

教育部人文社会科学重点研究基地基金及
广东外语外贸大学学术著作出版基金资助出版

Constructing the Interlanguage Modal System:

L2 Acquisition of Modality by
Chinese EFL Learners

构建中介语情态系统 ——中国英语学习者情态习得研究

胡春雨 著



科学出版社

Constructing the Interlanguage Modal System: L2 Acquisition of Modality by Chinese EFL Learners

**构建中介语情态系统
——中国英语学习者情态习得研究**

胡春雨 著

科学出版社
北京

图书在版编目(CIP)数据

构建中介语情态系统：中国英语学习者情态习得研究 =
Constructing the Interlanguage Modal System: L2 Acquisition of
Modality by Chinese EFL Learners: 英文 / 胡春雨著. —北
京：科学出版社，2011.6

ISBN 978-7-03-031336-2

I. ①构… II. ①胡… III. ①英语 – 中介语 – 研究 – 英文
IV. ①H31

中国版本图书馆 CIP 数据核字(2011)第 103696 号

责任编辑：刘彦慧 阎 莉 / 责任校对：郑金红

责任印制：赵德静 / 封面设计：无极书装

联系电话：010-6401 9074 电子邮箱：liuyanhui@mail.sciencep.com

科 学 出 版 社 出 版

北京东黄城根北街 16 号

邮政编码：100717

<http://www.sciencep.com>

中 国 科 学 院 印 刷 厂 印 刷

科学出版社编务公司排版制作

科学出版社发行 各地新华书店经销

*

2011 年 6 月第 一 版 开本：A5 (890×1240)

2011 年 6 月第一次印刷 印张：11 7/8

印数：1—2 000 字数：500 000

定价：56.00 元

(如有印装质量问题，我社负责调换〈科印〉)

前　　言

有关英语情态系统的描述与研究虽历来有之，但由于该系统比较复杂，其表现形式具有多样性、动态性、不规则性和模糊性，有关中介语情态系统的研究一直处于比较薄弱的态势，急需全面、系统而深入的描述与考察。本专著在这方面做了一些有意义的尝试。

本专著的总目标“中国英语学习者的情态习得研究”被具化为六个紧密相连的研究问题：(1)在当代英语中，认识可能性、根必然性、意愿/预测等情态概念是如何被表达的？(2)中学英语教科书在多大程度上反映出这些情态表达的实际使用情况？(3)和本族语者相比，高级英语学习者在使用这些情态表达时，存在什么样的偏差？(4)学习者的情态表达能力在多大程度上随着英语总体水平的提高而提高？(5)学习者情态表达的习得和使用是否存在较大的个体差异？(6)在中介语情态系统的构建过程中，哪些因素在起作用，它们又是如何相互作用的？

为了回答上述研究问题，共有四类研究为本文所采用，它们是：本族语者语料库研究、教学语料库研究、学习者语料库研究和实验研究。这四类研究相互关联，为我们理解英语情态表达在当代英语口语语中、教科书中、不同水平学习者的中介语中的使用情况，提供了一个较为有趣的对比。

本族语者语料库研究以构式语法为理论框架，以笔者自建的当代美国口语语料库(CASEC)、四个笔语语料库(LOB、FLOB、Brown、Frown)，以及CHILDES中的部分语料为依托，对英语情态系统的动态性、不规则性、复杂性、非线性及混沌性，进行了深入的研究。学习者习得这样的系统，需要在自己的中介语系统中建构具体的、抽象的、混合的等多种多样的情态构式，以便这些构式能在具体的使用事件中需要时随时被唤起。

教学语料库研究表明，中学英语教科书没能很好地体现出当代英语情态表达的一些重要特征，某些具体情态表达在教科书中的出现频率以及呈现顺序上存在问题。这也是导致学习者在建构中介语情态系统的过程中产生困难的原因之一。

通过对比分析学习者语料库和相关的本族语者语料库，发现：本族语者在表达某一情态概念时往往会展开使用一系列的表达形式，而学习者则过多依赖某一个或两个情态形式。学习者语料库之间的对比表明，三组不同水平的学习者在表达认知可能性、根必然性、意愿/预测等情态概念时，无论在口语中还是在议论文写作中，其情态表达的使用有着极为相似的规律，尽管较高水平的学习者在某些情态表达的使用上更接近本族语者。

