

The Cambridge Companion to Philosophy



The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Philosophy

A. S. McGrade

剑桥哲学研究指针

中世纪哲学

The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Philosophy

A. S. 麦格雷迪 编 Edited by A.S.McGrade

图书在版编目(CIP)数据

中世纪哲学 = The Cambridge Companion to Medieva 1 Philosophy / () 麦格雷迪編. 一北京: 生活・读书・新知三联书店, 2006.5 (剑桥哲学研究指针) ISBN 7-108-02481-0

I. 中... II. 麦... III. 中世纪哲学 - 研究 - 英文 IV. B13

中国版本图书馆 CIP 数据核字 (2006) 第 034379 号

责任编辑 舒 炜

封扉设计 罗 洪 崔建华

出版发行 生活·讀書·新知 三联书店 (北京市东城区美术馆东街 22 号)

邮 编 100010

图 字 01-2006-2002

经 销 新华书店

印 刷 北京隆昌伟业印刷有限公司

版 次 2006 年 5 月北京第 1 版 2006 年 5 月北京第 1 次印刷

开 本 635毫米×965毫米 1/16 印张 26.75

印 数 0,001-4,000 册

定 价 35.00 元

THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY

The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Philosophy takes its readers into one of the most exciting periods in the history of philosophy. It spans a millennium of thought extending from Augustine to Thomas Aguinas and beyond. It includes not only the thinkers of the Latin West but also the profound contributions of Islamic and Jewish thinkers such as Avicenna and Maimonides. Leading specialists examine what it was like to do philosophy in the cultures and institutions of the Middle Ages and engage all the areas in which medieval philosophy flourished, including language and logic, the study of God and being, natural philosophy, human nature, morality, and politics. The text is supplemented with chronological charts, biographies of the major thinkers, and a guide to the transmission and translation of medieval texts. The volume will be invaluable for all who are interested in the philosophical thought of this period.

The Cambridge Companion to

MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY

Edited by

A. S. McGrade



PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 IRP, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain
Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa
http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 2003

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2003 Reprinted 2005

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Trump Medieval 10/13 pt. System LATEX 28 [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 0 521 80603 8 hardback ISBN 0 521 00063 7 paperback

This edition of *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Philosophy* is published by arrangement with Cambridge University Press. Licensed for sale in People's Republic of China only. 本书由剑桥大学出版社授权生活・读书・新知三联书店出版。仅供在中华人民共和国境内销售。

The publisher has used its best endeavors to ensure that the URLs for external websites referred to in this book are correct and active at the time of going to press. However, the publisher has no responsibility for the websites and can make no guarantee that a site will remain live or that the content is or will remain appropriate.

剑桥哲学研究指针

出版说明

生活·读书·新知三联书店自20世纪80年代中期以来一向重视引介西方现当代学术著作,在著译界朋友大力支持下,我店陆续刊行综合性文库和专题性译丛若干套,对近二十余年中国学术思想的建设发展起到了积极的作用。

三联书店现在以英文原版形式引进出版"剑桥哲学研究指针",其主旨则在于便利国内读者和研究者翻阅查考,掌握西方学术研究的最新动态。"剑桥哲学研究指针"是英国剑桥大学出版社 20 世纪 90 年代刊行的大型学术参考书,面世之后,好评如潮,影响巨大,自1992 年至今已出版六十余种。这套书以大哲学家为中心线索,辅以若干时期的哲学主题及哲学流派,由出色当行的学者出任主编,邀集各领域专家组成国际化的学者队伍,专门撰写文章,综述研究状况,缕列文献目录;各书的编辑方针清晰,体例完备周密,内容丰富,资料充足,是很好的西方哲学研究指南读物。如原出版者所说:"这套书的目的之一,乃是针对艰深而富有挑战性的哲学家著作,帮助读者打消畏难心理",对哲学有兴趣的非专业读者和学生,由此可获得权威有效的方便指引;专家和深入研究者由此则可概览各种解释与分析的新进展。

在21世纪中国社会和思想文化创造性发展的大背景下,这套书或将有助于中国读者深入勘察有关西方思想传统的各种不断演变的诠释, 形成权衡取舍的批判性视野,并逐步确立中文学术界自身的看法。这 是我们引进出版这套书的深层期望所在。

三联书店编辑部 2006年3月

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

- E. J. ASHWORTH is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Waterloo, Canada. She is the author of Language and Logic in the Post-Medieval Period and of numerous articles on medieval and early modern language and logic. She has edited the Tractatus de obligationibus of Paul of Venice's Logica magna. She was editor of the Renaissance section of the Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy and continues as editor of the on-line version.
- ANNABEL S. BRETT is Lecturer in History at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of Gonville and Caius College. Her work in medieval and early modern political thought includes Liberty, Right and Nature: Individual Rights in Later Scholastic Thought and an edition of Ockham's On the Power of Emperors and Princes. She is now preparing a translation of Marsilius of Padua's Defender of Peace.

