sexual intercourse which blessed the tomb occupants to have prosperous offspring. ①In Sichuan, such pictures of the bird and the fish in the tomb have been further linked to the local tradition in ancestral worship. The pictures of the bird and the fish have been suggested to be used as the symbol of the totem of the local residents in southern Sichuan in the Han dynasty. ② The importance of this symbol of the local totem was reflected through the popularity of the picture of the bird and the fish in the cliff tombs and on the stone coffins. Not only the meaning of the picture of the bird and the fish developed under the local influence, but also the form of the picture. The image of the fish in the picture of the bird and the fish in Sichuan forms stark contrast to that in the tombs in central and eastern China. The images of the fish in Sichuan, especially in the Yibin area in Southern Sichuan, along the Yangzi River appear much longer and look very similar to a certain fish, the sturgeon which inhabits in Yangzi River in large number (Fig. 12). ③ In this sense, the development of the picture of the bird and the fish can be regarded as a continuation of the tomb decoration in central and eastern China but with local features. It is notable that when the picture of the bird and the fish was no longer an important decoration element in the tombs in central and eastern China in Eastern Han, the cliff tombs in Sichuan became to widely adopt this decoration element. In this sense, the picture of the bird and the fish becomes one of the clues to trace the development of the cliff tombs in Sichuan in Eastern Han.

The cliff tombs in Sichuan developed on the basis of many established traditions in tomb architecture and tomb decoration which had been developing for a long time in central and eastern China. Certain elements in the traditions in tomb architecture and decoration were adopted and developed to adapt to the local demands while certain elements were discarded. The picture of the bird and fish was one of the traditional elements that were put on important value in the process of selecting and developing. When the picture of the bird and fish and other elements of the tomb architecture and decoration work together to form a new burial type – the cliff tomb, the cliff tomb became a product related to the creation of the local identity of the residents in Sichuan in Eastern Han.

---

①Liu (1991) suggests that the single image of the fish might have the implication of wealth. When the images of the bird and the fish were put together, the more obvious meaning of the picture was on sexual intercourse which meant to bless the tomb occupants to have prosperous offspring.

②See Zhang and Chen 1991.

③See Lan and Qian 1987.

The notion of identity is instrumental in understanding the local features of the cliff tombs in Sichuan and how they related to tombs in central and eastern China. The picture of the bird and the fish is one of the local features of the cliff tombs in Sichuan. My use of the notion of identity is based on Richard Jenkins's work (2008) on social identity. The cliff tomb was a cultural product related to the local residents who were trying to build their identity through developing regional features of their tombs. When the local residents of Sichuan built their identities, they took consideration of both how they were defined by the mainstream culture in central and eastern China and how they understood their own identity. When they considered how they were defined by the mainstream culture in central and eastern China, they selected from a collection of available elements which were regarded as component parts of their collective identity defined by the mainstream culture. The picture of the bird and the fish was one of such elements. The selecting process was carried out not necessarily self-consciously by the local individuals. In the selecting process, based on the external definition of their collective identity given by the mainstream culture, the local individuals also contributed to the production and reproduction of their identity with their own internal understanding of who they were. The picture of the bird and the fish was adopted from the tomb art in central and eastern China while the meaning and the use of this picture acquired more local features in Sichuan in Eastern Han. As a result, building the cliff tombs became a materialised consequence of the internal-external negotiation of building identity. The use of the picture of the bird and the fish in the cliff tombs is a case study to show this internal-external negotiation of building identity.

(Doctoral advisor: Jessica Rawson)

## 图像和身份：四川东汉崖墓的案例研究

陈 轩（牛津大学考古系）

**摘要：**崖墓是东汉时期（AD 25-220）四川的一种主要墓葬形式。根据目前已发表的崖墓资料显示，崖墓最早出现在王莽时期（AD 8-25）的四川，并一直在四川地区发展。值得注意的是，在秦灭蜀之后，四川地区的墓葬演变与中原地区基本保持一致，由西汉普遍流行的竖穴墓发展为砖、石室墓，而崖墓的出现却似乎是当地的独创。