来自 16 名被试(6 名英语专业大一学生、6 名英语专业大三学生、4 名语言学专业研究生)的实验数据(这些数据分别来自被试的口笔语产出、翻译测试、语篇完型测试、可接受性判断测试、开放式问卷、访谈)在很大程度上印证了学习者语料库研究的结果，但也呈现出一幅更加复杂的习得图画：(1) 即便水平最高的被试口笔语产出中的情态表达也和本族语者存在巨大差异；(2) 同一水平组的不同被试在情态表达的使用上存在巨大差异；(3) 中介语情态系统呈现出动态、复杂、非线性化、有时候甚至是混沌的特点。

学习者在达到高级水平后，在英语情态表达上仍和本族语者存在巨大差异的原因，除了英语情态系统自身的复杂性和情态教学存在着各种各样的问题外，还因为汉语情态系统的迁移、学习者交际需求的满足等学习者自身因素。学习者在情态习得的初始阶段，在一些普遍制约原则的作用下，最大化地把母语情态系统迁移到中介语中，把 WILL 看作是将来时态的标记语，把 COULD, MIGHT, WOULD 看作是 CAN, MAY, WILL 的过去时形式，从而在很短的时间内较为轻松地构建出既经济又有效的中介语情态系统。随着输入的增加和英语整体水平的提高，有的高级学习者的中介语情态系统逐渐趋于复杂，而有的高级学习者由于交际需求的满足和缺乏对自己情态产出与本族语者情态使用差距的认识，基本上停留在情态表达使用的初中级阶段。

本书是迄今为止对中国英语学习者的情态习得进行系统研究的第一本专著。由于本研究将语料库语言学的方法和二语习得的实验方法结合起来，形成多角论证，从而使本课题比以往的同类研究显得更为全面和深入，具有一定的理论价值和实践意义。但由于作者水平有限，虽经多次修改，其中谬误仍难以避免，敬请读者指出以便作者加以修正。

胡春雨

2011年5月

Acknowledgements

This monograph grew out of my doctoral dissertation (Hu 2009) which was completed at Guangdong University of Foreign Studies. I owe a great debt to my supervisor Prof. Gui Shichun, for his enthusiasm, encouragement, enduring insights, and enormous generosity with which he has shared his time and thoughts with me. He has left his footsteps in each milestone of this study.

My gratitude also goes to the examiners of my dissertation, Prof. Huang Guowen, Prof. Qin Xiubai, Prof. Wei Naixing, Prof. He Anping and Prof. Liang Maocheng, who made to-the-point suggestions for further improvement of my doctoral research. Special thanks go to Prof. He Anping and her colleague Dr. Xu Manfei for allowing me to use Louvain International Database of Spoken English Interlanguage. The investigation of LINDSEI and the pedagogic corpus (which was also constructed by Prof. He and her colleagues, provided by Dr. Li Jinhui) comprises an indispensable part of the present study.

I owe special debts of gratitude to the professors in the PhD program of Guangdong University of Foreign Studies. These respectable professionals include Prof. Qian Guanlian, Prof. Qin Xiubai, Prof. Wang Chuming, Prof. Wu Xudong, Prof. Dong Yanping, Prof. Zeng Yongqiang, and Prof. Liu Jianda.

I have particularly good memories of the time spent in Henan Normal University where I conducted the main part of the experiment, and would like to thank the teaching staff there for the warm welcome I have received. I am especially grateful to Prof. Li Wenzhong, who provided every means to facilitate the experiment as well as invaluable suggestions to this study for improvement.

I owe a great debt of gratitude to the sixteen participants for their

cooperation and commitment, whose involvement has comprised another indispensable part for the completion of this study. Without their immense contribution, L2 acquisition of modality might still have remained a dark area for me.

I would also like to extend my gratitude to all the people who participated in the pilot studies, who helped me to type or transcribe experimental data, who provided me with invaluable reference materials, who exchanged ideas and arguments with me concerning a wide range of academic topics, and who offered warm supports when I was undergoing hard times during the period of my academic Odyssey. I fear that a list of names would inevitably contain omissions, and hope that they will accept my sincere thanks and forgive me not mentioning them individually.

For providing financial support, I would like to thank the National Key Research Center for Linguistics and Applied linguistics of Guangdong University of Foreign Studies, and School of English for International Business. My heartfelt thanks are also expressed to Ms. Liu Yanhui and Ms. Yan Li who arranged the publication of this book.

Last but not least, I would love to thank my family, especially my wife Yang Bei and my daughter Hu Huijun, for their unfailing support during my study and research career.