IDIT DOBBS-WEINSTEIN is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Vanderbilt University. She is the author of *Maimonides and St. Thomas on the Limits of Reason* and an audio book, *Moses Maimonides and Medieval Jewish Philosophy*, as well as many articles on medieval Jewish philosophy, with a special interest in its relations to medieval Islamic and Christian thought and to the philosophy of Spinoza.

THÉRÈSE-ANNE DRUART is Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Center for Medieval and Byzantine Studies at the Catholic University of America. Her recent publications include "The Human Soul's Individuation and its Survival After the Body's Death: Avicenna on the Causal Relation Between Body and Soul." She is

preparing a section on metaphysics for *The Cambridge Companion* to *Arabic Philosophy* and will be directing a continuing bibliography in medieval Islamic philosophy, theology, and the sciences for the Société Internationale des Sciences et de la Philosophie Arabe et Islamique.

P. J. FITZPATRICK is Emeritus Reader in Philosophy at the University of Durham. His writings include *Birth Regulation and Catholic Belief*, Apologia pro Charles Kingsley, and In Breaking of Bread: The Eucharist and Ritual.

JOHN HALDANE is Professor of Philosophy at the University of St. Andrews, where he is also Senior Fellow of the Centre for Ethics, Philosophy and Public Affairs. He is a Fellow of the Royal Society of Edinburgh and the Royal Society of Arts. Besides editing and coediting several collections of essays, he has written numerous articles on the history of philosophy, philosophy of mind, metaphysics, and moral philosophy, and is coauthor of *Atheism and Theism* in the Blackwell Great Debates in Philosophy series. He will be Gifford Lecturer in Natural Theology at the University of Aberdeen in 2003/4.

BONNIE KENT is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, Irvine. Since publishing *Virtues of the Will* she has worked especially on issues of motivation in medieval moral psychology. Her recent essays include "Habits and Virtues," in S. Pope, ed., *The Ethics of Aquinas*, and "Rethinking Moral Dispositions," in T. Williams, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Scotus*.

GYULA KLIMA is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Fordham University. He is the author of *Ars artium: Essays in Philosophical Semantics Medieval and Modern* and numerous articles on medieval logic and metaphysics. He has translated John Buridan's *Summulae de dialectica* and is currently working on a monograph on Buridan's logic and metaphysics.

D. E. LUSCOMBE is a Fellow of the British Academy and Research Professor of Medieval History at the University of Sheffield. He is the author of *The School of Peter Abelard, Peter Abelard's Ethics, Medieval Thought,* and many articles on Abelard and on medieval

conceptions of hierarchy. He is joint editor, with J. Riley-Smith, of parts 1 and 2 of volume IV of *The New Cambridge Medieval History* (forthcoming) and is currently completing an edition of the *Letters* of *Peter Abelard and Heloise*.

JAMES MCEVOY is Dean of the Faculty of Philosophy at the National University of Ireland at Maynooth. His special interests in medieval philosophy include Scottus Eriugena, Thomas Gallan, Robert Grosseteste, and the theme of friendship. He is the author of Robert Grosseteste (2002) and of two volumes on theories of friendship in antiquity and in the Christian era, Sagesses de l'amitié (1997 and 2002). He is a contributor to the edition of Grosseteste's unedited works and is preparing a book on friendship and associated concepts in the history of philosophy.

A. S. McGrade is Professor Emeritus of Philosophy, the University of Connecticut, and the author of *The Political Thought of William of Ockham*. He has edited, with John Kilcullen, two volumes of Ockham's political writings and, with John Kilcullen and Matthew Kempshall, volume II of *Cambridge Translations of Medieval Philosophical Texts* (on ethics and political philosophy).

JOHN MARENBON is Fellow and Director of Studies in the History of Philosophy, Trinity College, University of Cambridge. He is the author of a two-volume history of medieval philosophy; *The Philosophy of Peter Abelard*; *Aristotelian Logic, Platonism, and the Context of Early Medieval Philosophy in the West*; and *Boethius*. He is now at work on a new introduction to medieval philosophy (to replace his earlier history) and a study of medieval views of pagans (especially ancient ones).

STEVEN P. MARRONE is Professor of History at Tufts University. His studies of thirteenth-century epistemology include many articles and three monographs, William of Auvergne and Robert Grosseteste: New Ideas of Truth in the Early Thirteenth Century, Truth and Scientific Knowledge in the Thought of Henry of Ghent, and The Light of Thy Countenance: Science and Knowledge of God in the Thirteenth Century.

xiv

STEPHEN P. MENN is Associate Professor of Philosophy at McGill University and works on ancient and medieval philosophy and the history of mathematics. He is the author of Plato on God as Nous and Descartes and Augustine. He is completing a book manuscript on The Aim and the Argument of Aristotle's Metaphysics and is working with Calvin Normore on a book about nominalism and realism.

ROBERT PASNAU is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Colorado and the author of Theories of Cognition in the Later Middle Ages and Thomas Aquinas on Human Nature. A Philosophical Study of Summa Theologiae 1a 75–89, as well as numerous articles and reviews on topics in late medieval epistemology. He has edited Aquinas's commentary on Aristotle's De anima and volume III of Cambridge Translations of Medieval Philosophical Texts, on mind and knowledge. He is general editor of the Hackett Aquinas Project, a series of translations, with commentary, of Aquinas's central philosophical texts, and has contributed to that series a volume on Aquinas's treatise on human nature.

EDITH DUDLEY SYLLA is Professor of History at North Carolina State University. She has written extensively on fourteenth-century natural philosophy, especially the work of the Oxford Calculators. She is currently working on Walter Burley's physics and on the origins of mathematical probability, particularly in the work of Jacob Bernouli. Her forthcoming publications include "Business Ethics, Commercial Mathematics, and the Origins of Mathematical Probability" and, with A. Maierù, a short biography of Anneliese Maier.

THOMAS WILLIAMS is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Iowa. He has translated works by Augustine and Anselm and is now preparing volume v of *Cambridge Translations of Medieval Philosophical Texts*, on philosophical theology. His work on Duns Scotus includes "A Most Methodical Lover? On Scotus's Arbitrary Creator" and the editing of *The Cambridge Companion to Duns Scotus*.

PREFACE TO THE PROPERTY OF THE

This book presents one of the most exciting periods in the history of philosophy, a millennium of thought extending from Augustine to Wyclif in the Latin West, from al-Kindi to Ibn Rushd in Islam, and in medieval Jewish communities from Ibn Gabirol to Gersonides. As a Companion, the volume seeks to do more than present authoritative information about its subject. The contributors aim to take their readers as far as possible into medieval philosophy. I explain in the introduction how we hope to achieve this. For now it will be enough to say that we do not assume any prior knowledge of medieval philosophy or the languages in which it was written. We expect that most readers will have had some exposure to contemporary philosophy, but we welcome and hope to assist interested nonphilosophers as well. The volume is meant to be useful in medieval philosophy courses at all levels, but we also have very much in mind those who are approaching medieval philosophy on their own, without access to specialists in the field. We will be delighted if our efforts incite a degree of student agitation for more medieval courses in mainly modernist philosophy departments and if we encourage teachers who skipped or were deprived of the Middle Ages in their own training to offer such courses. It could be a liberating experience for all concerned.

The contributors to this volume have shown great public spirit and enthusiasm for medieval philosophy in setting aside more specialized research in order to make the whole subject accessible to others – not an easy assignment, but, they have found, a rewarding one. I am grateful for their counsel regarding my part in the volume and for their patience and good humor in adjusting their work to suit

yvi

the common good (most often by cutting out fine material for which there simply is not room). I am happy to thank the reviewers of an early prospectus for this Companion for highly effective criticism and the following for advice and information given along the way: Donald Baxter, Stephen Lahey, Miri Rubin, Paul V. Spade, Eleonore Stump, John Wippel, and Jack Zupko. My debts to Professor B. J. McGrade are easily borne but boundless. Individual contributors wish to acknowledge the advice or inspiration of Julie Allen, Paul Freedman, Ester Macedo, Mrs C. M. L. Smith, and Katherine Tachau. Final thanks are due to the editorial and production staff of Cambridge University Press, and especially to Hilary Gaskin, who has supported and judiciously overseen the volume from start to finish.