List of Abbreviations

BNC	British National Corpus
CASEC	Contemporary American Spoken English Corpus
CHILDES	Child Language Data Exchange System
CLEC	Chinese Learner English Corpus
EFL	English as Foreign Language
FLOB	Freiburg Lancaster-Oslo/ Bergen
ICLE	International Corpus of Learner English
IL	Interlanguage
L1	First Language
L2	Second Language
LINDSEI	Louvain International Database of Spoken English Interlanguage
LOCNESS	Louvain Corpus of Native English Essays
LOB	Lancaster-Oslo/ Bergen
NS	Native Speaker
NNS	Nonnative Speaker
SECCCL	Spoken English Corpus of Chinese Learners
SLA	Second Language Acquisition
WECCL	Written English Corpus of Chinese Learners

List of LINDSEI Transcriptions

=	Truncated words
:	The last syllable is lengthened
< >	Nonverbal vocal sounds
<?>	Not entirely sure of a word or word ending
<\A>, <\B>	Speaker turns
.	A “short” pause (< 1 second)
..	A “medium” pause (1-3 seconds)
...	A “long” pauses (> 3 seconds)
er, em, erm, mm, uhu, mhm	Filled pauses and backchannelling

Contents

前言

Acknowledgements

List of Abbreviations

List of LINDSEI Transcriptions

Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 Research Orientation.....	1
1.2 Rationale	1
1.3 The Scope of Inquiry	6
1.4 Theoretical Considerations.....	10
1.5 Organization of the Book.....	14
Chapter 2 The Acquisition of Modality	16
2.1 Modality.....	16
2.1.1 Definition and Classification	16
2.1.2 The English Modal System.....	19
2.1.3 The Chinese Modal System.....	23
2.2 L1 Acquisition of Modality	27
2.2.1 Naturalistic Longitudinal Studies	27
2.2.2 Experimental Studies	31
2.3 L2 Acquisition of Modality	33
2.3.1 Longitudinal Studies.....	33
2.3.2 Learner Corpus Studies	37
2.3.3 Experimental Studies	43
2.4 Limitations of Previous Studies.....	46
2.5 Summary	48
Chapter 3 Methodology	49
3.1 Research Questions	49

3.2 The NS Corpus Study	53
3.2.1 Introduction	53
3.2.2 Corpora Used in This Study	56
3.2.3 Data Analysis.....	60
3.3 The Pedagogic Corpus Study.....	63
3.3.1 Introduction	63
3.3.2 The Pedagogic Corpus Used in This Study	64
3.3.3 Data Analysis.....	64
3.4 The Learner Corpus Study	65
3.4.1 Introduction	65
3.4.2 Corpora Used in This Study	65
3.4.3 Data Analysis.....	69
3.5 The Experimental Study	75
3.5.1 Introduction	75
3.5.2 Participants	78
3.5.3 Instruments and Materials	79
3.5.4 Data Collection Procedures.....	81
3.5.5 Data Analysis.....	82
Chapter 4 Modality in Contemporary English, Textbooks and Learners' Language	84
4.1 Modality in Contemporary English	84
4.1.1 General Findings	84
4.1.2 Modal Expressions of Epistemic Possibility	89
4.1.3 Modal Expressions of Root Necessity.....	96
4.1.4 Modal Expressions of Volition and Prediction.....	104
4.1.5 Summary	118
4.2 Modality in the Textbooks.....	119
4.2.1 General Findings	119
4.2.2 Modal Expressions of Epistemic Possibility	121
4.2.3 Modal Expressions of Root Necessity.....	123
4.2.4 Modal Expressions of Volition and Prediction.....	126

4.2.5 Summary	129
4.3 Modality in Learners' Language: Deviation from the Norm.....	130
4.3.1 General Findings	130
4.3.2 Modal Expressions of Epistemic Possibility	132
4.3.3 Modal Expressions of Root Necessity.....	134
4.3.4 Modal Expressions of Volition and Prediction.....	136
4.3.5 Summary	141
4.4 Modality in Learners' Language: Modal Development.....	142
4.4.1 General Findings	142
4.4.2 Modal Expressions of Epistemic Possibility	144
4.4.3 Modal Expressions of Root Necessity.....	145
4.4.4 Modal Expressions of Volition and Prediction.....	147
4.4.5 Summary	150
4.5 Modality in Learners' Language: Individual Differences.....	151
4.5.1 General Findings	151
4.5.2 Modal Expressions of Epistemic Possibility	155
4.5.3 Modal Expressions of Root Necessity.....	157
4.5.4 Modal Expressions of Volition and Prediction.....	161
4.5.5 Summary	175
Chapter 5 Constructing the IL Modal System.....	177
5.1 The Inherent Complexity of the English Modality	177
5.2 The Role of Instruction	180
5.2.1 Instructional Input	181
5.2.2 Instructional Support.....	184
5.2.3 Summary	187
5.3 Learner Factors	187
5.3.1 L1 Influence.....	188
5.3.2 Universal Constraints	190
5.3.3 L2 Proficiency	194
5.3.4 Learner Needs and Learner Agency	195
5.3.5 Learner Awareness	198