A. S. McGrade

ABBREVIATIONS AND FORMS OF REFERENCE

For works cited with a number in square brackets (e.g., Kretzmann [41]), a full reference is given in the bibliography.

a.	article
ad	reply to (ad 1: reply to first objection)
CCAq	The Cambridge Companion to Thomas Aquinas, ed. N. Kretzmann and E. Stump (Cambridge, 1993)
CCAug	The Cambridge Companion to Augustine, ed. E. Stump and N. Kretzmann (Cambridge, 2001)
CCOck	The Cambridge Companion to Ockham, ed. P. V. Spade (Cambridge, 1999)
CCScot	The Cambridge Companion to Duns Scotus, ed. T. Williams (Cambridge, 2003)
CH12	A History of Twelfth-Century Western Philosophy, ed. P. Dronke (Cambridge, 1988)
CHLMP	The Cambridge History of Later Medieval Philosophy, ed. N. Kretzmann et al. (Cambridge, 1982)
CT I-III	The Cambridge Translations of Medieval Philosophical Texts

I Logic and the Philosophy of Language, ed. N. Kretzmann and E. Stump (Cambridge,

ed. N. Kretzmann and E. Stump (Cambridge, 1988)

II Ethics and Political Philosophy, ed.

A. S. McGrade, J. Kilcullen, and M. Kempshall (Cambridge, 2001)

III Mind and Knowledge, ed. R. Pasnau (Cambridge, 2002)

Abbreviations and forms of reference yviii

d distinction (in textual references) obi. objection The text of some or all of a Sentences commentary Ordinatio put in order for publication by the author, in contrast with a reportatio PC Patrologia graeca, ed. I. P. Migne, 162 vols, (Paris, 1857-66) (Greek text with Latin translation) Patrologia latina, ed. I. P. Migne, 221 vols, (Paris, 1844-64) question q. disputed question q. disp. quodl. quodlibet The "reported" form of some or all of a Sentences Reportatio commentary (see p. 330) ScG Thomas Aguinas, Summa contra Gentiles Peter Lombard, Sententiae in IV libris distinctae Sent. (Four Books of Sentences), 2 vols. (Grottaferrata, 1971-81) or commentary thereon (see p. 28) Thomas Aguinas, Summa theologiae: references are

to the four parts - I, IaIIae (first part of the second part), IIaIIae (second part of the second part), and III unique (e.g., where a question has only one article)

un.

CONTENTS

Notes on contributors page 187	ge xi
Preface and address the second	XV
Abbreviations and forms of reference	xvii
Introduction A. S. MCGRADE	I
Entry points	2
Otherness A volumer but appropriate	3
What is medieval philosophy?	4
Going further TRADEG REMA-RESERVE	7
A final image: medieval philosophy	
and freedom and metaphysical and freedom	8
	3.04
Medieval philosophy in context	10
STEVEN P. MARRONE vidosolida derwal	
Emergence of medieval philosophy in the late	
Roman Empire Manual and a substantial to associated	II
Monastic discipline and scholarship	16
Islam person, restinguished warm of the size of T	19
The rise of the West and the reemergence of	
philosophy amenament missind delawal	21
Rationalization in society: politics, religion,	
and educational institutions	28
Aristotle and thirteenth-century	
scholasticism	32
The contested fourteenth century	36
The place of authority in medieval	
thought	40
Philosophical sources	43
Genres de and the antiversal desire for	43

viii Contents

2	Two medieval ideas: eternity and hierarchy JOHN MARENBON AND D. E. LUSCOMBE	51
	Eternity Hierarchy	51 60
3	Language and logic E. J. ASHWORTH	73
	Sources and developments The purpose and nature of language	73
	and logic Signification, conventional and mental	77
	language Paronymy and analogy	81
	D - f	85
	Touch and namedon	92
	Informed and nevedor	93
	- Station of	
4	Philosophy in Islam THÉRÈSE-ANNE DRUART	97
	Philosophy, religion, and culture	100
	Psychology and metaphysics	100
	E.L.:	113
5	Jewish philosophy IDIT DOBBS-WEINSTEIN	121
	The roots of knowledge – Saadiah Gaon	
	Universal hylomorphism – Ibn Gabirol	122
	The limits of reason – Moses Maimonides	128
	A purer Aristotelianism – Gersonides	137
	Jewish-Christian interactions	141
,	Metaphysics: God and being	
6		147
	Physical and metaphysical proofs of God	147
	Avicenna's argument and some	14/
		150
	Essence and existence	154
	Only one necessary being?	157