5.3.6 The Role of Output Practice.....	199
5.4 The Dynamic Interaction of Contributing Factors	201
5.4.1 The Acquisition and Use of the Epistemic Markers.....	202
5.4.2 The Acquisition and Use of the Root Necessity Modals	207
5.4.3 The Acquisition and Use of the Volition and Prediction Modals (I)	210
5.4.4 The Acquisition and Use of the Volition and Prediction Modals (II).....	214
5.5 Towards a General Understanding of L2 Modal Acquisition	216
5.6 Summary	224
Chapter 6 Conclusion	226
6.1 Summary of Major Findings	226
6.2 Theoretical and Methodological Implications	228
6.2.1 Usage-Based Model vs. Corpus-Based Analysis.....	228
6.2.2 Group Data vs. Individual Data.....	230
6.2.3 Oral Data vs. Written Data.....	232
6.2.4 Production Data vs. Other Types of Data	232
6.3 Implications for Modal Instruction	234
6.3.1 Providing Better Modal Input	234
6.3.2 Providing More Input-Processing Tasks and Focus-on-Form Activities	235
6.3.3 Providing More Effective Explicit Instruction.....	237
6.3.4 Teaching Modals When Learner Are Developmentally Ready..	241
6.3.5 Providing More Awareness-Raising Activities	242
6.3.6 Providing Opportunity for Practice.....	243
6.4 Suggestions for Future Research	245
6.5 Concluding Remarks.....	247
References.....	249
Appendices.....	270
Appendix 1 Materials Used in CASEC.....	270
Appendix 2 A Pilot Study	272

Appendix 3	Topics in the Writing Task.....	282
Appendix 4	Topics in the Oral Task	287
Appendix 5	The Translation Test	288
Appendix 6	The Discourse Completion Test.....	293
Appendix 7	The Acceptability Judgment Test.....	297
Appendix 8	The Opened Questionnaire.....	299
Appendix 9	Participants' 256 Essays (Sample).....	302
Appendix 10	Participants' Sixteen Conversations (Sample).....	303
Appendix 11	Participants' Performance in the Translation Test	305
Appendix 12	Participants' Performance in the Discourse Competition Test.....	315
Appendix 13	Participants' Performance in the Acceptability Judgment Test.....	325
Appendix 14	Participants' Answers to Questions in the Opened Questionnaire	327
Appendix 15	Sample of Interviews.....	351
Appendix 16	Post-experiment Investigations (Sample)	355

List of Tables

2.1	Modal devices of epistemic possibility used by ten children.....	29
2.2	Comparison of children's and adults' distribution of modal forms.....	30
3.1	Description of collection procedures and data available from each of the three children	60
3.2	The spoken corpora used in this study	67
3.3	The written corpora used in this study	69
3.4	Information of sixteen participants.....	78
4.1	Frequencies of modals in the four written corpora	85
4.2	Frequencies of modal expressions in Frown and CASEC	86
4.3	Frequencies of modal expressions in CHILDES sample.....	88
4.4	Distribution of the epistemic markers in six corpora (per million words).....	93
4.5	A syntactic comparison of HAVE TO and HAVE GOT TO in CASEC	101
4.6	The main verb collocates with the volition/prediction modals in CASEC.....	108
4.7	Frequencies of modal expressions in the pedagogic corpus and the three NS corpora (per million words)	119
4.8	Comparison of modal expressions used by native speakers and advanced Chinese EFL learners.....	131
4.9	Distribution of WOULD in NS and NNS spoken and written corpus (per 100,000 words)	138
4.10	Comparison of modal expressions used by different proficiency groups (per 100,000 words)	142

4.11	Distribution of WOULD in NS and NNS corpora (per 100, 000 words)	149
4.12	Modal profile by participants in Group1	151
4.13	Modal profile by participants in Group2	153
4.14	Modal profile by participants in Group3	154
4.15	Distribution of WOULD in argumentative writing.....	162
4.16	WILL and BE GOING TO in conversations and translations..	163
5.1	Comparison of instructional input and learner output (per 100,000 words)	182
5.2	Correlation between the pedagogic corpus and the six learner corpora.....	183